



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 24, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Present at 1:40 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Drury, Murray and Shallenberger.

Staff present: Limón (until 1:45 p.m. and 3:00 p.m. to 3:48 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:30 p.m.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 10, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 10, 2012.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 3/0/3. Motion carried. (La Voie/Sharpe/Winick abstained. Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Orías/Winick, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down on Item A. Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Drury, Murray and Shallanberger would be absent.
2. Ms. Hernández announced the Landmark designations of the Main Central Library, Faulkner Gallery, and five of the *Corymbia (Eucalyptus) citriodora* trees.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:35 P.M. TO 1:36 P.M. ****

3. Commissioner Sharpe announced he would be stepping down from Item 6, 601 E. Micheltorena Street.
4. Chair Suding announced he attended the joint Planning Commission/City Council Work Session that was held at 9:00 a.m. today.
5. Mr. Limón made the following announcement and request:
 - a) The City Attorney and Community Development Director are planning additional Code of Conduct training for City-wide board and commission members.
 - b) The Commission was asked to inform Staff ahead of time when they must leave early or step down from an item.
6. Commissioner Orías requested a copy of the final version of the Historic Resources Element that was adopted by the City Council recently.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Ms. Hernández reported on the October 17 meeting of the Designations Subcommittee.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 35 ANACAPA ST / 36 E MASON ST** OC/SD-3 Zone

(1:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-112-002
 Application Number: MST2012-00379
 Owner: Joan Rand Moschovakis, Co-Trustee
 Applicant: Jorge Matos

(Proposal for soil remediation on an approximately 22,000 square foot vacant lot. The project includes excavation of 600 cubic yards of contaminated soil and import of clean fill material.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Actual time: 1:45 p.m.

Present: Jorge Matos, Applicant, L. Everett & Associates

Public comment was opened at 1:46 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that because the proposed project would not have the potential for encountering unknown, potentially significant archaeological resources in this location, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources will apply and shall be printed the on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Orías, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 00 E CABRILLO BLVD** P-R/SD-3 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
 Application Number: MST2004-00878
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant
 Agent: Applied EarthWorks Inc.
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(This is a revised project. The original Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge project was approved by the Planning Commission and Historic Landmarks Commission. The revised proposal involves the relocation of the beachway component of the bridge. The proposed bridge is to be a stand-alone bridge approximately 59 feet to the south of the originally-approved location. The beachway bridge width dimension would change from 18.5 feet wide to approximately 14 feet wide. The proposed 148 foot long beachway (pedestrian/bicycle) bridge would replace the approved temporary beachway bridge. The relocated beachway bridge would also provide room for the harbor dredge pipeline underneath.)

(Review of Addendum to the Supplemental Historic Properties Survey Report prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc. Original report was accepted by the Historic Landmarks Commission on December 13, 2006.)

Actual time: 1:47 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Applicant
Coleen Hamilton, Historical Consultant, Applied EarthWorks Inc.

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines of the City's Master Environmental Assessment. Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, commented that the previously presented report was revised in response to previous HLC comments and the trees were addressed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with regret that the lighting has not been determined.

Action: Orías/La Voie, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

3. 00 E CABRILLO BLVD

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
Application Number: MST2004-00878
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jessica Grant
Agent: Applied EarthWorks Inc.
Landscape Architect: David Black

(This is a revised project. The original Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge project was approved by the Planning Commission and Historic Landmarks Commission. The revised proposal involves the relocation of the beachway component of the bridge. The proposed bridge is to be a stand-alone bridge approximately 59 feet to the south of the originally-approved location. The beachway bridge width dimension would change from 18.5 feet wide to approximately 14 feet wide. The proposed 148 foot long beachway (pedestrian/bicycle) bridge would replace the approved temporary beachway bridge. The relocated beachway bridge would also provide room for the harbor dredge pipeline underneath.)

(Review After Final of changes to beachway bridge location and rail. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-07. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on October 10, 2012.)

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Applicant
David Black, Landscape Architect, David Black & Associates
Scott Onishuk, Principal, Bengal Engineering

Public comment opened at 2:05 p.m.

Virginia Castagnola-Hunter, neighborly property owner, commented on heaviness of proposed materials and possibly distracting from ocean view.

Public comment closed at 2:06 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would support iron rail and pickets? 4/2. (Sharpe/Suding opposed.)

How many Commissioners would support wood rail and pickets 2/4. (La Voie/Orias/Sharpe/Winick opposed.)

How many Commissioners would support horizontal rails? 0/6.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:

1. The project design as proposed is supportable.
2. The majority support vertical rails.
3. Add plinths at end of each span similar to the Sycamore Creek Bridge.
4. Introduce a camber in the profile that is applicable under current code with maximum height not to exceed 24 inches.
5. Applicant stated that lighting would be discussed at a future HLC meeting.

Action: La Voie/Winick, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Orias/Suding opposed. Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:33 P.M. TO 2:37 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

4. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST

C-2 Zone

(2:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009

Application Number: MST2011-00174

Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation

Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for the following exterior alterations: Remove 4,650 square feet of existing brick paving for reuse with new brick in a new hardscape design, add 241 square feet of new brick paving, and construct new stairs, walkways, and ramps for ADA compliance at various locations around the building. The public sidewalks along E. Cañón Perdido and Anacapa Streets will be replaced. Two existing olive trees will be replaced with Carob trees and the landscaped areas along the streets will be simplified to more accurately represent the original landscape design. New planters at the Anacapa Street lawn areas will provide more effective storm water treatment. Also proposed is new rooftop HVAC equipment which will require a 7'-4" tall plaster parapet wall over the existing Green Room roof. Minimal lighting will be added at the proposed entry stair and Esplanade, and existing exterior sconces will be re-lamped and refurbished. This proposed work affects Assessor Parcel Numbers 039-322-009 & 039-322-038.)

(Project Design Approval of the project is requested. Project requires, Historic Resource Findings and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark. Project was last reviewed on July 18, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:37 p.m.

Present: Joe Wilcox, Principal Architect, KBZ Architects
Dawn Sophia Ziemer, Associate Architect, KBZ Architects
Mat Gradias, Architect, KBZ Architects

Public comment opened at 2:52 p.m.

Bonnie Elliott, local resident, commented on ADA accessibility.

Public comment closed at 2:54 p.m.

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and continued two weeks with findings and comments:**
1. **Alterations to a City Landmark Findings were made as follows:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.
 2. The design is acceptable and supportable.
 3. Use existing brick to the extent possible for the entire esplanade.
 4. Sand struck moulded brick is preferred.
 5. Keep the handrail detailing simple, but not plain. Top twist or picket is supportable, no finial.
 6. Avoid the use of a ball finial running down the length.
 7. There shall be a vertical post for the handrail on each tread, rather than every other tread.
 8. The lamp post on top of the wall is acceptable, but provide a better base than what is proposed.
 9. Continue studying the lighting while avoiding step lighting on the risers.
 10. The Commission supports the “no cheek wall” alternative on the steps.
- Action: Orías/Boucher, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

PRESENTATION ITEM

5. **MISSION HISTORICAL PARK** A-F/SD-3 Zone
 (3:00) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 025-140-022
 Presenter: Santos Escobar, Parks Manager
 (Recently completed repairs to the Mission Aqueduct wall above A.C. Postel Memorial Rose Garden.)

Actual time: 3:05 p.m.

Present: Santos Escobar, Parks Manager
 Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor

Public comment opened at 3:14 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local historian, commented on the need for permanent signs to keep visitors from damaging the wall and aqueduct. The aqueduct should be kept clear of debris.

Public comment closed at 3:17 p.m.

Presentation held. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

FINAL REVIEW**6. 601 E MICHELTORENA ST**

C-O Zone

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-270-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00827
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis LLP
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers

(The Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation Workforce Housing Project will remove the former St. Francis Hospital complex, including the main hospital, convent, central plant, and other ancillary structures and construct 115 residential condominiums that will cover approximately 5.94 acres of the 7.39 acre site. Eighty-one of the units will be sold to Cottage Hospital employees at prices within the City's structure for affordable units and 34 units will be sold at market rates. The project will provide approximately 265 parking spaces, including 254 parking spaces for the 115 condominium units and 11 spaces for the Villa Riviera facility. The project was approved by the Planning Commission on September 21, 2006 (Resolution No. 039-06), and by the City Council on December 19, 2006 (Resolution No. 06-103), and April 29, 2008 (Resolution No. 08-038).)

(Final review of plaques and photos proposed for St. Francis Hospital memorial area.)

Actual time: 3:17 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Cearnal Andrulaitis LLP

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local historian, commented that the St. Francis Hospital was not "Memorial Hospital."

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:24 P.M. TO 3:35 P.M. ****

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the following corrections:

1. Strike the word "Memorial" from all plaques where it pertains to St. Francis Hospital.
2. Correct the spelling from Hoffman to Hoffmann.
3. Correct the date of the earthquake to June 29, 1925.
4. Verify the correct spellings of the names Kirkhuff and Hutchason.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe stepped down. Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**7. 653 MISSION CANYON RD**

E-1 Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-272-002
 Application Number: MST2012-00363
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Edgar Sands

(Revised project. Foundation work no longer proposed. Proposal for repairs and alterations to an existing 2,343 square foot single-family residence. Demolition of an existing 60 square foot bathroom, enclosing a 104 square foot existing deck, repair and/or rebuild existing steps and railings, extend some of the decks, and alterations to existing doors and windows. The total square footage on this site will be 2,423 square feet on a 1.55 acre parcel. The guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) is .053 or 66% of the maximum FAR.)

(Request Final Approval of revised project with reduced scope of work.)

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Edgar Sands, Architect
 Trish Allen, Senior Planner, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:46 P.M. TO 3:55 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**8. 900 CHANNEL DR**

R-1/SD-3 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002
 Application Number: MST2011-00246
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association
 Applicant: Tricia Knight
 Architect: SAC Wireless

(Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 45 foot tall tower pole structure concealed as an artificial eucalyptus tree and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower inside a monopole. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification. This parcel contains a **City Landmark: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain."**)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Planning Commission review, and Findings of No Visual Impact. Project was last reviewed on October 10, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:55 p.m.

Present: Tricia Knight, Agent for Verizon Wireless

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments to the Planning Commission:

1. The Commission would like to make it clear to the Planning Commission that any future company that wishes to co-locate at this site shall present the proposal to the HLC for review.
2. In the future, this pole shall be removed if other installations supersede this pole's equipment.
3. The applicant has pursued a design in its simplicity to minimize the impacts of the installation. The monopole is the least intrusive.
4. A faux tree or artificial vines are not acceptable.
5. Graffiti-proof the wall to the extent possible. A vine on the wall may be the best graffiti solution, which would require a temporary water tank.
6. The applicant shall implement a maintenance program for graffiti removal during vine establishment.
7. All antennae need to be enclosed within the pole.
8. Increase the height of the wall to screen the equipment enclosed.
9. Eliminate the fenestration on the wall.
10. The color of the pole and wall will require HLC review.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design
 Engineer: Penfied & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes 114 hotel units, nine timeshare units, 21,654 square feet of commercial floor area, and 243 underground and on-grade parking spaces.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved crosswalk material and light fixtures on Helena Avenue. Project was last reviewed by the Full Board on September 26, 2012.)

Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**B. 132 W HALEY ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-162-009
 Application Number: MST2012-00242
 Owner: Warren Grimsley
 Architect: Lori Kari

(Proposal for minor additions and alterations to an existing 714 square foot single-family residence on a 2,161 square foot parcel. The scope of work includes the following: New 10 square foot addition on the original front porch and a new 34 square foot storage room, replace existing doors and window, new door in rear bedroom, new roof shingles, new light fixtures, and repaint exterior. The proposal also includes installation of 260 square feet of paving and abatement of violations through the demolition of other unpermitted work including floor area, a storage shed, two trellises, and skylights. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification. This is a **Structure of Merit: "Bungalow Triplet II"** and is located in the Brinkerhoff Landmark District.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 045-12. Project Design and Final Approval is requested.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

1. Fence height shall be lowered to 4'-0".
2. Top of fence shall be cut square, not dog-eared.
3. Fence shall be stained with a driftwood type color, not painted.
4. South and east windows in living room may be replaced, like-for-like with exact window details, including the lugs.

NEW ITEM**C. 607 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-021
 Application Number: MST2012-00393
 Owner: Pierce Partners
 Applicant: Shane Downs
 Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal for a new 47'-0" lineal foot, 6'-0" tall plaster wall with sandstone cap at the rear of an existing commercial building. The structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pierce Block."**)

Continued indefinitely to Staff.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:16 P.M. ****