



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 29, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present until 2:03 p.m.
- BARRY WINICK – Present at 1:34 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO – Absent
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:52 p.m.
- NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present until 4:32 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.
Members absent: Drury.
Staff present: Limón, Hernández, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 15, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 15, 2012, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained on Item 4. Shallenberger abstained. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Commissioner Orías requested that staff follow up on the request that a map and list of designated City Landmark structures, Structures of Merit, and structures listed on the City's Potential Historic Resources List be provided. Mr. Limón responded that staff is working on this request.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Commissioner Sharpe.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 8/0/0. (Drury absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Drury would be absent from the meeting.
- b) The City Council hearing of the Historic Resources Element document is tentatively scheduled on October 2, 2012, and not October 16 as previously announced.
- c) Item 10 on the agenda at 1321 Alameda Padre Serra has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

2. Commissioner Shallenberger announced he would be leaving after Item 2.

3. Commissioner La Voie announced he would be stepping down on Items 8 and 9.

4. Commissioner Murray announced she would be stepping down on Item 1.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**1. 1130 N MILPAS ST** E-1/R-3 Zone

(1:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-004
 Application Number: MST2009-00551
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bowl Foundation
 Agent: Trish Allen, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.
 Architect: Steve Carter

(Proposal to construct a new 2,210 net square foot one-story administration building, pedestrian plaza, and walkway for the Santa Barbara Bowl with approximately 2,700 cubic yards of excavation and 1,200 cubic yards of fill grading. Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and Modifications to allow encroachments into the required setbacks is requested. The project requires City Council approval for abandonment of a portion of Lowena Drive. Courtesy review by the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission of associated improvements on the County-owned parcels is also requested.)

(Review of revised Historic Structures/Sites Addendum Report prepared by Fermina Murray, Architectural Historian. The report concluded that the proposed alterations will be done in a non-adverse manner and the physical characteristics will continue to convey its significance and eligibility for designation as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 1:41

Present: Trish Allen, Agent, SEPPS
 Fermina Murray, Historical Consultant

Commissioner Shallenberger disclosed that he spoke to the applicant, and reviewed the video and minutes of the August 15 meeting for purposes of becoming familiar with the item since he was not present at the previous review.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA and relevant Secretary of Interior guidelines and will not result in significant adverse impacts to the historic resource.

Motion: To accept the report with the following condition and comments:

1. On page 9 the first and second paragraphs shall be stricken from the report: "This revised section of the HSSR Addendum Report is responding to the Historic Landmarks Commission's August 15, 2012 motion, which states [...]."
2. The following recommendations shall be forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review:
 - a. The proposed 18 foot wide pedestrian walkway is appropriate, but should be designed in a manner to preserve the Oak trees. The Oak trees are important to the ambience of the County Bowl.
 - b. The applicant was asked to address the semi-trailer trucks parking lot area to see if any trees can be preserved.
 - c. The applicant should pay attention to the south elevation of the Box Office building shown on Sheet A3.1 for compatibility with the Dreier Building as well as the balance of the County Bowl architecture for a more unified façade, particularly the stone elements underneath the five vertical windows.

Action: La Voie/Shallenberger, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Murray stepped down. Drury absent).

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 34 E MISSION ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-005
 Application Number: MST2012-00305
 Owner: Catherine Compieri
 Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prior to project plans being submitted. The project will entail the restoration of an existing single-family residence including alterations to the residence and the demolition of an existing three car garage and the construction of a 622 square foot three-car garage with 472 square feet of accessory space above the garage. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2012-00269. This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Kinney House."**)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report found the subject parcel eligible for designation as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit and for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.)

Actual time: 1:56

Present: Jarrett Gorin, AICP, Owner Representative
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that Staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA and relevant Secretary of Interior guidelines and will not result in significant adverse impacts to the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury absent).

PUBLIC HEARING**3. 40 E ANAPAMU ST**

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
 Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council that the Central Library, Faulkner Gallery, and *Corymbia (Eucalyptus) citriodora* trees be designated as City Landmarks.)

Actual time: 2:03

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Mr. Limón acknowledged receipt of letters expressing opposition to landmarking the Eucalyptus trees from Irene Macías, Central Library Director; and Nancy Rapp, Parks and Recreation Director.

Written comments were also received from Kellam de Forest and Carol Bornstein expressing support for designating the Eucalyptus trees.

Public comment opened at 2:17 p.m.

1. Mary Louise Days, local historian, spoke in support of the building designation.
2. Eric Friedman, local resident, spoke in opposition to designating the three Eucalyptus trees located at the center bay of the west elevation at this time.
3. Fred Sweeney, local artist, spoke in support of designating the three Eucalyptus trees.
4. Alexandra Cole, local historian, spoke in support of the Eucalyptus trees and building designations.
5. Bob Cunningham, landscape architect, spoke in support of designating the three Eucalyptus trees.
6. W. Scott Burns, former Parks and Recreation Commission member, spoke in opposition to designating the three Eucalyptus trees and spoke in support of the building designation.
7. Irene Macías, Library Director, spoke in opposition to designating the three Eucalyptus trees and spoke in support of the building designation.
8. Susan Chamberlin, landscape historian, spoke in support of designating the Eucalyptus trees and suggested that a brief biography of licensed landscape architect Ralph Tallant Stevens be included.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution 2012-01 and forward the Landmark designation request of the Central Library, Faulkner Gallery, and all thirteen *Corymbia (Eucalyptus) citriodora* trees located at 40 East Anapamu Street to City Council for consideration; with the recommendation that the Council also place the trees on the City Parks Department Landmark, Historic, and Specimen Trees list.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Shallanberger absent).

PUBLIC HEARING

4. 2300 GARDEN ST

(2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024

Staff Member: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider adoption of a resolution to recommend to City Council that the St. Anthony's Seminary Complex and Grounds be designated a City Landmark.)

Actual time: 2:36

Present: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian

Written comments were received from Milt Hess, Upper East Association President, expressing support for the landmark designation.

Public comment opened at 2:44 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local historian, spoke in support of the designation and spoke of likelihood of Mission Period archaeological remains under the surface.

Fred Sweeney, Upper East Association member, spoke in support of the designation and expressed concerns.

Mary Rose, owner representative, requested a two-week postponement.

Michael Corrigan, adjacent neighbor, spoke in support of the designation and expressed concerns.

Public comment closed at 2:52 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks at the request of owner representative with comments:

1. Regardless of the property owner's attendance or absence at the September 12 HLC meeting, an action will be taken by the Commission at that public hearing.
2. Staff is to research the potential of archaeological remains on the site and include the result of such research in the draft resolution.
3. Staff is to research the status of the temporary perimeter fence.
4. Staff is to provide a more elaborate description of the site characteristics, including the mature landscaping, perimeter landscaping, and the landscaping as it relates between this complex and the Old Mission and Garden Street.

Action: La Voie/Orías, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Shallanberger absent).

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:00 P.M. TO 3:07 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM

5. PROPOSED SANTA BARBARA HISTORIC STYLE GUIDE

(2:40) Presenter: Anthony Grumbine, Harrison Design Associates

(Overview of proposed Santa Barbara Historic Style Guide to be included as part of upcoming *Design Guidelines for Historic Districts*.)

Actual time: 3:07

Present: Anthony Grumbine, Harrison Design Associates

Discussion held.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**6. 1000 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-041
 Application Number: MST2012-00330
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Streets Division
 Applicant: Public Works - Streets Division

(Proposal to install a 200 square foot prefabricated bikestation module in City Parking Lot #3 near the current MTD bus station. This project is being funded by a Measure A grant.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:28

Present: Jessica Grant, Project Planner
 Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. A flat roof may be the most appropriate roof type.
2. There should be a building code minimum gap between the bottom of the stucco and the top of the paving surface.
3. Study adding landscape, perhaps a vine, to soften the building.
4. The windows should be recessed a minimum of four inches.
5. Keep the building simple in its form and detailing.
6. Study the lighting that may be proposed.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Shallanberger absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 1220 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-019
 Application Number: MST2012-00285
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Parking Division
 Applicant: PMSM Architects
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith

(Proposal for alterations to City Parking Lot 5 including the following: convert the current entry on W. Victoria Street to an exit; install an 80 square foot premanufactured kiosk, associated parking equipment, and electrical service; realign the exit driveway; and new landscaping and frontage improvements from the access drive to the eastern property line of the adjacent parcel (Victoria Hall Theater) including a sidewalk extension and 370 square foot parkway planter. A total of 625 square feet of surface will be repaved.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on August 1, 2012. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:40

Present: Jason Currie, Project Manager, PMSM
 Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m.

John Rowbottam, local resident, spoke in favor of the project and expressed concern with the proposed kiosk.

Public comment closed at 3:52 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that the following Biological Resources Tree Mitigation Measures shall be placed on the plans:

1. BIO-1: Trees not indicated for removal on the site plan shall be preserved, protected, and maintained.
2. BIO-2: During construction, fencing or protective barriers shall be placed around the driplines of all trees within 25 feet of the proposed kiosk.
3. BIO-4: The City Arborist shall be present during any grading or excavation adjacent to the existing 12-inch sycamore tree and provide direction and measures to preserve the tree.
4. BIO-8: If removal of the 12-inch sycamore tree is required, then a replacement tree shall be planted subject to the approval of the Historic Landmarks Commission.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Suding opposed to the conversion of an entrance into an exit. Drury/Shallanberger absent).

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:58 P.M. TO 4:03 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

8. 2132 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-071-016
 Application Number: MST2012-00188
 Owner: Eric Gabrielsen
 Agent: Post/Hazeltine Associates
 Architect: William R. La Voie Architect, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish 2,407square feet of first and second story floor area and restore the roof terrace with deck, columns, and pergola; restore quatrefoil windows on the main level of the south elevation; and install new windows and doors on roof terrace. Also included is the demolition of a first floor breakfast room and adjacent exterior stairs, restoration of original windows on the first floor, and embellishment of the existing elevator tower. Required parking will be provided in a new 667 square foot attached 3-bay carport to be constructed on an existing paved auto court.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates. The report determined that the house and remaining elements of the designed landscape are eligible for designation as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark and for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources and the National Register of Historic Places.)

Actual time: 4:04

Present: William La Voie, Architect
Eric Gabrielsen, Owner
Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Nicole Hernández, Urban Historian, stated that staff supports the report's conclusions that the project meets the State CEQA Guidelines of the MEA and relevant Secretary of Interior guidelines and will not result in significant adverse impacts to the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with the condition that Standard 4 shall be addressed.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (La Voie stepped down. Drury/Shallanberger absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

9. 2132 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-071-016
Application Number: MST2012-00188
Owner: Eric Gabrielsen
Agent: Post/Hazeltine Associates
Architect: William R. La Voie Architect, Inc.

(Proposal to demolish 2,407square feet of first and second story floor area and restore the roof terrace with deck, columns, and pergola; restore quatrefoil windows on the main level of the south elevation; and install new windows and doors on roof terrace. Also included is the demolition of a first floor breakfast room and adjacent exterior stairs, restoration of original windows on the first floor, and embellishment of the existing elevator tower. Required parking will be provided in a new 667 square foot attached 3-bay carport to be constructed on an existing paved auto court.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:32

Present: William La Voie, Architect
Eric Gabrielsen, Owner
Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Public comment opened at 4:49 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for details with the comment that the design is commendable and appropriate to the original architecture.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (La Voie stepped down. Drury/Shallanberger absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**10. 1321 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA** A-1 Zone

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-027
 Application Number: MST2012-00298
 Owner: Ernest H. Brooks II
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposal to conceal exposed electrical conduits on an existing building with metal shrouding. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Riviera Campus."**)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on August 15, 2012.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**11. 1330 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00371
 Owner: Metropolitan Theatres Corporation
 Applicant: Peikert Group Architects

(This is a new project. Proposal for a new three-story multifamily rental unit development on a 91,000 square foot parcel located at the corner of W. Sola and Chapala Streets. The proposal includes 36 rental units totaling 31,140 square feet, a 550 square foot exercise room, and a 13,800 square foot parking garage. The parking garage will contain 40 spaces and a surface lot will contain 50 spaces, with 36 spaces allocated to the units and 54 spaces allocated to the Arlington Theatre. The buildings will range in height from 33 to 35 feet. Also proposed is the removal of some mature trees: one *Eucalyptus*, five *Acacias*, and one *Pittosporum*, with 15 mature palm trees to be preserved and re-planted. The amount of grading excavation has not yet been determined. This parcel is within the 10% Parking Zone of Benefit and contains a designated **Structure of Merit: "Arlington Hotel Garden Arch."**)

(Comments only; project requires Compatibility Criteria Analysis and Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 4:54

Present: Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Peikert Group Architects
 David Corwin, President, Metropolitan Theatres
 Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Receipt of written comments from Randall Fox was acknowledged. He expressed concerns with impacts on historic parking resources and uses in the Arlington Theater area.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m.

Susan Chamberlin, landscape historian, commented on the significance of the Arlington Theatre and the original village concept that called for a one-story around the theatre.

Public comment closed at 5:15 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

1. The owners' proposal for rental housing is commendable.
2. Provide a segregated play area for children that is safe and away from automobile and pedestrian circulation.
3. Provide a better design justification of the buildings on the site plan.
4. Study a more creative plan.
5. Study the possibility of bicycle paths and open areas for better livability.
6. The design should be sensitive to the west elevation of the Arlington Theatre.
7. Restudy increasing ground excavation to achieve lower building heights and parking area.
8. The proportion method that is exemplified in the interior of the Arlington Theatre should be utilized for this project in that the design is emulating the design of the interior.
9. Re-establish a connection between the historic gate and the pedestrian path.
10. Simplify the architecture but be consistent throughout the project, particularly the paseo elevation.
11. Break up the ridgelines.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

HLC Representative: Donald Sharpe

Time Adjourned: 11:55 a.m.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 416 STATE ST

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00276
 Owner: Hughes Land Holding
 Applicant: Mike Stinchfield
 Business Name: Baja Sharkeez

(Proposal to repaint an existing commercial building.)

(Review After Final to change previously-approved color selection.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with conditions:

1. The orange color is not approved.
2. The patio wall shall match the new white exterior with the light blue trim replacing the previously approved green.

NEW ITEM**B. 300 E ISLAY ST****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-121-001
Application Number: MST2012-00269
Owner: John Markham
Applicant: Pintado Pools
Landscape Architect: Rob Maday

(Proposal for a new 480 square foot swimming pool and 40 square foot pool equipment structure on a 15,960 square foot parcel. New landscaping is also proposed. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Annette Smith House."**)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheet L1.0.

NEW ITEM**C. 121 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
Application Number: MST2012-00315
Owner: Santa Barbara Beach House Hotel
Agent: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for new rooftop mechanical equipment, screening, and satellite dish antenna. Also proposed are new air intake hoods on the west elevation.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheets T1.1 and A3.2.

NEW ITEM**D. 118 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-002
Application Number: MST2012-00323
Owner: Friedrich Enterprises LP
Architect: Edwards Pitman Architects

(Proposal for the following exterior changes to an existing 10,409 square foot commercial building on a 22,887 square foot parcel: replace existing 6,221 square foot roof with new single-play cool roof system, repave and restripe existing 13,431 square foot parking lot and driveway, install three bicycle racks and gate to bike parking area, and construct a 120 square foot trash enclosure. The existing number of parking spaces will remain unchanged at 31.)

Project was revised to only replace 6,221 square feet of roofing with new single-ply cool roof system on a 10,409 square foot commercial building.

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:42 P.M. ****