



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 12, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present until 3:57 p.m.
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Absent
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present 1:50 p.m. to 2:35 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Thursday, May 6, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:

There was an HLC Designations Subcommittee meeting at 10:00 a.m. on Wednesday, May 12, in the Community Development Director's Conference Room, 630 Garden Street.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 28, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 28, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Pujo would be absent from today's meeting. Commissioner Adams would be leaving the meeting at 3:45 p.m.
- b) Item 1 on today's agenda at 925 Chapala Street was postponed two weeks to May 26th at the architect's request.

Motion: To postpone the project at 925 Chapala Street two weeks.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- c) The next regularly scheduled HLC Consent Hearing on May 26th will take place in the Fishbowl Conference Room at 630 Garden Street, located on the first floor.

- d) An appeal of the Historic Landmarks Commission's action on the project at 517 Chapala Street will be heard by the City Council at 2:00 p.m. on Tuesday, June 22nd. It was requested that a member attend the hearing to represent the HLC.

Commissioners Boucher and Shallenberger agreed to attend.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Boucher and Murray reported on the HLC Designations Subcommittee that met in the morning.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

1. 925 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-313-027
 Application Number: MST2010-00124
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Dawn Sophi Ziemer

(Proposal to remodel a former auto muffler repair shop into office space for City Fire Station No. 1. The project includes an upgrade of the front facade and streetscape including repainting the building and installing new sidewalk and landscaping. Also proposed is restriping the existing parking lot and installation of an electric gate on the south side of the building.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and compliance with the Chapala Street Design Guidelines.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:42 P.M. TO 1:52 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

2. 2420 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(1:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00020
 Owner: Kent Hodgetts
 Architect: Lenvik and Minor Architects

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Bernhard and Irene Hoffmann Residence." Proposal to construct a new swimming pool, flagstone pool apron, above-ground pool equipment enclosure, realign and resurface an existing driveway, and construct new site walls.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project requires Historic Resource Findings.)

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect

Chair Naylor acknowledged receipt of three letters expressing support for the project:

Public comment opened at 2:02 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the fencing.

Public comment closed at 2:03 p.m.

Motion: **Final Approval as submitted with the condition that the landscape plan be reviewed on the Consent Calendar in two weeks prior to the issuance of a Building Permit; and Historic Resource Findings were made as follows:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Naylor abstained. Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 228 E VICTORIA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:29) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-122-006
Application Number: MST2010-00098
Owner: Randee Meehan
Architect: RDG Architecture & Interiors, Inc.
Contractor: Andre Schneider Electric
Engineer: Thom Hume Consulting Engineers

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building including the following: replace storefront windows, add decorative tile window surrounds, reconfigure entry and add decorative wrought iron gate, alter existing roof parapet and add a pitched tile roof element, install three new windows with decorative tile surrounds on the west elevation, install new exterior light fixture, install new copper downspout, and install four new rooftop skylights. There will be an overall reduction of approximately 68 net square feet of Measure "E" floor area due to the entry reconfiguration. New signage to be reviewed under a separate application.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Present: Jeremy Roberts, Architect

Motion: **Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for final details.**

Action: Adams/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**4. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00296
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated as a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish an existing 3,078 square foot cottage (#12 "Overlook") and to construct a new 3,250 net square foot Spanish style cottage at El Encanto Hotel. Regrading and landscaping will also be included in this project.

(Final Approval of Cottage 12 is requested. Project requires Historic Resource Findings and compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 057-04 and Substantial Conformance Determination granted by Staff on June 9, 2008.)

Present: Trish Allen, Associate Planner
 Jim Lefever, Architect
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 2:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval as submitted.
 Action: Shallanberger, 0/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Restudy the fenestration of the west and east elevations to more match the Henry Lenny plan, specifically the massing.
2. Study the plate heights to reduce massing.
3. Revert back to the plaster guardrail on the south elevation.
4. Go back to the wrought iron guardrail on the south elevation in the center of the unit.
5. Restudy fenestration and massing on the north and south elevations.
6. No preference regarding the fountain on the north elevation.

Action: Suding/Adams, 7/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**5. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:29) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2008-00387
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Proposal to deconstruct and seismically reconstruct an historic arbor to match the existing arbor exterior.)

(Final Approval of the Historic arbor is requested. The arbor received Preliminary Approval on January 25, 2006, under MST2005-00490.)

Present: Trish Allen, Associate Planner
Minh Pham, Representing Ownership
Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the pergola.

Trevor Martinson, local resident, commented about difficulty in finding original bricks; structural issues; and wood species that should be used.

Public comment closed at 3:46 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and Final Approval with the following conditions:

1. The drawings shall be modified to reflect the existing angled back that is to be recreated.
2. A historical consultant on site shall monitor six of the columns as they are being taken down.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**6. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00140
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The project site has been designated a Structure of Merit. The proposed project is a Revised Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel consisting of the following components: 1) three, one-story cottages (#37, 38 & 39) containing operations/back of house facilities above an underground, 42-space, valet parking garage in the northwest corner. Components of the utility distribution facility would be located in cottage 39, in the underground parking garage, and underneath cottage 29; 2) Mission Village, consisting of 5 new cottages with an underground valet parking garage below in the northeast corner; 3) new Cottages 27 and 28, which were previously approved and then eliminated; 4) a swimming pool with a fitness center below; 5) realignment of the sandstone wall at the main driveway entrance on Alvarado Place; and 6) a new trash enclosure, screening gate, retaining walls and landscaping at the service area adjacent to the Main Building.)

(First Concept Review is requested of the back of the house cottages, utilities distribution facility, and the underground parking structure in the Northwest corner as approved by Planning Commission on September 10, 2009. Project requires Planning Commission Resolution No. 034-09.)

Present: Trish Allen, Associate Planner
 Jim Lefever, Architect
 Katie O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m.

Trevor Martinson, local resident, commented about the large eucalyptus trees along Alvarado Place and was concerned with the proposed parking garage cutting into the roots.

Jan Marco Von Yurt, neighbor, spoke in support of the project and the concern over the frailty of the eucalyptus trees along Alvarado Place; and requested that the date palm on the corner not be removed.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the original intent of the eucalyptus trees.

Joanna Von Yurt, neighbor, spoke in support of the project and suggested that a water feature be used to reduce noise.

Public comment closed at 4:33 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments:

1. The architecture is acceptable.
2. Provide an arborist report at the next review.
3. Study adding soil above the underground structure near cottage 37 to allow for more planting.
4. It was suggested that the hedge material at the 42 inch guard rail be less formal, faster growing material.
5. The different levels should be presented graphically on the plans.

Action: Suding/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Adams/Drury/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

Commission request: The public should be made aware of approximate dates when different portions of the project are to be reviewed via the HLC full board agenda.

FINAL REVIEW**A. 220 E ORTEGA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-033

Application Number: MST2010-00039

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment

Applicant: James Winslow

(Proposal to rehabilitate an existing groundwater treatment plant by adding two 100,000 gallon tanks, one new pressure vessel, and a 293 square foot addition to house electrical equipment. Also proposed is repaving and 95 linear feet of concrete masonry wall.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet 19.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:55 P.M. ****