



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 13, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present  
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent  
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Absent  
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
 FERMINA MURRAY – Absent  
 ALEX PUJO – Present  
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present  
 PHIL SUDING – Present until 2:52 p.m.

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

MICHAEL SELF – Present until 2:00 p.m.

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present  
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present  
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under *City Calendar* to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, October 8, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Public Comment:

None.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **September 29, 2010**.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 29, 2010, with corrections.**

Action: Adams/Suding, 4/0/2. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe. Adams/Pujo abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. HLC Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Craig Shallenberger; with the exception of Item C, which was also reviewed by Philip Suding and Item D, which was also reviewed by Michael Drury and Philip Suding.**

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee Consent meeting of **September 29, 2010**, as reviewed by the HLC Sign Committee.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Sign Committee Consent Calendar meeting of September 29, 2010.**

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Boucher/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

a) Commissioners Sharpe and Murray would be absent from the meeting.

b) Items 1 and 2 on the agenda at 318 State Street and 1303 State Street, respectively, were postponed two weeks at the applicants' request.

2. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, gave an update on the proposed Sign Ordinance amendments that were discussed with the Ordinance Subcommittee at its October 12 meeting. The Commissioners expressed concern with the proliferation of LCD monitors at gasoline stations as a form of advertisement. Of specific concern is the noise generated from them. They also felt that the public safety argument is not sufficient grounds to justify their use. There was a consensus to send their sentiments to the City Council in the form of a memorandum. Michael Self and Kellam de Forest also commented on the issue.
3. Mr. Limón stated that two other issues were discussed with the Ordinance Committee: Time approval extensions, and the idea of changing the terminology from “Preliminary Approval” to “Design Review Approval.”
4. Michael Self, City Council member, commented about the Chapala Street Guidelines with respect to bulb-outs. Commissioners Drury and Pujo agreed to attend the City Council hearing with respect to this subject on November 16 at 6:00 p.m.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Adams reported on the *34 W. Victoria St. Subcommittee*.

Commissioner Suding reported on the *El Encanto Subcommittee* meeting that Commissioners Drury and Sharpe also attended. The Mission Village area of the project was reviewed. Mr. de Forest made comments about the water line and plant material.

**NEW ITEM**

1. **318 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 037-254-020  
 Application Number: SGN2010-00128  
 Owner: 318 State St Properties, LLC  
 Applicant: Vogue Signs Company  
 Business Name: REI

(Proposal to install six new wall signs: One 2.2 square foot painted wall sign, a non-illuminated 8 square foot sign identifying goods, two 85.3 square foot internally illuminated wall cabinet signs, a 14 square foot halo-lit channel letter sign, and a 48 square foot internally illuminated cabinet sign. The total amount of signage requested is 242.8 square feet. The linear building frontage is 120 feet. The allowable signage is 60 square feet.)

**(Exceptions are requested to allow total signage in excess of the allowable, over-sized letters, and logos and for an off-site sign visible from Highway 101.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant’s request.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****2. 1303 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-014  
Application Number: MST2009-00371  
Owner: Bosse Toy Train Museum Inc.  
Architect: Edwards- Pitman Architects

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**. Proposal for alterations to an existing, two-story, 2,300 square foot commercial building including a 51 square foot one-story addition at the rear, and the elimination of 153 square feet from the second story. Also proposed is to reconfigure the front entry to be handicapped-accessible, and the addition of one rooftop HVAC unit at the front, and two rooftop condensers on the rear side. There will be a net loss of 103 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

**(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.**

**DISCUSSION ITEM****3. HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION RULES, MEETING PROCEDURES AND  
(2:07) GUIDELINES**

Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

(Review of updated guideline document to reflect proposed ordinance amendments and additional information.)

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 2:40 p.m. and reopened at 3:02 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed changes to the Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 2:42 p.m. and was reclosed at 3:05 p.m.

Commissioners Adams and Pujo agreed to participate in the *HLC Rules, Meeting Procedures and Guidelines Ad hoc Subcommittee*.

**Discussion held.**

**SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR (10:15):**

**See separate meeting minutes.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (10:00):****CONSENT (NEW)****A. 10 E CARRILLO ST****C-2 Zone**

(10:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-051  
Application Number: MST2010-00295  
Owner: William Poulis Revocable Trust  
Applicant: Darlene St. John  
Business Name: Former Aficianado European Bakery

(This building is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources**: "Gidney Building." Proposed trim color change on an existing commercial building.)

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**CONSENT (NEW)****B. 6 W DE LA GUERRA ST****C-2 Zone**

(10:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013  
Application Number: MST2010-00297  
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust  
Applicant: Marcos Rivas

(Proposal to remove an existing pair of doors in building facade and install a new freestanding Wells Fargo ATM machine and light fixture. Signage under separate review.)

**Final Approval as noted.**

**CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)****C. 710 ANACAPA ST****C-2 Zone**

(10:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013  
Application Number: MST2008-00362  
Owner: Adame Trust  
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is a **Structure of Merit: "Carpenter Gothic Cottage."** Proposal to demolish 985 square feet of the non-historic portion of an existing mixed-use building (currently 162.5 square feet of commercial space and 1,399 square feet of residential duplex space) resulting in a 418 square foot commercial space and 337 square foot commercial basement storage area. Also proposed is to construct a new, three-story, 3,035 square foot mixed-use building with 448 square feet of commercial space and a 1,941 square foot, three-bedroom residential unit. This will result in an increase of 1,040 square feet for commercial use, which will require Development Plan Approval findings. Two residential parking spaces and one commercial parking space will be provided in a ground level garage, as well as one uncovered handicapped accessible parking space. The project will include permeable paving, landscaping, irrigation, and drainage improvements of the site. There will be 514 cubic yards of grading, of which 86 cubic yards will be exported off site.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested. Development Plan Approval Findings were made on November 12, 2008.)**

**Final Approval with the following comments:**

1. Move irrigation backflow back against building.
2. Landscape plan revised at parkway as noted on plans.
3. Paving as noted on plans.

**CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)****D. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

(11:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2007-00140  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
 Architect: Gensler  
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio  
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Inc.  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a **Revised Master Plan** for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) **Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner**; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

**(Final Approval of the Mission Village portion of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-09.)**

**Final Approval as noted on plans with the following comments:**

1. **The following items are to be addressed and submitted for review by the El Encanto Ad hoc Subcommittee:**
  - a) Sheet A34.09.02, Detail 4, west elevation, Building 34B: study elevator entry, use traditional awning, not a quarter dome awning; no arch, no surround.
  - b) Sheet A34.30.00: Provide cut sheet for door hardware and card reader.
2. **The following items are to be addressed and submitted for review by Staff:**
  - a) Sheet A34.30.00, elevation Detail F; change dimension at head to 6".
  - b) Sheet A50.09.01, Detail 6: add radius to chimney.
  - c) Sheet A50.12.08, Detail 7: cross out FB-2.
  - d) Awning colors: FB-1 acceptable; FB-2 not acceptable.
  - e) Sheet A50.09.04, Detail 7: reverse jamb.
  - f) Sheet A50.09.05: remove keystone.
  - g) Sheet A50.12.06, Detail 5: add "copper" to note.

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:37 P.M. \*\***