



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 18, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present until 6:56 p.m.
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
BARRY WINICK – Present at 1:38 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Present

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:44 p.m. and again 3:06 p.m. to 3:58 p.m.
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian – Present
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present until 1:44 p.m.
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present until 5:45 p.m.
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Members absent: Shalanberger.

Staff present: Limón (until 1:44 p.m. and again 3:06 p.m. to 3:58 p.m.), Hernández, Berman (until 1:44 p.m.), Gantz (until 2:41 p.m. and again 3:56 p.m. to 5:45 p.m.), and Feliciano.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There was an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, July 18, 2012, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, Second Floor, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Mary Louise Days, local resident, informed the HLC that the Mission Historical Park is undergoing a repair at a portion of the aqueduct wall that ends at E. Los Olivos Street. Mr. Limón explained that an administrative emergency repair permit was granted by staff because people have a tendency of removing the stonework and using it to sit on. Santos Escobar, Parks Services Supervisor, was instructed to provide a memorandum for the record indicating who will do the repair and how it will be done to mimic the original condition. The goal is for repairs to occur before commencement of the Old Spanish Days Fiesta celebrations. Chair Suding and Commissioner Drury agreed to go to the site and observe the work.

Commissioner Orías requested a mechanism for informing the HLC of emergency issued permits for sites that fall under its purview.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 3, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 3, 2012, as amended.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/1. Motion carried. (La Voie abstained. Shallenberger absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Murray/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallenberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioner Shallenberger would be absent from the meeting and Chair Suding would be stepping down from Item 2 at 902 Chapala Street.
2. Mr. Berman reported that the City Council held a hearing on the Mason Street Bridge configuration and it was decided that Kimberly Avenue is to remain a two-way street.
3. Commissioner La Voie announced he would be leaving by 6:30 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Boucher and Murray reported on the Designations Subcommittee that occurred in the morning. Possible recommendations for landmark designations were reviewed and two of the sites will be discussed at the August 15, 2012, HLC meeting.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED 1:43 P.M. TO 1:44 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 314 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-019
 Application Number: MST2012-00150
 Owner: 318 State St Properties, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to construct a 552 square foot addition and alter the façade on an existing 7,527 square foot, single-story, commercial building. The alterations include new storefronts, windows, awnings, paint, changes to the existing parapet and other façade alterations. Project is proposed to result in a total development on site of 8,079 square feet. Parking is proposed to be provided in the existing 83 space parking lot involving a shared parking agreement with adjacent properties. This project requires compliance with Measure E commercial square footage limitations.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 1:44

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Shallenberger absent.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 902 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
 Application Number: MST2012-00149
 Owner: Cynthia Howard Trust
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal for a facade remodel to replace the existing storefront window system, remove the existing eave, fascia, and parapet, and add new copper gutter and downspouts. Parking lot work and a new trash enclosure will be reviewed under separate application MST2012-00217.)

(Review After Final for alterations resulting in a proposed 297 square foot addition to the existing building footprint by enclosing the southwest corner of the building and adding windows from column to column. Project was last reviewed and received a final approval on June 20, 2012.)

Actual time: 1:56

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Straw vote: How many Commissioners are against any angular solution? 7/1 (Winick).

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment that an angular solution is not supportable.

Action: Orías/Winick, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Shallenberger absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:09 P.M. TO 2:20 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. CABRILLO BLVD**

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-912
Application Number: MST2012-00175
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Public Works Department

(Proposal to install pedestrian-activated flashing lights at three intersections to improve the safety of pedestrians crossing the streets. The proposed locations are as follows: E. Cabrillo Blvd. at Corona Del Mar, W. Cabrillo Blvd. at Chapala St., and W. Cabrillo Blvd. at Bath St., and the following APN segments are involved: ROW-002-912, -002-877, -002-117, -002-880, -002-890, -002-184, -002-841, and -001-882.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 23, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:20

Present: Derrick Bailey, City Supervising Transportation Engineer

Public comment opened at 2:25 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions and request:

1. The cabinets shall be installed on the inland side of Cabrillo Blvd.
2. A minimum of three medium height shrubs shall be placed around the cabinet installation at Corona del Mar.
3. City Staff to investigate the lack of performance of the landscape on Cabrillo Blvd. at Chapala Street.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:32 P.M. TO 3:00 P.M. ****

ACTION ITEM**4. PROPOSED HISTORIC RESOURCES ELEMENT**

(3:15) Presenter: Heather Baker, Project Planner

(On June 28, 2011, Council authorized a Historic Resources Element (HRE) Task Force to convene to draft a new Historic Resources Element. The new HRE is to supersede the Cultural and Historic Resources section of the existing General Plan Conservation Element. The rest of the existing Conservation Element would remain in place at this time. The HRE Task Force voting membership is two Historic Landmarks Commissioners and one Planning Commissioner. Representatives from various other community groups are included in the HRE Task Force and contributed to discussion and work on the HRE. The HRE Task Force has met approximately 20 times since July 2011 and has drafted an introduction, goals, policies and implementation actions for consideration, as well as an appendix. Staff has supported the HRE Task Force drafting process and has reviewed the current draft document, as well as provided a map of historic districts in the document.)

(Staff's recommendation: That the Historic Landmarks Commission review the draft proposed HRE and recommend it for Council adoption.)

Actual time: 3:00

Present: Heather Baker, City Project Planner

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, HRE Task Force, commented in support of the document and suggested revisions to the staff report. She also suggested revisions to the HRE: 1) Further delineation of *El Cuartel* on the “Historic, Special Design, and Landmark Districts” map in the HRE; and 2) Revise the language of the second bullet on page 7.

Stella Larson, Planning Commission member, commented in support of the document and expressed appreciation for the members of the Task Force and Staff that worked on the document.

Jean Kahre, local resident, commented in support of the document and expressed appreciation.

Lee Moldaver, local resident, commented in support of the document and expressed appreciation.

Susan Chamberlin, local resident and landscape historian, commented on need to incorporate the concept of “cultural landscapes” and suggested revisions throughout the HRE consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards.

Joe Rution, local resident, commented in support of the document and stated that the HRE does not affect affordable housing. He disagreed with the “Santa Barbara for All” comment letter.

Chair Suding acknowledged receipt of emails and letters from Mary Louise Days, Cathie McCannon, Robert Ooley, Anne Petersen, Santa Barbara for All, and the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation; and summarized concerns.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

The Commission expressed appreciation for the many hours spent by the HRE Task Force and members of the public in the production of this document.

Motion: To recommend adoption of the proposed Historic Resources Element to the City Council with the comment that the Planning Commission and Historic Resources Element Task Force shall look into the merit of comments and suggestions made by Susan Chamberlin and Mary Louise Days.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1117 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(4:30) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-231-030
 Application Number: MST2012-00256
 Owner: 1129 State Street
 Applicant: Richard Six

(Proposal to demolish the existing facade and construction of a new facade on the State Street elevation including a 231 square foot addition and exterior alterations to include a new roof, window, wood corbels, plaster moldings and wrought iron work to an existing commercial building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:56

Present: Richard Six, Architect, Lenvik & Minor Architects

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The rear elevation as presented is acceptable.
2. The curved arches is an appropriate solution, but restudy the arch proportions.
3. The arch shall project six inches forward of the wall plane.
4. Simplify the base of the arch by making it coplanar.
5. Simplify the detailing of the building, such as eliminating the dentil work on the flanking side.
6. Continue studying and provide detailing of the middle entranceway.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:21 P.M. TO 4:50 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 33 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST

C-2 Zone

(5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009

Application Number: MST2011-00174

Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation

Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects, Inc.

(This is a **City Landmark: "Lobero Theatre."** Proposal to add one new rooftop HVAC unit and revisions to the front entry landscape/hardscape. Also proposed is a new accessible ramp to be constructed on the west elevation.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Historic Resource Findings, and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark. Project was last reviewed on April 27, 2011.)

Actual time: 4:50

Present: Joe Wilcox, Principal Architect, KBZ Architects
Dawn Sophia Ziemer, Associate Architect, KBZ Architects
Mat Gradias, Architect, KBZ Architects
Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio

Public comment opened at 5:09 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Street trees on Cañón Perdido Street are not supportable.
2. Study enlarging the planters between the palm trees on Anacapa Street.
3. The use of reed rush plants is not supportable. A formal plant material would be preferred.
4. Restudy the proposed light fixtures on top of the columns.
5. Study embellishment of the handrail vertical pickets.
6. The molding of the second parapet should not match the molding above or below.

Action: Orías/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**7. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL**

E-1 Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
Application Number: MST2010-00166
Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services (SEPPS)
Architect: Schacht Aslani Architects

(Proposed project consists of the Master Plan for the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History. The project components include demolition of the majority of the existing structures, approximately 58,500 square feet, with the exception of the designated structures of merit and proposed new development of approximately 109,500 square feet. The project requires a Measure E allocation of no more than 57,000 square feet and has received a preliminary dual designation as a Community Priority and Economic Development project.)

(Concept review only; no action may be taken. Project was last discussed on February 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 5:44

Present: Suzanne Elledge, Agent, SEPPS
Susette Naylor, Architect, Thompson Naylor Architects
Walter Schacht, Architect, Schacht Aslani Architects
Danny Kato, Senior Planner/ Development Review Supervisor

Public comment opened at 6:14 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners could support a height variance? 6/2 (Boucher/Orías opposed).

Commissioner Orías left at 6:55 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners could support a basilica type roof mass over the galleries? 6/1 (Sharpe dissented).

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Option C is preferred.
2. Study a basilica roof mass for the galleries, with subordinate roof types for the remaining buildings.
3. It would be preferred that the north/south corridor maintain the view, but be designed so that the pedestrian pathway is not straight, but rather interrupted by landscaping or other non-building improvements.
4. Study the coherent relationship between placement of buildings and ensuring a pleasant pedestrian experience.
5. The idea of moving the classrooms closer to the creek is supportable.
6. It was suggested that large buildings that are mostly composed around courtyards in one way or another be used as inspiration, such as the historic El Paseo.
7. Manipulate the architecture to give a more intimate sense when inside the buildings.
8. The architecture should be compatible with the Fleischmann Auditorium without mimicking it.

9. In Spanish Colonial Revival style of architecture the exterior design matches the interior design. Sketching the exteriors will lead to creative changes in the site plan, as the applicant imagines moving through the site and buildings. Concentrating on the elevations, rather than the site plan, is a better way to resolve the Commission's concerns regarding serendipity and imaginative exterior elevations.

10. The proposed gables are not consistent with Spanish Colonial Revival architecture.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services (SEPPS)
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. This is Phase II of the 2004 approved Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. Phase II includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and Cottages 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Phase I of the project was reviewed under MST99-00305.)

(Review After Final for a revised balcony and guardrail detail on Cottage 6.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM

B. 1000 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-014
 Application Number: MST2012-00264
 Owner: Quincy/1000 Associates, LP

(Proposal to raise the window sills 5-inches on the Carrillo Street façade of an existing bank building. There is an existing open building permit for the like-for-like replacement of 14 existing windows.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely for more detailed plans.

NEW ITEM

C. 601 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-018

Application Number: MST2012-00258

Owner: Eleonora Hofmann

Agent: Star Electric

(Proposal to install a new 40 amp circuit and associated conduit piping for an electric car charging outlet at the existing Enterprise Rent-a-Car.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued indefinitely due to incomplete plans.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:06 P.M. ****