



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 19, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
 PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:00 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. Project Design Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 extension 3311, or by email at SGantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov. Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Thursday, January 13, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There was an HLC Survey Subcommittee meeting at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, January 19, 2011, in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room, 2nd Floor, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Election of Chair and Vice-Chair for 2011.

Ms. Gantz opened nominations for office of Chair and Vice-Chair.

1. Nomination for Chair: **Naylor**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Naylor was elected as Chair.

2. Nomination for Vice-Chair: **Sharpe**.

A vote was taken and Commissioner Sharpe was elected as Vice-Chair.

- B. Appointments to Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to fill vacancies on the following subcommittees:

1. **HLC Consent Calendar: Sharpe and Suding.** Alternate: Shallanberger.
2. **Sign Committee Liaison: Boucher.** Alternate: Shallanberger.
3. **Street Tree Advisory Committee: Suding.** Alternate: La Voie.
4. **Visual Art in Public Places: Naylor.** Alternate: Boucher.
5. **Brinkerhoff Guidelines: Murray, Naylor and Orías.**
6. **Preservation Element: Murray, Naylor and Orías.**
7. **Design Awards: Boucher, Shallanberger and Sharpe.**
8. **Designations: Boucher, Murray and Sharpe.**
9. **Events: Boucher and Drury.**
10. **Five-Year HLC Goals: La Voie, Murray and Orías.**
11. **Historic Surveys: Boucher, Murray and Orías.**
12. **State of the Art Gallery/State Street Installations: Boucher.** Alternate: Drury.

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

13. **Airport: La Voie, Murray and Suding.**
14. **El Encanto Hotel: Drury, Naylor, Shallanberger, Sharpe, and Suding.**
15. **Entrada de Santa Barbara: Orías, Shallanberger and Sharpe.**
16. **Highway 101 High-Occupancy Vehicle (HOV): Orías and Suding.**
17. **HLC Rules, Meeting Procedures and Guidelines: Boucher and La Voie.**

18. **Lower Mission Creek Design: Orías and Suding.**
19. **Paseo Nuevo Branding: Boucher and Shallanberger.**
20. **Plaza De la Guerra: La Voie, Sharpe and Suding.**
21. **433 E. Cabrillo Blvd. (Waterfront Hotel): La Voie, Naylor, Orías, and Shallanberger.**
22. **34 W. Victoria Street (former Vons grocery store: Drury, Naylor, Sharpe and Suding.**

C. Public Comment:

Mary Louise Days, local resident, commented on the letter the Commission received from Harold Kroeger and suggested that perhaps the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation may be interested in the placement of the historic windows.

Motion: To respond to Harold Kroeger's correspondence proposing that he contact the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation with respect to the placement of the historic windows originally found in the lobby of the Anacapa Street post office.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 5, 2011.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 5, 2011, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 7/0/2. (La Voie/Naylor abstained.) Motion carried.

E. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Craig Shallanberger; with the exception of Item A, which was reviewed by Bill La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Commissioner Drury announced a Lockwood de Forested art show called "Forty Days and Forty Nights" at the Sullivan Goss Art Gallery.
2. Commissioner Boucher noted that installation of video monitors on top of gasoline pumps is a clear violation of the Sign Ordinance. They advertise products and services that are not related to the business, they do not fit into the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, and are visually disturbing and noisy. Jaime Limón stated that Staff has drafted exemption language per the Ordinance Committee's request to possibly allow video LCD screens of limited size and sound. The City Council will consider the proposed exemption in February.

Motion: To draft a new letter in response to latest proposed sign ordinance amendments, reinforcing the HLC's position that the video LCD screens shall be prohibited entirely in the City.

Action: Naylor/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Commissioners Boucher and Drury agreed to represent the HLC at that City Council meeting.

3. Commissioner Sharpe announced he would be stepping down from Item 3, 813 Anacapa Street.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher and Jake Jacobus reported on the HLC Survey Subcommittee that met in the morning.

Commissioner Suding reported on the Highway 101 Milpas to Cabrillo/Hot Springs *Ad hoc* Subcommittee.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED1. **18 E ORTEGA ST**

C-M Zone

(2:03) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00384
 Owner: Alan Porter
 Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal to change the exterior paint color of the building housing Dargan's Pub.)

(Referred from Consent Calendar. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Return with more information, such as the street view, and the entire color palette and its environment.
2. White or off-white would be preferred, but variations of two tones or a lighter building color would be supportable.

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED2. **322 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-028
 Application Number: MST2010-00365
 Owner: Craddock Living Trust
 Architect: Peter Becker Architect

(This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pedotti House."** Proposal for residential alterations including the following new work: two pairs of French doors, a wall around a portion of the existing entry porch, a 22 linear foot long wood fence at the front property line, a 132 linear foot long stucco wall at the interior property line, new wrought iron driveway gates, a wider entry door in the legal accessory building, a new flat glass skylight, a new plaster chimney, and a repaved driveway. Total development on this 7,405 square foot parcel will be 2,001 square feet and will be 66% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**3. 813 ANACAPA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-033
 Application Number: MST2010-00372
 Owner: SIMA El Paseo LP
 Applicant: Thomas McMahan
 Business: Wine Cask

(Proposal to permit as-built improvements on the Anacapa Street streetscape and in an interior courtyard at El Paseo including the restoration of an existing historic fountain and new exterior dining furniture including chairs, tables, heaters, and umbrellas. Also proposed is to install two new wrought iron entry gates, one at the courtyard and one at the arcade. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-00359.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Mitchell Sjerven, Restaurant Manager
 Anda Ashkar, SIMA Vice-President
 Thom MacMahon, Architect

Correspondence was received from Tony Spann, Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation, regarding the fountain, heater design and location, gates, furniture design, and furniture placement in the arcade.

Public comment opened at 2:19 p.m. and reopened at 2:36 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local resident, commented that the agenda should have stated that El Paseo is a Historic Landmark and on the National Register of Historic Places.

Tony Spann, SBTHP El Paseo Façade Easement Committee, commented that the current owner and the landlord are working well with the Trust on design details.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented he recalled that a tarp cover that rolled back was used over the patio area in the 1930s. He also commented on the furniture and the arcade area.

Public comment closed at 2:20 p.m. and reclosed at 2:39 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

- 1. Heaters:** Are acceptable as presented.
- 2. Umbrellas:** The landlord should explore using an overhead, retractable awning across the open courtyard as opposed to umbrellas.
- 3. Furniture design:** Both proposals are unacceptable. In the arcade do not use sofas; rather, it should be simple tables and chairs that are light and portable.
- 4. Furniture placement in arcade:** Should not impede pedestrian traffic or affect the façade visually. It should be informal rather than a formal geometric layout.
- 5. Resolved issues:** Copper top tables to be on pedestal bases, the fountain restoration, and the heaters.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 8/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**4. 829 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-007
 Application Number: MST2010-00392
 Owner: Rametto Company, LLC
 Applicant: Glen Morris
 Architect: Linane Drews

(This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Howard-Canfield Building."** Proposal for window and door alterations to the first floor tenant space of an existing commercial building and to reclaim 28 square feet of floor area which will restore the original footprint of the tenant space entry.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Present: Glen Morris, Applicant
 James Drews, Architect

Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval.
 Action: Drury. Motion failed for lack of second.

Amended

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued two weeks with the condition that the stone lozenges be removed from the proposal.

Action: Drury/La Voie, 7/2/0. (Orías/Suding opposed.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:28 P.M. TO 3:34 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 121 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:39) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
 Application Number: MST2010-00390
 Owner: Santa Barbara Beach Hotel, LP
 Applicant: AB Design Studio
 Landscape Architect: CommonGround

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing hotel to include new storefront windows, doors, awnings and lighting. The existing parking lot will be improved with new landscaping planters and will be restriped to provide nine uncovered parking spaces. New trash and mechanical wall enclosures with trellis structure are also proposed. Interior alterations will reduce the number of hotel rooms from 53 to 41 and will be under a separate permit.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Present: Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect
 Clay Aurell, Architect
 Tom Hawkins, Flora Source

Public comment opened at 4:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the green wall and possible reconsideration of the metal awnings to be replaced with an overhead, retractable awning.

Public comment closed at 4:02 p.m.

Withdrawn

Motion:

Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Colors as proposed are acceptable.
2. Patio dividers: Bamboo and decorative iron fence are not acceptable. The screening between unit patios should be more traditional.
3. Bollards: The bollard lights are not acceptable as designed.
4. Lighting: The proposed style of the wall light fixtures is not acceptable.
5. Green wall: The concept is supportable. Restudy a more appropriate installation within the context of a Spanish Colonial Revival historic district. It was suggested that the vegetation be draped more naturally.
6. Entry canopy: Restudy the design. There is too much metal showing. It should be simplified, referential to Hispanic design, and solid steel. The addition of ball finials is not acceptable.
7. Side canopies: The simple design of the metal canopies over the side windows at the front is acceptable with the exception of the use of the stars as anchor plates.
8. Metal awnings: Restudy the design of the remaining canopy struts so that they are less of a Victorian style. One Commissioner would prefer as much natural light to be allowed into the building as possible.
9. West elevation: Study ways to provide sun control on the west elevation, possibly with awnings as used on other parts of the building.
10. Landscaping:
 - a. Include a skyline tree in the back patio area.
 - b. Substitute plant material for a broad leaf, canopy tree in the parking lot.
 - c. Restudy the parking lot plan to include as much landscaping as possible in an effort to increase amount by about 10%.

Action:

La Voie/Sharpe. Motion withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion:

Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. **Colors** as proposed are acceptable.
2. **Patio dividers:** Bamboo and decorative iron fence are not acceptable. The screening between unit patios should be more traditional.
3. **Bollards:** The bollard lights are not acceptable as designed.
4. **Lighting:** The proposed style of the wall light fixtures is not acceptable.
5. **Green wall:** The concept is supportable. Restudy a more appropriate installation within the context of a Spanish Colonial Revival historic district. It was suggested that the vegetation be draped more naturally.
6. **Entry canopy:** Restudy the design. There is too much metal showing. It should be simplified, referential to Hispanic design, and solid steel. The addition of ball finials is not acceptable.
7. **Side canopies:** The simple design of the metal canopies over the side windows at the front is acceptable with the exception of the use of the stars as anchor plates.

8. **Metal awnings:** Restudy the design of the remaining canopy struts so that they are less of a Victorian style. One Commissioner would prefer as much natural light to be allowed into the building as possible.
9. **West elevation:** Study ways to provide sun control on the west elevation, possibly with awnings as used on other parts of the building.
10. **Landscaping:**
 - a. Include a skyline tree in the back patio area.
 - b. Substitute plant material for a broad leaf, canopy tree in the parking lot.
 - c. Restudy the parking lot plan to include as much landscaping as possible in an effort to increase amount by about 10%.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/3/0. (Naylor/Suding/Shallanberger opposed.) Motion carried.

SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR (10:15):

See separate meeting minutes.

HLC CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 1210 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2005-00323
 Owner: Granada Tower, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to two residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs, adding rooftop dormers and windows, reopening existing window rough openings (two windows each on six floors), adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation, and relocation of a temporary wireless antenna installation frame to the rooftop.)

(Review After Final of paint color change to the two existing wooden storefront systems on the tenant spaces flanking the theater entrance doors.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the comment that the color shall match the bronze of the marquee or the main entry doors to the Granada Theater.

NEW ITEM**B. 834 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-021
Application Number: MST2011-00006
Owner: First States Investors 5000a, LLC
Applicant: Dennis Stout
Designer: Dave Tilsner
Business Name: Bank of America

(Proposal for three new wrought iron exterior light fixtures. One fixture will be mounted on the State Street frontage and the other two will be mounted at the rear.)

Final Approval with the condition that the lighting specs shall meet the outdoor Streetlight Design Guidelines.

NEW ITEM**C. 6 W DE LA GUERRA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013
Application Number: MST2011-00008
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
Agent: Dennis Stout

(This is a **Structure of Merit: "Las Teindas Building."** Proposal to install a new awning above an automated teller machine in a "Forest Green" Sunbrella fabric.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

NEW ITEM**D. 1021 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-006
Application Number: MST2011-00018
Owner: Pueblo Associates, Ltd.
Applicant: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust
Contractor: Armstrong Associates

(Proposal to remove three existing rooftop air conditioning units and one existing boiler and install three new rooftop air conditioning units and two new boilers. The proposed new A/C units are 24" taller than the top of the existing parapet. The new proposed boiler vents will extend 5'-4" above the top of the existing parapet.)

Final Approval as noted on drawing M2.3.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:42 P.M. ****