



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Tuesday, March 30, 2010**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**2:00 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Present
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- PHIL SUDING – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, March 26, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission could not be broadcast live on TV Channel 18 due to a conflict in meeting schedules. It was rebroadcast in its entirety on Wednesday at 1:30 P.M. and Friday at 1:00 P.M. of the same week. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking Online Meetings.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the Ordinance Committee that met at noon. The discussion was with regard to the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance two-year review in which City Staff proposed extensive changes to the HLC.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 17, 2010.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 17, 2010, with corrections.**

Action: Suding/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Robert Adams and Craig Shalanberger.**

Action: Boucher/Drury, 8/0/0. (Suding abstained on Item C. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Sharpe would be absent from the meeting.
- b) The project at 13 E. Cabrillo Blvd., which was continued two weeks ago to today's meeting, was indefinitely postponed at the applicant's request.

2. Commissioner Drury announced an exhibit by Milford Zornes at the Wildling Museum in Los Olivos. It will run through June 6.

3. Commissioner Drury announced he would be absent from the April 14<sup>th</sup> and May 12<sup>th</sup> meetings.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT****1. 512 BATH ST****(2:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-035

Application Number: MST2009-00469

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Proposed demolition of an existing two-story apartment building and the construction of a two and three-story multi-building apartment complex on a 1.10 acre lot. The proposal includes 53 affordable studio units, varying between 300 and 399 square feet, a 901 square foot two-bedroom manager's unit, 2 laundry rooms, a 623 square foot recreation room and a 1,415 square foot community center. The proposal includes 30 vehicle parking spaces, including 12 covered and 18 uncovered, and 32 covered bicycle parking spaces. The project will result in 18,751 square feet of residential area; 2,165 square feet of community facilities; 3,760 square feet of garages; and the removal of eight existing trees. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications for bonus density, parking, distance between buildings, and an interior setback encroachment.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Present: Lisa Plowman, Architect

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, commented that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and appendix and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the stone perimeter walls on Bath Street.

Public comment closed at 2:22 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**

Action: Pujo/Murray, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT****2. 3626 SAN REMO DR**

E-3/SD-2 Zone

**(2:22)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011  
Application Number: MST2009-00325  
Owner: Madsen Trust  
Agent: Alexandra Cole

(Proposal to subdivide one legal lot (known as parcels 053-231-011 & -010) into four legal lots. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing 3,137 square foot residence, a detached garage with studio apartment, a shed, a lath house and driveway. The four proposed parcels have development envelopes which provide a creek setback and implementation of a creek restoration plan. Development of The lots is not a part of this application.)

**Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. The report finds the structure to be eligible for Structure of Merit status.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
Nancy Madsen, Owner

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that this is an unusual house in a very large, park-like property. It is located in a neighborhood that has been cut into subdivisions and apartments. The report states that it was designed by Edwards, Plunkett & Howell. The front façade is to be preserved.

Public comment opened at 2:25 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the importance of this house.

Public comment closed at 2:26 p.m.

**Motion: To accept the report with the recommendation that the proposed new additions be in keeping with the Edwards, Plunkett & Howell design.**

Action: Murray/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****3. 1221 - 1235 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

**(2:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-002  
 Application Number: MST2009-00526  
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP  
 Agent: Lori Smyth  
 Contractor: Ron Esposito

(The structure with the address of 1227 - 1233 State Street is a designated Structure of Merit: "Upper Hawley Building." Proposal to paint all structures in Victoria Court and make a minor plaster change to an entry arch. Also proposed is to legalize the as-built installation of entryway tile. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2008-01313.)

**(Third Concept Review. Project requires Historic Resource findings. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Lori Smyth, Agent  
 Ron Esposito, Contractor

**First**

**Motion: Final Approval as submitted with the following conditions:**

1. The color of the Upper Hawley (1231 State Street) building is acceptable.
2. The color of the Victoria court entrance is acceptable.
3. The colors on the interior of property are acceptable with the exception of PL-126, which shall be changed to PL-134.
4. The color of Arigato (1225 State Street) and Starbucks (1235 State Street) buildings shall be PL-96 white.
5. The use of color to emulate stone on any building is not acceptable.

Action: Suding/Pujo, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**Motion: To reopen the motion to discuss the entryway tile at 1221 State Street.**

Action: Naylor/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**Second**

**Motion: Final Approval of the "Tuscan Red" terracotta tile in ¼ inch thickness for the State Street entry into the court at 1221 State Street.**

Action: Pujo/Adams, 7/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****4. 222 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

**(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-028  
 Application Number: MST2010-00044  
 Owner: Charles Jarvis Trust  
 Applicant: The Towbes Group  
 Architect: Edwards - Pitman Architect

(Proposal to replace 492 square feet of existing rooftop air handling equipment with new on an existing two-story commercial building.)

**(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect

**Motion: Final Approval as submitted.**

Action: Pujo/Adams, 8/0/0. (Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FRFROM 3:12 P.M. TO 3:20 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW****5. 222 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

**(3:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-013  
 Application Number: MST2010-00072  
 Applicant: Dan Schultz  
 Business Name: CVS Pharmacy

(This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Pythian Castle Lodge Hall."  
 Proposal to install printed window shades in the front windows of a commercial retail store.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Dan Schultz, Applicant  
 Jesse Guerrero, Operations Manager

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that large photographs on window shades do not conform to the EPV Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:24 p.m.

**Motion: The application is denied. The proposal is not in compliance with the Sign Ordinance or El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.**

Action: Pujo/Drury, 7/0/1. (Sharpe absent. Adams abstained.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:36 P.M. TO 3:49 P.M. \*\***

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****6. 1732 SANTA BARBARA ST**

E-1 Zone

**(3:49)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-001  
 Application Number: MST2009-00114  
 Owner: Richard Nash  
 Architect: Peter Becker

(This is a City Landmark: "Huning Mansion." Proposal for a new landscape plan for an existing single-family residence on a 20,000 square foot parcel. The plan includes the removal of nine trees from the front yard to be replaced with a new hedge and 30 rose bushes. Also proposed are new trees and shrubs in the side and rear yards, a new fountain, and a new wood trellis in the backyard. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2009-00052.)

**(Review After Final revised landscape plan.)**

Present: Jim Melnick, Owner Representative  
 Peter Becker, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:00 p.m. and reopened at 4:14 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented with regard to the wrought iron gate in front. He also commented that this is a historical landmark that meets different criteria for design review.

Public comment closed at 4:01 p.m. and reclosed at 4:14 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final with the following conditions:

1. The proposed planting bed in front shall roll down to the existing lawn on both sides of the front walkway. The introduction of a low wall would substantially change the formality and historic nature of the entrance to the house and is unnecessary.
2. The addition of the rose garden in lieu of lawn area is supportable and commendable.
3. The proposed citrus pots at the front along Santa Barbara Street shall be deleted.
4. Informal sitting opportunities shall be utilized in front as well as at the Camellia garden along Islay Street.
5. Provide an irrigation plan.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 2/6/0. (Drury/Murray/Naylor/Pujo/Shallanberger/Suding opposed. Sharpe absent.) **Motion failed.**

**Substitute**

**Motion:** Final Approval of the Review After Final with the following conditions:

1. There shall be planting in front of the two proposed 30-inch walls facing Santa Barbara Street with groundcover or shrubs.
2. The addition of the rose garden in lieu of lawn area is supportable and commendable.
3. The proposed citrus pots on the front along Santa Barbara Street shall be deleted.
4. Informal sitting opportunities shall be utilized in front as well as at the Camellia garden along Islay Street.
5. Provide an irrigation plan.

Action: Drury/Pujo, 7/1/0. (Suding opposed. Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.



**CONSENT CALENDAR****FINAL REVIEW****A. 435 STATE ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-007  
Application Number: MST2009-00484  
Owner: Stella and James Anthes  
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio  
Business Name: Whiskey Richard's

(Proposal to recess an existing storefront (reusing the existing storefront windows) and remodel the facade, creating a new outdoor dining area. This will result in a Measure "E" credit of 250 square feet. New signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

**(Final approval of entry doors and floor material is requested.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****B. 410 STATE ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-022  
Application Number: MST2010-00087  
Owner: Tom A. Williams, Jr.  
Applicant: Mike Doering  
Business Name: Staples

(Proposed building color changes to an existing retail store and minor alteration to the stucco wall caps.)

**Continued two weeks to the Full Board.**

**NEW ITEM****C. 118 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-081-013  
Application Number: MST2010-00091  
Owner: MF Santa Barbara, LLC  
Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects, Inc.

(Proposed installation of a temporary landscape buffer and relocation of fence along State Street. Included is a contingency landscape plan in the event that the building project does not move forward by the deadline defined in a substantial conformance determination.)

**Final approval with the following conditions on the contingency landscape plan only:**

1. The plan shall provide a meandering, 4'-0" wide decomposed granite walking path, with two minimum 4'-0" wide benches along the likely path of travel from the W. Mason Street sidewalk to the State Street sidewalk.
2. The fescue shall be maintained free of invasive weeds.
3. Trees proposed for this plan shall include a minimum of three, 24" box evergreen canopy trees.

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:32 P.M. \*\***