



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, September 26, 2012 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.**

---

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 3:40 p.m. and again at 4:00 p.m.  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present  
FERMINA MURRAY – Absent  
JUDY ORÍAS – Present  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent  
BARRY WINICK – Present at 1:34 p.m.

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Present from 1:33 p.m. until 3:00 p.m.

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:54 p.m.  
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Project Planner/Urban Historian – Present until 3:30 p.m.  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website:** [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

#### CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

#### ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Murray and Shallanberger.

Staff present: Limón (until 1:54 p.m.), Hernández (until 3:30 pm.), Gantz, and Feliciano.

#### GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 12, 2012.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 12, 2012, with correction.

**Action:** La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

## C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.**

Action: Boucher/Winick, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

Commissioner Orías inquired whether alterations to a City Landmark should be reviewed by the full commission instead of being placed on the Consent Calendar.

Mr. Limón responded that consistent with the HLC's adopted meeting procedures, a proposal to alter a City Landmark can be reviewed on the Consent Calendar depending on the scale of the project. He explained that the reviewer of the Consent Calendar must make the required findings to approve but can refer the project to the full commission if there are concerns. Any Commissioner may ask the Consent Reviewer to provide a oral report of what the project entails during the full board meeting when the Consent Calendar is ratified.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Murray and Shallanberger would be absent.
- b) Chair Suding would be stepping down on Item 7, 35 State Street.
- c) The annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is in progress. The resignation deadline for current Commissioners who otherwise would not be at the end of their term is Wednesday, October 3, 2012. (This is in order for the position to be included in the current recruitment process.) The application deadline for new appointments is Friday, October 19, 2012, at 5:00 p.m. with interviews by the full City Council on Tuesday, October 30, 2012, at 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, November 13, 2012, at 6:00 p.m.; and Tuesday, November 20, 2012, at 4:00 p.m. New Board and Commission members will be appointed on Tuesday, December 11, 2012.

## 2. Commissioner Orías reminded the Commission that the City Council hearing of the Historic Resources Element document is scheduled for October 2, 2012.

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Winick reported on the joint Airport Commission, Architectural Board of Review and Visual Art in Public Places Committee's September 20 work session on the proposed public art "Marine Tribute" glass sculpture to be displayed at the Santa Barbara Airport Terminal.

Commissioner Sharpe requested that staff schedule a Design Awards Subcommittee meeting.

F. Request formation of an *ad hoc* subcommittee for the Public Works Mason Street Bridge Railing Design project.

John Ewasiuk, Principal Engineer, and John Ilasin, Project Engineer, requested the formation of an *ad hoc* subcommittee for discussion of innovative bridge rail alternatives. Mr. Ewasiuk provided an update on the City Council action and approval that occurred on July 17, 2012.

Commissioners Drury and Orías volunteered to participate.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****1. 1236 GARDEN ST**

R-3 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-001  
Application Number: MST2011-00258  
Owner: Timothy Dewar  
Applicant: Thompson Naylor Architects, Inc.

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing 1,071 square foot, one-story, single-family residence. The project includes conversion of a 419 square foot attic space to habitable floor area, demolition of a 67 square foot enclosed rear porch and existing 171 square foot detached single-car garage, construction of a new 286 square foot attached one-car garage and storage space, addition of 48 square feet to the main floor, new dormer windows on the north and south elevations, two new skylights, one relocated window and one new window on the ground floor, removal of a tree within the front setback, and new landscaping. The total floor area on this 3,769 square foot parcel will be 1,767 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review of zoning modifications is required for the new garage and new second-story dormer to encroach into the interior yard setback and to reduce the non-conforming open yard area. The floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio will be .47, or 81% of the maximum FAR. The house is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is **eligible for Structure of Merit status: "Colonial Revival hybrid circa 1899."**)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Ray Corbett.)**

Actual time: 1:44

Present: Tim Dewar and Sherri Bryan, Owners

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that this project is unlikely to discover or effect prehistoric or earlier historic resources and no mitigation measures are required. The standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources will apply and shall be printed the on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Public comment opened at 1:45 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report as presented.**

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****2. 635 OLIVE ST**

C-M Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-012  
Application Number: MST2012-00156  
Owner: David Potter  
Architect: Michael Porter

(Proposal to demolish an existing 940 square foot one-story single family residence and construct a three-story mixed-use building with a basement and roof deck. The project consists of 2,997 square feet of commercial wine production and storage space and 1,429 square feet of residential space with an attached 424 square foot one-car garage and three uncovered parking spaces.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Dudek.)**

Actual time: 1:46

Present: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that because the potential for the proposed project to encounter unknown but potentially significant subsurface prehistoric remains is considered very unlikely, no mitigation measure are required and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources will apply and shall be printed the on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, commented that archaeology reports primarily focus on below-ground resources. Archaeology consultants generally provide ground-surface photographs to show the percentage of ground-surface available for inspection. He stated that the City's Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) does not require photographic documentation of the grounds or the existing structure on the site. The preparer of this report graciously provided photographs in response to a request to do so after the report had been prepared.

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: To accept the report with the condition that the additional photographs of the existing building provided by the report preparer be included.**

Action: La Voie/Drury, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

The Commission noted that it would like an amendment to the City's Master Environmental Assessment to add the requirement that archaeological reports include photographic documentation of the building(s) on site for context.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****3. 132 W HALEY ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-162-009  
 Application Number: MST2012-00242  
 Owner: Warren Grimsley  
 Architect: Lori Kari

(Proposal for minor additions and alterations to an existing 714 square foot single-family residence on a 2,161 square foot parcel. The scope of work includes the following: New 10 square foot addition on the original front porch and a new 34 square foot storage room, replace existing doors and window, new door in rear bedroom, new roof shingles, new light fixtures, and repaint exterior. The proposal also includes installation of 260 square feet of paving and abatement of violations through the demolition of other unpermitted work including floor area, a storage shed, two trellises, and skylights. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification. This is a **Structure of Merit: "Bungalow Triplet II"** and is **located in the Brinkerhoff Landmark District.**)

**(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Staff Hearing Officer review, and Historic Resource Findings.)**

Actual time: 1:54

Present: Lori Kari, Architect  
 Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m.

Wanda Livernois, neighbor, commented that the home be should returned to its original condition as much as possible, especially the exterior, which would include the front door location and depth of the porch. She also commented that the proposed tall fence in the front is inappropriate.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and the Consent Calendar with comments:**

1. The design as proposed is acceptable.
2. The requested modification is supportable as a reasonable use and enhancement of the historic resource.
  - a. The modification is aesthetically appropriate. The proposed modification does not pose consistency issues with the following design guidelines and findings: style of architecture and character of the neighborhood.
  - b. The yard encroachment promotes an appearance of uniformity of development and is consistent with other encroachments and setbacks in the neighborhood.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Orías opposed because she would like the neighbors to be made part of the final decision process. Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****4. 403 LOMA ALTA DR**

E-1 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-243-002  
 Application Number: MST2012-00324  
 Owner: Scarlett Dawn Moorehead  
 Applicant: Souter Land Use  
 Designer: Dexign Systems

(Proposal to construct a new 162 square foot detached carport with 334 square feet of permeable paving to replace a garage that was demolished without the required permits. Also proposed on this 23,087 square foot parcel is to permit an as-built six foot tall fence with gate at the southwest corner and to remove an unpermitted storage shed, patio cover, and laundry hookups. No new floor area is proposed in the existing 2,345 square foot single-family dwelling. This proposal will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2011-00952. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications. This is a designated **City Landmark: "Carl Oscar Borg House."**)

**(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on September 12, 2012.)**

Actual time: 2:16

Present: Scarlett M. Elkhazen, Owner  
 Syndi Souter, Agent  
 Tony Xiques, Designer

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. The masonry piers should be a minimum dimension of 16 inches.
2. Use the existing front gate as inspiration.
3. There should be less mass on the top.
4. Use a *portole* or *ramada* type of structure as inspiration.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:35 TO 3:00 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****5. 900 CHANNEL DR**

R-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-393-002  
 Application Number: MST2011-00246  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cemetery Association  
 Applicant: Tricia Knight  
 Architect: SAC Wireless

(Proposal for the installation of a new wireless communications facility consisting of nine panel cellular antennas on a new 58 foot tall tower pole structure concealed as an artificial eucalyptus tree and new ground-mounted equipment in a 700 square foot walled enclosure. An alternative design would be to conceal the tower inside a monopole. Planning Commission review is requested for a Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, and a zoning modification. This parcel contains a **City Landmark: "Charles Caldwell Park Watering Trough and Fountain."**)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval. Project was last reviewed on July 20, 2011.)**

Actual time: 3:00

Present: Tricia Knight, Agent  
 Dewayne Bonham, Radio Frequency Engineer

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

An email from Mary Louise Days, local historian, was acknowledged by Chair Suding.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. A shorter utility pole would be more appropriate.
2. A single pole may be acceptable.
3. The *faux* tree is not acceptable.
4. There should be a condition for removal of the pole as technology eventually makes it obsolete.
5. Provide other locations in the area where the facility could be sited.
6. Consider designing a capitol for the top of the pole.
7. Simplify the top of the enclosure.
8. Taper the pole.
9. Provide photographs of other monopoles in Santa Barbara County.
10. Provide photographs of equipment site from the historic resource, including a view of the historic resource in that photograph.
11. Signage at the historic resource is not appropriate.

Action: Winick/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:28 P.M. TO 3:40 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****6. 118 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-002  
 Application Number: MST2012-00372  
 Owner: Friedrich Enterprises LP  
 Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 10,409 square foot office building. The project includes the following work: repave (with permeable material) and restripe an existing 13,431 square foot parking lot, construct a new bicycle parking area with 6'-0" tall gate, and change the exterior color of the building. The number of parking spaces on this 22,887 square foot parcel will remain at 31 and will include ADA and compact car spaces.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Actual time: 3:40

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. The existing planter in front of the building is acceptable in a darker color.
2. Soften the fence on the eastern property line with landscape.
3. Simplify the paint scheme: no paint on the wainscot or window surrounds.
4. Adding landscape to the parking lot was strongly suggested and the applicant should return with the result of consult with property owner.

Action: Drury/Winick, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sharpe stepped down. Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****7. 35 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004  
 Application Number: MST97-00357  
 Agent: Ken Marshall  
 Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld  
 Architect: DesignARC, Inc.  
 Landscape Architect: Suding Design  
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.

(Proposal for a mixed-use development, Entrada de Santa Bárbara, involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 35, 36, and 118 State Street. The proposal includes 114 hotel units, nine timeshare units, 21,654 square feet of commercial floor area, and 243 underground and on-grade parking spaces.)

**(Review After Final of changes to approved crosswalk material and light fixtures on Helena Avenue. Project was last reviewed on June 20, 2012.)**

Actual time: 3:59



Present: Philip Suding, Landscape Architect  
John Ewasiuk, Principal Engineer

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support the gray concrete color? 6/0.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for revised drawings with the following comments:**

1. The proposal is ready for Approval of the Review After Final.
2. The light fixture is acceptable as presented.
3. The gray concrete color is acceptable.
4. Draw inspiration from the chevron pattern located at various intersections nearby.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Murray/Shallanberger absent.)

### **CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**

#### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

##### **A. 530 CHAPALA ST**

**C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001  
Application Number: MST2012-00095  
Owner: Lane Investments Family Trust  
Architect: Hugh Twibell

(Proposal for a legal change of use to office use, replacement of doors and windows, a new trash enclosure, and a new parking lot with associated landscaping. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement cases ENF2011-00587 and ENF2011-00532. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Dal Pozzo Tire Corporation Building."**)

**(Review After Final of changes to approved lighting and trash area and final approval of details for the entire project.)**

**Approval of Review After Final as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****B. 719 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-018  
 Application Number: MST2012-00358  
 Owner: Nancy Rogers & Yolanda Bebout Trust  
 Applicant: Glassman Planning Associates  
 Architect: MBH Architecture  
 Business Name: Men's Wearhouse

(Proposal to recess the front entry doors in an existing retail store. The existing doors will be re-used and the treatment of the new surrounding surfaces will match the existing storefront system. There will be a Measure E credit of 13 square feet. This building is a **City Landmark: "Alexander or White House Building."** Resolution #90-182, November 6, 1990.)

**(Requires Findings for Alterations to a City Landmark.)**

**Project Design and Final Approvals with the following condition and findings:**

1. The tiles and colors shall match existing.
2. **Alterations to a City Landmark Findings were made:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

**FINAL REVIEW****C. 1321 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-027  
 Application Number: MST2012-00298  
 Owner: Ernest H. Brooks II 1995 Revocable  
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to conceal exposed electrical conduits on an existing building with metal shrouding. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Former Jefferson School Campus."**)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on September 12, 2012.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****D. 700 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-015  
 Application Number: MST2012-00230  
 Owner: Ortega Pacific, LLC  
 Applicant: Tony Stogsdill, Associate AIA  
 Business Name: Panera Bread Bakery

(Proposal to restripe an existing parking lot, adding an accessible space and path of travel, and construct a new trash enclosure. This parcel is in the 85% parking zone of benefit.)

**(Review After Final of new ladder for rooftop access and truncated domes.)**

**Approval of the Review After Final as submitted.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 P.M. \*\***