



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, August 19, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required <u>at the time of submittal</u> & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Thursday, August 13, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 22, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 22, 2009, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 8/0/1. (Drury abstained). Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of August 5 as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Adams/Murray, 8/0/1. (Drury abstained. Pujo abstained from Item A, 1324-G State Street.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of August 19 as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item F, which was reviewed by Susette Naylor.

Action: Adams/Curtis, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Made clarifications regarding the full board agenda:

(1) Under General Business, Item C Consent Calendar, the minutes to be ratified were those of August 5th and August 19th (rather than August 5th and August 12th).

(2) Item #6, 914 Chapala Street, would need Final Approval of a revised landscape plan, not approval of a Review After Final as stated in the agenda.

- b. Item #4 on the agenda, review of an Historic Structures/Site report for 540 W. Pueblo Street, was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request. The Commissioners were asked to retain their copy of the report for review at the September 2nd meeting.

2. Commissioner Shallenberger announced he would be stepping down from Items 1 and 2.

3. Commissioner Boucher thanked Commissioner Adams and his wife Nancy for making their home available for the HLC Summer Party.
4. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, reported on the successful installation of a sprinkler system designed to protect the wood siding on a house in the event of a fire.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher and Mr. Jacobus reported that the HLC Designations Subcommittee met in the morning. The Subcommittee is recommending that the Full Board designate the structure at 710 Anacapa Street as a Structure of Merit. A preservation plan will be presented by the applicant.

Mr. Jacobus reported that the Subcommittee will also be recommending that the Full Board place the home located at 601 E. Valerio Street on the City's List of Potential Historic Structures.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 915 E ANAPAMU ST E-1/R-3 Zone

(1:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00331
 Owner: Charles Crail
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Permit and Planning Services
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to construct 13 two- and three-story residential apartments and demolition of an existing 2,192 square foot single-family residence on a 40,759 square foot parcel in the E-1 and R-3 Zones. The proposal includes two three-bedrooms, two one-bedroom, and nine two-bedroom apartments ranging from 626 to 1,584 square feet, for a total of 14,732 square feet. A total of 3,350 cubic yards of grading is proposed and 28 parking spaces are provided (17 below grade and 11 at grade) in a combination of one and two-car garages, carports, and uncovered spaces. The project requires environmental assessment.)

(Review of Phase 1 Archaeological Resource Report prepared by Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that archaeological resources were not likely to be present in the survey property area, but the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources is recommended.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger stepped down.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 314-324 STATE ST C-M Zone

(1:58) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020
Application Number: MST2009-00245
Owner: 318 State St Properties, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom, aka Andalucia Building." Proposal to demolish an existing 2,436 square foot building at the rear portion of 314 State Street and construct a new trash enclosure and loading dock. Proposed for the rear structure of 318 State Street is a facade remodel including new awnings, doors, and windows. Also proposed is a reconfiguration and associated landscaping of five parking lots including the addition of 16 new parking spaces for a total of 84 parking spaces. These spaces are proposed to be the designated parking for the five parcels from 314 through 324 State Street, 323 and 327 Anacapa Street, and 24 E. Gutierrez Street. The proposal includes preservation of the existing historic arcade and front building located at 318 State Street. No new square footage is proposed.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the applicant is proposing to beautify and upgrade the parking lot in the back of the Andalucia Building to a higher standard. The report points out that the main character-defining features of the structure are the State Street facades. The parking lot and the building proposed to be removed are not considered to be historically significant. Staff read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked if the changes proposed for State Street facade are included in the 316 State Street address. Ms. Cole responded that there will not be any changes to the historic front.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Murray/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger stepped down.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 2050 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-001
 Application Number: MST2008-00593
 Owner: Melanie Ellison
 Architect: Harrison Design Associates
 Contractor: Giffin & Crane General Contractors, Inc.

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was determined to be eligible for City Landmark status: "Crointher Residence, Crocker Row." Proposal to rehabilitate the street facade of an existing three-story, 3,543 square foot, single-family residence to a close approximation of its historic appearance circa 1894-1905. Proposed exterior alterations include door and window changes, foundation replacement, facade rehabilitation, removal of an exterior staircase on the east elevation, new plaster finish, new Mission tile and metal roof, and new landscaping. No new square footage is proposed on this 10,125 square foot parcel.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report Addendum prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Bernard Austin, Harrison Designs Associates
 Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the report evaluates a change to the project which would sister-in material to gain strength in order to use tile on the building. Staff read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:06 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 540 W PUEBLO ST C-O Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-090-046
 Application Number: MST2007-00092
 Owner: Cancer Center of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(Review for the new Cancer Center of Santa Barbara. The proposed project involves 10 parcels and will include the demolition of 18,690 square feet of the existing 20,130 square foot medical facility and accessory structures, to be reconstructed further away from Mission Creek, and demolition of 6 existing residential buildings. Proposal for construction of a new 52,069 square foot, three-story, Cancer Center, a 56,422 square foot, four-story, 164 space, parking structure, an 18 space parking lot, for a total of 182 on-site parking spaces, and 3 new residential buildings totaling 6,739 square feet. The proposal will result in 53,509 square feet of commercial space and 6 new residential units, for a total of 11 residential units. The project includes the removal of 9 existing trees and proposed addition of 11 trees. The project requires Planning Commission review for Development Plan Approval findings.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D.)

Review of this report was postponed two weeks at the preparer's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1316 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:08) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-001
Application Number: MST2009-00364
Owner: Ronchietto Trust
Designer: Ernesto Busnelli
Business Name: Café Buenos Aires

(Proposal to install new windows to act as wind barriers in an existing streetscape dining patio. The area of work will be in three arched openings and two currently wrought iron-gated entries on the Arlington Avenue elevation.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Wallace Ronchietto, Owner

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the applicant may think of using glass as used at the newly remodeled restaurant at Hendry's Beach.

Public comment closed at 2:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:

- 1) The majority support the concept of partial enclosure of the courtyard.
- 2) It would be preferred that the enclosures be temporary.
- 3) Pursue a solution that only encloses below the spring line capital below the arch.
- 4) One Commissioner believes the project as presented would set a precedent for other businesses in the vicinity of the Arlington Theater.
- 5) One Commissioner believes the project will set a precedent and is incompatible with the architecture of the building.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW HEARING

6. 914 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(2:39) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-047
 Application Number: MST2007-00541
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency
 Applicant: Victor Garza
 Agent: Jessica Grant, Project Planner
 Architect: Paul Poirier

(Proposal to demolish five arcades at City Parking Lot #2 and replace with enhanced landscaping and planters at the W. Canon Perdido Street elevation. The existing raised planters on the north and east elevations are proposed to be clad in sandstone. On the north elevation, new landscaping will include four Sweetshade trees, one Queensland Umbrella tree, two Giant Birds of Paradise, one Jacaranda tree, and nine Tree Ferns. One eight foot tall King Palm tree will be removed. On the east elevation, one Cork Oak tree will be replaced with a more appropriate specimen, and six Tree Ferns and six Pygmy Date Palms will be planted. On the south elevation, two Eucalyptus citriodora trees will be replaced. Project includes (5) light pole fixtures.)

(Final approval of revised Landscape Plan is requested.)

Present: Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect
 Jessica Grant, City Project Planner
 Victor Garza, City Parking/TMP Superintendent

Motion: Final Approval of the landscape plan with the following comments:
 1) The majority likes the palette and the solution as proposed.
 2) Prolong the removal of the Citriodora to the extent possible until the other plant material reaches maturity.
 3) Adjust the valve box irrigation location as needed.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/1/0. (Naylor opposed.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 2300 GARDEN ST RETIRED Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review After Final of changes to exterior seismic joints, changes to steps & retaining walls, new exterior vents, clarification of wash pad location, new downspouts and new light fixtures.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the expansion joint colors shall match the adjacent surface colors as closely as possible.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 2300 GARDEN ST RETIRED Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00812
 Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

(Review After Final for exterior changes to seismic joints.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the expansion joint colors match the adjacent surface colors as closely as possible.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

C. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
Application Number: MST2006-00190
Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC
Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: M2 Architecture
Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
Contractor: Matt Construction Company
Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for seismic, safety, and utility upgrades in the Main Building of San Roque High School. Improvements include seismic strengthening, installation of new fire sprinkler system, accessibility upgrades including the installation of a new elevator, new drinking fountains, and restrooms. Exterior work includes new rooftop penetrations for ventilation, elevator overrun, and new handrails.)

(Review After Final for exterior changes to seismic joints.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the expansion joint colors match the adjacent surface colors as closely as possible.

CONTINUED ITEM

D. 21 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-133-013
Application Number: MST2009-00357
Owner: Randolph/21 Investments, LP
Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal to replace rooftop HVAC equipment in same location. The new equipment is taller and will be painted to match body color of building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

E. 536 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-001
Application Number: MST2007-00569
Owner: 536 State Street, LLC
Architect: Dawn Sherry
Business Name: Joe's Cafe

(Proposal to remove existing abandoned rooftop equipment and install four new air conditioning units and associated equipment. New equipment will be concealed behind a parapet and will not be visible from the street.)

(Review After Final of additional rooftop screening for existing HVAC equipment on the northwest elevation.)

Postponed two weeks at applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

F. 834 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-021
Application Number: MST2008-00071
Owner: First States Properties 80
Applicant: Yvonne Michals
Architect: Steve Hausz
Business Name: Bank of America

(Proposal to remove five existing automatic teller machines, install four new automatic teller machines and relocate one night drop. Any new signage is to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.)

(Review After Final of trash receptacles to satisfy previous final approval condition, and change to lighting component over night depository.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:09 P.M. ****