



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 14, 2011 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present until 5:15 p.m.
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
MICHAEL DRURY – Present
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
FERMINA MURRAY – Present
JUDY ORÍAS – Present until 5:10 p.m.
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF – Absent
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:45 p.m.
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Absent
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

NOTICE:

- A. On Friday, September 9, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast can also be seen via personal computer by going to www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/Government/Video and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Boucher, Drury, La Voie, Murray, Orías, Sharpe, Shallanberger, and Suding.

Members absent: None.

Staff present: Gantz, Limón, and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 31, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of August 31, 2011, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: To table ratifying the Consent Calendar to the end of the meeting.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

The ratification of the Consent Calendar items was reopened at 5:24 p.m.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item E, which was also reviewed by William La Voie at 5:15 p.m.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 6/0/0. (Orías/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Chair Suding would be stepping down on Item 1, 35 State Street.
2. Chair Suding announced that he attended the Semi-Annual Advisory Group Meeting with chairs and vice-chairs that was held on Wednesday, September 7, 2011.
3. Commissioner Shallanberger announced he would be stepping down from Item 5, 702 Laguna Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Orías reported on the Historic Resources Element Task Force.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:40 P.M. TO 1:48 P.M. ****

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM1. **35 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(1:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-018

Application Number: MST2011-00065

Staff Members: George Estrella, Chief Building Official; and Joe Poire, Fire Marshall

(Notice and Order from Chief Building Official regarding Californian Hotel - Review of Interim demolition/design measures.)

Present: Steve Wiley, City Attorney
 George Estrella, City Chief Building Official
 Joe Poire, City Fire Marshall
 Melissa Cinarli, Project Manager, DesignARC
 Rye Syfan, Structural Engineer, Taylor and Syfan Consulting Engineers

City Attorney held discussion on Area A of the Californian Hotel. Applicant gave presentation.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m.

Trevor Martinson, local architect, expressed concerns: proposed steel frame with concrete infill; proposed concrete replacement; and impacts to adjacent properties.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern: guarantee of project completion should be made public.

Public comment closed at 2:19 p.m.

Motion: Conceptual Approval of the partial demolition with the following conditions:

1. Provide a work program for restoration to be coordinated through the City Historian.
2. Provide photo documentation of the entire façade and its details.
3. Provide a scrim proposal on how the exposed façade might look like after it is placed on the building.
4. Provide a proposal that indicates the restoration of the roof tiles on the State Street façade and tower elements. Include a proposal to remove, store and reuse the roof tiles in future construction of the Californian Hotel.
5. Establish an agreement between the owner and the City Attorney for replication of the building in case of a structural failure.
6. Provide agreement by a historical consultant for comprehensive inspection during both the demolition and restoration work.

Action: La Voie/Oriás, 7/0/0. (Suding stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW (NEW)

2. 20 E CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-047
 Application Number: SGN2011-00091
 Owner: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust
 Applicant: Jeff Reich
 Designer: Chandler Signs
 Contractor: Mall Signs & Service
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(Concept review of a proposal to replace 100.44 square feet of existing signage with 167.1 square feet of new signage. One existing 8 square foot ATM sign is proposed to remain unaltered. Total amount of signage on site will be 175.1 square feet. Two exceptions are requested to exceed the 90 square foot maximum total signage allowed and to exceed the maximum 10-inch letter height. The linear building frontage is 150 feet. The allowable signage is 90 square feet.)

(Requires Sign Exception Findings.)

Present: Joe Mueller, Chandler Signs
John Shehorn, Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

Applicant clarified the actual total square footage being requested as 156.7 (rather than the 175.1 square feet that was agendized).

Public comment opened at 3:00 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern: adherence to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:00 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. This is an important building at an important part of town.
2. Although there is existing oversignage on the site, it is better than what is being proposed.
3. Study changing the logo to be more of a Hispanic style.
4. Restudy the gold color in the logo to either be gold leaf or replicate the gold color of the existing Sign A letters.
5. Either a red-gold or a blacker blue-based red is preferable to what is proposed for the letters.
6. The proposed change in font style for Sign A, the monument sign, is not acceptable.

Action: La Voie/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. **424 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(3:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
Application Number: MST2011-00342
Applicant: ATC Design Group
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(Proposal to enclose a 733 square foot patio/arcade on an existing 11,500 square foot, two-story commercial building and alterations including the following: a new facade on the State Street elevation, infill of several overhead roll-up doors and new entry on the north elevation, new parking lot striping and landscaping, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is to repave the existing paseo between State Street and the existing, 25-space parking lot in the rear with brick. Total development on site will total 12,233 square feet.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio
Ryan Mils, Architect, DMA

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Signage on the building facing the parking lot should be removed.
2. Loading dock door should not look like a roll up door.
3. Removal of the arcade at State Street is unfortunate.
4. A bulkhead of 18 to 24 inches tall is preferred as opposed to having the storefront system go all the way down to the ground.
5. It is understood that the columns along State Street will be changed to square columns.
6. It was suggested that the overhead structure located at the back of the sidewalk on State Street be removed.
7. Study the arched transoms for the window breakup, particularly the centered mullions.
8. Leave the wall that is between the sidewalk on Haley Street and the parking lot.
9. Study increasing the space for the Tipuana trees in the finger planters of the parking lot.
10. Study the shade requirements of the trees in between the buildings.
11. Landscape plans must be prepared by a licensed landscape architect.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:47 P.M. TO 3:52 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 1936 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(3:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001
 Application Number: MST2011-00167
 Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation
 Agent: Lucy Dinneen
 Applicant: Cadence Development
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,300 square foot, 33 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings.)

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m.

A letter from Scott Perry, adjacent property owner, was acknowledged: 33 foot height of the proposed one-story project and noise impacts on neighboring properties.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern: different kinds of arches.

Public comment closed at 4:05 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments:

1. The site is important because it is at a gateway to Mission Santa Barbara and the Upper State Street neighborhood.
2. The parapet articulation is successful.
3. Provide sections of adjacent structures as they relate to the proposed building. Show elevations in their entirety from at least property line to property line; perhaps even beyond the property line showing neighboring features.
4. Address remediation apparatus.
5. Move the first riser at the steps at the back of the sidewalk to allow for railing projections.
6. Building forms need more juxtaposition and definition as well as shade and shadow.
7. More refinement is needed on the building. Bring the disparate parts together.
8. Express the function of the tower.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**5. 702 LAGUNA ST**

R-3 Zone

(4:27)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-023

Application Number: MST2010-00288

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Housing Authority

Architect: East Beach Ventures Architecture

(Proposal for approximately 7,656 square feet of one and two-story non-residential additions at an existing Housing Authority facility. The additions consist of a 2,946 square foot first floor addition and a 2,726 square foot second floor addition to an existing 986 square foot one-story storage building (Building A), and a 1,834 square foot one-story addition to an existing 4,184 square foot one-story maintenance building (Building B). There are 59 parking spaces proposed. Planning Commission approval is requested for an amendment to an existing Conditional Use Permit, a Transfer of Existing Development Rights for new nonresidential square footage, and a Development Plan.)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 012-11. Project was last reviewed on August 31, 2011.)

Present: Peter Ehlen and Adrian Coulter, Architects
David Black, Landscape Architect

Commissioner Shallanberger stated that he has no conflict of interest and would not be stepping down.

Motion: Project Design Approval contingent upon subsequent approval of a Substantial Conformance Determination and continued indefinitely with the following conditions:

1. Eliminate railing at top of parapet. Raise the parapet by six inches at the entry feature on the north elevation to meet guardrail height.
2. The sizes of the three replacement olive trees shall be two 24 inch box and one 36 inch box.
3. Option A is the preferred color option, which is the same color for both buildings.

Action: Drury/Orias, 6/0/2. (Boucher/La Voie abstained because they are opposed to a design that is not appropriate in Santa Barbara.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:43 P.M. TO 4:55 P.M. ****

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

6. **33 E MICHELTORENA ST**

R-O Zone

(4:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-014
 Application Number: MST2011-00180
 Owner: Archdioces of Los Angeles
 Applicant: Joe Chenoweth
 Architect: Archart

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to permit an existing 12-foot high hedge on an existing 6-foot high fence within 10 feet of the front lot line and within 50 feet of the corner at Arrellaga and Anacapa Streets. Also proposed are permitting an existing 12-foot high hedge on an existing 6-foot high fence, construction of new portions of the fence ranging from 6 to 9 feet high within 10 feet of the front lot line at Anacapa Street and replacement of asphalt paving with a new planting area. . The project received Staff Hearing Officer approval on July 27, 2011. Other work previously requested under this application will be reviewed separately under MST2011-00286 and does not require a zoning modification. This is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Notre Dame School."**)

(Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 032-11. Project was last reviewed on August 31, 2011.)

Present: Gary Jensen, Architect
 Joe Chenoweth, School Business Manager, Notre Dame School

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals with the following comment and condition:

1. This is an important historic resource.
2. Appreciation was expressed for the building to remain visible from public view.
3. The hammered pickets as proposed are acceptable conditioned upon the existing landscaping to remain and be maintained as long as the fence is in existence.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 5:10 P.M. TO 5:24 P.M.
 TO ALLOW TIME FOR THE REVIEW OF ITEM E ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00):**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 26 CHAPALA ST****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-001
Application Number: MST2010-00176
Owner: Dario Pini
Architect: Bryan Murphy

(The 10,000 square foot project site is currently developed with a 5,602 square foot, 11-unit apartment/hotel complex. The proposed project involves exterior alterations including the replacement of all existing windows, extending an existing second-floor balcony corridor and adding a 36" porch wall, a facade remodel, relocation of an as-built trash enclosure, and a revised landscape plan including the replacement of two existing 12 foot tall palm trees canopy trees. The discretionary applications required for this project are zoning modifications to allow alterations within the required 10'-0" front setback on Mason Street and a reduction of the required outdoor living space. No additional square footage is proposed. The parcel is non-conforming with 11 existing parking spaces to remain, but the parking lot will be repaved with permeable pavers and reconfigured to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act. This application addresses violations called out in ENF2010-00250.)

(Review After Final of change to roof details.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**B. 3 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-006
Application Number: MST2011-00351
Owner: Levon Investments, LLC
Architect: Paul Poirier

(Proposal to replace 14 single-lite aluminum sliding doors with new 10-lite aluminum clad wood doors on the second floor balconies. The new doors will have the same sized openings and will be painted "hunter green.")

Project Design and Final Approvals with the following conditions:

1. The doors shall have muntin bars.
2. The three windows shall be painted to match the new door color.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 509 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-009
Application Number: MST2009-00290
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Architect: Henry Lenny
Designer: Michael De Rose
Business Name: Cabana Restaurant

(Proposal to remove an existing storefront and recess the new storefront 15'-0" to create an outdoor dining area. This project will result in a credit of 375 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Review After Final of new hanging light fixture.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 525 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-002
Application Number: MST2011-00349
Owner: John Lindgren
Architect: Van Rooy Design
Business Name: My Sweet Pineapple

(Proposal for exterior changes to an existing outdoor dining area including new paint colors, seating, lighting, and patio railing. New signage to be reviewed under a separate permit.)

Continued two weeks with the following comments:

- 1.** Color palette and wrought iron needs to be more traditional and needs to comply with El Pueblo Viejo Design Guidelines.
- 2.** Submit an interior elevation of the new patio booth so the HLC can see what it will look like.
- 3.** Submit cut sheets of any new tables or chairs to be placed on the patio.
- 4.** Remove built-in booth from the public right-of-way.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 210 W CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025
Application Number: MST2011-00061
Owner: DBN Carrillo LLC
Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for exterior facade changes to an existing building in the Radio Square retail center including the following: new exterior paint color, new windows along Carrillo Street, new storefront, new 397 square foot patio along the De la Vina Street frontage, new HVAC equipment, and the removal of two existing ficus trees and one existing palm tree. No new floor area is proposed. The parking requirement for this parcel is 94 spaces, with 72 legal, nonconforming spaces to be maintained.)

(Continued final approval of details is requested. Project last reviewed on August 31, 2011, at Consent.)

Final Approval of details as resubmitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:25 P.M. ****