



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, November 30, 2011 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 3:06 p.m. and again at 3:29 p.m.
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present until 3:06 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Absent
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, November 18, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe, and Suding.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Limón, Gantz and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Trevor Martinson, local resident, commented on the project located at 29 E. Victoria Street. He expressed concern on the recent changes made to the plans with respect to encroachment issues. Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor, responded that the applicant proposed a simple, minor alteration and the process that has been followed is consistent with the HLC Guidelines.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 9, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 9, 2011, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Sharpe, 7/0/1. (Drury abstained and Suding abstained from Items 2 and 4.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Craig Shalanberger; with the exception of Item A, which was reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following changes to the agenda:

- a) Item 2 on the agenda at 517 Chapala Street was postponed to January 4, 2012, at the applicant's request. All other items would be reviewed 40 minutes sooner than indicated.

Motion: To postpone Item 2 to the January 4, 2012, meeting.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

- b) There is a correction to the project description for Item 4 at 1216 State Street: the bus enclosure walls are proposed to be five feet tall, not 15 as stated in the mailed notice.
- c) The first Designations Subcommittee meeting of 2012 will occur on January 18th at 11 a.m. in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room on the second floor of 630 Garden Street.
- d) Quarterly Designations and Survey Subcommittee meeting dates have been scheduled and emailed to those HLC members who serve on those subcommittees.

2. Mr. Limón announced that the City Council will be reviewing the sites recommended by the Commission to be designated as City Landmarks on Tuesday, December 6, 2011, during the afternoon session. At the conclusion of the designation hearing, Jake Jacobus, former City Historian, will be recognized for his service to the City and his commitment to preservation in the community. The entire Commission was invited to attend.

Commissioners Boucher and Murray volunteered to attend the proposed landmarks discussion.

3. Commissioners Boucher and Sharpe announced they would be leaving at 5:00 p.m.

4. Commissioner Drury disclosed that he reviewed the plans for the 1722 State Street project with the applicant and offered comments.
5. Commissioner Shallenberger announced he would be leaving after the review of Item 3 due to conflicts of interest.
6. Commissioner Suding acknowledged receipt of a letter from Kent and Tammy Hodges that are in support of the expansion of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History, but expressed opposition to the current plan as proposed.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **2417 MEDCLIFF RD**

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-330-014
Application Number: MST2011-00268
Owner: Delson Family Trust
Agent: Sid Goldstien
Architect: William Demmary & Associates

(Proposal for alterations and additions to an existing 2,030 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and a detached 366 square foot garage on a 32,194 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a total of 334 square feet of one-story additions to the residence and alterations and additions to the existing garage to result in a new 498 square foot attached two-car garage. The proposed total of 2,862 square feet is 60% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio guideline. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for a Coastal Development Permit and Zoning Modifications to allow a six foot tall fence and rolling security gate to be located on the front property line.)

(Review of Phase I Archeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, as the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required, and that the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources shall be reproduced on the plans prior to building permit issuance.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**2. 517 CHAPALA ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: H & R Investments, LP
 Applicant: Peikert Group Architects, LLC
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development (19,781 square foot net; 21,683 square foot gross) with six residential condominium units (totaling 10,147 square feet) and two commercial condominium spaces (totaling 2,729 square feet). One of the residential units would be affordable.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 030-06 and City Council decision of June 22, 2010. Project was last reviewed on October 26, 2011.)

This item was postponed to the meeting of January 4, 2012.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 40 E ANAPAMU ST** C-2 Zone

(1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-002
 Application Number: MST2011-00428
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Irene Macias, Library Director
 Agent: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency
 Architect: Campbell & Campbell
 Business Name: Central Library

(Proposal to upgrade both landscape and hardscape areas in front of the Santa Barbara Public Library and the Faulkner Gallery along portions of E. Anapamu and Anacapa Streets. The improvements would include approximately 3,200 square feet of additional hardscape, 500 cubic yards of imported fill, a reduction in turf area and in total trees from 49 to 30, a new fountain, seating, artwork display areas, lighting, and an approximately 4,500 square foot activity space. No changes to the building are proposed.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Irene Macías, Library Services Manager
 Peggy Burbank, Redevelopment Specialist
 Douglas Campbell and Regula Campbell, Architects, Campbell & Campbell

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m. and reopened at 2:43 p.m.

The following people spoke in favor of the project in general, not necessarily the proposal before the Commission:

Eric Kelley, local business owner.

Larry Feinberg, Santa Barbara Museum of Art Director.

Eik Kahng, Santa Barbara Museum of Art Chief Curator.

Ginny Brush, (City Arts Advisory Committee's) Visual Arts in Public Spaces Committee, provided a letter as well.

Steve Cushman, Chamber of Commerce President.

Lynne Tahmisian, La Arcada Representative.

The following people expressed concerns:

Robert Burke, local resident – financing source for the project, purview of Commission on legality of funding for the project, and people issues versus plans/concrete.

Mary Louise Days, local historian – removal of existing Eucalyptus trees and cluttering of permanent objects obscuring the space.

Kellam de Forest, local resident – celebration of historic Faulkner Gallery building, use of a water feature, and preservation of existing trees.

Eric Friedman, City Library Advisory Board Chair – return to historic design, and Eucalyptus tree removal to maximize and make space more usable.

W. Scott Burns, local resident – left a note commenting on the need for better lighting.

Frank Goss, local resident – large Eucalyptus trees as fire hazards and safety issues.

Public comment closed at 2:27 p.m. and reclosed at 2:44 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Renovation of the Library Plaza is long overdue.
2. The lack of formality to the Faulkner Gallery is perplexing.
3. The Faulkner Gallery should be celebrated.
4. Original library entrance should not have any added art placed in front of it.
5. Better visibility of the original library entrance is paramount.
6. Pay attention to the balance of opening up the visibility of the original library entrance and the blank walls.
7. Explore visibility of the whole library building.
8. Keep planted and built items in the space low and sight-lines open.
9. Provide a demolition and tree removal plan.
10. Proposed landscape plan is not compliant with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines and is too contemporary.
11. The majority of the Commission would like the applicant to continue to study the retention of the Eucalyptus trees. Skyline trees are important in the downtown area.
12. Lighting fixture style should be exemplary for this space.
13. Original Faulkner fountains should be looked at as an element to be reimplemented.
14. Safety of the pool or fountain needs to be considered.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:06 P.M. TO 3:09 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1216 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2011-00435
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center of Performing Arts
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal to regrade and repave an existing parking lot north of the Granada theatre and construct two residential garages of 485 square feet and 595 square feet, a new trash enclosure, and 15 foot tall walls to enclose bus/truck parking serving the theatre. The new garages will serve the residential units located in the Granada Tower. Planning Commission review is requested.)

(Comments only; one time only review of the project concept.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The tight geometry of the site is of concern.
2. Continue processing this project through departmental review, specially the Fire Department.
3. Provide landscaping at the north-south paseo as it runs from the existing alley out to State Street.
4. Study a different architectural solution with respect to the garages. Although the proposed design is in conformity with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines, it is not within the context.
5. Consider opportunities for the elimination of potential graffiti on walls.
6. Study an integration between the two paving materials at the existing concrete alley and the proposed asphalt bus parking/garage area.

Commissioners Shallanberger and Sharpe absent.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 101 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-006
 Application Number: MST2011-00171
 Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 714 square foot laundry building and 40 space parking lot and construct a new 27,011 square foot, three-story hotel with 34 guest rooms and a 34 space, at-grade parking garage. Planning Commission review is requested for Zoning Modifications, development plan approval, and a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; no action. Project was last reviewed on August 3, 2011.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
 Mark Romasanta, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on compatibility of design with neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

The Commission made the following comments.

1. The early review of this project is appreciated.
2. The architecture is acceptable and consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
3. The one-way traffic solution is the preference of the majority of the Commission.
4. Show a simulation of the view up State Street.
5. The long wall at the back of the sidewalk on State Street may benefit from a decorative tile element, a water feature or an art element to enhance the pedestrian experience.
6. The plaza at the corner of Mason and State Streets needs to be more pleasant and purposeful, and more engaged with the public sidewalk.
7. Study the use of anti-tagging material.

Shallanberger absent.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:50 P.M. TO 4:05 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

6. **1700 E CABRILLO BLVD** P-R/SD-3 Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00315
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jill Zachary and Jan Hubbell
 Agent: Kathy Frye, Natural Areas Planner

(This parcel is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Andree Clark Bird Refuge; Site of Chumash Village and Salt Pond, 42 acres." Included on the State Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to remove and restore 0.86 acres of marsh vegetation within the lake, around three public viewing platforms, and along various locations along the perimeter of the lake; maintenance of a concrete culvert and a grouted sandstone culvert along Old Coast Highway including removal of 453 cubic yards of silt and vegetation from those man-made structures; and restoration of bird refuge native habitats.)

(Final Approval of the Project is requested. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 023-11. This was last reviewed on August 17, 2011.)

Present: Kathy Frye, City Natural Areas Planner

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Orías abstained. Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 34 W VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
Application Number: MST2009-00266
Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architecture
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (formerly Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 26,538 square feet of commercial/retail space, 37 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 81 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height.)

(Review After Final of changes including refinements to construction documents and details, new gate and wall refinement at market trash area, and reconfiguration of market roof skylights.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 114 NATOMA AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-072-009
Application Number: MST2011-00155
Owner: Steven D. Krieg
Architect: Amy Taylor

(Proposal to repair and rebuild dryrot-damaged rear decks and stairs at the front and rear of a multi-family complex. The front elevation second floor walkway will also be widened by 18" and the rotted wood balcony railing will be replaced with a new wrought iron railing. New exterior light fixtures are also proposed.)

(Review After Final of the following changes: door replacements; door alteration at unit 118; repair of plaster guardrail and increase of plaster to 42" height; cripple wall repair; framing replacement; and waterproofing.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on A-4.1.

NEW ITEM**C. 1800 EL ENCANTO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-020
Application Number: MST2011-00432
Architect: Eric Mossman
Owner: Suzanne Finamore

(Proposal for alterations to the main residence and two legal guest houses to include the following: In the main house, replacement of several existing windows with French doors, replacement of aluminum sliders with new French doors, installation of new French doors facing the courtyard; demolition of approximately 100 square feet of floor area illegally constructed in the 1960's and located in the courtyard; like-for-like replacement of six existing wood garage doors on the two detached three-car garages; six new fireplace chimneys; and replacement of existing aluminum windows with new wood windows. In the guest houses: addition of new fireplace chimneys, addition of a new window, and replacement of an aluminum slider with new French doors. All colors to match existing. No new floor area is proposed.)

Comments given and continued to December 7, 2011, Full Board meeting.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 424 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
Application Number: MST2011-00342
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Applicants: ATC Design Group/Henry Lenny Design Studio
Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture
Business Name: 99 Cent Store

(Proposal to enclose a 733 square foot patio/arcade on an existing 11,500 square foot, two-story commercial building and alterations including the following: a new façade on the State Street elevation, infill of several overhead roll-up doors and new entry on the north elevation, new parking lot striping and landscaping, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is to repave the existing paseo between State Street and the existing, 25-space parking lot in the rear with brick. Total development on site will total 12,233 square feet.)

(Review After Final of the addition of new awnings on the State Street frontage.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**E. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-004
 Application Number: MST2011-00279
 Owner: HDG Associates/Jeffrey Hansen
 Applicant: Tynan Group

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Mar Monte Hotel." Proposal to convert 10 underground parking spaces to 1,900 sq. ft. of storage space, create a valet parking plan for the underground parking, and to relocate two existing ADA accessible parking spaces for 1111 E. Cabrillo Blvd. and 1039 Orilla Del Mar. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Second Concept Review; project requires Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on July 20, 2011.)

Project Design and Final Approvals with Development Plan Approval findings made as follows:

1. The proposed development complies with all provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, based on a preliminary plan check review by Planning Division staff. The plans will undergo further zoning plan check review to ensure compliance when submitted to the Building & Safety Division; and,
2. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning, as determined by the project's consistency with the City's General Plan; and,
3. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact upon City and South Coast affordable housing stock because the new floor area will be used for storage purposes only; and,
4. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's water resources as there will be no expected increase in water use resulting from the proposed project, which is consistent with the General Plan; and,
5. It will not have a significant unmitigated adverse impact on the City's traffic because the floor area will be used for storage purposes only; and
6. Resources will be available and traffic improvements, if required, will be in place at the time of project occupancy.

NEW ITEM**F. 731 DE LA GUERRA PLAZA****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-026
 Application Number: MST2011-00436
 Owner: Richard Schmidt & Gwen Buswell
 Applicant: Gloria Gonzalez
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: Tony Ray's Restaurant

(Proposal for a 1,033 square foot retractable awning with wrought iron posts to be installed over the rear patio of an existing restaurant.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:18 P.M.
 UNTIL THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING OF DECEMBER 7, 2011.****