



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

Wednesday, March 28, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:00 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
 LOUISE BOUCHER
 MICHAEL DRURY
 WILLIAM LA VOIE
 FERMINA MURRAY
 JUDY ORÍAS
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
 BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then click *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:00 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías (left at 3:33), Suding (out 2:16 to 2:21).

Members absent: Shalanberger, Sharp, and Winick

Staff present: Berman (present 1:00 to 2:43), Limón (present 1:00 to 1:32 and 2:43 to 3:51), Shafer.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with the modern design of the project at 901 Olive Street, and that the ABR is accepting of the proposed modern design.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 14, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 14, 2012, as amended.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger, Sharp and Winick absent)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of March 28, 2012, as reviewed by Craig Shallanberger.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger, Sharp and Winick absent)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a. There are no changes to the agenda.
- b. Ms. Gantz, Planning Technician, is away this week. In Ms. Gantz absence Mr. Limón and Mr. Berman will staff the meeting.
- c. Mistery Sharp, Winick, and Shallanberger will be absent.
- d. Following up on the Stone Pine Landmark Trees on Anapamu Street, Mr. Limón requested that Mr. Downey, City Arborist, provide written documentation as to the events. Mr. Downey responded that in order to protect other trees from a beetle infestation, he instructed that the infested tree be removed. Mr. Limón requested that in the future Mr. Downey notify staff in a timely manner.
- e. The proposal to relocate the old original Airport Terminal is still in process with restoration work proposed. A proposal to replace the original stucco will be reviewed by the HLC as part of the relocation. Mr. Berman will conduct research to determine the exact restoration procedures and the type of potential designation.

2. Mr. Suding made the following announcements:

- a. A meeting of the HLC Designation Subcommittee will take place on April 11 at 11:00 a.m. in the Housing and Redevelopment conference room.
 - b. Ms. Gantz conveyed her appreciation for the floral arrangement provided on behalf of the HLC.
3. Commissioner Drury expressed concern that the project at 901 Olive Street will be reviewed by ABR rather than the HLC. Mr. Suding explained that the project is not located within EPV.
4. Commissioner Murray reported that the Pearl Chase Society is sponsoring a home tour of the Bungalow Haven area on May 20. Ms. Murray suggested obtaining tickets as soon as possible as they are going fast.

E. Subcommittee Reports: No reports.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. **1709 OVERLOOK LN**

E-1 Zone

(1:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-192-016
Application Number: MST2012-00073
Owner: Pearson S. Jones Trust
Architect: Peter Becker

(Proposal for a 24 square foot first floor addition on the west elevation and exterior alterations to an existing two-story single-family residence. New doors, windows, and attic dormers are included in the project, as well as 1,400 square feet of new permeable paving, new entry gates, and landscape plan. There will be 111 cubic yards of grading excavation and 113 cubic yards of fill. The single-story, three-bay detached garage will remain unchanged. The guideline floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio is .139 or 117% of the maximum FAR.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D., Historian. The report determined that the property qualifies for City Landmark status, inclusion on the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places.)

Actual time: 1:16 p.m.

Present: Ron Nye, Historian; Peter Becker, Architect and Tom Princeton, Associate

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that Staff has read the report, found it meets requirements of the Master Environmental Assessment and recommends acceptance of the report.

Commissioner Murray expressed concern that the report recommends landmarking only the house and not the grounds, and asked whether the integrity of the garden still exists. Mr. Nye explained that a majority of the garden features have been damaged or removed.

Public comment was opened at 1:28 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern about the loss of the remnants of historic terraces. Suggested including the entire property as part of the landmark designation and the terraces might be rebuilt.

Public comment was closed at 1:32 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners feel the remaining landscape remnants from the original Lockwood Deforest plans are significant enough to designate? 4/2, a majority in support.

Motion: To accept the report with the following changes:

1. Include the 1920's photographs showing the terracing, and additional supporting documentation.
2. Consider adding an overlay showing proposed elements over the existing elevations.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. 1709 OVERLOOK LN**

E-1 Zone

(1:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-192-016
Application Number: MST2012-00073
Owner: Pearson S. Jones Trust
Architect: Peter Becker Architect

(Proposal for a 24 square foot first floor addition on the west elevation and exterior alterations to an existing two-story single-family residence. New doors, windows, and attic dormers are included in the project, as well as 1,400 square feet of new permeable paving, new entry gates, and landscape plan. There will be 111 cubic yards of grading excavation and 113 cubic yards of fill. The single-story, three-bay detached garage will remain unchanged. The guideline floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio is .139 or 117% of the maximum FAR.)

(Request by Staff to add this property to the City of Santa Barbara List of Potential Historic Structures and Sites.)

Actual time: 1:39 p.m.

Present: Ron Nye, Historian; Peter Becker, Architect and Tom Princeton, Associate

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, recommended the placement of the 1709 Overlook Lane on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment was opened at 1:40 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, suggested the entire property be designated as a potential historic landmark.

Courtney and Tanny Jones, owners of 1709 Overlook Lane, spoke in favor of the designation.

Public comment was closed at 1:42 p.m.

Motion: To request that Staff initiate the placement of the 1709 Overlook Lane on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources with the following comments:

1. Include the surviving landscape elements as described in the report (page 12 and 13)
2. The current property boundary is to be the area of designation.
3. The HLC appreciates the owners support of the landmark designation.

Action: La Voie/Orias, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

Subsidiary

Motion: To request that Staff initiate the designation process, with the comment that the property owners have indicated their support.

Action: La Voie/Orias, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. 1709 OVERLOOK LN**

E-1 Zone

(1:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-192-016
Application Number: MST2012-00073
Owner: Pearson S. Jones Trust
Architect: Peter Becker

(Proposal for a 24 square foot first floor addition on the west elevation and exterior alterations to an existing two-story single-family residence. New doors, windows, and attic dormers are included in the project, as well as 1,400 square feet of new permeable paving, new entry gates, and landscape plan. There will be 111 cubic yards of grading excavation and 113 cubic yards of fill. The single-story, three-bay detached garage will remain unchanged. The guideline floor-to-lot-area (FAR) ratio is .139 or 117% of the maximum FAR.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment and a Public Works Encroachment Permit.)

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: Peter Becker, Architect and Tom Princeton, Associate; Ms. Puck Erickson, Arcadia Studio

Staff comments: Mr. Berman requested the Commission's direction regarding to the gate material.

Public comment was opened at 2:02 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. The design is commended, with the following changes:
 - a. Locate the circular driveway to allow a minimum 3-foot clearance for landscaping.
 - b. The proposed gate location is acceptable.
 - c. Provide a gate design appropriate for the building in iron or steel.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Orias opposed, due to non-inclusion of landscape comments regarding fire and water retention. Shallenberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

DISCUSSION ITEM**4. 00 E CABRILLO BLVD**

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(1:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
Application Number: MST2004-00878
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Bobbi Salvini, Project Manager
Landscape Architect: David Black

(The Cabrillo Boulevard bridge replacement was approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission on January 21, 2009. The City has received direction from the Planning Commission to pursue relocating the approved beachway (paved bike/pedestrian path) alignment next to Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge over Mission Creek to the approved temporary beachway location.)

(Request for comments on the type of general architectural design for the proposed Beachway Bridge.)

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Public Works; Bobbi Salvini, Project Manager

Staff comment: Mr. Berman informed the Commission that the original proposal was for a temporary bikeway however the current proposal is for a permanent bridge.

Public comment was opened at 2:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned how the proposal fits into EPV and suggested submitting photographs or renderings.

Public comment was closed at 2:28 p.m.

Public comment was reopened at 2:32. p.m.

Sheila Lodge, Planning Commissioner, spoke in favor of the proposed permanent bridge.

Public comment was closed at 2:33 p.m.

Comments only, no action was taken. The HLC provided the following individual or collective comments:

- a. A wood material is suggested for the bridge railing.
- b. There is concern that the bridge could be an obstruction to the view corridor.
- c. The bridge should be designed to withstand flooding.
- d. Provide photographs depicting the effect of the project on views toward the bridge.
- e. The bridge should appear as a lighter bridge as it will carry pedestrians, not vehicles.
- f. The bridge need not make reference to the Cabrillo Boulevard Bridge in its design.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**5. 2300 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
Application Number: MST2012-00103
Owner: San Roque School Charitable Trust
Applicant: Mary Rose
Architect: Appleton & Associates

(Proposal to legalize the following as-built conditions: 1,205 linear feet of security fencing, 1,447 linear feet of temporary construction fencing, 604 linear feet of safety fencing, two outdoor drinking fountains and three outdoor sinks, steps and handrail which replaced a grass path on the west side, metal wall railing, temporary mobile water closet and screening planters, temporary flagstone walkway, replacement of an area of existing paved driveway with new planting and rock curb, temporary screening plantings around Infirmary/outdoor classroom, shop, and gym to be removed when construction of previously-approved project resumes, temporary wood gate and infill doors at arcade for security during construction, new landscaping, and 29 temporary parking spaces (on gravel) in a previously-approved construction laydown yard. All items called out as "temporary" will be removed by March 31, 2014.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 2:42 p.m.

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant.

Public comment was opened at 2:59 p.m.

Fred Sweeney, representing the Upper East Association Board of Directors, expressed concern that photos could not be located early in the week for viewing. Requested an opportunity to view documents and provide comments.

Scott Burns, local resident, expressed concern that the temporary construction fencing is now being proposed as permanent safety/security fencing.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern that the proposed temporary fencing and the new stairs do not fall within the EPV Guidelines.

Public comment was closed at 3:03 p.m.

Staff comments: Mr. Limón suggested that, because the property has potential landmark status, a condition be placed indicating that landscaping is not to be changed without prior HLC approval.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. No temporary apparatus shall become permanent (i.e. gate from Garden Street, temporary classrooms, lighting, utility poles, landscape planting).
2. Trees are not to be used to screen the front of the school, nor the chapel. The existing temporary tree may require removal.
3. Any changes to the landscaping are to be approved by the HLC, regardless of how minor.

4. Staff is requested to begin the landmark designation process.
5. Provide a proposal for any permanent security fencing before any temporary fencing will be considered. Staff is requested to verify the temporary screening.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. **217 HELENA AVE**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-020

Application Number: MST2012-00074

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Facilities

(Proposal to install two level II electric vehicle-charging stations in an existing city-owned public parking lot.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on March 14, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Alelia Parenteau, City Administrative Analyst

Straw vote: How many Commissioners prefer the pole mounted charger apparatus? 2/3 (minority)

Straw vote: How many Commissioners prefer the pedestal mounted charger apparatus? 3/2 (majority)

Motion: Final approval with the following conditions:

1. The pedestal-mounted charging apparatus with signs mounted or painted on the unit is approved. Approval is valid for two years, anticipating advances in technology.
2. Any future installations shall be sensitive to the EPV requirements; suggested colors are dark green or black.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Boucher opposed. Orias, Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 530 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

(3:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001

Application Number: MST2012-00095

Owner: Lane Investments Family Trust

Architect: Hugh Twibell

(Proposal for a legal change of use to office use, replacement of doors and windows, a new trash enclosure, and a new parking lot with associated landscaping. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement cases ENF2011-00587 and ENF2011-00532. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Dal Pozzo Tire Corporation Building.")

(Second Concept Review. Project requires compliance with the Chapala Street Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on March 14, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Hugh Twibell, Architect; Steve Dal Pozzo and Tom Lane, Owners

Public comment was opened at 3:45 p.m.

Kellam de Forest: suggested returning the "Dal Pozzo" name to the side of the landmark building.

Public comment was closed at 3:46 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the suggestion to provide a commemorative plaque.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Orias/Shallanberger/Sharp/Winick absent)

**** THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 3:51 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

HLC Representatives: Shallanberger

Staff present: Limón

CONTINUED ITEM**A. 819 STATE ST E****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-010
Application Number: MST2012-00055
Owner: ESJ Centers
Architect: James LeCron
Business Name: Swarovsky

(This is a revised project description: Proposed exterior alterations on an existing retail store. On the paseo elevation, an existing window will be replaced with a new entry storefront door and window in the same opening.)

(Second review.)

Final Approval as submitted with the State Street façade to remain with no color change.

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**B. 1224 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-039
Application Number: MST2012-00071
Owner: Eric and Cynthia Meyer
Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal for a new ground floor storefront system which will reclaim 81 square feet of originally permitted floor area, and a five square foot addition. Also proposed is to replace six windows on the second story facing State Street and replace three windows on the second story facing the alley. The existing columns and entablature on State Street will be removed.)

Final approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 801 PASEO NUEVO****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Application Number: MST2010-00338
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio
Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

(Final Approval of details is requested.)

Final approval of the details as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 1103 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-014
Application Number: MST2012-00111
Owner: Ronald Gillio Trust
Architect: Peter Hunt
Business Name: Bella Rosa Off Leash

(Proposal to permit an as-built, 22'-0" long, 6'-0" tall chain-link gate with dark green canvas cover at the rear of the parcel. The parcel is currently developed with two commercial retail spaces. No changes are proposed to the existing building. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2012-00111.)

Continued four weeks with the comment to return with a compatible material of stained wood or iron.