



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 14, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
 PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, April 9, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No comments.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 30, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 30, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Suding/Adams, 6/0/1. (Drury/Murray absent. Sharpe abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Pujos/Suding, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Drury and Murray would be absent from the meeting.
2. Commissioner Sharpe reported that he and Chair Naylor attended a meeting of the State Courts System with respect to the proposal to enclose the patio and cover it with a skylight at the newer section of the municipal courts building. The Commissioners made comments and suggestions after the applicant's presentation, but the project was approved almost exactly as proposed.
3. Commissioner Adams announced that on Saturday, April 17, the Architectural Foundation of Santa Barbara will be holding its Kids Draw Architecture sketch session. It will take place at the Santa Barbara Historical Museum, 136 E. De la Guerra Street, from 1:00 p.m. to 3:00 p.m.
4. Commissioner Boucher spoke about gooseneck lights for signs in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. She mentioned that this type of industrial fixture is not acceptable in EPV. Mr. Limón clarified that language related to that effect can be added to the proposed amendments to the Sign Ordinance and, consequently, the Sign Review Guidelines.
5. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, announced that the City Council Ordinance Subcommittee will be reviewing the proposed revisions to the Conejo Road Landslide area ordinance on Tuesday, April 22, at 12:30 p.m. in Room 15, City Hall second floor.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. PLAN SANTA BARBARA GENERAL PLAN UPDATE****(1:42)** Staff: Bettie Weiss, City Planner

(Overview discussion regarding review of draft General Plan documents and Draft Environmental Impact Report.)

Present: Bettie Weiss, City Planner

Public comment opened at 2:04 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked whether there is a specific historic resources section being proposed. He also asked about using the words historic or historical rather than “heritage.”

Public comment closed at 2:05 p.m.

Discussion held.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEMS**2. Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Update Two-Year Review Implementation****(2:09)** Staff: Heather Baker, Project Planner

(Review proposed changes to Santa Barbara Municipal Code, Single Family Residential Design Guidelines and Single Family Design Board Guidelines to implement the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Update Two-Year Review. Ordinance and SDFB Guideline changes are focused on noticing, design review triggers, staff administrative approvals, parking, subdivision projects, green building standards for large residences, and project time extensions and expirations. Design guideline changes are focused on landscaping, parking, covered outdoor areas, Floor to Lot Area Ratio implementation, glass railings, basements, lighting, and fences.)

Present: Heather Baker, Project Planner

SBMC Project Extension and Expiration Procedures**(2:17)** Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

(Proposed sections 22.22.180, 22.68.110, and 22.69.090 clarify how Design Review expirations are handled for projects, in particular for projects with multiple approvals. The proposed project expiration and extension provisions will affect all HLC and SFDB projects, including commercial and multi-family HLC projects.)

(The Commission is requested to forward recommendations to the City Council.)

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m. and reopened at 2:46 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the Community Development Director’s extensions that would not require public feedback. Mr. Limón clarified that the Director’s role is not being amended, whereas the Director currently only grants one extension.

Wanda Livernois, local resident, commented about appealable timeframe of only ten days.

Tony Vassallo, local resident, commented about the reduction of meetings to review proposed designs.

Public comment closed at 2:28 p.m. and reclosed at 2:49 p.m.

Motion: To recommend that City Council adopt the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Update Two-Year Review ordinance changes; and the revised Single Family Residential Design Guidelines and Single Family Design Board Guidelines.

Action: Pujo/Adams, 6/1/0. (Drury/Murray absent. Suding opposed.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

3. **517 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:52)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007

Application Number: MST2005-00088

Owner: H&R Investments, LP

Architect: Peikert Group Architects, LLC

(The proposed project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development with six two-bedroom residential condominium units totaling 9,999 square feet (net) and two commercial condominium spaces totaling 2,872 square feet (net). One of the units would be affordable. A modification to allow the 10% open space on the second floor is requested. Seventeen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested. Previous Preliminary Approval expired on March 4, 2010. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 030-06 and with City Council decision of March 4, 2008.)

Present: Lisa Plowman and Gordon Brewer, Peikert Group Architects
Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Mr. Limón provided the Commission background information relative to the project's review history and how current regulations and guidelines do not allow for additional time extensions. Therefore, the Preliminary Approval has expired and a new Preliminary Approval is necessary for the project to move forward. Staff recommended that the Commission consider the unique facts and circumstances involving this project, including its valid land use approvals that will not expire until 2012 and to focus the review on verification of remaining design items consistent with the previous direction provided by City Council on March 4, 2008.

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

Tony Vassalo, neighbor, commented about west elevator height, garage plate height, roof top balconies, and requirement for no "B" permits to be allowed on street.

George Ogle, neighbor, commented about the 2008 compatibility study, mountain views obstruction, and guideline violations.

Wanda Livernois, neighbor, commented about the compatibility with the character of the city, the surrounding neighborhood, and adjacent properties; and too little increase of landscape and height reduction.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about compatibility guidelines and no benefit to the city.

Public comment closed at 3:18 p.m.

Motion: Deny the project based on the following:

- 1. The preliminary approval has expired.
- 2. Building design issues related to mass, bulk and scale.
- 3. Neighborhood compatibility concerns with adjacent Brinkerhoff Landmark District.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 4/3/0. (Naylor/Pujo/Shallanberger opposed. Drury/Murray absent.)
Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:48 P.M. TO 3:54 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. **410 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(3:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022
 Application Number: MST2010-00087
 Owner: Tom A. Williams, Jr.
 Applicant: Mike Doering
 Business Name: Staples

(Proposed building color changes to an existing retail store and minor alteration to the stucco wall caps.)

(Second Concept Review; referred to Full Board from Consent on March 30, 2010.)

Present: Tom Williams, Owner
Mike Doering, Painter

Public comment opened at 3:59 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval with the following conditions:

- 1. The detail of the parapet and lip under the niche shall match as shown on the plan.
- 2. All plaster trim color shall match existing building color.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. **228 E VICTORIA ST** C-2 Zone

(4:10)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-122-006
 Application Number: MST2010-00098
 Owner: Randee Meehan
 Architect: Roberts Design Group Architecture & Interiors, Inc.
 Contractor: Andre Schneider Electric
 Engineer: Thom Hume Consulting Engineers

(Proposal for alterations to an existing commercial building including the following: replace storefront windows; add decorative tile window surrounds; reconfigure entry and add decorative wrought iron gate; alter existing roof parapet and add a pitched tile roof element; install three new windows with decorative tile surrounds on the west elevation; install new exterior light fixture, install new copper downspout; and install four new rooftop skylights. There will be an overall reduction of approximately 68 net square feet of Measure "E" floor area due to the entry reconfiguration. New signage to be reviewed under a separate application.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Jeremy Roberts, Architect

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. This is an interesting proposal and it is supportable.
2. There should be a general toning down, such as treating the west elevation in plaster rather than tile. There is also concern as to how the tile interacts with the existing stone.
3. Revisit the shape of the proposed roof pots, perhaps using a finial or plaster treatment.

Action: Suding/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

6. **424 STATE ST** C-M Zone

(4:33)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025
 Application Number: MST2008-00346
 Owner: Ray Mahboob
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Agent: John Thyne

(Proposal for demolition, redesign, and reconstruction of an existing storefront.)

(Review After Final of change to front elevation entailing the removal of two central columns.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 William Lam, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked about the age of the columns.

Public comment closed at 4:37 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: Shalanberger/Adams, 6/1/0. (Pujo opposed. Drury/Murray absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1210 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
Application Number: MST2005-00323
Owner: Granada Tower, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th, and a portion of the 9th, floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to two residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs, adding rooftop dormers and windows, reopening existing window rough openings (two windows each on six floors), adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation, and relocation of a temporary wireless antenna installation frame to the rooftop.)

(Review After Final for minor revisions to approved tower elevator lobby entry; door design and dedication plaque.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 913 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-037
Application Number: MST2009-00524
Owner: Aryana Jeans, LLC
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Levy's Shoes." Proposal for a facade remodel to include the replacement of an existing commercial storefront with new steel storefront and wrought iron ornamentation, and relocation of the entry door, enclosing the existing entry area resulting in 63 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Final approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 906 GARDEN ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-037
Application Number: MST2009-00565
Owner: Environmental Defense Center, Inc.
Architect: Dan Weber

(The City Landmark "Refugio Cordero Adobe" is contained within this parcel. Proposal to construct a new patio area consisting of 90 square feet of flagstone paving and a 168 square foot wooden pergola with built-in counter area for storage. The pergola will be added to an existing storage shed and is not in close proximity to the City Landmark structure.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**D. 1036 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-001
Application Number: MST2010-00099
Owner: Levon Investments
Architect: Richard Chavira

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Elks Club Building, Lloyds Bank." Proposal to remove an automated teller machine (ATM) from its current location, patch wall to match existing, and install a new ATM in a new location on the same elevation with a minor alteration to the landscaping and pavers.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued two weeks.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:43 P.M. ****