



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

Wednesday, November 9, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:45 p.m.
MICHAEL BERMAN, Acting Urban Historian – Present
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, Friday, November 4, 2011, at 1:30 P.M., the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 p.m. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Orias, Shallanberger, Sharpe, and Suding.

Members absent: Drury.

Staff present: Berman, Gantz, Limón (left at 2:45), and Shafer.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment: None.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 26, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 26, 2011, as amended.

Action: LaVoie/Boucher, 5/0/2. Motion carried. (Murray and Suding abstained, Drury absent.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: To ratify the Consent Calendar of November 9, 2011 as amended. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Commissioner Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury absent.)

Mr. Limon requested explanation of the actions for Items D and G.

Mr. Sharpe explained that item D was denied because the colors were not consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines.

Mr. Limon requested that Commissioner Sharpe work with the applicant of Item G and that the item is to be referred back to staff for administrative approval prior to November 30. Staff will notify interested parties.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a. The November 23 meeting will be cancelled due to the furlough closure and the next scheduled meeting will occur on Wednesday, November 30th, with a submittal deadline of Wednesday, November 16th. There will be only one meeting in December, on the 7th.

b. Mr. Drury is absent from today's meeting.

c. Chair Suding will step down from Item 2, 902 Chapala Street, and Item 4, 1722 State Street.

2. Mr. Limon made the following announcements:

a. The first concept review of the new Police Station will take place at the December 7 meeting.

b. Jake Jacobus, retiring Urban Historian, will be recognized for his years of service to the City at the December 6 City Council meeting.

3. Ms. Orias reported on the recent passing of Mrs. Gebhard and wished to recognize Mrs. Gebhard for her years of service to the City of Santa Barbara.

4. Mr. LaVoie announced that he will leave at 5:15 p.m.

5. Ms. Orias announced that she will leave at 5:00 p.m.

6. Mr. Suding announced that a holiday party will be held in early December at Commissioner Sharpe's home.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Mr. Limon reported that Landmark Designation meetings will continue when the vacant Urban Historian position is filled.
2. Ms. Orias reported that the Historic Resources Element Subcommittee will meet Thursday, November 10 for discussion of goals and policies.
3. Mr. Suding reported on the November 3 Street Tree Advisory Committee meeting and field trip to the Library Plaza. There was discussion of the concept plan which will require removal of three significant Eucalyptus trees and the removal or relocation of additional trees.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT1. **1020 PLACIDO AVE**

R-4 Zone

(1:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-008
Application Number: MST2011-00252
Owner: Abigail Solomon-Godeau
Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story 2,271 square foot single-family residence to be converted to a congregate care facility. The exterior alterations include a new accessible parking space, accessible ramp, stairs, trash enclosure, deck, and site walls exceeding 3.5 feet in the front yard.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone of Dudek.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that, due to minimal risk of encountering archaeological resource materials, the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources shall apply and be reproduced on the plans prior to building permit issuance.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Drury absent.)

Commissioner Orias requested that a photograph of the home be provided with future archeological reports. Ms. Gantz agreed to check the MEA guidelines.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**2. 902 CHAPALA ST A**

C-2 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
 Application Number: MST2011-00347
 Owner: Cynthia Howard Gift Trust
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Kupiec Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 8,818 square foot two-story building and construct a 52'-6" tall, four-story, mixed-use building including 10,836 square feet of commercial floor area and 8,833 square feet of residential floor area. There will be four 2-bedroom units and four 1-bedroom units for a total of eight residential units. The project includes 22 covered ground level parking spaces and is located in the 100% parking zone of benefit. Total development on site will be 28,755 square feet on a 16,868 square foot parcel. Historic Landmarks Commission approval of a Development Plan is requested to allow the construction of 2,018 square feet of new Measure E floor area.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings. The project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011.)

Present: Bob Kupiec, Architect
 Jim Palencia, Kupiec Architects
 Philip Suding, Landscape Architect
 Trish Allen, Agent

Public comment was opened at 2:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest: concerned that the project is too big and serves no public purpose.

Public comment was closed at 2:13 p.m.

Steve Foley, Public Works Transportation Engineer, provided staff comments concerning guidelines applicable to the project.

Straw vote: Who feels the sidewalks are adequate as presented? Chair Sharpe indicated that a majority of Commissioners support the sidewalks as presented.

Straw vote: Who feels the sidewalks should be wider?

Chair Sharpe indicated that a majority of the Commission felt the sidewalk width on both W. Canon Perdido and Chapala Streets is adequate.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments:

- 1) The architecture is acceptable as presented.
- 2) The corner entry is acceptable.
- 3) Provide a more consistent arch design throughout the project.
- 4) There are differing opinions as to whether there should be a large tree at the southeast courtyard entry.
- 5) Some Commissioners are concerned the project is still too bulky, others feel the bulk is a nice trade-off for the interior courtyard.
- 6) A majority of the Commissioners can support the sidewalks as presented.
- 7) The landscaping is acceptable. Provide a water retention study.

Action: LaVoie/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Drury absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(2:44) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
Application Number: MST2010-00261
Applicant: Thomas Conti
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace the structurally deficient Mason Street Bridge over Mission Creek and increase channel capacity in accordance with the approved 2001 Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement. The existing bridge span is 35 feet and the new bridge span will be 55 feet; the existing road bed width is 36 feet and the new road bed width will be 60 feet.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires compliance with City Council Resolution No. 01-137.)

Present: Don Spagnolo, Public Works Project Manager
John Ewasiuk, Public Works Engineer
David Black, Landscape Architect

Michael Berman provided background comments and remained available to respond to questions.

Public comment was opened at 2:58 p.m.

Mark Romasanta: addressed road width concerns, sidewalks, turning radius, and the "taking" of public property.

Eddie Harris: addressed concerns about health and productivity of the Creek; potential EIR requirement for removal of the historic Sycamore tree; suggested narrowing the sidewalks.

Chris Casebeer, opposed, deferred his speaking time to Ms. French.

Le Anne French, Creeks Advisory Committee: addressed concerns with tree preservation, suggested narrowing the bridge, and consideration of the type of railing used.

Virginia Hunter: concerned about the order of construction projects, and possible flooding if the Cabrillo Bridge is not addressed first.

Mary Louise Days: expressed concern about removal of the Sycamore trees and questioned whether a historic structures report had been prepared. Mr. Berman responded that several reports have been prepared.

Public comment was closed at 3:11 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments:

- 1) The Sycamore tree is to be preserved *in situ*.
- 2) The bridge width is to be narrowed to the extent possible.
- 3) Slope the banks of the creek to the maximum extent possible.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Shallanberger abstained. Drury absent)

Note: 1) Staff agreed to inform homeowners on this block when they are no longer found within the flood plain. 2) The road should be reduced to one-way and narrowed to enable a tree to be saved.

****THE COMMISSION RECESSED AT 3:30 P.M. AND RECONVENED AT 3:33 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 1722 STATE ST**

C-2/R-1 Zone

(3:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-021
 Application Number: MST2011-00189
 Owner: 1722 State Street Investors, LLC
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser
 Business Name: Former Bank of America

(Proposal to convert an existing two-story, 7,200 square foot bank building to a new surgery center and construct a 5,721 square foot, two-story addition. The existing 52 parking spaces will remain and new landscaping will be added to this 28,875 square foot parcel. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Conditional Use Permit, a Development Plan, a Transfer of Existing Development Rights and a Tentative Subdivision Map for up to eight commercial condominiums. The previously approved mixed-use project is proposed to be withdrawn.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission review. This project was last reviewed on May 25, 2011.)

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect
 Jay Blatter, Architect
 Phil Suding, Landscape Architect

Public comment was opened at 3:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest: concerned that the arches do not enter into something of significance; questioned whether 18 feet is enough space for circulation.

Jerry Wheeler: in support of the project; the project is an upgrade to the neighborhood.

Public comment was closed at 3:46 p.m.

Straw vote: How many support the side yard setback relief with saw-tooth and additional canopy trees? 4/2 (Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Shallenberger, in favor)

Straw vote: how many find the architecture acceptable as presented? 2/4 (Murray, Shallenberger in favor)

Failed

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with the finding that the Compatibility Analysis criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.22.14.B and 22.68.045.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
- 2) The side yard setback for parking is supported with the condition that additional trees be planted in available areas within the saw-tooth area.
- 3) The architecture needs further refinement for consistency with the EPV Guidelines.

Action: Shallenberger/ Motion failed for lack of a second.

Failed

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with the finding that the Compatibility Analysis criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.22.14.B and 22.68.045.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable.
- 2) The side yard setback for parking is supported with the condition that additional trees be planted in available areas within the saw-tooth area.
- 3) The architecture is not compatible with the EPV Guidelines and Charter, and is inappropriate for the neighborhood.

Action: Murray/ Motion failed for lack of a second.

Motion: Continued to the Planning Commission with the finding that the Compatibility Analysis criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.22.14.B and 22.68.045.B of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and return to the Full board with the following comments:

- 1) The Commission had generally positive comments to the architecture.
- 2) The proposed parking set backs are supported.
- 3) The architecture is to be modulated to be more in keeping with the EPV Design Guidelines and Hispanic style.
- 4) The architecture is compatible with the EPV Guidelines and is appropriate for the neighborhood

Action: Shallenberger/Murray, 3/2/1. Motion carried. (Boucher/Suding opposed. Sharpe abstained. Suding stepped down. Drury absent)

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

NEW ITEM

A. 1129 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
 Application Number: MST2011-00398
 Owner: 1129 State Street
 Architect: Thomas McMahon, AIA

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources: "San Marcos Court Building."** Proposal to divide a current rear tenant space into four units, necessitating the installation of three pairs of single-light, oil-rubbed bronze entry doors which will match the existing. No new floor area is proposed.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 0-300 W CABRILLO BLVD****HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
Application Number: MST2011-00364
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Ashleigh Shue

(Proposal to repair and replace failing brick crosswalks with alternative material in several locations along W. Cabrillo Blvd.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project was last reviewed at Full Board on October 26, 2011.)

Final Approval as submitted of all locations on West Cabrillo Blvd per Attachment 2.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 424 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
Application Number: MST2011-00342
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Applicant: ATC Design Group
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture
Business Name: 99 Cent Store

(Proposal to enclose a 733 square foot patio/arcade on an existing 11,500 square foot, two-story commercial building and alterations including the following: a new facade on the State Street elevation, infill of several overhead roll-up doors and new entry on the north elevation, new parking lot striping and landscaping, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is to repave the existing paseo between State Street and the existing, 25-space parking lot in the rear with brick. Total development on site will total 12,233 square feet.)

(Final Approval of architectural details including new window awnings and plant material is requested. Project was last reviewed on October 26, 2011.)

Final Approval of the details as noted on Sheets A-4, A-4.1 and A-5.0.

NEW ITEM**D. 820 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-024
Application Number: MST2011-00408
Owner: El Paseo LLC
Applicant: SignCraft

(Proposal for window awning fabric replacement. The existing decorative iron awning supports and finials will remain. Signage on the awnings will be reviewed under SGN2011-00133.)

Application denied due to color inconsistency with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

NEW ITEM**E. 232 W MICHELTORENA ST R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-221-018
Application Number: MST2011-00413
Owner: William L. Corbin
Architect: Dwight Gregory

(Proposal for a new 100 linear foot long chain-link fence at the east property line. The fence height will be 42" for the first 20 feet from the front property line and will be eight feet for the remaining 80 linear feet. New landscaping is also proposed at the site. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted with the condition that the fence material be black.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 925 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-313-027
Application Number: MST2010-00124
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer

(Proposal to remodel a former auto muffler repair shop into office space for City Fire Station No. 1. The project includes an upgrade of the front facade and streetscape including repainting the building and installing new sidewalk and landscaping. Also proposed is restriping the existing parking lot and installation of an electric gate on the south side of the building.)

(Review After Final of new security cameras.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final.

NEW ITEM**G. 29 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-009
Application Number: MST2011-00411
Owner: Alan R. Porter
Architect: Bildsten + Sherwin

(Minor exterior alterations for new rooftop equipment with fan and make-up units at rear and front entry handicapped accessibility automatic door opening hardware.)

Public comment: Mr. Ruhling; Mrs. Ruhling; Trevor Martinson.

Continued indefinitely for staff to work with Commissioner Sharpe to grant Administrative Approval. Interested parties will be contacted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:09 P.M. ****