



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 4, 2012 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Absent.
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 2:02 p.m.
BARRY WINICK – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: TBD
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:03 p.m. and again at 2:58 p.m.
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Absent
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, December 16, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Susan Gantz.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Shallanberger, Sharpe, Suding, and Winick.
Members absent: Orías.
Staff present: Limón, Gantz and Feliciano.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There will be an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, January 18, 2012, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 630 Garden Street, 2nd Floor.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Election of Chair and Vice-Chair for 2012.

Ms. Gantz opened nominations for office of Chair and Vice-Chair.

1. Nomination for Chair: **Suding**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Suding was elected as Chair.

2. Nomination for Vice-Chair: **Sharpe**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Sharpe was elected as Vice-Chair.

(Orías and Shallanberger absent.)

B. Appointments to Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to fill the following subcommittees:

1. **HLC Consent Calendar: Sharpe and Suding.** Alternate: La Voie.
2. **Sign Committee Liaison: Boucher.** Alternate: Shallanberger.
3. **Street Tree Advisory Committee: Suding.** Alternate: La Voie.
4. **Visual Art in Public Places: Vacant.** Alternate: Winick.
5. **Brinkerhoff Guidelines: La Voie, Murray and Orías.**
6. **Preservation Element: Murray and Orías.**
7. **Design Awards: Boucher, Shallanberger and Sharpe.**
8. **Designations: Boucher, Murray and Sharpe.**
9. **Events: Boucher and Sharpe.**
10. **Five-Year HLC Goals: La Voie, Murray and Orías.**
11. **Historic Surveys: Boucher, Murray and Orías.**

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

12. **Architectural Detail: La Voie, Sharpe and Winick.**
13. **Entrada de Santa Barbara: Orías, Shallanberger and Sharpe.**
14. **Highway 101 High-Occupancy Vehicle (HOV): Orías and Suding.**
15. **Lower Mission Creek Design: Orías and Suding.**
16. **Plaza De la Guerra: La Voie, Sharpe and Suding.**

C. Public comment:

John Fritsche, local resident, spoke about the idea of placement of a plaque commemorating the location of the Loughhead Aircraft Manufacturing Company at 101 State Street. He also provided written information on the historical significance of the site.

The HLC referred the discussion and proposal to the next HLC Designations Subcommittee.

- D. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meetings of November 30 and December 7, 2011; and approval of the minutes of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History Discussion/Workshops of November 9 and December 7, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 9, 2011, with respect to the SBMNH Discussion/Workshop, as corrected.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Winick abstained. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 30, 2011, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 6/0/1. (Winick abstained. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 7, 2011, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 6/0/1. (Winick abstained. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 7, 2011, with respect to the SBMNH Discussion/Workshop, as corrected.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 6/0/1. (Winick abstained. Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Orías/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Congratulations were extended to Commissioner Michael Drury who was reappointed to a second four-year term and new member Barry Winick who was welcomed as he was appointed to his first term on the HLC.

b) Commissioner Murray would be stepping down on Item 3 at 517 Chapala Street.

2. Commissioner Winick announced he would be abstaining from the last two items on the agenda.

3. Heather Baker, Project Planner, announced that the revised version of the *Historic Landmarks Commission General Design Guidelines & Meeting Procedures* that was adopted by the City Council in December 2011 is now available and copies have been distributed to the Commission. This document replaces the HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION RULES AND PROCEDURES.

4. Commissioner La Voie announced he would be absent from the next meeting.

5. Chair Suding indicated that there have been discussions with respect to the designation of the three Eucalyptus trees located at the Main Branch Library.

6. Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, announced that the position of Urban Historian/Associate Planner is now open for recruitment.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED1. **651 PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

(2:03) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2010-00338
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture
 Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

(Second review of Phase II improvements. Phase I received final approval on August 31, 2011. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Henry Lenny and Ryan Mills, Architects

Public hearing opened at 2:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed column and use of columns for commemoration.

Public comment closed at 2:14 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The profile of the proposed benches is acceptable.
2. Removal of the iron railings at the north court is appreciated.
3. Call out the finish and workmanship of all materials.
4. Provide drainage of the bench.
5. The details of the column fountain will be very important.
6. The proportions of the column height and width are appropriate according to Palladian calculations.
7. Study the height of the pool surround.
8. Continue to study the terminus of the benches so they do not compete with the base of the fountain column.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Orías absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**2. 702 LAGUNA ST**

R-3 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-023
Application Number: MST2010-00288
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority
Architect: East Beach Ventures Architecture

(Proposal for approximately 7,656 square feet of one and two-story non-residential additions at an existing Housing Authority facility. The additions consist of a 2,946 square foot first floor addition and a 2,726 square foot second floor addition to an existing 986 square foot one-story storage building (Building A), and a 1,834 square foot one-story addition to an existing 4,184 square foot one-story maintenance building (Building B). There are 59 parking spaces proposed. Planning Commission approval was given on June 16, 2011.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. A Substantial Conformance Determination was made on December 8, 2011. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-11. Project was last reviewed on September 14, 2011.)

Present: Peter Ehlen and Adrian Coulter, Architects
David Black, Landscape Architect
Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority Deputy Executive Director/COO
Kelly Brodison, City Assistant Planner

Motion: Final Approval and continued to the Consent Calendar in two weeks with the following conditions:

1. The railing should not have vertical pickets.
2. The square light fixture as proposed is not acceptable and should be more traditional.
3. The paving pattern at the entry should be simplified or reference a Spanish style.
4. The proposed "taffy" body color is not acceptable.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 6/1/1. (La Voie opposed. Winick abstained. Orías absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:55 P.M. TO 3:00 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**3. 517 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: H & R Investments, LP
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects, LLC

(The project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development (19,781 square foot net; 21,683 square foot gross) with six residential condominium units (totaling 10,147 square feet) and two commercial condominium spaces (totaling 2,729 square feet). One of the residential units would be affordable.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 030-06 and City Council decision of June 22, 2010. Project was last reviewed on October 26, 2011.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect
 Carrie Bingham, Designer

Public hearing opened at 3:07 p.m. and reopened at 3:26 p.m.

Susie Thompson, neighbor, commented on residential permit parking.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on citizen concerns of large buildings on Chapala Street; and impact on historic resources.

Tony Vassallo, neighbor, commented on the plate height of the first story garage facing the alley and also provided written comments.

Wanda Livernois, neighbor, commented on incompatibility with neighborhood; and size, bulk and scale.

Robert Maxim, local resident, commented on minimal setbacks and parking.

Public comment closed at 3:18 p.m. and reclosed at 3:27 p.m.

- Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for final details:**
1. The architectural detailing is acceptable and is in conformance with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
 2. The vent on the west elevation # 3, detail # 17 on A8.04 shall be eliminated.
 3. Although objectionable, and based on the appeals to the City Council, the Commission reluctantly accepts the project with its proposed size, bulk and scale per City Council approval.
 4. The project meets the required Compatibility Analysis Criteria based solely on City Council approval and direction to the Commission.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 3/3/1. (Boucher/Drury/Sharpe opposed. Winick abstained. Murray stepped down. Orías absent.) **Motion failed.**

After a brief discussion, Commissioner Drury indicated his desire to change his vote and a revote was taken.

Reconsidered

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 4/2/1. (Boucher/Sharpe opposed. Winick abstained. Murray stepped down. Orías absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00):**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 1800 EL ENCANTO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-020
Application Number: MST2011-00432
Owner: Suzanne Finamore
Architect: Eric Mossman

(Proposal for alterations to the main residence and two legal guest houses to include the following: In the main house, replacement of several existing windows with French doors, replacement of aluminum sliders with new French doors, installation of new French doors facing the courtyard; demolition of approximately 100 square feet of floor area illegally constructed in the 1960's and located in the courtyard; like-for-like replacement of six existing wood garage doors on the two detached three-car garages; six new fireplace chimneys; and replacement of existing aluminum windows with new wood windows. In the guest houses: addition of new fireplace chimneys, addition of a new window, and replacement of an aluminum slider with new French doors. All colors to match existing. No new floor area is proposed. These structures are on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested, with particular focus on chimney caps and the support of two overhead elements on the south elevation of the main house. Additionally, an alternate garage door design will be presented. Project was last reviewed on the Full Commission agenda on December 7, 2011.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:33 P.M. ****