



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 14, 2012 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:00 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*- Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present until 4:03 p.m.
- JUDY ORÍAS – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:30 p.m.
- MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Absent
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:07 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray (until 4:03 p.m.), Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.

Staff present: Limón (until 1:30 p.m.), Gantz and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 29, 2012.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 29, 2012, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item G, which was reviewed by Craig Shallanberger.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. A copy of the Historic American Engineering Record was received from the State Department of Transportation for the Cold Spring Canyon Bridge Suicide Barrier Project. Distribution of this booklet was one of the mitigation measures in connection with that project, and they have sent one copy for the HLC archives. HLC members may contact Ms. Gantz to review this record.
 - b. The 37th Annual California Preservation Conference will take place in Oakland on May 3-6, 2012. She asked that Commission members inform her if interested in attending.
2. Due to the historic significance of the resource, Mr. Drury commented that the trees at 1707 Grand Avenue were trimmed allowing a better view of the resource.
 3. Commissioner Murray announced she would be leaving at 4:00 p.m.
 4. Commission Orías reported that one of the Stone Pine Landmark Trees on Anapamu Street was cut down. Mr. Limón responded that he will have Timothy Downey, City Urban Forest Superintendent, report on the loss of the tree.
 5. Commissioner Orías inquired as to the 1321 Alameda Padre Serra project that was supposed to return for review of the windows and doors. Commissioner Sharpe responded that the applicant returned to the Consent Calendar as directed by the full board.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Orías reported on the Historic Resources Element Subcommittee. The preparation of a Draft HRE has been completed. Staff is reviewing the document and it will return to the Subcommittee one more time on April 17 before being forwarded to the HLC, Planning Commission and City Council. The Staff involved was thanked along with interested organizations and individuals that participated.

Commissioner Sharpe requested that direction be given to applicants proposing to change storefronts at Paseo Nuevo. These projects are becoming more common during the Consent Calendar review. Current proposals have been a variety of mismatch styles that would not be approvable. Mr. Limón responded that there is a tenant design manual in place, but it may be outdated. Staff is to contact Paseo Nuevo management for a possible update. Commissioners Boucher, Shallanberger, Sharpe, and Winick agreed to participate in a Paseo Nuevo *Ad hoc* Subcommittee to discuss the subject.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED1. **217 HELENA AVE**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(1:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-020

Application Number: MST2012-00074

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: City of Santa Barbara - Facilities

(Proposal to install two level II electric-vehicle charging stations in an existing city-owned public parking lot.)

(Referred up from the Consent Agenda on February 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 1:30

Present: Alelia Parenteau, City Administrative Analyst

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would prefer the bollard-mount option with modifications?
3/6 (Boucher, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick opposed).

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments/suggestions:

1. Explore different finish options that are more consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines. Perhaps match the color of the trash cans and avoid stainless steel straps.
2. Study using the pole-mount option as long it has a finish that is consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
3. The sign shall be incorporated within the charging system as one unit.

Action: Orías/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW2. **530 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

(1:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-171-001

Application Number: MST2012-00095

Owner: Lane Investments Family Trust

Architect: Hugh Twibell

(Proposal for a change of use to offices, replace doors and windows, construct a new trash enclosure, and construct a new parking lot with associated landscaping. This application addresses violations called out in enforcement cases ENF2011-00587 and ENF2011-00532. This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and is included on the **State Historic Resources Inventory: "Dal Pozzo Tire Corporation Building; Constructed: 1930."**)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 1:45

Present: Hugh Twibell, Architect
Steve Dal Pozzo, Owner

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on importance of site.

Public comment closed at 1:58 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments/suggestions:

1. The owners' care of the building and sensitivity to the historic resource is appreciated.
2. The applicant is strongly encouraged to pursue landmark status.
3. Add descriptive call-outs such as "existing" and "proposed" on the drawings.
4. Study the location and especially the configuration of the trash enclosure.
5. Consider the use of a graffiti-minimizing surface wherever possible.
6. Consider stormwater management for the site.
7. There should be more consistency in the light fixtures.
8. Study adding a finial to the top of the tower.
9. Study changing the roll up doors to another color.
10. The landscape should be sensitive to the security of the site.
11. Study adding vine pockets to walkway to soften the building.
12. Explore eliminating the need for truncated domes by incorporating curbs and planters as applicable.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:24 P.M. TO 2:33 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

3. 33 W VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00327
 Owner: Unity Shoppe, Inc.
 Architect: PMSM Architects
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Victoria Hall Theater

(Proposed renovation and seismic upgrade including a rerouted circulation pattern at the front entry, reconstruction of the stage house at the south elevation, and raising the existing roof height to 55 feet to accommodate a new fly loft. Changes will occur on the north, east, and south elevations. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit. This is a **Structure of Merit: "Former First Baptist Church."** The building is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit for improvements within the Victoria Street Right-of-Way. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011.)

Actual time: 2:33

Present: Jason Currie, Project Manager, PMSM
 Derek Westen, Board Member, Ensemble Theater Company
 Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the narrowing of Victoria Street, the radical change to the historic streetscape, and traffic circulation.

John Rowbottom, adjacent neighbor, commented on property line, how both buildings relate along the driveway, common trash enclosure, and iron handrail incompleteness.

Public comment closed at 3:07 p.m.

Chair Suding disclosed that he met with Rob Dayton, City Principal Transportation Planner, with respect to the proposed configuration of the sidewalk and planter along Victoria Street.

Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely for colors and details with the following comments and conditions:

1. The applicant's sensitivity to the historic resource is appreciated.
2. The Commission directs Staff to begin the process of designating the site as a City Landmark.
3. The extent and hard work of the applicant's drawings is appreciated.
4. Resolve the neighbor interface with respect to proximity, access issues, and other concerns.
5. Study using a larger tree than the *Stenocarpus* to replace the London Plane trees.
6. Provide a cut-sheet for the Quick Crete planters.
7. Reconfigure the lay-out of the sidewalk near the diagonal curve to widen the perceived distance between the two sidewalk edges.
8. A mid-block crosswalk should be left out of the project as it may not be a wise idea at the proposed location.
9. The step lights proposed in the risers are not acceptable.
10. Reconsider a color more appropriate to the Gothic Revival style. The proposed blue color needs more substantiation and research.
11. It was suggested that the paneling above the stage door be diagonal.
12. Plan where the expansion screeds will be placed on large expansions of plaster.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/1/1. (Suding opposed to public encroachment for use of private building. Winick abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. **1224 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-039
 Application Number: MST2012-00071
 Owner: Eric and Cynthia Meyer
 Architect: AB Design Studio, Inc.

(Proposal for a new ground floor storefront system with associated four square foot addition, removal of decorative bas-relief plaster elements from under the second floor windows and installation of a wrought iron detail, and replacement of the six windows on the second story.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2012.)

Actual time: 3:44

Present: Clay Aurell and Eric Behr, Architects
Eric Meyer, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. The tile selection is acceptable.
2. The column on the second floor as proposed is acceptable.
3. Keep the framing of the storefronts simple and clean.
4. Provide a visual support by substantiating the door located under the column between the two buildings.

Action: Orías/Winick, 8/0/1. (Suding abstained.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

5. 801 PASEO NUEVO

C-2 Zone

(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
Application Number: MST2010-00338
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio
Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

(Final Approval of the Phase II improvements is requested. Phase I received final approval on August 31, 2011. Project was last reviewed on January 4, 2012.)

Actual time: 4:03

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Straw vote: How many Commissioners feel that a more traditional lighting pole should be proposed?
1/7.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned how the proposed monumental column fits in with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 4:15 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of Phase II and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details with the following conditions:

1. The height of the proposed fountain surround is more appropriate than was presented previously.
2. The proportions of all proposed columns are acceptable.
3. Consider the stability of the fountain column.
4. Eliminate the cantilever on the fountain surround.
5. The fountain bottom and side should be a dark tile.
6. Investigate the appropriate depth of the fountain pool.
7. All sculptures shall reflect a more Hispanic inspiration.
8. Consider public art input.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

HLC Representative: Donald Sharpe; and Craig Shallenberger for Item G.

Time Adjourned: 12:00 p.m.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 26 CHAPALA ST

R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00176
 Owner: Dario Pini
 Architect: Bryan Murphy

(The 10,000 square foot project site is currently developed with a 5,602 square foot, 11-unit apartment/hotel complex. The proposed project involves exterior alterations including the replacement of all existing windows, extending an existing second-floor balcony corridor and adding a 36" porch wall, a facade remodel, relocation of an as-built trash enclosure, and a revised landscape plan including the replacement of two existing 12-foot tall palm trees canopy trees. The discretionary applications required for this project are zoning modifications to allow alterations within the required 10'-0" front setback on Mason Street and a reduction of the required outdoor living space. No additional square footage is proposed. The parcel is non-conforming with 11 existing parking spaces to remain, but the parking lot will be repaved with permeable pavers and reconfigured to comply with the Americans With Disabilities Act. This application addresses violations called out in ENF2010-00250.)

(Review After Final of change to roof pitch over balcony corridor to allow majority of existing roof to remain.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 202 STATE ST****HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-018
Application Number: MST2012-00010
Owner: Howe Family Partnership
Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis Architectes
Business Name: Road House Bar & Grill

(Proposal to permit as-built outdoor patio furniture, umbrellas, heaters, lighting, and heavy wooden post screen at palm tree. Existing patio bar and fireplaces were approved under separate permits.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on February 1, 2012.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the condition that lighting attachment point or palm tree be no higher than 12 feet off ground.

NEW ITEM**C. 819 STATE ST E****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-010
Application Number: MST2012-00055
Owner: ESJ Centers
Architect: James Lecron
Business Name: Swarovsky

(Proposed exterior alterations on an existing retail store. On the State Street elevation, the horizontal decorative concrete band above the entry will be repainted and the bulkhead tile will be replaced. On the paseo elevation, an existing window will be replaced with a new entry storefront door and window in the same opening.)

Continued two weeks.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 19 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-003
Application Number: MST2012-00059
Owner: Myatt W. Volentine Foundation
Applicant: Fernando Ortiz
Architect: Edwards-Pitman Architects
Engineer: Ehlen, Spiess & Haight, Inc.

(Proposal to remove three lights from an existing entry sidelight storefront and install an aluminum multi-tenant mailbox. The powder coat finish is proposed to be dark bronze in color.)

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2012.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**E. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-008
Application Number: MST2012-00063
Owner: HDG Associates
Architect: East Beach Ventures
Business Name: Hyatt Santa Barbara

(Proposal for a portable bar to be located on the pool deck under an existing canvas gazebo. Also proposed are outdoor furniture, umbrellas, cabanas, and heaters. This building is on the City's Potential Historic Resource List: "Mar Monte Hotel.")

(Second Concept Review. Project was last reviewed on February 29, 2012.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions:

1. The portable bar shall be sheathed in Sunbrella "Canvas Wheat" fabric on three sides.
2. The two sides shall have the fabric covering straight across the top, not at an angle per marked-up cut-sheet dated May 15, 2008.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**F. 117 W MASON ST R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
Application Number: MST2011-00123
Owner: Arthur Toga
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal for alterations and a 618 square foot, second-story addition, and a 30 square foot lower level addition to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed to the detached 666 square foot garage with an 824 square foot duplex above, nor to the 156 square foot storage/laundry room. No ground disturbance will occur on the site. The ground surface will be covered with a moisture barrier prior to pouring the concrete slab and if it becomes necessary to pour concrete on a level surface, clean fill such as sand will be used to create such a surface. Archeological and Chumash monitoring will be conducted per the Extended Phase 1 report dated 12/1/11. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of approximately 3,409 square feet and is proposed to address violations called out in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00416). This parcel is identified as a "Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District.")

(Project Design Approval of the project is requested. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 002-12. Project was last reviewed on August 17, 2011.)

Project Design Approval as noted on Sheet A2.2 and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**G. 502 BRINKERHOFF AVE****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-013
Application Number: MST2010-00215
Owner: Sassola III Family Trust
Architect: On Design LLC
Applicant: Patsy Stadelman

(Proposal to change the legal use of an existing 1,080 square foot single-family residence to mixed-use, install a new wheelchair lift and path of travel, and a new landing and stairs on the west elevation. The resulting mixed-use building will allow 430 square feet of residential use and 650 square feet of commercial use. No new floor area is proposed. Final Building Permit signoff for this project will abate enforcement case ENF2010-00517. This building is a Structure of Merit.)

(Review After Final of new meter enclosure on the east elevation facing Haley Street. This parcel is within the Brinkerhoff Landmark District.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:36 P.M. ****