



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 6, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present at 1:33 p.m. to 1:44 p.m.
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present until 2:52 p.m.
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the *Meeting Videos* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding and Winick.

Members absent: Shallenberger.

Staff present: Limón, Berman, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

None.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 23, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 23, 2012, with correction.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 6/0/2. Motion carried. (Murray/Orías abstained. Shallenberger absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Boucher/Winick, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Chair Suding would be stepping down from Item 1 at 902 Chapala Street and Commissioner Shallanberger would be absent from today's meeting.
 - b) The projects to repaint the buildings at 718, 716, 714, 712 State and 15 E. Ortega Streets, which were continued two weeks to today's meeting, have been indefinitely postponed at the owner's request.
 - c) The first Historic Landmarks Commission meeting in July will take place on Tuesday the 3rd due to the legal holiday on the 4th.
2. Mr. Limón announced that Nicole Hernández has been hired as the new City Urban Historian. She will begin June 18, 2012.
 3. Commissioners Drury and Murray announced they would not be attending the June 20, 2012, HLC meeting.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:37 P.M. UNTIL 1:44 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

1. 902 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(1:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019

Application Number: MST2012-00217

Owner: Cynthia D. Howard Gift Trust

Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architecture

(Proposal to reconfigure an existing parking lot including repaving approximately 400 square feet and restriping 22 parking spaces. Also proposed is new parking lot landscaping and the relocation of a trash enclosure. A waiver of 5'-0" wide planters along the north and east perimeters is requested. This parcel is located in the 100% parking Zone of Benefit. Building facade changes were approved under separate application MST2012-00149. A parking waiver is requested.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 1:44

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
Philip Suding, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 1:49 p.m. and, with no one wishing to speak, was closed.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the comment that the applicant should consider a change in the pebbles selection.

Action: Oriás/Drury, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Shallenberger absent.)

There is a ten-day appeal period.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:59 P.M. TO 2:04 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 0 BLK W MASON ST

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
Application Number: MST2010-00261
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Thomas Conti

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 36 feet and the new road bed width will be 60 feet.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:04

Present: John Ewasiuk, City Principal Engineer

Staff comments: Michael Berman stated that the project has been revised and the project description should have read: "The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing bridge road bed width is 24.4 feet and the new road bed width will be 28 feet. The existing total bridge width is 33.4 feet and the proposed bridge total width would be 43 feet."

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

Lee Moldaver, Creeks Advisory Committee, spoke in support of the project and commented on Kimberly Avenue made into a one-way street towards the freeway.

Mark Romasanta, adjacent property owner, spoke in support of the project.

Eddie Harris, Santa Barbara Urban Creeks Council, spoke in support of the project and commented on careful exploration of alternatives, shading for quality habitat, and making Kimberly Avenue into a one-way street.

Public comment closed at 2:34 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Extend the landscaping towards the corner of Kimberly and Mason Streets.
2. Size the boulders correctly in preparation for storm events.
3. Study the terminus of the bridge rails making them substantial.
4. Study guardrail treatment to make the proposed material look like wood.
5. The Commission is in support of an open rail bridge design; but what is being proposed is not acceptable and should conform to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
6. The bridge should be made as narrow as possible so that it is consistent with the residential neighborhood setting.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 1936 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00167
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Applicant: Cadence Development
 Agent: Lucy Dinneen
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,450 square foot, 33 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on May 9, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:52

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect
 Kelly Brodison, City Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 3:04 p.m.

Fred Sweeney, Upper East Association, expressed concern with large parking exposed to State Street and appropriate architectural solution.

Lisa Burns, Upper East Association, expressed concern with generation of high traffic and compatibility with residential neighborhood.

Tony Fischer, neighborhood resident, commented that the design should not be driven by underground conditions, and requested story-pole placement.

Joan Livingston, Upper East Association, commented on transitional intersection; and gateway to parkway, Santa Barbara Mission and unique residential area.

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The architecture, for the most part, continues to be acceptable.
2. Site Plan B is promising and should continue to be studied, including the elevations.
3. The potential of landscaping along State Street is a positive addition to site Plan B.
4. Detailing of the parapet is important as shown in the examples used for inspiration.
5. The siting of the building is extremely important and should not be driven by what is underground.
6. The proposed parking is problematic and not in conformance with the Urban Design Guidelines.

Action: Winick/La Voie, 7/1/0. Motion carried. (Murray opposed because she felt that the scale and siting of the building is inappropriate to the neighborhood. Shallenberger absent.)

Commission request: The applicant is encouraged to work closely with the Upper East Association to come to a consensus on the design and placement of the building.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:27 P.M. TO 3:32 P.M. ****

Item 3 was reopened at 3:32 p.m. and reclosed at 3:33 p.m. with no changes to the motion or its comments.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 1321 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA

A-1 Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-027
 Application Number: MST2012-00180
 Owner: Ernest Brooks II Trust
 Applicant: Peikert Group Architects
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Middle School

(Proposal for a minor addition and exterior alterations in the basketball court area and rear parking lot including the following: removal of existing portable storage, construction of a new 438 square foot storage building with clay tile roof and 8' tall wood fence enclosure, a 14' tall sound barrier wall on the east side of the basketball court, a 6' tall black chain link fence around two sides of the court, and a new wood trellis with stucco pilasters on the rear elevation. Also proposed is to restripe a small section of the parking lot, reducing the number of parking spaces from 115 to 112, which still meets the parking requirement of 109 spaces. New light fixtures, planters, and landscaping will complete the project. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Jefferson Campus."**)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 23, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:33

Present: Lisa Plowman and April Palencia, Peikert Group Architects
David Black, Landscape Architect
Don Olsen, Santa Barbara Middle School Board

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m.

Paul Welterlen, adjacent neighbor, commented on perimeter landscaping on both sides of the property to reestablish landscape buffer.

Public comment closed 3:43 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. The landscape plan as shown on Sheet SI1.0 and the proposed architectural changes are acceptable.
2. Clarify the discrepancy in the perimeter landscaping in relation to the site plan.
3. Research the permitting issues for the electrical boxes.
4. The electrical boxes and conduit need to be screened.
5. The perimeter vegetation needs to be studied and implemented, especially on the east side.
6. Tubular steel is historically not permitted. Solid steel is preferable for the fence.

Action: Winick/Drury, 6/0/2. Motion carried. (Murray/Orias abstained.)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00):

HLC Representative: Philip Suding

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2010-00342
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Architect: Henry Lenny
Architect: Gensler
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Historical Consultant: Alexandra Cole
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to rehabilitate an existing historic waterfall.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved landscaping in the waterfall garden area.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on sheets F-L2.1a and F-L2.3 of the plans.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Architect: Henry Lenny
Architect: Gensler
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.
Historical Consultant: Alexandra Cole
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Review After Final of changes to the approved project as follows: Guardrail locations and planting south of Cottage 39, lawn alternatives, reduction of chimney height on Cottage 31, change of awning fabric on Cottages 30, 31, 32, 33, 34a, 34b, 37, 38, and 39, and the Pool/Fitness Building.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on sheet L-L2.0 and with the following conditions:

1. Changes shall be made to the planting south of Cottage 39 as noted on plans.
2. Areas determined to be "active recreation" areas by Public Works are allowed to use Marathon II grass. All other new lawn areas, including the larger lawn area adjacent to the Main Building, shall be planted with water wise 'UC Verde' grass.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 500 NIÑOS DR****P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-002
Application Number: MST2000-00707
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Rich Block and Cameron Carey
Architect: David Mendro
Business Name: Santa Barbara Zoo

(Construction of a proposed 8,805 square foot, one-story Discovery Pavilion building and a 1,408 square foot addition to the existing administrative building. Three existing buildings, totaling 1,868 square feet, and two existing animal holding facilities would be removed. An existing 1,779 square foot building would be remodeled and incorporated into the new building. The project would result in a net increase of approximately 9,190 square feet of building area.)

(Review After Final of the following changes: parapet height on the Discovery Building, new storage enclosure, revisions to the ramp and addition of a wheelchair lift at the loading dock, HVAC equipment enclosure, rooftop mechanical equipment, and exterior light fixtures. Also proposed is the removal of an existing 60' tall volunteer eucalyptus that is buckling the accessible path of travel. Approval of this work will be contingent upon review and approval of the tree removal by the Parks and Recreation Department.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheets A2.02 and E-3 with the condition that the tree removal is acceptable to the HLC with a replacement of one 5 or 15-gallon Lemon-scented Gum (*Eucalyptus citriodora*) to be planted within 50 feet of the removed one.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 902 CHAPALA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
Application Number: MST2012-00149
Owner: Cynthia Howard Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal for a facade remodel to replace the existing storefront window system, remove the existing eave, fascia, and parapet, and add new copper gutter and downspouts. Parking lot work and a new trash enclosure will be reviewed under separate application MST2012-00217.)

(Final Approval of lighting and hardware details. Project was last reviewed on May 23, 2012.)

This item was postponed at the architect's request.

NEW ITEM**E. 615 DE LA VISTA AVE****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-033-029

Application Number: MST2012-00218

Owner: Beatrice Barton

Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal to add a 208 square foot, lower level deck and trellis and two planters to an existing, 1,666 square foot two story duplex. This structure is in the Lower Riviera Special Design District and is an eligible contributor to a potential historic district.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as noted on Sheet A2.1 and T1.2, and footings shall be no deeper than 12 inches.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:58 P.M. ****