



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, February 13, 2013 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 2:01 p.m. and again at 2:07 p.m.  
MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Absent  
FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
JUDY ORÍAS – Present  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 1:38 p.m. until 4:00 p.m.  
BARRY WINICK – Present at 1:33 p.m.

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present from 1:45 p.m. until 2:47 p.m.  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 1:46 p.m.  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

---

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:33 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Boucher (until 2:01 p.m. and again at 2:07 p.m.), Drury, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: La Voie.

Staff present: Limón (1:45 p.m. until 2:47 p.m.), Hernández (until 1:46 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 30, 2013.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 30, 2013, with correction.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Suding abstained from Item 5. Sharpe abstained from Item 4. Orías abstained. La Voie/Shallanberger/Winick absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Suding abstained from Items A and C. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner La Voie would be absent.
- b) The project at the Santa Barbara Club at 1105 Chapala Street, which was continued to today's meeting, was indefinitely postponed at the architect's request.
- c) On February 12, 2013, the City Council received an update on the Code of Conduct for Advisory Group Members and adopted revised Advisory Group Guidelines which include additional code of ethics training requirements and address the Fair Political Practices Commission sole proprietor exemption. Training on these guidelines will occur at the February 27, 2013, HLC meeting.
- d) The following Joint Architectural Board of Review/Historic Landmarks Commission Design Awards recipients were honored in a ceremony at the February 12, 2013, City Council meeting:
  - ❖ Saint Barbara Award:
    - Kellam de Forest - Civic activist and historic preservation advocate.
  - ❖ George Washington Smith Award:
    - 2100 Laguna St. - Residential addition designed by Mark Shields - completed in 2009.
  - ❖ Lockwood de Forest Award:
    - Historical Society Museum at 136 E. De La Guerra St. - Exemplary design in landscape architecture by Martha Degasis from Arcadia Studio - completed in 2009.

2. Ms. Hernández made the following announcements regarding staff progress on Historic Resources Element implementation:

- a) Policy 8.3. Retain Documents: At the April 10 HLC meeting, the Commission will hold a public hearing to consider proposed amendments to the City's Potential Historic Resources List, which includes the proposed addition of 21 properties. The most updated versions of Designated City Landmarks and Structures of Merit will also be presented.
- b) Policy 1.2. Guidelines: City-wide Historic District Guidelines are currently being prepared and a new intern has been hired to assist in preparing the draft.

3. Commissioner Sharpe announced he would not be attending the next HLC meeting.

4. Commissioner Suding reported on the February 5, 2013, City Council meeting that was held for staff to receive direction on the suggested Five-Year Historic Resources Work Program. Commissioners Drury, Murray and Orías also attended. The prioritization of the 47 items that are on the Historic Resources Element Work List were discussed, the importance of using existing information so that it does not become obsolete was emphasized, and focusing on placing neighborhood preservation higher on the list of tasks was suggested.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Suding reported on the February 7, 2013, Street Tree Advisory Committee (STAC) meeting with respect to the Alvarado Place trees (related to the El Encanto Hotel, 1900 Lasuen Road). Tim Downey, Urban Forest Superintendent, has set up a meeting with Patrick Gladden, Southern California Edison Vegetation Manager, to discuss the necessary pruning of the Eucalyptus trees that are in conflict with power lines. This issue is high on Mr. Downey's priority list. There was no mention of plans to replace the Eucalyptus trees that were cut down at the El Encanto Hotel property since it is not in the STAC's purview.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

1. **800 ALVARADO PLACE (FORMERLY 1900 LASUEN RD)**

(1:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing at 1:45 p.m. on March 13, 2013, to consider recommending the landmark designation of the El Encanto Hotel site, located at 800 Alvarado Place, as a City Historic District.)

Actual time: 1:44

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that the site is architecturally and historically significant for its grouping of Craftsman/Vernacular cottages designed by Winsor Soule and Russell Ray, Spanish Colonial Revival cottages designed by Edwards, Plunkett and Howell, and its landscaping designed by Charles Frederick Eaton.

Commissioner Murray inquired as to the process of requesting that the Eucalyptus trees that were removed for emergency purposes be replaced in light of the possible landmark designation that includes the area where the trees were located. Chair Suding responded that Staff has made a request to the property owner.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution 2013-01 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing to consider recommending to City Council that the El Encanto Hotel site, located at 800 Alvarado Place, be designated a City Historic District, as determined by the City Urban Historian to be eligible for designation.

Action: Orías/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW****2. 0 BLK W MASON ST 2096 SEG ID**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096  
Application Number: MST2010-00261  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Applicant: John Ewasiuk

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. Overall existing bridge width is 33.4 feet and is proposed to be 43 feet.)

**(Project Design Approval is requested. Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137. Project was last reviewed on June 6, 2012.)**

Actual time: 1:46

Present: John Ewasiuk, Principal Engineer  
Thomas Conti, Engineer  
David Black, Landscape Architect  
Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, clarified that the proposed bridge width is 49.5 feet – not 43 feet as agendized. He commented on the City Council approval decision of July 17, 2012. City Council did consider the design concerns previously raised by the Commission, but City Council confirmed that Kimberly Avenue would remain a two-way street and granted authority to the City Engineer to determine the final bridge design width that will meet all City, State and Federal regulatory requirements. The elements that are still subject to review are proposed bridge rail design alternatives and landscape plan, which includes the creek bank landscape.

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m.

Mark Romasanta, neighboring property owner, spoke in support of the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed increased width of the bridge and the need for vegetation along the creek bed located along the side of Kimberly Avenue.

Public comment closed at 2:12 p.m.

Commissioner Orías requested that the criteria for stop sign/traffic warrants be provided. Commissioner Shallenberger requested an overlay of the existing bridge on a site plan.

**Motion: Project Design Approval with the following comment and conditions:**

1. The majority support the proposed horizontal metal railing in a painted finish or wood finish.
2. Provide a sample of the faux sandstone wall well in advance of the installation.
3. Resolve the joining of the two fence styles.
4. There is concern with traffic on the bridge and the effect on the liveability of the neighborhood.
5. Provide detailing of the spacing for the planting of the larger landscape material.
6. Provide detailing for the varying of the horizontal rail spacings on the bridge rail.
7. Provide detailing of the placement of the street light fixture on Kimberly Avenue to be out of view of the Mason Street-State Street style fixtures.

Action: Winick/Boucher, 5/3/0. (Drury/Shallanberger/Sharpe opposed. La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:47 P.M. TO 2:53 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****3. MISSION CREEK**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-012  
 Application Number: MST2008-00360  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Jon Frye, County Flood Control  
 Applicant: John Ilasin, Project Engineer

(Proposal to widen Mission Creek between Cabrillo Boulevard and Highway 101 and replace existing bridges. This is part of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. Bridges are to be reviewed under separate Master Applications. Reach 1A (phase 1) creek widening between Cabrillo Boulevard and W. Mason Street is complete. Reach 1A (phase 2) creek widening is part of the Mason Street Bridge Replacement project (MST2010-00261). Reach 1B is located between W. Mason Street and W. Yanonali Street.)

**(Involves Reach 1B to widen the creek channel between Yanonali and Mason Streets and will include the construction of channel walls, expanded habitat zone, rip-rap revetments, ornamental fencing, and landscaping. Reconfiguration of parking spaces on 135 Kimberly Ave. is also proposed. The project received Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit and requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 036-08.)**

Actual time: 2:53

Present: John Ilasin, Project Engineer  
 Matthew Griffin, Project Manager, County Flood Control  
 Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the parking area's purpose and the possibility of providing landscaping in that area, and fading the fence into the landscaping as much as possible.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

- Motion: Project Design Approval of Reach 1B with the following comments and conditions:**
1. The project is supportable.
  2. Coordinate this project with the bridge project known as the Mason Street Bridge Replacement Project, especially with respect to creek vegetation, wall material and fence material.
  3. Provide a landscape plan for the parking lot.
  4. Study permeable paving in the parking lot.
  5. Provide more sections of the creek on the plans.
  6. If possible, provide samples of the faux sandstone wall prior to final approval.
  7. Resolve the requirements for stormwater management.
  8. Strive for graffiti-resistant surfaces.
  9. Provide the species and photographs of the tree to be removed.
  10. Provide locations and photographs of light fixtures to be relocated.
- Action: Winick/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FORM 3:34 P.M. TO 3:33 P.M. \*\***

### **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

4. **1117 STATE ST** C-2 Zone  
 (3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030  
 Application Number: MST2012-00256  
 Owner: 1129 State Street  
 Applicant: Richard Six

(Proposal to demolish the existing façade and construction of a new façade on the State Street elevation including a 231 square foot addition and exterior alterations to include a new roof, window, wood corbels, plaster moldings and wrought iron work to an existing commercial building.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on December 5, 2012.)**

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, Architect

- Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals, and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details:**
1. The project is supportable.
  2. The simplicity of the rear elevation is appreciated.
  3. Resolve the architectural projection that crosses the property line.
  4. Try to get a single piece of honed limestone to avoid joints on the face of the pilasters.
  5. On detail 16, Sheet A4.0, raise the decorative finial above the adjoining surface.
- Action: O'rias/Boucher, 8/0/0. (La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****5. 336 W CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-091-012  
 Application Number: MST2013-00050  
 Owner: El Patio Beachside Inn, Inc.  
 Architect: Tai Yeh

(Proposal for alterations to the rear elevation of an existing three-story hotel. The work will include three new pairs of French doors and a new elevator tower, and the conversion of existing interior floor area to eight new guest rooms. There are 92 existing parking spaces with a parking requirement of 69 spaces. The site is a Designated Site of Merit.)

**(Comments Only; Project Requires Environmental Assessment and Coastal Review.)**

Actual time: 3:58 p.m.

Present: Tai Yeh, Architect

It was clarified that the site is significant archaeologically; yet, the building itself is not significant in the historic sense.

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:**

1. The French doors are an improvement to the rear elevation.
2. The filling-in of the existing mechanical door is appreciated.
3. Study adding some landscaping to mitigate the elevator tower.
4. Research the permitting of the existing mechanical equipment on the rooftop.

Action: Winick/Orías, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)****CONTINUED ITEM****A. 2020 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA STE 125**

SP-7 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-163-004  
 Application Number: MST2013-00035  
 Owner: Michael Towbes, LLC  
 Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal to increase the height of an existing parapet wall by 20 inches and an adjacent lower parapet wall by 28" at the southeast corner of Ebbetts Hall to create a rooftop deck. The project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer for a zoning modification. This property is currently developed within the Riviera Campus Historic District and is a Designated City Landmark: "Furse Hall, Quadrangle Buildings, Ebbets Hall, and Grand Stair.")

**(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)**

**Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:**

1. The proposed project improves the existing condition of the building by making the building more usable and flexible.
2. The insignificant increase in parapet height will have minimal visual impact and will not be noticed.

**CONTINUED ITEM****B. 410 W SOLA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-051-010  
Application Number: MST2013-00037  
Owner: Veronica Gray  
Applicant: REC Solar

(Proposal to install a 3.43 kw photovoltaic roof-mounted solar energy system. A total of 14 solar panels are proposed.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**Continued indefinitely for applicant to return with a solution parallel with the roof surface and less visible.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****C. 902 CHAPALA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019  
Application Number: MST2012-00217  
Owner: Cynthia D. Howard Gift Trust  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP  
Business Name: Charles Schwab

(Proposal to reconfigure an existing parking lot including repaving approximately 400 square feet and restriping 22 parking spaces. Also proposed is new parking lot landscaping and the relocation of a trash enclosure. A waiver of 5'-0" wide planters along the north and east perimeters is requested. This parcel is located in the 100% parking Zone of Benefit. Building façade changes were approved under separate application MST2012-00149. A parking waiver is requested.)

**(Review After Final of backflow device screening at the southwest corner of the parcel.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****D. 416 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-023  
Application Number: MST2013-00061  
Owner: Hughes Land Holding  
Agent: Sherry & Associates  
Business Name: Killer Shrimp

(Proposal for dining furniture to be placed in the existing front and rear patios, built-in booth seating in the rear patio, new trash enclosure, and parking lot restriping.)

**Continued two weeks for revised scope of work to include new trash enclosure and parking lot restriping.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****E. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2007-00140  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
Architect: Gensler  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in Cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath Cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

**(Review After Final to change height of pool enclosure to satisfy County of Santa Barbara Environmental Health Services regulations.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:19 P.M. \*\***