



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 7, 2011 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:00 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present.
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:16 p.m.
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present until 2:47 p.m.
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary – Present until 1:50 p.m.
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present at 1:45 p.m.

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, December 2, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:01 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe, and Suding.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Limón (left at 1:16), Berman (left at 2:47), Gantz, Feliciano (arrived at 1:45), and Shafer (left at 1:50).

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 30, 2011.

Motion: To postpone the review of the November 9, 2011, workshop minutes and the November 30, 2011, minutes to the next HLC meeting scheduled for January 4, 2012.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item D, which was reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding abstained from Item B, 35 State Street.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Commissioner Boucher reported on the December 6 City Council approval of three Landmark Designations that were recommended by the Commission.
2. Commissioner La Voie reported on a proposed minor restoration to occur at the Old Mission. The circa 1952 window above the front entry doors will be replaced with a new window having the configuration of the original window and which will allow the sun, on the winter solstice, to shine through the window and illuminate the location of the original tabernacle.
3. Commissioner Drury announced that he would be leaving at 7:15 p.m. and Commissioner Shalanberger announced he would be leaving at 5:00 p.m.
4. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a. Chair Suding would be stepping down from Item 6, 902 Chapala Street.
 - b. The next HLC meeting will take place on Wednesday, January 4, 2012.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 117 W MASON ST**

R-4/SD-3 Zone

(1:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-101-003
Application Number: MST2011-00123
Owner: Arthur Toga
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(This parcel is identified as a "Contributing property to the Potential West Beach Historic District." Proposal for alterations and a 618 square foot, second-story addition and a 30 square foot lower level addition, to an existing 1,115 square foot, one-story single-family residence. No changes are proposed to the detached 666 square foot garage with an 824 square foot duplex above, and to the 156 square foot storage/laundry room. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for zoning modifications. Project requires Coastal Review on this 5,539 square foot parcel located in the appealable and non-appealable jurisdictions of the Coastal Zone. The project will result in total development on site of approximately 3,409 square feet and is proposed to address violations called out in Zoning Information Report (ZIR2010-00416).)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Western Points Archaeology and an Extended Phase I Cultural Resources Investigation and Addendum Report prepared by A. Toren of Compass Rose Archaeological, Inc.)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that the reports were reviewed by both Environmental Analyst Melissa Hetrick and Dr. Glassow who agreed with the reports' conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 1:07 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with its recommendation that construction be monitored by a qualified archaeologist and a recognized Chumash Native American with the conditions outlined on page 9 of the Extended Phase I Cultural Resource Investigation prepared by George Toren of Compass Rose Archaeological, Inc.

Action: Boucher/Sharp, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**2. 1800 EL ENCANTO RD**

E-1 Zone

(1:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-020
Application Number: MST2011-00432
Owner: Suzanne Finamore
Architect: Eric Mossman

(Proposal for alterations to the main residence and two legal guest houses to include the following: In the main house, replacement of several existing windows with French doors, replacement of aluminum sliders with new French doors, installation of new French doors facing the courtyard; demolition of approximately 100 square feet of floor area illegally constructed in the 1960's and located in the courtyard; like-for-like replacement of six existing wood garage doors on the two detached three-car garages; six new fireplace chimneys; and replacement of existing aluminum windows with new wood windows. In the guest houses: addition of new fireplace chimneys, addition of a new window, and replacement of an aluminum slider with new French doors. All colors to match existing. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Request by Staff to add this residence to the City of Santa Barbara List of Potential Historic Structures and Sites.)

Present: Eric Mossman, Architect
Suzanne Finamore, Owner

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, requested that, in lieu of the preparation of a Historic Structures Report, the Commission nominate the property to be placed on the City of Santa Barbara List of Potential Historic Structures and Sites, followed by a review and discussion of proposed changes to the structure as a separate agenda item. The basis for this request is that the structure was designed by the famous architectural firm of Edwards-Plunkett, and it has architectural character worth preserving. Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, clarified that adding the property to the Potential List would give the Commission purview over the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 1:11 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident commented that placement of this property on the Potential List should not preclude a Historic Structures Report.

Public comment closed at 1:14 p.m.

Motion: To accept Staff's recommendation to add the structure to the City of Santa Barbara List of Potential Historic Structures and Sites.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 1800 EL ENCANTO RD**

E-1 Zone

(1:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-020
Application Number: MST2011-00432
Architect: Eric Mossman
Owner: Suzanne Finamore

(Proposal for alterations to the main residence and two legal guest houses to include the following: In the main house, replacement of several existing windows with French doors, replacement of aluminum sliders with new French doors, installation of new French doors facing the courtyard; demolition of approximately 100 square feet of floor area illegally constructed in the 1960's and located in the courtyard; like-for-like replacement of six existing wood garage doors on the two detached three-car garages; six new fireplace chimneys; and replacement of existing aluminum windows with new wood windows. In the guest houses: addition of new fireplace chimneys, addition of a new window, and replacement of an aluminum slider with new French doors. All colors to match existing. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed on the Consent agenda on November 30, 2011.)

Present: Eric Mossman, Architect
Suzanne Finamore, Owner

Public comment opened at 1:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the heating of rooms historically, and that the preparation of a Historic Structures Report is necessary.

Public comment closed at 1:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued to the January 4, 2012, Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. The overall impact and project is supportable.
2. The structure being brought back to its original state is appreciated.
3. The owner is encouraged to concur with Staff's request to place the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Structures and Sites, and in the preparation of a Historic Structures Letter Report.
4. Eliminate the exposed wood over the door on the north elevation.
5. Vary the chimney cap sizes and provide more traditional detailing on the plans.
6. Provide some sort of support for the two overhead elements on the south elevation; iron grille work was suggested.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(1:43) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
 Application Number: MST2010-00261
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Thomas Conti

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 36 feet and the new road bed width will be 60 feet.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137. Project was last reviewed on November 9, 2011.)

Present: John Ewasiuk, City Principal Engineer
 David Black, Landscape Architect
 Pat Kelly, City Assistant Public Works Director

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m.

Lee Moldaver, Santa Barbara Creeks and Watersheds Advisory Committee: saving of sycamore tree, compatibility with unique nature of neighborhood, narrower bridge and expanse, and request for range of other options and scenarios.

Eddie Harris, Santa Barbara Urban Creeks Council: saving of sycamore tree, appropriate habitat, lack of slope banks, and narrower bridge.

Mark Romasanta, local business owner: spoke in favor of the project.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: Continued to the January 4, 2012, meeting with the following comments:

1. The sloped banks are essential to the success of this project.
2. Continue to study reduction of the sidewalk width.
3. Provide a plan showing Kimberly Avenue as a one-way street with a reduced throat.
4. Show Sycamores on the west side of Mission Creek in close proximity to the existing Sycamore.
5. Although some Commissioners felt that the project is a good balance, the majority found that a further effort towards balance needs to be made, bringing the bridge closer to neighborhood compatibility.
6. Provide plan showing a minimized (side-to-side) width of the bridge. Shrinking the width of the bridge should be done so as to protect the Sycamore tree. If the Sycamore tree is ultimately proposed to be removed, mitigation measures shall be clearly shown on the plans.
7. Appropriately significant sized trees shall be proposed.
8. Return with studies of proposed material and color for the bridge railings and abutments; earth tones were suggested.

Action: Orías/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:39 P.M. TO 2:46 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 215 E FIGUEROA ST

R-3 Zone

(2:46) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-037
 Application Number: MST2011-00424
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Jeff Gorrell, Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Architect: Howard Leach, Leach Mounce Architects

(Early concept review for a proposal to demolish an existing 28,025 square foot Police Station building, including on-grade parking and driveways, and construct a new 48 foot tall, 58,005 square foot Police Facility in three levels above ground over an 89,651 square foot two-level subterranean parking garage providing 187 parking stalls. Twenty-three at grade parking spaces would also be provided. A rezone to the C-2 zoning designation is proposed. Planning Commission and City Council approval is requested.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission and City Council approval.)

Present: Joshua Haggmark, City Principal Engineer
 Jeff Gorrell and Howard Leach, Architects
 Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Staff comments: Joshua Haggmark, City Project Manager, stated that the purpose of this review was to receive comments as to whether the project is headed in the right direction. The City Council has deemed this as a high priority project. Staff is working on providing the Council with a conceptual plan and cost estimate for possibly placing the project on the November 2012 ballot.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would support the building in its current proposed architectural style? 2/4/2 (Boucher/Drury/La Voie/ Sharpe opposed. Murray/Orías abstained.)

How many Commissioners would prefer an architectural style that is more in keeping with a civic building? 4/2/2. (Shallanberger/Suding opposed. Murray/Orías abstained.)

Public comment opened at 3:13 p.m.

The following people spoke in favor of the project:

Mary Lynn Arroyo, Police Officer, Police Officers Association.

David Whitham, Police Lieutenant, Combined Communication Center.

The following people expressed concerns:

Paul Cook, neighbor: compatibility to neighborhood in height, solar access, and closeness to residential versus commercial.

Steve Hoegerman, neighbor: transitional residential neighborhood not compatible with proposed project.

Sasha Kapernekas, neighboring owner: non-conformance with small cottages.

Paul Kontos, neighbor: conformity with building height of neighborhood.

Kellam de Forest, local resident: reuse of building more sustainable than demolition; careful design of façade; bulk reduced to be less monumental; and other site consideration.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The program requirements exceed the size of the site.
2. Explore any and all height reductions. The proposed mass, bulk, and scale would only work in the fact that this is a community priority building.
3. Pull away the basement at the front of the property line to enhance the pedestrian plaza at the sidewalk level.
4. Step back and increase the setback, particularly on the east property line where the project faces the bungalows; and reduce the size, bulk and scale on this side as well.
5. The atrium is a positive element.
6. Explore developing the rear of the property.
7. The lighting needed for this building is of concern.
8. Antennas need to be incorporated into the design.
9. Carefully study the roof itself and the equipment that penetrate the roof.
10. Simplify the embellishments.
11. The proposed building is too much, too ornate, and too friendly.
12. Findings for compatibility with existing neighborhood will be very difficult, if not impossible, since the proposed front side facing Figueroa Street would need to relate to the style of the neighborhood.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. 902 CHAPALA ST A

C-2 Zone

(4:08) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
 Application Number: MST2011-00347
 Owner: Cynthia Howard Gift Trust
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Kupiec Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 8,818 square foot two-story building and construct a 49'-0" tall, four-story, mixed-use building including 10,878 square feet of commercial floor area and 8,989 square feet of residential floor area. There will be four 2-bedroom units and four 1-bedroom units for a total of eight residential units. The project includes 20 covered ground level parking spaces and is located in the 100% parking zone of benefit. Total development on site will be 28,028 square feet on a 16,868 square foot parcel. Historic Landmarks Commission approval of a Development Plan is requested to allow the construction of 2,060 square feet of new Measure E floor area.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Development Plan Approval findings. The project was last reviewed on November 9, 2011.)

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS
Bob Kupiec and Jaime Palencia, Architects
Philip Suding, Landscape Architect

Staff Comments: Heather Baker, AICP Project Planner presented a memo to assist the HLC with project compatibility analysis, listing design guidelines suggested for special consideration by the HLC.

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed height and that the Chapala Street façade needs to be addressed.

Public comment closed at 4:25 p.m.

- Motion:** **Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely with the following comments:**
1. Further develop the southeast corner plaza design to include items of interest.
 2. Design the top of the tower in a more Hispanic style.
 3. All six of the Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been met and the proposal is in accordance with the *Pedestrian Master Plan, Urban Design Guidelines, El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines*, and tentatively in conformity with the guidelines described in the *Historic Landmarks Commission General Design Guidelines and Meeting Procedures* for project sustainability given that the project is not yet fully designed.
 4. **Development Plan Approval findings were made as follows:**
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, based on a preliminary plan check review by Planning Division staff. The plans will undergo further zoning plan check review to ensure compliance when submitted to the Building & Safety Division;
 - b. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning, as determined by the project's consistency with the City's General Plan;
 - c. The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the neighborhood's aesthetics/character in that the size, bulk, or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood;
 - d. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact upon City and South Coast affordable housing stock;
 - e. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's water resources as there will be no significant increase in water use, which is consistent with the General Plan;
 - f. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's traffic, and resources will be available and traffic improvements will be in place at the time of project occupancy per 28.87.300.D.1.F.and G according to Supervising Transportation Planner Steve Foley, who reviewed the traffic analysis performed by Associated Transportation Engineers dated November 15, 2011.
- Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 5/2/0. (Murray/Sharpe against. Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**NEW ITEM****A. 229 E VICTORIA ST R-O Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-072-009
Application Number: MST2011-00440
Owner: Architect, Foundation of Santa Barbara
Architect: Lori Kari

(Proposal to repaint an existing office building. This is a designated **Structure of Merit: "Acheson Residence."**)

(Project requires Historic Resource Findings.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted and the following Historic Resource Findings were made: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 35 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
Application Number: MST2011-00065
Applicant: Michael Rosenfeld / 35 State Street Partners
Applicant: DesignARC

(General safety related repairs and proposal to repaint the Californian Hotel.)

(Review of scrim proposal for exposed façade. This issue was last discussed on September 14, 2011.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the windows on the scrim or Sheet A3.1 be painted black.

REFERRED BY FULL COMMISSION**C. 651 PASEO NUEVO****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2010-00338
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

(Second review of Phase II improvements. Phase I received final approval on August 31, 2011. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011.)

This item was postponed to the Full Board meeting of January 4, 2011.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
 Application Number: MST2010-00200
 Owner: Hyatt Development Corporation
 Agent: Tynan Group
 Designer: Henriksen Design Associates, Inc.
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Architect: Shlemmer+ Algaze+Associates
 Landscape Architect: Carducci & Associates
 Business Name: Mar Monte Hotel

(Proposal for interior and exterior alterations including renovations to the swimming pool, lobby, spa, and guest rooms. The swimming pool coping and deck will be replaced with new, and landscaping improvements will be made in the pool area as well. Several existing stucco walls will be replaced with wrought iron railings and one existing guest room window will be replaced with sliding doors. Several guest rooms will be combined to create suites, so the number of hotel rooms will change from 174 to 170. The number of existing parking spaces of 158 will not change. Also included is to replace an existing railing and columns (in the spa lobby) with a new stucco wall. This 110,599 square foot parcel is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and will require a Coastal Exemption. The **"Santa Clara" building, one of three buildings on site, is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mar Monte Hotel."**)

(Review After Final of revised landscaping layout to the swimming pool area.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**(SANTA BARBARA MUSEUM OF NATURAL HISTORY DISCUSSION / WORKSHOP
 – SEE SEPARATE MINUTES)**

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:50 P.M. ****