



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 2, 2013 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present at 1:38 p.m.
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
- BARRY WINICK – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:39 p.m.
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie; Orías, Sharpe (at 1:38 p.m.), Suding, and Winick.
Members absent: Murray, Shallanberger and Winick.
Staff present: Limón (until 1:39 p.m.), Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There will be an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, January 9, 2013, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street, 2nd Floor.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

None.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 5, 2012.

Motion: To postpone the review and approval of the December 5, 2012, draft minutes to the next meeting at staff's request.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger/Sharpe/Winick absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Murray and Winick would be absent from the meeting.
2. Jaime Limón and Heather Widen (Baker) presented a memo with highlights of the Five-Year City's Historic Preservation Work Program, including the implementation of the Historic Resources Element, that will be presented to the City Council at a later date. The Commission will be given an opportunity to provide input at the January 16, 2013, HLC meeting as a discussion item.
3. Mr. Limón announced that the election of Chair and Vice-Chair would be conducted at the next HLC meeting due to the Full Commission not being present.
4. Mr. Limón announced that ethics and efficiency training will be scheduled during a meeting when the Full Commission is expected to attend.
5. Commissioner Orías requested an update on the Eucalyptus trees at the El Encanto Hotel that were removed for emergency purposes.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

None.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:39 P.M. TO 1:41 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**1. 1130 N MILPAS ST**

E-1/R-3 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: Steve Carter
 Landscape Architect: Van Atta Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Review of Rudolf C. Ziesenhenné Memorial Begonia Garden commemorative plaque per Planning Commission Resolution No. 015-12 condition. The Historic Resources Report was accepted August 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 1:41 p.m.

Present: Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect, Van Atta Associates
 Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS
 Steve Carter, Architect, DesignARC Architects

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the tree species shown on the plaque did not resemble the purposed plant material.

Public comment closed at 1:47 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The graphic should be a Begonia or Begonia flower instead of the Oak tree.
2. Clarify the purpose of the date range. It was suggested that the location within the plaque be changed so that Rudolf C. Ziesenhenné's lifespan is shown after his name.
3. The plaque should mention something relating to Ziesenhenné's cultivation of begonias and that there was a greenhouse located on the site.
4. Include more descriptive and complete text on the plaque.
5. Photographs need to be incorporated onto the site per the 2005 Historic Resources/Sites Report.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 2121 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003
 Application Number: MST2012-00470
 Owner: Steve Handleman
 Architect: Thomas Ochsner
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for a minor addition and alterations to an existing, 6,752 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, detached garage, and detached accessory building. The proposal includes a 128 square foot addition to an existing 500 square foot storage structure to be converted to a one-story, three-car detached garage. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 749 square foot garage to a 276 square foot covered patio, a 473 square foot swimming pool pavilion and a 27 square foot equipment enclosure. Additional improvements on this 25,500 square foot parcel will be a new swimming pool, relocated driveway with new vehicular entry gate, new pedestrian gate, new site walls, and landscape plan. The proposed floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be .27, or 146% of the guideline maximum FAR. Total square footage on site will be 6,907 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for zoning modifications. This proposal will address violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-00425 including conversion of a storage building to habitable space and removal of illegal structures. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "the Olives Brinkerhoff-Fenzi House."**)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only, project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings. Project was last reviewed December 19, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:04 p.m.

Present: Thomas Ochsner, Architect, Tom Ochsner, Jr. AIA
 Derrik Eichelberger, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the Olive tree's historic significance, visibility of the house from the street, and possible removal of the hedge.

Public comment closed at 2:17 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Encourage designation of this structure.
2. There is general support for the project, including the revised pedestrian walkway gate.
3. Keep the house visible by not planting a hedge that would exceed the allowable height. Study making the pedestrian experience pleasant, to encourage walking within the neighborhood.
4. Return with a plan showing the structures located at the adjacent properties.
5. Provide a detail of the pergola arbor located on the south side as to whether the material will be vegetation, wood or steel.
6. Investigate the provenance of the Olive tree.
7. Propagation of the existing Olive tree is encouraged.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe stepped down. Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.)

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 2786 PUESTA DEL SOL** E-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-223-038

Staff: Nicole Hernández

(The Commission is requested to place the structure located at 2786 Puesta del Sol on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Actual time: 2:29

Staff comments: Ms. Hernández commented that it was built in the 1920s within 1000 feet of El Pueblo Viejo II. The building appears to retain integrity in materials, design, setting and feeling and qualifies as a Potential Historic Resource. The building should have an Historic Structures/Sites Report for any major alterations or additions; therefore, the project proposed to alter front windows would require an HSSR or Commission approval. Placing the structure of the City's List of Potential Historic Resources would place it under the Commission's purview.

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept Staff's recommendation of placing the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Suding opposed because the HLC did not have the benefit of the appointed Architectural Historian's input. Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**4. 2786 PUESTA DEL SOL** E-3 Zone

(2:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-223-038

Application Number: MST2012-00473

Owner: Mike & Elizabeth Challen

Designer: Chris Belanger

(Proposal to remove an existing rear porch, construct a new 107 square foot first story addition, construct a new rear deck, window alterations and an interior remodel to an existing 3454 square foot two-story single family residence with a detached 819 square foot three-car garage.)

(Building has been determined to qualify as a Potential Historic Resource.)

Actual time: 2:36

Present: Chris Belanger, Designer, Chris Belanger Residential Design

Public comment opened at 2:43 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The flat roof on the south, north and east elevation is acceptable.
2. The north elevation needs reworking and refining.
3. Pull back the addition at least one foot from the corner of the existing house as per Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
4. Differentiate between the old and new.
5. The south elevation needs to read more like an Eastern style enclosure.
6. Bring glazing all the way down to the window sill at the existing front porch.
7. Investigate retaining the chimney on the rear if structurally possible.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.)

FINAL REVIEW HEARING – Referred from the Consent Calendar**5. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone****(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009

Application Number: MST2011-00174

Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation

Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.)

(Final Approval of the project details is requested. Project was last reviewed by the Full Board on December 19, 2012, and continued to the Consent Calendar.)

Actual time: 3:02

Present: Dawn Sophia Ziemer, Associate Architect, KBZ Architects
Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on unnecessary increase in lighting.

Trevor Martinson, local architect, commented against contemporary lighting and the need to retain 1920s style lighting.

Public comment closed at 3:16 p.m.

Commissioner Sharpe requested a mock-up of any proposed sign lighting which would return to the Full Board as a Review After Final.

Motion: Final Approval of details with the exception of the lighting proposed in the eave located on the façade above the signage that identifies the structure as the "Lobero Theatre."

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger/Winick absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
Application Number: MST2011-00174
Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.)

(Final Approval of the project details is requested. Project was last reviewed on December 19, 2012.)

Referred to the Full Board as an added Item 5.

NEW ITEM**B. 109 W MASON ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-011
Application Number: MST2011-00321
Owner: 109 West Mason Street, LLC
Architect: Gil Barry

(Proposal for "as-built" replacement of windows and doors, "as-built" deck on second floor, "as-built" conversion of a motel office to a bedroom, new plastered archway at existing stairs, "as-built" site walls and gates, "as-built" interior alterations and two new proposed balconies to an existing two-story twelve (12) unit apartment building. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-00869.)

(The building is a contributing property to a Potential Historic District.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 641 POR LA MAR CIR B R-3/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-410-032
Application Number: MST2012-00484
Owner: Mikhail A. Rakov
Architect: Bryan Pollard

(Proposal to enclose existing 146 square foot second story balcony and add one skylight.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 902 LAGUNA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-013
Application Number: MST2012-00487
Owner: Blood Systems Inc.
Applicant: Windward Engineering

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations consisting of replacing two garage doors, replacing a single door with a double French door, relocating one existing door, adding two new windows, adding two van accessible parking spaces.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheets A202 and A501 with the condition that windows shall match existing Metalcorp windows.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:28 P.M. ****