



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 15, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:30 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Absent
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present until 4:57 p.m.
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Absent
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- PHIL SUDING – Present until 2:27 p.m.; again at 2:32 p.m. until 2:51 p.m.; and again at 3:09 p.m.

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:51 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Absent
- KATHLEEN KENNEDY, Associate Planner – Present at 4:15 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present until 5:30 p.m.
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, September 10, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 *Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):

A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the City Council upholding the HLC's decision to deny approval of the bulb-out at the corner of Carrillo and Anacapa Streets.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 1, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 1, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Murray/Adams, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendars: Sign Committee Consent and HLC Consent.

Motion: Ratify the EPV Sign Committee Consent Calendar of September 15, 2010, as reviewed and corrected by Louise Boucher and Natalie Cope.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the HLC Consent Calendar of September 15, 2010, as reviewed by Philip Suding.

Action: Drury/Suding, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

D. Listing of approved Conforming Signs of September 1, 2010.

1. 503 Paseo Nuevo – Eyebrow Art (SGN2010-00095).
2. 819 State Street – Epic Bowl (SGN2010-00087).

The Conforming Signs were reviewed by Natalie Cope.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Chair Naylor and Commissioners Pujo and Sharpe would be absent from the meeting.
- b) Commissioner Shallenberger would be stepping down from Item 8 at 318 State Street.

2. Commissioner Drury announced that The Oak Group is having an exhibition benefiting the Eastern Sierra Land Trust at the Faulkner Gallery, Santa Barbara Public Library, through September 30, 2010.

3. Commissioner Drury reported that at the September 14 meeting, the City Council upheld the HLC decision with respect to the intersection of Carrillo and Anacapa Streets. Mr. Limón added that there is no prohibition in the guidelines against curb extensions; however, it is clear that the HLC has purview as to whether they are acceptable in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

F. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Boucher reported on the Survey Subcommittee as to the progress of Part I of the Area 3 Lower Riviera Neighborhood Historic Survey.

(2:18)

2. Mr. Limón requested the creation of an HLC Highway 101 High-Occupancy Vehicle (HOV) *Ad hoc* Subcommittee to work with CalTrans for the areas within the coastal portion of the project. Commissioner Drury volunteered to participate.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **200 BLK CHAPALA ST**

(1:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070
 Application Number: MST2010-00263
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Applied Earthworks
 Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposed replacement of the Chapala - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek.)

(Review of Archaeological Survey Report prepared by Ann Munns of Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)

Present: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that the potential for encountering prehistoric archaeological resources during construction is considered low, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on the construction plans prior to issuance of a building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 200 BLK CHAPALA ST**

(1:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-070
Application Number: MST2010-00263
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Applied Earthworks
Architect: Craig Drake

(Proposed replacement of the Chapala - W. Yanonali Street bridge over Mission Creek.)

(Review of Historical Resources Evaluation Report prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc. The HRER concludes that the Chapala Street Bridge qualifies as a Structure of Merit.)

Present: Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that Staff has read the report, found it to be acceptable and recommend acceptance of the report.

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Public comment reopened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on public visibility and providing a full historic report.

Public comment reclosed at 2:04 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the understanding that subsequent reviews will preserve, to the extent possible, the sandstone abutments and steel trusses as character defining features of the bridge.

Action: Adams/Drury, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
Application Number: MST2010-00261
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Thomas Conti

(Proposed replacement of the Mason Street bridge over Mission Creek.)

Present: Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that the potential for encountering prehistoric archaeological resources during construction is considered low, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on the construction plans prior to issuance of a building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Suding, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**4. 0 BLK W MASON ST**

(2:07) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-096
 Application Number: MST2010-00261
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Thomas Conti

(Proposed replacement of the Mason Street bridge over Mission Creek.)

(Review of Historical Resources Evaluation Report prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc. The HRER recommends that the structure at 15 W. Mason Street, former garage for the Californian Hotel, be removed from the Designated Historic Resources list as a Structure of Merit. The Mason Street bridge was found to not qualify as a historic resource.)

Present: Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that Staff has read the report, found it to be acceptable and recommend acceptance of the report.

Public comment opened at 2:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the need to have the structure formally documented.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the comment that the letter from Mary Louise Days dated December 15, 1987, be included

Action: Boucher/Suding, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**5. 1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

(2:19) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
 Application Number: MST2010-00032
 Owner: Monte C. and Patricia R. Fligsten Trust
 Designer: Eric Swenumson

(This dwelling is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was found to be worthy of Structure of Merit status: "Hall Cottage/Park Residence." Proposal to demolish and reconstruct 731 square feet of an existing 2,851 square foot, two-story single-family residence and construct a 216 square foot, first-floor addition. Also proposed is to construct two new second-floor decks at the rear totaling 1,576 square feet. An existing 1,211 square foot, two-story detached accessory space is to remain unaltered. This project will result in a total square footage of 4,266, which is 90% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio on a 25,425 square foot parcel.)

(Review of an Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report originally reviewed and accepted on May 11, 2005 under MST2005-00123. The structure was found to be worthy of Structure of Merit status and for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post, Historical Consultant
Eric Swenumson, Designer
Monte Fligsten, Owner

An e-mail was received from Phil Morreale, neighbor, expressing support for the project.

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Public comment reopened at 2:26 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to documenting existing with historical photographs.

Public comment reclosed at 2:27 p.m.

Staff comments: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, stated that the City Historian has read the report and recommends acceptance of the report.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 5/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

6. 1730 ANACAPA ST

E-1 Zone

(2:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
Application Number: MST2010-00032
Owner: Monte C. and Patricia R. Fligsten Trust
Designer: Eric Swenumson

(This dwelling is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources** and was found to be **worthy of Structure of Merit status: "Hall Cottage/Park Residence."** Proposal to demolish and reconstruct 731 square feet of an existing 2,851 square foot, two-story single-family residence and construct a 216 square foot, first-floor addition. Also proposed is to construct two new second-floor decks at the rear totaling 1,576 square feet. An existing 1,211 square foot, two-story detached accessory space is to remain unaltered. This project will result in a total square footage of 4,266, which is 90% of the maximum guideline floor to lot area ratio on a 25,425 square foot parcel.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Eric Swenumson, Designer
Monte Fligsten, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Public comment reopened at 2:41 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to whether the anterior sandstone wall was plastered over or removed.

Public comment reclosed at 2:42 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The size, bulk and scale are generally acceptable.
2. The color palette is generally acceptable; however, the assignment is not.
3. Clarify the siding above the windows on the west elevation on the plans.
4. Provide a roof plan in future submittals.
5. Study the access landing and/or stairs at the west elevation mechanical room door.
6. Study the fireplace/BBQ wall siding and provide details of that element.
7. Pull the railing for the roof deck from east to west so that the roof beyond captures the railing.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:51 P.M. TO 3:03 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**7. 00 E ANAPAMU ST**

C-2 Zone

(3:03) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-0RW
 Application Number: MST2008-00338
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal for new Metropolitan Transit District bus stop shelter designs for various downtown locations on City sidewalks.)

(Final Approval of project is requested.)

Present: David Damiano, MTD Manager of Transit Development and Community Relations
 Ken Radtkey, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the size and busyness of the proposed structures for El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Public comment closed at 3:25 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely for details to return to the Consent Calendar:

1. Study and improve the MTD signage portion at the tops of the side elevations of the bus stop for durability and how it is attached to the frame.
2. Restudy the protruding bench arm rests so that they are more traditional.
3. Study sitting opportunities on Anapamu Street so that they are more regularly spaced and traditional in form.
4. The sandstone bases shall be a lighter color: more of a Santa Barbara sandstone.
5. The laser cuts shall have as many eased edges as possible to soften the edges.
6. Address the skateboard concerns so that the outdoor furnishing is skateboard-proof from damage.
7. The proposed LED would be acceptable.

Action: Adams/Drury, 3/2/1. (Suding/Boucher opposed because they cannot support the laser cut ironwork. Murray abstained. Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**8. 318 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(4:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
Application Number: MST2010-00167
Owner: 318 State Street Properties, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architecture

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom, a.k.a. Andalucía Building." Proposal for a facade remodel at the rear elevation of an existing structure at 318 State Street including the removal of nine existing windows, sandblasting an existing brick facade, a new plaster entry surround, new doors, trellis, canvas awnings, paint, truck dock with roll-up door, parapet, and light fixtures. The proposal includes preservation of the existing historic arcade and front building located at 318 State Street. No new square footage is proposed.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Joe Andrulaitis and Jeff Hornbuckle, Architects
Peter Lewis, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:10 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support to the use of Glulam material for the trellis?
1/4. (Adams/Boucher/Murray/Suding opposed.)

Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for details with the following conditions:

1. Glulam for the trellis is not acceptable. Genuine wood, either rough sawn or other, is preferred.
2. Flashing at the parapet shall be painted a dark bronze color to blend with existing brick building material.
3. Galvanized fittings on the trellis shall be painted a dark color.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 5/0/0. (Shallanberger stepped down. Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.)
Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**9. 101 W CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-023
Application Number: MST2009-00397
Owner: Verizon California, Inc.
Agent: Blu Croix Ltd.
Engineer: Penfield and Smith Engineering Inc.
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal for a one-lot subdivision into two new lots and conversion of existing office space into four commercial condominium units in an existing four-story telecommunications switch facility. Also proposed on this 75,134 square foot parcel is the installation of a new ADA accessible lift at the Chapala Street entry and street improvements including a new bulb-out and landscaping at the south corner of the intersection of Chapala and W. Canon Perdido Streets. No new floor area is proposed. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for the Tentative Subdivision Map and the condominium conversion.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 104-09.)

Present: Michael Morgan, Agent
Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect

Staff clarified that Preliminary and Final Approval were being requested.

Public comment opened at 4:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the historic status of the site, its character-defining features, and removal of the bulb-out at that corner.

Public comment closed at 4:37 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks with the following conditions:

1. Provide additional final details for the iron railings.
2. Treat the wheelchair lift in a more traditional fashion that also helps it to blend in and disappear more into the recess of the building.

Action: Drury/Boucher, 5/1/0. (Suding opposed because he does not approve the proliferation of contemporary materials. Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**10. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(4:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00140
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Gensler
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) **Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner**; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(In-Progress Review of the Mission Village portion of the project. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 004-09.)

Present: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
 Casey Nagel, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:12 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented in support of the proposed fountain.

Public comment closed at 5:14 p.m.

- Straw votes:
1. How many Commissioners would prefer the off-set fountain location on the east side of the organic-shaped open space? 4/1. (Suding opposed.)
 2. How many Commissioners would prefer the fountain in the center of the organic-shaped open space? 4/1. (Murray opposed.)

- Motion:** Continued two weeks with the following comments:
- 1. Building 32 south elevation:**
 - a. Applicant has responded to all the Commission comments from the preliminary approval motion.
 - b. The gabled roof at the center of the elevation is appreciated.
 - c. There is no consensus on the use of shutters and it was left up to the architect to choose a design.
 - 2. Building 33 south elevation:**
 - a. Applicant has responded to the Commission comments from the preliminary approval motion.
 - b. The restudy of the angle of the chimneys still needs to be addressed.
 - c. The fountain in the open space area was previously resolved; there is no longer a wall fountain proposed.
 - d. Resolve the splays on the first story windows.
 - 3. Building 34A west elevation:**
 - a. The revised building massing is generally acceptable.
 - b. Restudy the stair configuration in context with the previous design.
 - 4. Building 34A south elevation:** The chimney terminations are appropriate.
- Action: Adams/Drury, 5/0/0. (Boucher/Naylor/Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

SIGN COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR

See separate meeting minutes.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)**CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)****A. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Gensler
Architect: Henry Lenny
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a **Structure of Merit**. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; **3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated;** 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Final Approval of Cottages 27 and 28 is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 034-09.)

Final Approval with Detail 12 (Sheet A50.12.02) to return to Staff for review.

CONSENT (FINAL REVIEW)**B. 1900 LASUEN RD****R-2/4.0/R-H Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00140
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Gensler
Architect: Henry Lenny
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: **1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29;** 2) Mission Village, consisting of 6 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Final Approval of details for the northwest corner/back-of-house portion of the project. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution Nos. 004-09 and 034-09.)

Final Approval with garage entry elevation (Sheet A.36.02.01) to return to Staff.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:51 P.M. ****