



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 27, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
- FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
- ALEX PUJO – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present at 2:24 p.m.
- PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:13 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, October 22, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:31):

- A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the City Council meetings on the Plan Santa Barbara General Plan Update.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 13, 2010**.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 13, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 4/0/2. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent. Boucher/Sharpe abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. HLC Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item A, which was also reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 6/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee Consent meeting of **October 13, 2010**, as reviewed by the HLC Sign Committee.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee Consent meeting of October 13, 2010, as reviewed by the Sign Committee.

Action: Sharpe/Pujo, 6/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Drury and Murray would be absent from the meeting and Chair Naylor would need to leave by 6:30 p.m.
- b) There will be an appeal hearing at the City Council on November 16, evening session, of the HLC's action on the project at 101 W. Cañón Perdido Street. Commissioners Drury and Pujo have agreed to represent the HLC.

2. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, distributed a draft letter directed to the City Council Ordinance Committee with respect to the HLC's concern about the proliferation of LCD monitors at gasoline stations. The Commissioners suggested changes to the memo.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT1. **201 & 211 E HALEY ST**

C-M Zone

(1:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-016
 Application Number: MST2010-00233
 Owner: Mission Linen Supply
 Applicant: URS Corporation
 Agent: Don Bock
 Contractor: Brady Environmental, Inc.

(Proposal for a temporary, 90-day, on-site soil remediation project as required by the California Regional Water Quality Control Board. The proposal will involve the removal and treatment of contaminated soil and placement of an RV and job trailer. The proposal involves approximately 1,700 cubic yards of grading excavation which will be treated, replaced, and regraded on site. Also proposed is an access easement to remove and treat the contaminated soil on the adjacent property at 211 E. Haley, and allowance for temporary vehicle storage for use on the adjacent property to be located at 201 E. Haley while the work is being performed. Approval is requested to allow the occupancy of a temporary trailer by the site superintendent for the duration of the remediation work, which is proposed to occur around the clock. The proposal also includes adding a green screen to an existing six foot tall perimeter fence to screen the equipment from public view.)

(Review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich of URS Corporation.)

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, commented that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations for required archaeological monitoring during any earth-moving activities on either parcel.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

NEW ITEM2. **318 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(1:46)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
 Application Number: SGN2010-00128
 Applicant: Vogue Signs Company
 Business Name: REI

(Proposal to install six new wall signs: one 2.2 square foot painted wall sign, one non-illuminated 8 square foot sign, two 85.3 square foot internally illuminated wall cabinet signs, one 14 square foot halo-lit channel letter sign, and one 48 square foot internally illuminated cabinet sign. The total amount of signage requested is 242 square feet. The linear building frontage is 120 feet. The allowable signage is 60 square feet.)

(Exceptions are requested to allow total signage in excess of the allowable, over-sized letters and logos, and for an off-site sign visible from Highway 101.)

Present: Patti Civarra, REI Representative
 Greg Mellinger, REI Representative
 Peter Lewis, Property Owner
 Christian Muldoon, Vogue Sign Company

Public comment opened at 1:59 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about no access from State Street and signs larger than allowed by the Sign Ordinance.

Public comment closed at 2:00 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Redesign the proposal so that it is directed to pedestrian and vehicular access, not to the adjacent freeway.
2. The applicant would benefit from locating ground signs on Gutiérrez and Anacapa Streets.
3. Signs 3, 4 and 6 are not acceptable.
4. The Commission does not support an exception request to allow letter height in excess of the allowable for signs facing the freeway. Further study is required for an exception of letter height on other proposed signs.
5. Proposals should conform to the Sign Ordinance (e.g., internally illuminated signs are not acceptable).

Action: Pujó/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Drury/Murray/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. **309 E CAÑÓN PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:17)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-034
 Application Number: MST2010-00265
 Owner: Sligh Family Trust
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,233 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and construct a new 4,075 square foot, two-story duplex, and subterranean parking garage with four parking spaces on a 5,037 square foot lot. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for zoning modifications to allow encroachment into the front and interior yard setbacks and to not provide the total amount of required open space.)

(An Historic Structures/Sites Report was accepted by the HLC on June 10, 2009, which proposed demolition of this structure. Photo-documentation of the existing house, its setting and the retaining wall, and installation of a commemorative plaque memorializing the history of the property and its association with Old Spanish Town is required. Project also requires Environmental Assessment, and Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested.)

Present: Clay Aurell, Designer
 Lang Sligh, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:42 p.m.

Wayne Ashcraft, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Richard Sanford, neighbor, expressed concerns with the project's adjacency to El Caserío, and the scale and mass on the north end of property.

Mike Schley, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed concern with the impacts to adjacent historic structures.

Ellen Goodstein, Legal Aid Foundation Executive Director, spoke in favor of the project.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. Stair towers should be integrated more into the mass of the building.
2. Lower the elements that exceed the second-floor roofline.
3. Positive comments were expressed with respect to the modifications for the underground garage and setbacks.
4. Project Compatibility Analysis was made with the following comments:
 - a) The size, bulk, and scale were generally acceptable with the exception of the mass and height of the stair towers.
 - b) Additional information is required to assure that the proposed building is sensitive to adjacent Historic Resources. A vicinity plan should identify adjacent historic resources and photo-simulations/site cross-sections, are requested to show the streetscape, and full-scale elevations of both sides of the property to show possible impacts to adjacent historic resources.
5. Allow more open space and green space and study the size of the building to allow some canopy trees.

Action: Pujos/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. **702 LAGUNA ST**

R-3 Zone

(3:13)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-023

Application Number: MST2010-00288

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

Architect: East Beach Ventures

(Proposal for approximately 7,656 square feet of one and two-story non-residential additions at an existing Housing Authority facility. The additions consist of a 2,946 square foot first floor addition and a 2,726 square foot second floor addition to an existing 986 square foot one-story storage building (Building A), and a 1,834 square foot one-story addition to an existing 4,184 square foot one-story maintenance building (Building B). There are 59 parking spaces proposed. Planning Commission approval is requested for an amendment to an existing Conditional Use Permit, a Transfer of Existing Development Rights for new nonresidential square footage, and a Development Plan.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission Approval.)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect
Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority

Motion: Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Planning Commission:

1. The Commission supports the design because it locates the taller elements in the center of the site, creating less of an impact to the neighboring properties.
2. The project meets all aspects of the Project Compatibility Analysis requirements.
3. Study relocating the two Olive trees proposed to be removed.
4. Significant canopy trees should be added to the site plan.
5. Provide more design variation between the elements that are essentially the same (e.g., plaster scoring).

Action: Suding/Pujo, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. **1809 STANWOOD DR**

A-1 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-143-005
 Application Number: MST2010-00322
 Owner: Linda Dye
 Applicant: Roy Harthorn

(This structure is a designated **Structure of Merit**: "Flores Casita, former Flores Ranch." Proposal for alterations to an existing structure including the replacement of porches and closet removed for seismic retrofit foundation replacement, and installation of a new roof. Also included is the installation of a new window to match existing and the restoration and rehabilitation of doors, windows, siding, trim, and finishes per original plan and photographic record.)

(Project requires Tier 2 Basic Best Management Practices to comply with the City's Stormwater Management Program.)

Present: Roy Harthorn, Applicant
 Linda Dye, Owner

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for final.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. **1303 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:59) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-014
 Application Number: MST2009-00371
 Owner: Bosse Toy Train Museum, Inc.
 Architect: Edwards- Pitman Architects

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal for alterations to an existing, two-story, 2,300 square foot commercial building including a 51 square foot one-story addition at the rear, and the elimination of 153 square feet from the second story. Also proposed is to reconfigure the front entry to be handicapped-accessible, and the addition of one rooftop HVAC unit at the front, and two rooftop condensers on the rear side. There will be a net loss of 103 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the blank wall on Victoria Street.

Public comment closed at 4:04 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for final.

Action: Adams/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:09 P.M. TO 4:20 P.M. ****

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

7. **1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

(4:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015

Application Number: MST2010-00032

Owner: Monte C. and Patricia R. Fligsten Trust

Designer: Eric Swenumson

(This dwelling is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and was found to be **worthy of Structure of Merit status: "Hall Cottage/Park Residence."** Proposal to demolish and reconstruct 731 square feet of an existing 2,851 square foot, two-story single-family residence and construct a 216 square foot, first floor addition. Also proposed is to construct two new second floor decks at the rear totaling 1,576 square feet. An existing 1,211 square foot, two-story detached accessory space is to remain unaltered. This project will result in a total square footage of 4,266, which is 90% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio on a 25,425 square foot parcel.)

(Project requires Tier 2 Basic Best Management Practices to comply with the City's Stormwater Management Program.)

Present: Eric Swenumson, Designer
Monte Fligsten, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:24 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for complete color selection to be shown on elevations.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR (10:15):

See separate meeting minutes.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00):**HLC-CONSENT (NEW)****A. 500 NIÑOS DR****P-R/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-002
 Application Number: MST2010-00299
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Channel Islands Restoration
 Applicant: George Thomson

(This site is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: Site of A Child's Estate & Chumash Village Archaeological Site. Proposal for a habitat restoration project along the western margin of the Andree Clark Bird Refuge located on Santa Barbara Zoo property. The project will include the removal of non-native vegetation including arundo, myoporum, and cape ivy, and planting new native vegetation including willows, sycamores, and wetland species. Coastal review is required.)

(Comments only; Environmental Assessment required.)

Final Approval with updated drawings to be directed to Staff with the following conditions:

1. Add *Salix lasiolepis* (Arroyo Willow) to the palette.
2. Concentrate the Sycamore placement closest to Cabrillo Blvd.
3. Study adding 2 or 3 Oaks into the bioswale area.

HLC-CONSENT (NEW)**B. 936 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-029
 Application Number: MST2010-00317
 Owner: Sobhani Trust
 Architect: Aday Architects
 Business Name: US Bank

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Logan & Bryan Building, former Mission Federal Savings." Proposal for minor alterations to an existing commercial building including a new automated teller machine, night depository, and new handicapped-accessible ramp with level landing and guardrail. Also proposed is to re-lamp existing light fixtures with 8-watt LED warm light bulbs.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A.

HLC-CONSENT (NEW)**C. 1111 E CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-352-008
Application Number: MST2010-00323
Owner: HDG Associates
Contractor: Callender Glass

(This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Mar Monte Hotel." Proposal to replace 70 existing aluminum windows with new Fiberglass-clad wood windows. All window opening sizes to remain the same.)

Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. Existing aluminum frames are to remain installed and the new windows shall conform to those frames.
2. Colors shall match existing.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:31 P.M. ****