



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, December 19, 2012 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 3:38 p.m. and again at 3:42 p.m.  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 3:40 p.m.  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 3:40 p.m.  
MICHAEL DRURY  
WILLIAM LA VOIE  
FERMINA MURRAY – Present until 3:40 p.m.  
JUDY ORÍAS  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 1:38 p.m.  
BARRY WINICK

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Present until 3:35 p.m.

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:40 p.m.  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

### CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

### ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher (until 3:40 p.m.), Drury, La Voie; Murray (until 3:40 p.m.), Orías, Shallanberger (at 1:38 p.m.), Sharpe (until 3:40 p.m.), Suding (until 3:38 p.m. and again at 3:42 p.m.), and Winick.

Others present: Larson (until 3:35 p.m.)

Staff present: Limón (until 3:40 p.m.), Hernández and Feliciano.

### GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 5, 2012.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 5, 2012, as amended.**

Action : La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.**

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Hernández announced that three Eucalyptus trees located at the El Encanto Hotel site were removed for emergency purposes. Chair Suding and Commissioner Orías stated that there should be a replacement for the loss of those significant skyline trees.

2. Mr. Limón spoke on Staff preparation of Ordinance amendments to historic districts. Two meetings have been scheduled in January 2013 with the City Council Ordinance Committee.

The Staff report for the City Council will identify the City's Work Program for the Community Development Department for the next four years and includes moving the historic district designation process forward.

3. Mr. Limón announced that a new audio system will be installed in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room over the holiday closure.

4. Commissioners Boucher, Murray and Sharpe announced they would be stepping down from Item 6, 2121 Garden Street.

5. Commissioners La Voie and Winick announced they would be absent from the January 2, 2013, HLC meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Drury reported on the "stop" sign that Commissioner Orías had suggested to be placed near the Mason Street Bridge to assist in possible project cost reductions. The Public Works Department has responded that a "stop" sign at the proposed corner would not be supportable.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

1. **1709 OVERLOOK LANE**

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-192-016

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing at 2:00 p.m. on January 16, 2013, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the residence located at 1709 Overlook Lane.)

Time: 1:45 p.m.

Public comment opened at 1:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution 2012-04 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing on January 16, 2013, to consider recommending to City Council that the residence located at 1709 Overlook Lane be designated as City Landmarks, as determined to be eligible for designation.

Action: Orías/Shallanberger, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

#### **2. 112 W CABRILLO BLVD**

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-013

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing at 2:20 p.m. on January 16, 2013, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the Veteran's Memorial Building located at 112 W. Cabrillo Blvd.)

Time: 1:47 p.m.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from the County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission expressing support for the designation.

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Hillary Campbell, representing County Second District Supervisor Janet Wolf, expressed support for the designation.

Public comment closed at 1:48 p.m.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution 2012-05 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing on January 16, 2013, to consider recommending to City Council that the Veteran's Memorial Building located at 112 W. Cabrillo Blvd. be designated as City Landmarks, as determined to be eligible for designation.

Action: Sharpe/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

### **MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**

#### **3. 1129 STATE ST**

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public hearing at 2:40 p.m. on January 16, 2013, to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark Designation of the San Marcos Building located at 1129 State Street.)

Actual time: 1:49 p.m.

Public comment opened at 1:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion:** To adopt Resolution 2012-06 as an intention to hold a Public Hearing on January 16, 2013, to consider recommending to City Council that the San Marcos Building located at 1129 State Street be designated as City Landmarks, as determined to be eligible for designation.

**Action:** La Voie/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

#### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

#### **4. 1936 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001  
Application Number: MST2011-00167  
Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation  
Agent: Lucy Dinneen  
Applicant: Cadence Development  
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,500 square foot, 33 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

**(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on June 6, 2012.)**

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Fred Sweeney, Landscape Architect, spoke in support of the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with respect to the lack of a landscape plan and importance of well-travelled corner.

Public comment closed at 1:57 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposal with respect to the siting and architecture is appropriate.
2. Provide a landscape plan, paying particular attention to the landscaping along Mission and State Streets.
3. Thicken the parapet.
4. Restudy the placement and number of arches on the east elevation.

**Action:** La Voie/Boucher, 7/2/0. (Murray/Suding opposed.)

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:13 P.M. TO 2:20 P.M \*\***

**FINAL REVIEW****5. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009  
 Application Number: MST2011-00174  
 Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation  
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on December 5, 2012.)**

Actual time: 2:20 p.m.

Present: Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates  
 Dawn Sophia Ziemer, Associate Architect, KBZ Architects  
 Mat Gradias, Architect, KBZ Architects

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m.

Susan Chamberlin, Landscape Historian, expressed concerns with respect to the existing landscaping, particularly the brick hardscape.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concerns with respect to existing landscaping, hardscape and railings, and commented on the restoration of the landmark to its original historic appearance.

Public comment closed at 3:00 p.m.

Chair Suding summarized the following Commissioners' comments:

1. The lighting as proposed is much more acceptable and the applicant's effort is appreciated.
2. Elimination of the handrail orbs is appreciated.
3. Study the proposed light cut off of the sign light.
4. Avoid not lighting the full arch.
5. Study lighting of the poster case located on the corner of the building on Anacapa Street.
6. The changes at the front of the building are problematic for the Commission.

**Motion: Final Approval of the design and continued two weeks for details to the Consent Calendar with comments:**

1. Study the fixture type XR.
2. Study the lighting of the sign with the intent of the proposal to be washing the entire wall more and not specifically the sign.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 8/0/1. Motion carried. (Murray abstained.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****6. 2121 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003  
Application Number: MST2012-00470  
Owner: Steve Handleman  
Applicant: Thomas Ochsner Architect  
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for a minor addition and alterations to an existing, 6,752 square foot, three-story, single-family residence, detached garage, and detached accessory building. The proposal includes a 128 square foot addition to an existing 500 square foot storage structure to be converted to a one-story, three-car detached garage. Also proposed is the conversion of an existing 749 square foot garage to a 276 square foot covered patio, a 473 square foot swimming pool pavilion and a 27 square foot equipment enclosure. Additional improvements on this 25,500 square foot parcel will be a new swimming pool, relocated driveway with new vehicular entry gate, new pedestrian gate, new site walls, and landscape plan. The proposed floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) will be .27, or 146% of the guideline maximum FAR. Total square footage on site will be 6,907 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for zoning modifications. This proposal will address violations outlined in enforcement case ENF2012-00425 including conversion of a storage building to habitable space and removal of illegal structures. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "the Olives Brinkerhoff-Fenzi House."**)

**(Comments only, project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings.)**

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Thomas Ochsner, Architect, Tom Ochsner, Jr. AIA  
Derrick Eichelberger, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 3:58 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued to the January 2, 2013, meeting with comments:**

1. There is general support for the project.
2. The applicant's respect of the historic resource is greatly appreciated.
3. Applicant should provide a photograph of the Olive tree proposed to be removed, and provide a specific replacement and Arborist Report.
4. Provide footprints of adjoining structures for evaluation and modification support.
5. There is support for the modification to the South pergola structure and it was suggested using an iron support for the plant material.
6. There is tentative support for the side yard encroachments for the proposed garage reconversion in that the existing structure is being turned back to its original historic use.
7. Provide some simplification of the pedestrian entrance from Garden Street.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Sharpe stepped down. Boucher absent.)

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00):****FINAL REVIEW****A. 205 CHAPALA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070  
Application Number: MST2010-00263  
Owner/Applicant City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Applied EarthWorks, Inc.  
Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposal to replace the Chapala Street - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek. The replacement bridge would be a single-span bridge consisting of a combination of precast and cast-in-place concrete slab with asphalt concrete or polyester concrete overlay on the deck for the road surfacing. City standard sidewalks would be added to both sides of the street on the bridge and would tie into the existing sidewalks along Chapala and Yanonali Streets. New combination vehicular/pedestrian railings would be installed on each side of the bridge. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit to perform this work in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 003-12. Project was last reviewed on August 15, 2012.)**

**Final Approval with comment and condition:**

1. If a plaque sign is proposed facing Chapala Street, return with size graphics and materials.
2. The pole light material shall be changed to metal, tapered, in a green color.

**NEW ITEM****B. 215 E MISSION ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-323-009  
Application Number: MST2012-00455  
Owner: Gerrold & Barbara Rubin Trust  
Applicant: Souter Land Use Consulting  
Designer: Dexign Systems

(Proposal to permit a 400 square foot "as-built" accessory structure attached to an existing garage located in the required setbacks. Staff Hearing Officer review is required. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Driscoll House."**)

**(Comments only: Requires Staff Hearing Officer Review.)**

**Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the comment that the proposal is supportable.**

**NEW ITEM****C. 1424 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-072-020  
Application Number: MST2012-00467  
Owner: 22483 PCH II LP  
Owner: Bartlett Tree Experts  
Business Name: Merrill Lynch and Sotheby's

(Proposal to replace nine, 15'-20' foot tall, diseased Nerium Oleander trees with nine, 24-inch box sized Rhapsiolepis "Majestic Beauty" Indian Hawthorn trees. Five of the diseased trees are located along the exit drive on the south side of the building and four are located on the Anacapa Street frontage.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****D. 128 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004  
Application Number: MST2012-00430  
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties Ltd.  
Architect: Michael Patrick Porter Architect  
Business Name: C'est Cheese

(Proposal for entry door, window, and rooftop mechanical equipment changes.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the rooftop mechanical equipment shall not exceed the parapet height.**

**CONTINUED ITEM****E. 1033 ANACAPA ST (30 E FIGUEROA ST)****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-035  
Application Number: MST2012-00460  
Owner: Levon Investments, LLC  
Applicant: Paul Poirier + Associates  
Architect: Hoffman Vest Judaken  
Business Name: Pacific Western Bank

(Proposal to remove an existing window and install a new automatic teller machine, night depository, LED wall luminaire, and awning on an existing commercial building.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****F. 34 E MISSION ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-005  
 Application Number: MST2012-00305  
 Owner: Catherine Compieri  
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza  
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC

(Proposal for alterations to an existing single-family residence including the following: document the as-built enclosure of two second-floor sleeping porches done in the 1930's (one at 242 square feet and one at 322 square feet), convert the unpermitted enclosure of an 89 square foot second-floor sleeping porch back to unenclosed porch condition, construct a new pedestrian entry gate on the E. Mission Street elevation, and make window and architectural detail alterations. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2012-00269. This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Kinney House"** and was found to be **eligible for City Structure of Merit status and listing in The California Register of Historical Resources.**)

**(Review After Final of change to add a flat panel skylight on the west elevation.)**

**Approval of the Review After Final with the condition that the skylight shall be a dark bronze color.**

**NEW ITEM****G. 621 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-036  
 Application Number: MST2012-00479  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Victor Garza

(Proposal to permit an as-built security camera installed at the second-floor north elevation of Parking Lot #10.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****H. 1115 ANACAPA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-019  
 Application Number: MST2012-00480  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Victor Garza

(Proposal to install a new security camera on the fifth level east elevation of the elevator tower on Parking Lot #7.)

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:15 P.M. \*\***