



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 26, 2011 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 2:40 p.m.
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present until 3:00 p.m.
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 1:43 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:45 p.m. and returned at 3:40 p.m.
 MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present 3:00 p.m. until 3:30 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, October 21, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 p.m. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Shallanberger, Sharpe and Suding.

Members absent: Drury.

Staff present: Limón, Berman, Gantz, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 12, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 12, 2011, with corrections.

Action: Orías/Boucher, 5/0/1. (La Voie abstained. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item E, which was also reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Chair Suding would be leaving at 2:40 p.m., Commissioner Murray would be leaving at 3:00 p.m., and Commissioner Drury would be absent.
- b. Item 3 on the agenda for 651 Paseo Nuevo was postponed at the applicant's request. Item 4 at 517 Chapala would be moved up on the agenda and would be reviewed one-half hour early.

Motion: To postpone the review of Item 3 at 651 Paseo Nuevo.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.)

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Orías reported on the Historic Resources Element Task Force.

F. Appointment to the Architectural Details *Ad hoc* Subcommittee.

Commissioners La Voie and Sharpe were appointed.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**1. 1936 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:44) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00167
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Agent: Lucy Dinneen
 Applicant: Cadence Development
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,300 square foot, 33 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on September 14, 2011.)

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Fred Sweeney, local resident, was concerned with neighborhood compatibility and importance of the site as a gateway to the City and the Old Mission.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed architecture design and neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

A motion was made by Commissioner La Voie and seconded by Commissioner Shallenberger, but a vote was not taken.

A modified motion was made, but Commissioner Shallenberger withdrew his second and so a vote was not taken.

Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The style of architecture with its simplicity is acceptable and compatible with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. The proposed height is acceptable.
3. Use different material on blind arches to further distinguish from awning surround; the awnings need to be more predominant and respond to the arch.
4. The recesses in the arches need to be at least three feet deep. The addition of an arcade was suggested.
5. Increase landscape and reduce hardscape.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 3/3/1. (Murray/Shallenberger/Sharpe opposed. Orías abstained. Drury absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute**Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. The style of architecture with its simplicity is acceptable and compatible with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. The proposed height is acceptable.
3. Use different material on blind arches to further distinguish from awning surround; the awnings need to be more predominant and respond to the arch.
4. The recesses in the arches need to be restudied to obtain the proper depth.
5. Increase landscape and reduce hardscape.

Action: Shallanberger/Orías, 5/2/0. (Murray/Sharpe opposed. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 0-300 W CABRILLO BLVD**

HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:34) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2011-00364
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Ashleigh Shue

(Review of various alternatives to repair and replace failing brick crosswalks with alternative material.)

(Comments only. Applicant to return in the future with proposed project locations.)

Present: Ashleigh Shue, City Project Engineer
 Brian D'Amour, City Supervising Engineer

Public comment opened at 2:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following conditions:

1. The asphalt paving is acceptable as presented as the solution for the replacement of the failing brick infill here.
2. Both the concrete and asphalt shall be painted with crosswalk striping.
3. Concrete borders shall remain.
4. It was noted that historically the material on this boulevard has always been asphalt.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Drury/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 651 PASEO NUEVO** C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002
 Application Number: MST2010-00338
 Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency
 Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

(Second review of Phase II improvements. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Phase I received final approval on August 31, 2011. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:58 P.M. TO 3:05**

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 424 STATE ST** C-M Zone

(3:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
 Application Number: MST2011-00342
 Owner: Ray Mahboob
 Applicant: ATC Design Group
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture
 Business Name: 99 Cent Store

(Proposal to enclose a 733 square foot patio/arcade on an existing 11,500 square foot, two-story commercial building and alterations including the following: a new facade on the State Street elevation, infill of several overhead roll-up doors and new entry on the north elevation, new parking lot striping and landscaping, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is to repave the existing paseo between State Street and the existing, 25-space parking lot in the rear with brick. Total development on site will total 12,233 square feet.)

(Third Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on October 12, 2011.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Ryan Mills, Architect, DMA

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on insufficient parking.

Public comment closed at 3:16 p.m.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details with the following conditions:

1. The landscape plans shall be reviewed by the HLC Landscape Architect on the Consent Calendar.
2. On the State Street façade, the bottom of the windows shall be lined up across the façade at consistent elevation relative to the floor at the height of the door bulkhead.
3. The pergola over the trash enclosure shall be redesigned to be appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.
4. Plant materials shall be reselected from the City's approved plant list.
5. Windows on Detail 2 of Sheet A7.1 shall be shown to have at least an eight inch reveal from the exterior.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:30 P.M. TO 3:39 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

5. **517 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:39) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
 Application Number: MST2005-00088
 Owner: H & R Investments, LP
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects, LLC

(The project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development (19,781 square feet net; 21,683 square feet gross) with six residential condominium units (totaling 10,147 square feet) and two commercial condominium spaces (totaling 2,729 square feet). One of the residential units would be affordable.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Gordon Brewer and Carrie Bingham, Peikert Group Architects
 Robert Fowler, Landscape Architect
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:48 p.m.

Susie Thompson, neighbor, commented on parking spaces on site and the street.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, spoke against the project's bulk and scale and impacts on the Brinkerhoff Historic District.

Wanda Livernois, neighbor, spoke against the size of the proposed building.

Public comment closed at 3:53 p.m.

The applicant confirmed that there are no solar collectors proposed on this project.

Failed

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Shallanberger/La Voie, 1/2/2. (Boucher/Sharpe opposed. La Voie/Orías abstained. Drury/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute

Motion: Continued to the November 30, 2011, meeting to allow all members of the Commission to participate in the review of the proposed project with the following comments:

1. Air handling equipment shall not be exposed on outside area patios.
2. The guardrail wall shown on Sheet A5.0 of the Chapala Street elevation needs to be thicker by at least 24 inches.
3. Restudy the detail for window type “unidentified” shown on Sheet A4.21.
4. The project’s proximity to the Brinkerhoff District continues to be of concern.

Action: La Voie/Shallanberger, 5/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR:

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 1816 STATE ST

C-2/R-1 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 027-032-021
 Application Number: MST2009-00281
 Owner: Alamar II, LLC
 Architect: Bryan Murphy
 Business Name: Fiesta Inn & Suites

(Proposal for an addition and exterior alterations to an existing three story commercial building. The proposal includes facade alterations, a 62 square foot lobby addition, a tower addition having no new floor area, a 270 square foot storage room addition on the third floor of the building, a new 312 square foot deck, two new patio areas totaling 585 square feet, widening the second floor corridor by 164 square feet, and alterations to the existing parking lot. This project received Planning Commission approval on February 12, 2010. Approval of this project will abate violations outlined in ENF2008-01335.)

(Review After Final of proposed changes to roof detail, new stair to tower and second floor landing, shift French door at second story and windows below on State Street elevation, new stairs at parking lot, and relocation of lobby entry doors and window. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-10.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 701 CHAPALA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008
Application Number: MST2011-00385
Owner: Nancy Brock Trust
Designer: Thomas Morrison

(Proposal to install new redwood decking inside an existing fenced patio. New umbrellas, tables, and chairs are also proposed for outdoor seating at the existing restaurant.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 19 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-003
Application Number: MST2009-00097
Owner: The Volentine Foundation
Architect: Edwards - Pitman Architects

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations on the south elevation of an existing commercial building. The proposed work includes the following: demolish an existing exterior stairway, add a new second floor balcony with wrought iron rail; new awnings; add a new basement level window; and, change two existing solid doors to French doors.)

(Review After Final of new trash enclosure at south elevation.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final as noted on the drawings.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 210 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025
Application Number: MST2011-00061
Owner: DBN Carrillo, LLC
Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for exterior facade changes to an existing building in the Radio Square retail center including the following: new exterior paint color, new windows along Carrillo Street, new storefront, new 397 square foot patio along the De la Vina Street frontage, new HVAC equipment, and the removal of two existing ficus trees and one existing palm tree. No new floor area is proposed. The parking requirement for this parcel is 94 spaces, with 72 legal, nonconforming spaces to be maintained.)

(Review After Final of new outdoor dining tables, chairs, and umbrellas.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the following conditions:

1. Submit a manufacturer color sample of the table top material for Staff approval.
2. The umbrella standards shall have a black powder coat finish.

TIME CERTAIN AT 1:00 P.M.:**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****E. 101 E VICTORIA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-071-013
Application Number: MST2011-00204
Owner: Dehlsen Associates, LLC
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(This project involves two separate parcels at 101 E. Victoria Street and 109 E. Victoria Street. Proposal for alterations at an existing two-story commercial building including a new two-story entry, door and window replacement, partial new roof, new gutters and downspouts, renovation of exterior grilles, new planter areas, new trash enclosure, and modification of one existing parking space to make it van-accessible. (The trash enclosure and modified parking space are on the 109 E. Victoria Street parcel.) The proposal also includes the removal of 50 square feet of floor area, a 42" high perimeter wall around the parking lot, four new rooftop HVAC units, and a 30-panel rooftop photovoltaic system which will not be visible from the street.)

(Review After Final of proposed changes to include new stone veneer on a portion of the south elevation, new parking lot planting strips, and new landscape plan.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheets A4.0 and L-1.1.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:05 P.M. ****