



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

Wednesday, April 11, 2012

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:00 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent
BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present until 2:46 p.m. and again at 3:30 p.m.
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:01 p.m. by Chair Suding.

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, Winick.

Members absent: Shallenberger

Staff present: Berman (present 1:01 to 2:46 & 3:30 to 4:30), Gantz, Shafer.

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 28, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 28, 2012, as amended.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/2. Motion carried. (Sharpe/Winick abstained. Shallenberger absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of April 11, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Commissioner Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.
- b) A Notice of Availability of the Draft Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Assessment was received indicating that open public forum meetings for the South Coast HOV Project on U.S. Highway 101 will be conducted. Meetings will be held Tuesday, April 24, from 5:00 to 8:30 p.m. at the Montecito Country Club, and Wednesday, April 25 from 5:00 to 8:30 p.m. at the Carpinteria High School Cafeteria.

2. Commissioner Orías requested a report regarding the replacement of a Stone Pine tree on East Anapamu Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Murray reported on the April 11 Landmark Designations Subcommittee meeting. A letter will be drafted and sent to the owners of Saint Anthony's Seminary requesting that a landmark designation process be started. The Subcommittee suggested it would be appropriate to designate the two central library buildings and the eucalyptus trees in one application. A "hot list" of potential designations is also being prepared.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 500 FOWLER RD****A-F/SD-3 Zone**

(1:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00002
 Owner: Santa Barbara Airport
 Architect: Fred Sweeney
 Architect: Joseph Grogan

(Proposal for the construction of a new two-story Airline Terminal facility measuring approximately 66,045 square feet. The new facility would be located south of the existing 20,000 square foot main Terminal building, which would remain in operation during construction. The original 5,000 square foot 1942 Terminal building would be rehabilitated, with additions constructed in 1967 and 1976 to be removed. The 1942 building would be relocated and incorporated as part of the new facility. The existing rental car/security operations building, airline trailers and baggage claim pavilions, which are currently part of the existing Terminal complex, would also be removed and the uses would be incorporated into the new terminal. The existing short-term parking lot would be reconfigured and the loop road would be revised to incorporate an alternative transportation lane for buses, taxis, and shuttles. Project received Planning Commission Approval on 9/20/2007 (Resolution No. 037-07). The project received Final Approval by the ABR on 5/19/08.)

(Review After Final of the following changes to the approved plans to relocate and rehabilitate the original 1942 terminal building: replace all exterior stucco, replace the decorative stair riser tile, omit installation of one new window on the east elevation, and install frosted glazing in the Ladies Restroom windows.)

Actual time: 1:16

Present: Leif Erickson, Project Manager; Andrew Bermond, Assistant Planner, Santa Barbara Airport.

Staff comment: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that he read the report and recommended reevaluating the building to determine its significance after the relocation move.

Public comment was opened at 1:23 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Return with a design mock-up and stair tile samples.
2. The project shall have no expansion joints where there were none before.
3. Stucco is to match existing in texture, color, and finish.
4. It is recommended that the owner obtain an updated Historic Structures Report to determine the level of historic significance at post construction.

Action: Orias/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent.)

THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:38 TO 1:58 P.M.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 2300 GARDEN ST****E-1 Zone**

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
Application Number: MST2012-00103
Owner: San Roque School Charitable Trust
Applicant: Mary Rose
Architect: Appleton and Associates

(Proposal to legalize the following as-built conditions: 1,205 linear feet of security fencing, 1,447 linear feet of temporary construction fencing, 604 linear feet of safety fencing, two outdoor drinking fountains and three outdoor sinks, steps and handrail which replaced a grass path on the west side, metal wall railing, temporary mobile water closet and screening planters, temporary flagstone walkway, replacement of an area of existing paved driveway with new planting and rock curb, temporary screening plantings around the infirmary/outdoor classroom, shop, and gym to be removed when construction of previously-approved project resumes, temporary wood gate and infill doors at arcade for security during construction, new landscaping, and 29 temporary parking spaces (on gravel) in a previously-approved construction laydown yard. All items called out as "temporary" will be removed by March 31, 2014.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on March 28, 2012.)

Actual time: 2:00

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant; Ken Mineau and Joe Mendoza, Appleton and Associates.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, acknowledged receipt of a letter from The Upper East Dog Owner's Group requesting public access to the grassy area and playing fields. She explained that it is not within the HLC's purview to condition public access onto the property.

Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, reported that SBMC Section 28.87.170.G permits, but does not require, open mesh top fencing.

Public comment was opened at 2:17 p.m.

Kellam de Forest suggested that the visible portion of the property could be considered a cultural landscape. He expressed concern that a fence will impact the historic structure and a part of Santa Barbara history and suggested the fence be wrought iron to comply with Santa Barbara guidelines.

Lisa Burns, expressed concern that by installing a fence, the new owners have closed the site, negatively impacting the cultural environment that no longer has an open expansive feeling.

Fred Sweeney, representing the Upper East Association Board of Directors, recommended that the HLC appoint a subcommittee to review issues with the fence and conduct a site visit; stated that Title V and the Building Code have no requirement for fencing and leaves fencing up to individual schools.

Kristina Foss, representing Mission Santa Barbara, expressed the concerns that the fencing has green canvas, creating a blind turn for cars exiting, and prevents safe pedestrian access to the steps; a view of parked cars is preferred over the loss of visibility; also expressed planter drainage issues.

Public comment was closed at 2:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comment to return with a master plan showing both landscaping, security fencing, and gates appropriate to this particular cultural resource in conformance with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 7/0/1. Motion carried. (Sharpe abstained. Shallenberger absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. 209 PASEO NUEVO

C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002

Application Number: MST2012-00132

Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3

Architect: De Vicente + Mills Architecture

(Proposal to replace eight existing retail vendor carts within the Paseo Nuevo retail shopping center.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:46

Present: Henry Lenny and Ryan Mills, Architects

Public comment was opened at 2:50 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A majority of the HLC expressed concern with the increased width of the kiosks and suggested studying repositioning the kiosks.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Paseo Nuevo *Ad hoc* Subcommittee prior to returning to the Full Commission.

Action: Boucher/Orias, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallenberger absent.)

The *Ad hoc* Subcommittee consists of Commissioners Boucher, Sharpe, Shallenberger, and Winick.

THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:08 TO 3:12 P.M.

FINAL REVIEW**4. 1920 LAGUNA ST****R-2 Zone**

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-393-014
Application Number: MST2012-00009
Owner: Northup Family Trust
Architect: Kent Mixon

(Proposal to demolish 93 square feet of existing floor area and construct 111 square feet of new floor area in an existing 4,939 square foot, two-story, single-family residence. The net increase, which will be on the ground floor, is 18 square feet. An over-height bamboo hedge located within the interior yard setback is proposed to be reduced in height to eight feet, which will address a violation called out in enforcement case ENF2009-00612. Also proposed is a new 27 square foot porch at the rear. The existing 952 square foot, detached, two-car garage is proposed to remain unaltered. The current guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) of .35, or 123%, will remain unchanged on this approximately 15,000 square foot parcel. This is a Designated Structure of Merit: "Oliver-Mistretta Residence.")

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on January 18, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:12

Present: Kent Mixon, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 3:16 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of the project.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger absent)

THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:18 TO 3:30 P.M.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 125 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-012
 Application Number: MST2009-00119
 Owner: Redevelopment Agency of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Children's Museum of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.
 Architect: B3 Architects and Planners

(This is a revised project description. The project site contains the 455 square foot "Signalman's Building," which has been determined to be eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. The project includes a new 16,691 square foot, three-story building to be used as the Children's Museum of Santa Barbara, with indoor and outdoor galleries, a courtyard, and roof terrace. The maximum building height would be 40 feet. The project also includes two uncovered parking spaces accessed from Kimberly Avenue and pedestrian access on the south side of the site connecting State Street and Kimberly Avenue. The proposal received a Preliminary Community Priority Designation by City Council on April 7, 2009.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 021-11. Project was last reviewed on May 11, 2011.)

Actual time: 3:30

Present: Trish Allen, Agent; Barry Berkus and Micah Winkelstein, Architects; Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect; Allison De Busk, City Project Planner.

Public comment was opened at 3:54 p.m.

Kellam de Forest commended the architect and landscape architects on the interesting design. He asked about locations for visitor parking, the children's walking route, and whether the mesh infill conforms to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

A letter from the Union Pacific Railroad was acknowledged by Chair Suding.

Public comment was closed at 3:56 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval of the architecture and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for review of architectural details. Project Design Approval of the landscape and continued two weeks to Full Commission with the following comments:

1. Honor the Signalman's building appropriately.
2. Add more restrained whimsy to the tower.
3. Solar panels are to be below the parapet.
4. The pipe rail is acceptable as presented.
5. The mesh on the railing shall match the previously approved nearby installations.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 7/0/1. Motion carried. (Boucher opposed. Shallenberger absent.)

On behalf of the HLC, Chair Suding stated that the consensus of the HLC is to return to the 1:30 p.m. meeting time starting April 25.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

HLC Representatives: Donald Sharpe.

Staff present: Susan Gantz.

FINAL REVIEW**A. 117 W MASON ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
 Application Number: MST2011-00123
 Owner: Arthur Toga
 Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for alterations and a 618 square foot, second-story addition and a 30 square foot lower level addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed to the detached 666 square foot garage with an 824 square foot duplex above, or to the 156 square foot storage/laundry room. No ground disturbance will occur on the site. The ground surface will be covered with a moisture barrier prior to pouring the concrete slab and, if it becomes necessary to pour concrete on a level surface, clean fill such as sand will be used to create such a surface. Archeological and Chumash monitoring will be conducted per the Extended Phase 1 report dated 12-1-11. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of approximately 3,409 square feet and is proposed to address violations called out in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00416). This parcel is identified as a "Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District.")

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 17 W ORTEGA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-022
 Application Number: MST2012-00131
 Owner: Garrett and Joann Van Wyk
 Applicant: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal for the partial demolition of 940 square feet of an existing storage building, a new wrought iron fence, new awning to match existing, new accessible path of travel to the rear of the building, and new trash enclosure. This project will result in a Measure "E" credit of 940 square feet. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mission Revival Building.")

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 114 NATOMA AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-072-009
Application Number: MST2011-00155
Owner: Steven D. Krieg
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to repair and rebuild dry rot-damaged rear decks and stairs at the front and rear of a multi-family complex. The front elevation second floor walkway will also be widened by 18" and the rotted wood balcony railing will be replaced with a new wrought iron railing. New exterior light fixtures are also proposed.)

(Review After Final of changes to covered porch at Unit 120 including removal of exposed wood posts and beam at first floor and replacement with plaster finish over wood; second floor corbel decorative detailing; new second floor exposed posts to be wood-wrapped steel posts to match the removed posts.)

Final Approval as submitted of the Review After Final.

NEW ITEM**D. 200 BLK CHAPALA ST 2070 SEG ID****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-012
Application Number: MST2012-00085
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Jarrett Gorin

(Proposal to stripe an existing paved area within an abandoned portion of the Chapala Street right-of-way for a temporary 12-space valet parking lot for the Santa Barbara Beach House Hotel. The parking will be removed upon commencement of construction of the Chapala Street Bridge, anticipated to begin in May 2013. No new paving will take place.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with condition that a copy of the lease agreement be forwarded to HLC staff to confirm a May 2013 deadline for removal.

NEW ITEM**E. 734 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-028
Application Number: MST2012-00128
Owner: Steven Stevens Trust
Architect: Pacific Architects, Inc.
Business Name: Le Relais De Paris

(Proposal for storefront alterations including the following: changing an existing window to a new entry door and changing the existing front entry doors to windows, a new awning, and new light fixtures. Changes at the rear of the building include a new trash enclosure, removal of a window, replacement of an existing door, and a new light fixture. Also proposed are new outdoor dining furniture, umbrellas, and heaters. Front and rear elevations will be repainted to match the existing color. Signage to be reviewed under a separate application.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on sheets A-1, A-2 and D-1. Signage is not approved in this application.

NEW ITEM**F. 316 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-023
Application Number: MST2012-00129
Owner: Craviotto Primo Investments, LLC
Applicant: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to demolish 94 square feet of floor area at the rear of a multifamily building. The exterior finishes will match the existing. Also proposed is the following new work: foundation, roof, exterior paint, gutters, downspouts, and French drains. The building will be reconfigured and reduced from the permitted three units plus studio to three units. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2010-00925.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**G. 611 PASEO NUEVO C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Application Number: MST2012-00138
Owner: I & G Direct Real Estate 3, LP
Applicant: Rudy Garces
Owner: Macerich Company
Business Name: Mendi

(Proposal for a minor storefront change to replace an existing storefront window with a second pair of entry doors in the Paseo Nuevo retail shopping center.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.