



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 26, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
 PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present from 2:45 p.m. to 3:06 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the <u>time of submittal & each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, May 21, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

Roy Harthorn, Historian, updated the HLC on the restoration repair of the Flores Casita located at 1809 Stanwood Drive.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 12, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 12, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/2. (Drury/Pujo abstained. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Craig Shallenberger and Robert Adams.

Action: Suding/Murray, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Sharpe would be absent from the meeting.
- b) The regularly scheduled Historic Landmarks Commission meeting on Wednesday, June 23, 2010, has been rescheduled to Thursday, June 24, 2010, at the same time and location.

2. Commissioner Adams announced the I Madonnari Italian Street Painting Festival at the Mission of Santa Barbara the weekend of May 29, 2010.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Drury reported on the West Beach Art Project. The last project located at Chapala is progressing.

Commissioner Pujo reported on La Entrada de Santa Barbara Subcommittee. The applicant has agreed to simplify the project, especially on Mason Street at Area B.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**1. 13 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(1:41)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-111-012
 Application Number: MST2010-00033
 Owner: Virginia and Renee Castagnola Family
 Architect: Lenvik and Minor Architects
 Engineer: Frank Cunningham
 Business Name: Lighthouse Restaurant

(The proposed project is related to the E. Cabrillo Bridge Replacement Project. Proposed additions and alterations to an existing 5,155 square foot commercial building on a 7,274 square foot parcel in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The changes include demolition of 1,166 square feet on the first floor [part of which is currently overhanging Mission Creek], a 1,036 square foot second-floor addition and stairway, and a new 350 square foot outdoor patio on the first floor. City Council approval is requested for a variance for the project to encroach into the ten foot E. Cabrillo Blvd. setback, Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit and a Zoning Modification to encroach into the twenty foot front yard setback, and the Chief Building Official will need to make Development Along Creeks findings as well as assure compliance with Mission Creek development standards. The project will result in credit of 130 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Findings, and Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

Present: Richard Six, Architect
 Virginia Castagnola, Owner
 Pat Kelly, City Engineer/Assistant Public Works Director
 Debra Andoloro, City Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the lighthouse tower and asked about its function.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following positive comments to the Planning Commission:

1. The mass, bulk, and scale of the proposed addition is acceptable.
2. The location and size of the trash enclosure are acceptable.
3. Additional landscaping is requested.
4. The details will be worked on after the development review is completed.
5. At least two Commissioners find the project supportable, but have trouble with the lighthouse remaining as part of the project.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 6/2/0. (Boucher/Suding opposed. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Reopen the item in order to make compatibility analysis findings.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Substitute

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following positive comments to the Planning Commission:

1. The mass, bulk, and scale of the proposed addition is acceptable.
2. The location and size of the trash enclosure are acceptable.
3. Additional landscaping is requested, particularly more trees and more planting at the trash enclosure.
4. The details will be worked on after the development review is completed.
5. At least two Commissioners find the project supportable, but have trouble with the lighthouse remaining as part of the project.
6. The project meets all six of the Compatibility Analysis requirements.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 6/2/0. (Boucher/Suding opposed. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED

2. 925 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:09) Assessor’s Parcel Number: 039-313-027
 Application Number: MST2010-00124
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Dawn Sophi Ziemer
 Landscape Architect: Earthform Design

(Proposal to remodel a former auto muffler repair shop into office space for City Fire Station No. 1. The project includes an upgrade of the front I and streetscape including repainting the building and installing new sidewalk and landscaping. Also proposed is restriping the existing parking lot and installation of an electric gate on the south side of the building.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with the Chapala Street Design Guidelines.)

Present: Dawn Ziemer and Richard Khristian, KBZ Architects
 Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect
 Peter Ramsdell, City Fire Special Projects Manager

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the original design of the building and coverage for the door openings.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would agree to move forward with the chain-link fence as shown? 3/5. (Adams/Boucher/Murray/Naylor/Suding opposed.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The project is ready for preliminary and final approvals after environmental assessment is completed.
2. Study the tree wells and plant materials along Chapala Street to be more drought-tolerant.
3. Redesign the chain link fence to meet El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines standards.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED**3. 321 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:43) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-019
 Application Number: MST2009-00220
 Owner: Jon and Sally Terrell
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for a condominium conversion of an existing two-story duplex and exterior alterations including the enclosure of a 133 square foot open deck, construction of a new 380 square foot, second-floor deck, and the addition of a 326 square foot roof deck. Also proposed on this 7,900 square foot parcel adjacent to El Caserío is a new exterior stairway. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for the condominium conversion.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval. Note: Initial Concept Review comments were given by Consent reviewer.)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:51 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following positive comments to be forwarded to the Staff Hearing Officer:

1. The project is compatible with the building and neighborhood
2. The Commission agrees with the proposed solutions for the outdoor space.

Action: Adams/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:55 P.M. TO 3:06 P.M. ****

PRELIMINARY REVIEW HEARING**4. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00296
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposal is to demolish an existing 3,078 square foot cottage [#12 "Overlook"] and to construct a new 3,250 net square foot Spanish style cottage at El Encanto Hotel. Regrading and landscaping will also be included in this project.)

(Preliminary Approval of Cottage 12 is requested. Project requires Historic Resource Findings and compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 057-04 and Substantial Conformance Determination granted by staff on June 9, 2008.)

Present: Jim Lefever, Architect
Trish Allen, SEPPS
Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. The applicant has addressed the Commission's previous comments.
2. Remove the balcony on the west elevation.
3. Restudy the proportion at the base of the oriel window, not necessarily to emulate that of Building 11, but to approach it in a more elegant way.
4. Restudy the location of the upper window on the south end of the west elevation with relation to the lower window on the same elevation.
5. Provide a vertical landscape element that responds to the missing fountain in order to soften the north elevation.
6. Provide additional details and show all downspout locations.

Action: Shallanberger/Adams, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

5. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:45)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2005-00490
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. This is Phase II of the 2004 approved Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. Phase II includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and Cottages 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Phase I of the project was reviewed under MST99-00305.)

(Review After Final of change to approved Master Site Plan landscape pathways. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 057-04.)

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
Jim Lefever, Architect
Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about a pathway plan in the original design; and handicap accessibility.

Public comment closed at 3:50 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. Change the width of all three foot pathways to 42 inches to provide a more functional walkway.
2. Where pathways lead to a single, non-handicap accessible unit, reduce the width to 42 inches.

Action: Pujol/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:59 P.M. TO 4:01 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED**6. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(4:01)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00140
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages [#37, 38 & 39] containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 5 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(Continued Concept Review of Mission Village. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No's. 004-09 and 034-09.)

Present: Casey Nagel and Jim Lefever, Architects
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.

Trevor Martinson, local resident, commented about zoning issues and variance.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the aesthetics fitting in with the residential areas on Mission Ridge and the eastern side.

Public comment closed at 4:28 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. The Commission is in support of the redistribution of the massing and breaking up of Building 34 into Buildings 34A and 34B; and redistributing square footage for Buildings 30 and 31 so that they are partial two-story buildings.
2. The second story should have a lower plate height than the first story.
3. Study the space between floors allocated for the HVAC mechanical system because as proposed it creates an odd proportion and makes the space between the windows and the roof too high.
4. Windows over 28 inches in width should be reduced.
5. Study a different solution to the use of the circular element and the iron railing at the southwest corner so that it is less of a commercial element.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

El Encanto Hotel Subcommittee: The Subcommittee will meet on Wednesday, June 9, from 9:00 a.m. to 10:00 a.m. in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.

CONSENT CALENDAR**FINAL REVIEW****A. 228 E VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-122-006
 Application Number: MST2010-00098
 Owner: Randee Meehan
 Architect: RDG Architecture and Interiors, Inc.
 Contractor: Andre Schneider Electric
 Engineer: Thom Hume Consulting Engineers

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building including the following: replace storefront windows, add decorative tile window surrounds, reconfigure entry and add decorative wrought iron gate, alter existing roof parapet and add a pitched tile roof element, install three new windows with decorative tile surrounds on the west elevation, install new exterior light fixture, install new copper downspout, and install four new rooftop skylights. There will be an overall reduction of approximately 68 net square feet of Measure "E" floor area due to the entry reconfiguration. New signage to be reviewed under a separate application.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 2420 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-025
Application Number: MST2010-00020
Architect: Lenvik and Minor Architects
Owner: Kent Hodgetts

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Bernhard and Irene Hoffmann Residence." This is a revised project description: Proposal to construct a new swimming pool, stone pool apron, above-ground pool equipment enclosure, realign and resurface an existing driveway, and utility trenching.)

(Final Approval of landscape details is requested.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A-1.

NEW ITEM**C. 207 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-031
Application Number: MST2010-00146
Owner: State of California
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(This site is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: "Part of reconstruction of original El Presidio de Santa Barbara State Historical Park." Proposal to relocate, upgrade and expand a trash enclosure from 185 square feet to 213 square feet.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment but action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet C-0.0.

NEW ITEM**D. 715 SANTA BARBARA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-007
Application Number: MST2010-00150
Owner: Santa Barbara Historical Society
Applicant: Frank Schipper Construction

(These two buildings are City Landmarks: "Historic Adobe (1825) and Covarrubias Adobe (1830)."
Proposal to remove the existing plaster finish and apply new lime plaster coat and whitewash. Also proposed is to remove the existing clay tile roofing, apply new underlayment, and reinstall the original clay tiles. Existing copper gutters and downspouts will be replaced in kind, like-for-like in material and configuration.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**E. 107 W YANONALI ST**

R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-072-005

Application Number: MST2010-00152

Applicant: Bill Spiewak

Owner: Christy Kelso

(Proposal to remove and replace a 41" diameter, 70' tall Bunya-bunya tree (Araucaria bidwillii) from the front yard of a property. A replacement tree is proposed.)

(Project requires tree removal findings per SBMC Section 15.24.090.)

Final Approval with the condition that the replacement tree, to be planted in the parkway strip per city standards, shall be a 24" box Magnolia grandiflora "Little Gem." Findings for removal were made per SBMC Section 15.24.090.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:53 P.M. ****