



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 5, 2011

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Absent
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 JUDY ORÍAS – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 2:12 p.m.
 PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present at 2:00 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Absent

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for Project Design Approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.69 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for Project Design Approval or Final Approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. Project Design Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Project Design Approval and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 extension 3311, or by email at SGantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov. Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, December 17, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There was an El Encanto Hotel *Ad Hoc* Subcommittee meeting at 11:45 a.m. on Wednesday, January 5, 2011, in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Public Comment:

Mary Louise Days, local resident, commented about the possibility of a tenant for a World War II era hangar at the Santa Barbara Airport. She hoped that at least one of the very old hangars on the northeast corner of the main property would be listed as a potential historic resource.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meetings of **November 10** and **December 8, 2010**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of November 10, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 3/0/3. (Drury/Murray/Orías abstained. La Voie/Naylor/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of December 8, 2010.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 3/0/3. (Drury/Orías/Suding abstained. La Voie/Naylor/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe and Philip Suding.

Action: Murray/Suding, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Naylor/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Welcomed newly appointed Commissioner Orías, and welcomed back Commissioners LaVoie and Sharpe.
- b. Commissioners Naylor and LaVoie would be absent from the meeting, and Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down from Item 2 at 813 Anacapa Street.

c. The next Highway 101 Design Review Team meeting will be held on Wednesday, January 12 at 10:00 a.m. in the Public Works Conference Room at 630 Garden Street. The case planner for that project requested a member of the HLC be present for that meeting, and Commissioner Drury volunteered to attend.

2. Commissioner Drury presented a book written by Pico Iyer with photographs by Macduff Everton entitled "The Book of Santa Barbara."

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/City Historian, announced there will be a meeting of the Designations Subcommittee on January 19 at 11:00 a.m. in the Community Development Director's Conference Room. The Lower Riviera Historic Survey will be reviewed.

2. Commissioner Murray requested that the two Santa Barbara Airport historic hangars be discussed at the next Designations Subcommittee meeting.

3. Commissioner Suding reported on the El Encanto Hotel Subcommittee.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

1. **829 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(1:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-007
 Application Number: MST2010-00392
 Owner: Rametto Company, LLC
 Architect: Linane Drews
 Applicant: Glen Morris

(The Howard-Canfield Building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal for window and door alterations to first floor for tenant space improvements to an existing commercial building.)

Present: Glen Morris, Applicant
 James Drews, Architect

Public comment opened at 1:52 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the project should address the Paseo Nuevo guidelines; and requested that the Nordstrom building not be emulated in the design.

Public comment closed at 1:53 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Breakup the windows with smaller pane sizes.
2. Restudy the size, proportion, and color of the tiles. A warmer, more traditional Hispanic design shall be implemented.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**2. 813 ANACAPA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-033
 Application Number: MST2010-00372
 Owner: SIMA El Paseo, LP
 Applicant: Thomas McMahan
 Business: Wine Cask

(Proposal to permit as-built improvements on the Anacapa Street streetscape and in an interior courtyard at El Paseo; restoration of an existing historic fountain and new exterior dining furniture including chairs, tables, heaters, and umbrellas. This project will address violations called out in enforcement case ENF2010-00359.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Doug Margerum and Mitchell Sjerven, Owners
 Anda Ashkar, SIMA Vice-President and General Counsel
 Thomas McMahan, Architect/Agent

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m.

Tony Spann, Historic Trust for Historic Preservation, commented on the aspects that the Trust finds acceptable and issues of concern.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the wrought iron fitting in with the dining patio area and suggested canvas sheets attached to cables as a shade solution.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners could support furniture at the arcade? 5/1 (Murray opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support a scaled-back configuration of furniture in the arcade? 5/1 (Murray opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support the current configuration of the furniture at the arcade? 2/4 (Boucher/Murray/Orías/Suding opposed.)

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. The Commission will work with the Trust for Historic Preservation to come to an accord.
2. The restoration of the courtyard fountain is supportable.
3. Explore different finishes for the portable heater grille. At least one Commissioner felt that the heaters are a distraction to the site. Provide an accurate number of existing portable heaters and study minimizing the number.
4. The furniture needs to be more traditional. The configuration of the furniture at the arcade needs to be scaled back.
5. Explore a roll-back overhead canopy for shading the courtyard.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 6/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down. La Voie/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**3. 121 STATE ST**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-001
Application Number: MST2010-00390
Owner: Santa Barbara Beach Hotel, LP
Applicant: AB Design Studio

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing hotel to include new storefront windows, doors, awnings and lighting. The existing parking lot will be improved with new landscaping planters and restriped to provide 9 uncovered parking spaces. New trash and mechanical wall enclosures with trellis structure are proposed. Interior alterations to hotel to reduce hotel rooms from 53 to 41 are under separate permit.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Coastal Review.)

Present: Josh Blumer and Clay Aurell, Architects
Trent Lyon, Tryon Company

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the hotel history; species and possible damage of the trees; aluminum windows should be wood; and façade on State Street less Hispanic with canopies.

Public comment closed at 3:10 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. The Commission is appreciative of the proposed improvements. It was suggested that the applicant look at the history of the building for possibly including a commemorative plaque.
2. The metal awnings and exterior elevation as proposed along State Street is acceptable. Study using ornamentation on the metal awnings.
3. The patios and roof deck are acceptable.
4. Restudy the entry canopy so that it conforms to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Guidelines.
5. Study using vines rather than a mixed vegetated wall on the side facing the parking lot to soften the building.
6. Study providing landscape on the back of the State Street sidewalk and widen the finger planter.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 7/0/0. (La Voie/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR (10:15):

See separate meeting minutes.

HLC CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**FINAL REVIEW****A. 1303 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-014
 Application Number: MST2009-00371
 Owner: Bosse Toy Train Museum, Inc.
 Architect: Edwards-Pitman Architects

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal for alterations to an existing, two-story, 2,300 square foot commercial building including a 51 square foot one-story addition at the rear, and the elimination of 153 square feet from the second story. Also proposed is to reconfigure the front entry to be handicapped-accessible, and the addition of one rooftop HVAC unit at the front, and two rooftop condensers on the rear side. There will be a net loss of 103 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Final review is requested of the project and details.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 502 BRINKERHOFF AVE****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-013
 Application Number: MST2010-00215
 Owner: Sassola III Family Trust
 Architect: On Design, LLC
 Applicant: Patsy Stadelman

(This building is a **Structure of Merit**. Proposal to change the legal use of an existing 1,080 square foot single-family residence to mixed-use, install a new wheelchair lift and path of travel, and a new landing and stairs on the west elevation. The resulting mixed-use building will allow 430 square feet of residential use and 650 square feet of commercial use. No new floor area is proposed. Final Building Permit signoff for this project will abate enforcement case ENF2010-00517.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires Historic Resources Findings.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 18 E ORTEGA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00384
 Owner: Alan Porter
 Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal to change the exterior paint color of the building housing Dargan's Pub from off-white to "Golden Popover.")

Continued two weeks to the Full Board.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 1900 LASUEN RD**

C-2 Zone

(11:30)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2005-00490
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. This is Phase II of the 2004 approved Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. Phase II includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and **Cottages** 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and **29**. Phase I of the project was reviewed under MST99-00305.)

(Final Approval of architectural details is requested for Cottage 29.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:56 P.M. ****