



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 28, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present at 1:35 p.m.
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

BETTIE WEISS, CITY PLANNER – Present at 4:10 p.m.
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:05 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, October 23, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33)

A. Public Comment:

1. Mary Louise Days, local resident, expressed concern for the demolition of the back part of Our Lady of Guadalupe Church located at 221 N. Nopal Street.
2. Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the project at 301 E. Canon Perdido Street.

Andrew Roteman commented on the reason the siding was not being replaced with like-for-like materials.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would prefer to have the project at 301 E. Canon Perdido Street agendaed for the next meeting? 0/6. (All opposed.)

The Commission requested that Staff continue the review of the project.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 14, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 14, 2009, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 5/0/1. (Murray abstained. Naylor abstained from Item 1. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Pujo/Adams, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Drury and Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.
2. Commissioner Boucher reminded the Commission of the approaching HLC Holiday Party.
3. Commissioner Adams stated that a protective fence was placed around an oak tree at 911 Laguna Street has been removed multiple times and heavy building and construction materials stacked within the dripline. He stressed the importance of not interrupting the process of protecting trees in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

0. **710 ANACAPA ST**

(2:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
(Consideration of Intent to Hold a Public Hearing.)

Staff present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian

The Commission was requested to adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on November 11, 2009, to consider the structure at 710 Anacapa Street, known as the "Myers Cottage," be designated as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Commissioner Murray requested that the resolution state that the building should not be moved or demolished upon being designated as a Structure of Merit.

Motion: To adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on November 11, 2009, to consider a request by the property owner to designate the Myers Cottage, located at 710 Anacapa Street, as a City of Santa Barbara Structure of Merit.

Action: Pujos/Murray, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. **3626 SAN REMO DR**

E-3/SD-2 Zone

(2:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-231-011
Application Number: MST2009-00325
Owner: Madsen Trust
Agent: Alexandra Cole

(Proposal to subdivide one legal lot (known as parcels 053-231-011 & -010) into four legal lots. The proposal includes the demolition of an existing 3,137 square foot residence, a detached garage with studio apartment, a shed, a lath house and driveway. The four proposed parcels have development envelopes which provide a creek setback and implementation of a creek restoration plan. Development of the lots is not a part of this application.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Public comment opened at 2:03 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local resident, stated that she hoped a Historic Structures/Sites Report will be prepared and commented that the demolition of the house would be a loss to the neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 2:04 p.m.

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agreed that, because the project has little potential to result in significant impacts on prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. **522 GARDEN ST**

C-M Zone

(2:05)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-023

Application Number: MST2008-00598

Owner: Steven Harper

Architect: Edward De Vicente

Designer: Ryan Mills

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,460 square foot single-family residence and construct a new, 2,784 square foot, three-story, mixed-use building on a 3,292 square foot lot. The building consists of 415 square feet of new commercial space on the first floor, and an 1,855 square foot residential unit with a 160 square foot deck on the second floor, a 168 square foot deck on the third floor, an attached 514 square foot, two-car garage for the residential unit, and two uncovered parking spaces for the commercial space. The proposal includes the removal of one street tree.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agreed that, because no project has little potential to result in significant impacts on prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required, and the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources applies and shall be on plans prior to issuance of building permit.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Adams/Pujo, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 1704 STATE ST**

C-2/R-3 Zone

(2:06)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-017
Application Number: MST2007-00494
Owner: 1704 State Street
Architect: Hochhauser Blatter

(Proposal for expansion of the existing Santa Barbara Artificial Kidney Center. The project includes the demolition of an existing 992 square foot structure formerly known as the DAC Video Store and the original bank teller drive-thru area. The proposed project includes the construction of a new, one-story, 5,693 square foot addition to an existing, two-story, 11,742 square foot medical office building. A total of 44 parking spaces are proposed, along with landscaping and repairs to the existing building. The project will require Planning Commission approval of the Development Plan, a Zoning Modification for a reduction in the required number of parking spaces, and a Conditional Use Permit.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 041-08.)

Present: Jay Blatter and Nigel Gomersall, Architects
David Black, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The landscape design is everything desired for a commercial building.
- 2) Restudy ways to recreate the planter facing Valerio Street that is now displaced by a pair of doors.
- 3) Minimize the concrete for the bicycle parking facing State Street and increase the landscape area.
- 4) A more monochromatic palette is desired.
- 5) Make sure that the parapet heights hide mechanical equipment.
- 6) Restudy ways to enhance the aspect of the main light fixtures facing State Street.
- 7) Study the way to minimize the width of the secondary sidewalks.
- 8) The trellises' lumber sizes should be square versus rectangular.

Action: Puj0/Murray, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED**4. 34 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:55)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-016
 Application Number: MST2009-00266
 Owner: Victoria Street Partners, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLC
 Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(Proposal to demolish an existing 20,125 square foot commercial building (Vons grocery store) and 61 surface parking spaces on a 1.4 acre lot. The proposal includes the construction of 23,125 square feet of commercial/retail space, 38 residential condominium units (of which five would be affordable to middle-income homebuyers) and 87 parking spaces in a subterranean garage. Buildings would be two and three stories in height. Planning Commission approval is requested for a tentative subdivision map and a zoning modification for the residential units to encroach into the interior yard setback.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the bridges becoming less bulky and should be a straight walkway rather than an arch, would like to see a less park-like structure on the bridge next to the market and that it could emulate the bridge that is proposed to be located in the center paseo.

Public comment closed at 3:12 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:

- 1) The applicant's sensitivity and responsiveness to the Commission's requests and comments is appreciated. There have been continuous improvements to the project.
- 2) The project is in compliance with the required compatibility findings in terms of the mass, bulk and scale, including the reduction of the third floor mass on the east and west elevations; its sensitivity to the adjacent landmark; and the architectural character of the design.
- 3) The concerns among some Commissioners about the central paseo bridge, the landscape design and other details will be resolved in future reviews.

Action: Pujó/Sharpe, 5/1/0. (Murray opposed because she is concerned with the cumulative impact of the project's density on the adjacent landmark, and the need of more open space and landscape. Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW**5. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:27)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013
 Application Number: MST2009-00486
 Owner: Fess Parker Doubletree Hotel
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLC

(Proposal to construct a new, one-story, 240 square foot stucco building for use as the tennis office at an existing hotel.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Substantial Conformance Determination.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:30 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment that the applicant is to return with a proposal that meets El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW**6. 700 E ANAPAMU ST**

R-3 Zone

(3:34)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-240-008
 Application Number: MST2009-00466
 Owner: Santa Barbara High School District
 Architect: Joe Wilcox

(This is a City Landmark: Santa Barbara High School Building, Peabody Stadium, Stadium Ticket Booth, Manual Training Building, Gymnasium." Courtesy review of the proposed demolition and reconstruction of ramps, flatwork, lightwell walls, storm drain lines, and landscaping at the front of the main building on the south end. This project also includes demolition and reconstruction of the adjacent concrete stairwell. Ornamental handrails will be installed at the ramps and stairwell. Guardrails will be installed at the lightwell walls. New landscaping and irrigation will be installed in the area of the work.)

(Courtesy review only.)

Present: Joe Wilcox, Architect
 Carl Mayrose, Santa Barbara School Districts

Public comment opened at 3:37 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Positive comments were made.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:43 P.M. TO 3:52 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW**7. 15 E ANAPAMU ST** C-2 Zone

(3:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-028
 Application Number: MST2009-00265
 Owner: Santa Barbara Oddfellows Lodge
 Applicant: Eric Lassen

(Proposal to demolish 365 square feet of existing rooftop structures and enclose 542 square feet of the second floor rooftop area, and other exterior alterations at the rear of an existing commercial building. Also proposed is to install a new elevator, extend an existing balcony along the east elevation, increase the height of an existing rooftop parapet wall, install one new door and two new windows, and install new exterior light fixtures.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Eric Lassen and Tom Moore, Applicants

Motion: Final Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for minor details.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW**8. 435 STATE ST** C-M Zone

(4:07) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-007
 Application Number: MST2009-00484
 Owner: Stella and James Anthes
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
 Business Name: Whiskey Richard's

(Proposal to recess an existing storefront and remodel the façade to create a new outdoor dining area. This will result in a Measure "E" credit of 250 square feet. New signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details with the following comments:

- 1) Traditional window break-ups are preferred.
- 2) The bottom line of the doors should line up with the bottom line of the windows.
- 3) Planter pots should be provided on the patio.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Drury/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM**(4:22)**

Bettie Weiss, City Planner, gave a Plan Santa Barbara update, including a summary of process milestones to date, next steps, and Historic Resource Element.

Discussion held.

CONSENT CALENDAR**FINAL REVIEW****A. 316 CASTILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-015
 Application Number: MST2008-00038
 Owner: Santa Barbara Genealogical Society
 Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposal to construct a 2,709 square foot one-story library addition, new patio cover at the interior courtyard, and make interior alterations. Also proposed is a new screen wall to be constructed around an existing electrical panel next to the driveway. The project will result in 6,995 square feet of development on this 20,040 square foot parcel.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval with the condition that an off-site parking agreement between the two sites be recorded against both properties.

NEW ITEM**B. 1935 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-007
 Application Number: MST2009-00310
 Owner: Serfas Service Station, LP
 Applicant: Fiedler Group
 Business Name: AM-PM Minimarket

(Proposal for exterior changes to an existing service station/mini market including the following: repaint existing commercial building and fuel islands, replace the entry door, add a new ADA pedestrian path of travel along the northwest side of the lot and new truncated domes at the existing ramp, restripe parking lot for seven parking spaces, add perimeter planting at parking area, and permit as-built installation of two antennas at rear of building.)

Continued two weeks to November 11, 2009.

NEW ITEM

- C. **205 E CARRILLO ST** C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-212-028
Application Number: MST2009-00461
Owner: Bosse Commercial Properties, LLC
Architect: Edwards - Pitman Architects
(Proposal to repaint the exterior of an existing commercial building.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A3.01.

NEW ITEM

- D. **525 STATE ST** C-M Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-002
Application Number: MST2009-00465
Owner: John Lindgren
Applicant: Diane Harding
Contractor: Cachalot Canvas Co
Business Name: Madison's Grill and Tavern
(Proposal to install a new 20'-0" wide canvas awning at the patio in Sunbrella fabric "Terracotta" #88022. Signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

Final Approval with the condition that the installation consist of two awnings, separated by six (6) inches, centered.

FINAL REVIEW

- E. **1316 STATE ST** C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-001
Application Number: MST2009-00364
Owner: Ronchietto Trust
Business Name: Café Buenos Aires
Designer: Ernesto Busnelli
(Proposal to install new windows to act as wind barriers in an existing streetscape dining patio. The area of work will be in three arched openings and two currently wrought iron-gated entries on the Arlington Avenue elevation.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**F. 2300 GARDEN ST**

RETIRED Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
Application Number: MST2005-00812
Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC
Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: M2 Architecture
Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
Contractor: Matt Construction
Business Name: San Roque High School

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

(Review After Final of changes to the means and methods of seismic strengthening and to a previously approved seismic joint at the southeast corner of Arcade 1.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:59 P.M. ****