



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 5, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe, Suding (until 2:41 p.m. and again at 2:47 p.m.), and Winick.

Others present: Larson (until 2:58 p.m.)

Staff present: Hernández, Gantz and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 7, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 7, 2012.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 7/0/2. Motion carried. (Orías/Shallanberger abstained.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried. (La Voie abstained from Item F; Suding abstained from Items F and G.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down from items 2 and 3 at 836 Bath Street and 720 De La Vina Street, respectively.
2. Chair Suding announced that Barry Berkus and Robert Maxim had passed away and expressed condolences to their families.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported he and Commissioner Shallanberger conducted separate site visits to review the sample concrete and siding color for the Mission Creek bypass culvert project at the Railroad Train Station.

Commissioner Drury reported he and Commissioner Orías recently attended a Mason Street Bridge Railing Design *Ad hoc* Subcommittee meeting that was held with the Public Works Department.

Commissioner Murray reported on the Designations Subcommittee meeting that met in the morning with staff. She acknowledged local resident and historian Mary Louise Day's contribution to the revisions made to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **32 E ISLAY ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-005
 Application Number: MST2012-00440
 Owner: Arthur Denk
 Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal to construct a 275 square foot one-story addition and a new 460 square foot two-story addition to an existing one-story 1,470 square foot single-family residence. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing, detached, 270 square foot one-car garage and construction of a new attached 280 square foot one-car garage. A new 190 square foot second-floor deck is proposed. The proposed total of 2,485 square feet, located on a 6,080 square foot lot, is 92% of the required floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR). The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Actual time: 1:42 p.m.

Present: Paul Zink, Architect

Public comment was opened at 1:44 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, as the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required. The standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources will apply and shall be printed on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. **836 BATH ST**

R-4 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-001
 Application Number: MST2012-00385
 Owner: Arthur Louie
 Agent: Post/Hazeltine Associates
 Architect: ACME Architecture

(Proposal for a two-unit subdivision to include the following: demolish two detached single-car garages, a 383 square foot, one-bedroom cottage, an attached 102 square foot service porch, and two detached storage sheds. Structurally upgrade an existing three-bedroom, one-story house and foundation and replace windows and roof. Construct a new attached two-story, three-bedroom dwelling unit and two attached two-car garages to create a two-unit condominium. Also proposed is associated new landscaping and paving. Staff Hearing Officer review is required. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Residence: Constructed in 1912."**)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report found the residence to be eligible for Structure of Merit status.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, commented that staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State of California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines of the City's Master Environmental Assessment.

Public comment was opened at 1:45 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with the comment that the report is well prepared.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe stepped down.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 720 DE LA VINA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-017
Application Number: MST2012-00277
Owner: SHGC Property LP
Architect: Steve Harrel

(Proposal for a two-story mixed-use development comprising the following: conversion of an existing one-story duplex to a partial two-story, 500 square foot commercial building including demolition of 360 square feet of floor area, demolish an existing 486 square foot detached studio, construct a 620 square foot ground level studio apartment, a 789 square foot, second-floor, 1-bedroom apartment, a 613 square foot, second-floor, 1-bedroom apartment, three covered parking spaces, and one accessible parking space. Total development on site will be 2,354 square feet. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** as **eligible for City Structure of Merit status.**)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 7, 2012.)

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Steve Harrel, Architect

Public comment was opened at 1:59 p.m.

Mike Gilson, adjoining property owner, expressed support for the project and made suggestions.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with conditions:

1. The street front of the second-story roofline shall match that of the existing structure's tropical gable.
2. The bracket at the "bridge" should be at a 45 degree angle with a higher spring line.
3. The reference to artificial turf shall be removed from drawings.
4. The plant material in the bioswale shall be reconsidered by a professional landscape architect

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe stepped down.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**4. 1117 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030
Application Number: MST2012-00256
Owner: 1129 State Street
Applicant: Richard Six

(Proposal to demolish the existing façade and construction of a new façade on the State Street elevation including a 231 square foot addition and exterior alterations to include a new roof, window, wood corbels, plaster moldings and wrought iron work to an existing commercial building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on July 18, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:14 p.m.

Present: Richard Six, Architect

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The Commission is in support of the project.
2. The roof pitch in the center section should be a lower slope. The parapet at the top of the roof should be expressed in plaster, more like the original proposal.
3. The Commission accepts the height of the sill across the front elevation.
4. The eave line on the upper roof plane should be as low as possible and closer to the tops of the windows.
5. Study changing the false chimney to a real buttress.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:34 P.M. TO 2:41 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 1236 GARDEN ST**

R-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-001
Application Number: MST2011-00258
Owner: Timothy Dewar
Applicant: Thompson Naylor

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,071 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes conversion of a 419 square foot attic space to habitable floor area, demolition of a 67 square foot enclosed rear porch and existing 171 square foot detached single-car garage, construction of a new 286 square foot attached one-car garage and storage space, addition of 48 square feet to the main floor, new dormer windows on the north and south elevations, two new skylights, one relocated window and one new window on the ground floor, removal of a tree within the front setback, and new landscaping. The total floor area on this 3,769 square foot parcel will be 1,767 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is required for the new garage and new second-story dormer to encroach into the interior yard setback and to reduce the non-conforming open yard area. The floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) will be .47, or 81% of the maximum FAR. The house is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is **eligible for Structure of Merit status: "Colonial Revival hybrid circa 1899."**)

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 050-12. Project was last reviewed on August 15, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:41 p.m.

Present: Dennis Thompson, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects
Tim Dewar and Sherri Bryan, Owners

Public comment was opened at 2:42 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that the applicant shall comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 050-12, which requires photo documentation using the City of Santa Barbara Community Development Department's "Required Documentation Prior to Demolition" recordation standards prior to building permit issuance.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the direction to Staff to begin the process of designating the building as a Structure of Merit.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
Application Number: MST2012-00462
Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects
Business Name: Lobero Theatre

(Proposal to lower 390 square feet of the Scene Shop building roof at the northwest corner of the parcel to accommodate new roof-mounted mechanical equipment. A new parapet wall will be constructed on the south side of the equipment well in order the screen the equipment from view, and a new rooftop access hatch is also proposed. This is a designated **City Landmark: "Lobero Theatre."**)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires Historic Resource Findings and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark.)

Actual time: 2:48 p.m.

Present: Joe Wilcox, Architect, KBZ Architects
Michael Bech, Architect, KBZ Architect

Public comment was opened at 2:51 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the following comment and findings made:

1. The proposal does not impact public view of the historic structure.
2. **Historic Resource Findings:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.
3. **Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark."

Action: Winick/Orías, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**7. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
 Application Number: MST2011-00174
 Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
 Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on November 7, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:57 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sophia Ziemer, Associate Architect, KBZ Architects
 Ann Kale, Lighting Designer, Ann Kale Associates
 Mat Gradias, Architect, KBZ Architects

Public comment was opened at 3:19 p.m.

Susan Chamberlin, local landscape historian, spoke against any possible obstruction of historic views from the street.

Public comment closed at 3:21 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. The Commission may need to proceed with the benefit of a focused study for lighting if existing lighting is proposed to be changed in either location or shape.
2. Rebulbing/relamping changes are supportable.
3. The stepped light pole for the pole fixture is preferable. Study using a treble clef as a base; if not, use the kiosk base.
4. Too many fixtures are being proposed.
5. The foyer fixture placement or shape should not be changed.
6. Lighting in the foyer shall point upward as well as downward.
7. The pendant in the foyer should be inspired by the other two fixtures in the foyer.
8. Restudy signage lighting.
9. Too much landscape lighting is being proposed.
10. Exposed conduits on trees or in landscape is not allowed.
11. Consider safety when placing landscape lighting
12. Pendant lights should be hung from the beams of the pergola.
13. Handrail details are acceptable with the exception of the terminations that are to be coordinated with the Building and Safety Division.

14. When studying the lighting, strongly consider the overall amount and value of light.
15. Consider skateboard use as it relates to handrail design.
16. Use flame shaped bulbs only in an upright position.

Action: Orías/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

NEW ITEM

A. 128 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
 Application Number: MST2012-00430
 Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties Ltd.
 Architect: Michael Patrick Porter Architect
 Business Name: C'est Cheese

(Proposal for entry door, window, and rooftop mechanical equipment changes.)

Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Design windows at west elevation to match front elevations.
2. Provide mechanical equipment sections for roof equipment.
3. Colors and door hardware acceptable if twisted handle is proposed.

CONTINUED ITEM

B. 1000 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-014
 Application Number: MST2012-00413
 Owner: Quincy 1000 Associates, LP
 Architect: Edwards & Pitman Architects
 Business Name: Bank of Montecito

(This is a revised project description. Proposed replacement of main entrance window, frame, trim, wood detailing, and entry door. Pair of entry doors to be replaced with accessible single-entry, steel door with pivots and floor closer. Window to be replaced like-for-like in the existing opening. All details to match existing. Wood windows and frames to match existing materials and color. Glazing to be replaced by laminated glass having a U-factor of .77 or less. This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Bank of Montecito."**)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 924 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-024
 Application Number: MST2012-00426
 Owner: Michael Rizor
 Applicant: Eric Voulgaris
 Business Name: Rooms & Gardens

(Proposal to repaint all wood trim on an existing storefront.)

Continued indefinitely to Design Review Supervisor.

NEW ITEM**D. 135 E ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-121-011
 Application Number: MST2012-00452
 Owner: Sourmany 2006 Revocable Trust
 Architect: Hugh Twibell

(Proposal to replace an existing glass front entry door with a new aluminum and glass door and to replace the existing wood rear entry door with a new steel clad door without glazing. These doors are being replaced to meet ADA standards.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the front entry shall be bronze anodized aluminum and rear door shall match the existing door color.

NEW ITEM**E. 1033 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-035
 Application Number: MST2012-00460
 Owner: Levon Investments, LLC
 Applicant: Paul Poirier + Associates
 Architect: Hoffman Vest Judaken
 Business Name: Pacific Western Bank

(Proposal to remove an existing window and install a new automatic teller machine, night depository, LED wall luminaire, and awning on an existing commercial building.)

Continued two weeks for applicant to return with approvable colors and to recess the units into the building as far as possible, realizing there are ADA standards to be followed.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 101 E CABRILLO BLVD HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-004
 Application Number: MST2010-00135
 Owner: Anthony Schrippo Trust
 Designer: SkyeLine Construction
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects
 Business Name: Santa Barbara FisHouse

(Proposal for exterior alterations including the removal of 416 square feet of an existing planter on the west elevation (Anacapa Street), and construction of a new 345 square foot dining patio. Also proposed is the reconfiguration of the parking lot to increase parking by three spaces, outdoor dining furniture, a new entry door, four new windows, and a new trash enclosure. A zoning modification has been approved to allow the seating area, door, windows, and parking space in the front yard setback.)

(Review After Final of changes to landscaping, bike rack, and parkway pavers.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**G. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
Application Number: MST2008-00313
Owner: Richard Gunner
Applicant: Michael Gunner
Architect: William La Voie
Architect: Marks Bloxom Architects, Inc.
Landscape Architect: Suding Design
Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal for alterations to an existing four-story, 43,354 square foot Santa Barbara Inn hotel. The project will consist of the following: change the exterior facade design, enlarge the main entry, remove and relocate two units, relocate existing bar and restaurant, relocate existing hotel rooms, replace existing swimming pool and spa, remove existing equipment shed and replace it with a new, partial below-ground vault, redesign the landscape and hardscape, remove the entry area drive and two curb cuts and replace with landscaping, install new sidewalk on the Milpas Street side, and repave and landscape the parking area. The net increase in new floor area is 492 square feet; however, there is a net decrease of 1,082 square feet of Measure E floor area. The project will result in a 43,191 square foot structure. The architectural design has been revised from the original project design which received Preliminary Approval under application MST2004-00052.)

(Review After Final of the following changes to the approved project: add two ramps inside the parking garage; revise entry at the Milpas Street garage; add glass behind arched openings at two locations; narrow columns at the parking garage; relocate trash enclosure; add a transformer; add a roll-up door at pool equipment room; and clarify proposed roof tile material.)

Approval of Review After Final with comments:

1. Trash enclosure to be resolved by the Design Review Supervisor.
2. The trash enclosure doors and bollards shall be dark brown.
3. The Milpas Street entry arch shall be as deep as possible.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:01 P.M. ****