



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, March 3, 2010

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
- DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
- ROBERT ADAMS – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Absent
- MICHAEL DRURY – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- ALEX PUJO – Present at 1:48 p.m.
- CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present
- PHIL SUDING – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Absent SHEILA LODGE (Alternate) – Present at 2:00 p.m.

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, February 26, 2010, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 17, 2010.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of February 17, 2010, with corrections.

Action: Adams/Suding, 7/0/0. (Boucher/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Murray/Suding, 7/0/0. (Boucher/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Jacobus made the following announcements:

- a) Commission Boucher and Staff member Susan Gantz would be absent from the meeting.
- b) The Commission was reminded that the last HLC meeting in March will take place on Tuesday, March 30th at 2:00 p.m. in the same location, with Consent to be reviewed at the regular time in the Fishbowl Conference Room. This change is due to the Wednesday, March 31st legal holiday.
- c) There will be a Commission site visit at 2420 Garden Street on Monday, March 15, 11:00 a.m. The project will be reviewed by the HLC on March 17.
- d) The HLC Survey Subcommittee will be meeting on Wednesday, March 17, at 10:00 a.m. in the Community Development Director's Conference Room located on the second floor.
- e) Item 3, 1221-1235 State Street, and Item 7, 128 E Canon Perdido Street, were postponed two weeks at the applicants' request.
- f) Item 5 on the agenda, 2420 Garden Street, were postponed at Staff's request.

2. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, stated that Public Works Department staff requested a meeting with the *Ad hoc* Subcommittee of the Lower Mission Creek flood control project. They are preparing to move forward with Phase I of the project. The discussion will include fence styles, wall treatments, and a plant species list. It will be a joint Subcommittee meeting with the Architectural Board of Review. Commissioners Suding and Adams are the representatives and they would prefer to meet in the afternoon Wednesday or Thursday during the week of March 8.
3. Mr. Limón reported that the Planning Division Staff has been working on the two-year NPO update, primarily with the Single Family Design Board (SFDB). City Council has given direction to move forward with minor ordinance amendments and changes to the design guidelines dealing with single-family development. SFDB reviews most of these projects, but Staff's intent is to keep the Commission informed of these changes. The Commission will be provided in advance a list of the recommendations that will be presented to the City Council.
4. Bettie Weiss, City Planner, and George Estrella, Chief Building Official, provided an update on the Californian Hotel. Mrs. Weiss reported that Staff is continuing to work with the applicant on the Substantial Conformance issue. Mr. Estrella spoke about complaints with regard to the condition of the building. These are important public safety matters, including concrete roof tiles falling to the curb, stabilization of the building, loose abandoned signs, and destruction of the interior by vandals. The evaluation of a solution is being coordinated. (Suding recused himself.)

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Adams reported on the Street Tree Subcommittee. An alternative street tree for the 200 block of De la Guerra Street is being considered to replace the existing diseased species.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 219 SYCAMORE LN R-2 Zone
(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-073-046
Application Number: MST2009-00482
Owner: Housing Authority, City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Design Arc

(Proposal to construct 20 new private laundry rooms, totaling 692 square feet, for 20 units at an existing multi-family duplex development. The proposal also includes exterior alterations to the existing structures including new balconies and conversion of the existing commons building to a multi-purpose room for the residents. Zoning modifications are being requested to allow minor architectural projections into the interior and front yard setbacks and for distance between buildings at three locations for the additional laundry facilities.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because no project impacts on prehistoric or historic archaeological resources would occur, no mitigation measures are required, but the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources would apply.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Shallanberger/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 125 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-075-012

Application Number: MST2010-00045

Owner: Redevelopment Agency, Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove 950 cubic yards of contaminated soil and replace with 950 cubic yards of replacement clean soil. There is no proposed change in grade or slope.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Bryon Bass, Strata Science.)

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations for monitoring during initial ground disturbing excavations within the project Area of Potential Effect.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Adams/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. 1221 - 1235 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-002

Application Number: MST2009-00526

Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP

Agent: Lori Smyth

Contractor: Ron Esposito

(The structure with the address of 1227 - 1233 State Street is a designated Structure of Merit: "Upper Hawley Building." Proposal to paint all structures in Victoria Court and make a minor plaster change to an entry arch. Also proposed is to legalize the as-built installation of entryway tile. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2008-01313.)

(Third Concept Review. Project requires Historic Resource findings. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 220 E ORTEGA ST

(2:07) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-033
 Application Number: MST2010-00039
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment
 Applicant: James Winslow

(Proposal to rehabilitate an existing groundwater treatment plant by adding two 100,000 gallon tanks, one new pressure vessel, and a 293 square foot addition to house electrical equipment. Also proposed is repaving and 95 linear feet of concrete masonry wall.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: James Winslow, City Project Engineer
 David Black, Landscape Architect
 Julie Wendt, KBC Architects
 Jim Meyerhoffer, Carollo Engineers
 Heather Baker, City Project Planner

Public comment opened at 2:21 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1. The proposed changes to the architecture, including the single-fixture flood lights, are acceptable.
2. The color on the tanks shall be Ethereal.
3. The color of the gates shall be a Satin Malaga Green.
4. The interior gate shall be framed with columns particularly at the west end of the eastwest wall.
5. If the Tier 3 SWMP standards can be solved, the preference would be to have DG and asphalt in lieu of the proposed concrete pavers.
6. All trees to be dense and substantial; and the New Zealand Christmas Tree shall be a multi-trunk specimen.
7. The plants selected shall screen the transformer.

Action: Pujo/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 2420 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-025
 Application Number: MST2010-00020
 Architect: Lenvik and Minor Architects
 Owner: Kent Hodgetts

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Bernhard and Irene Hoffmann Residence." Proposal to construct a new swimming pool, above-ground pool equipment enclosure, realign and resurface an existing driveway, and construct new site walls.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings.)

This item was postponed at Staff's request.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:47 P.M. TO 3:03 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

6. 517 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(3:03) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-007
Application Number: MST2005-00088
Owner: H&R Investments, LP
Applicant: Peikert Group Architects, LLC
Applicant: H&R Investments
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The proposed project consists of a lot merger and the construction of a mixed-use development with six two-bedroom residential condominium units totaling 9,999 square feet (net) and two commercial condominium spaces totaling 2,872 square feet (net). One of the units would be affordable. A modification to allow the 10% open space on the second floor is requested. Seventeen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 030-06.)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect
Kathleen Kennedy, City Project Planner

Mrs. Kennedy reviewed the project's history, including the Commission's denial of the project in 2008 and the applicant's appeal to the City Council in that same year. The appeal of the HLC denial was overturned by the City Council and Preliminary Approval of the project was granted.

Chair Naylor read City Council's direction:

"Councilmembers Williams/Horton moved to approve the recommendations and refer the project back to the HLC for in-progress review with specific direction as follows:

1. Incorporate into the design approval the proposed roof decks/garden;
2. Eliminate elevator access to front penthouse roof garden deck and thereby reduce the height of the tower to an acceptable height as determined by the HLC;
3. Require all air conditioning equipment or solar panels to be screened and hidden from public view; and
4. Reduce total square footage to that which was approved by the PC and require the applicant to obtain a substantial conformance determination."

Mrs. Kennedy clarified that, in reviewing the video of the City Council hearing, Staff found that Council's discussion for the first item in the motion was giving direction to the HLC to review the decks in relation to the privacy issues with the surrounding areas.

Public comment opened at 3:17 p.m.

Wanda Livernois, neighbor, expressed opposition to the project: not compatible with neighborhood.

Caroline Vassallo, neighbor, expressed opposition to the project: noticing requirements, roof top decks threatening views and privacy, and landscaping.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, expressed opposition to the project: compatibility with neighborhood and building height.

Tony Fischer, local attorney, expressed opposition to the project: noticing requirements, reduction of square footage and size, bulk and scale, and updated agenda description.

Paul Primeau, neighbor, expressed opposition to the project: noticing requirements, and no street parking permits.

Public comment closed at 3:27 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

1. Suggestions were made with respect to landscape in terms of how it would impact the roof decks, air conditioning equipment and solar panels; and suggestions were made regarding the height and density of trees at the alley.
2. Provide a PDF of the City Council approved plans that were reviewed during the appeal hearing and of the plans currently being presented to the Commission.
3. Provide a 3-D model at the next review.
4. Staff is to provide the Commission with a link to the online City Council meeting video during which the appeal was overturned.
5. The reduction in total square footage will be confirmed by Staff.

Action: Suding/Shallanberger, 7/0/1. (Murray abstained. Boucher absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

7. 128 E CANON PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-004
Application Number: MST2003-00243
Owner: Pueblo Viejo Properties, Ltd.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story, mixed-use development. The proposal consists of the following alterations: remove two "as-built" residential units, convert existing residential garages to storage, and add a laundry room. Also proposed are exterior changes to the existing garage doors, new doors and changes to windows, moped and bicycle parking, removal of an "as-built" balcony partition, new gates and walls, closing off the driveway along Santa Barbara Street, and a landscape plan. Development Plan approval is requested to allow 2,718 square feet of new non-residential floor area for the conversion of the garages. Zoning modifications are requested to eliminate the existing residential parking and to not provide new parking for the converted commercial square footage.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-07.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM**

- A. 222 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-028
Application Number: MST2010-00044
Owner: Charles H. and Chambers A. Jarvis Trust
Architect: Edwards Pitman Architect
Applicant: The Towbes Group

(This building is on the city's list of Potential Historic Resources: "W.C. Logan Building." Proposal to replace 492 square feet of existing rooftop air handling equipment with new on an existing two-story commercial building.)

Continued two weeks to allow for installation of story-poles showing the size of the proposed mechanical equipment.

NEW ITEM

- B. 1236 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-001
Application Number: MST2010-00048
Owner: Rosenthal Living Trust/Family Trust
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to replace four existing rooftop pyramid skylights with flat panel aluminum skylights with anodized bronze finish.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- C. 1732 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-001
Application Number: MST2009-00114
Owner: Richard Nash
Designer: Peter Kavonian & Associates

(This is a City Landmark: "Huning Mansion." Proposal for a new landscape plan for an existing single-family residence on a 20,000 square foot parcel. The plan includes the removal of nine trees from the front yard to be replaced with a new hedge and 30 rose bushes. Also proposed are new trees and shrubs in the side and rear yards, a new fountain, and a new wood trellis in the backyard. Approval of this project will abate enforcement case ENF2009-00052.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved project including installing a man-door instead of a window in the garage, and exterior paint color change.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM

D. 736 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-029

Application Number: MST2010-00056

Owner: Mar Family Trust

Architect: East Beach Ventures

(Proposal to remove an existing entry door and 60 square foot window and replace them with a new wood storefront including a four-light transom window and a tri-fold door system with single swing door.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:10 P.M. ****