



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 8, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Absent
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Absent
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Thursday, July 2, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 24, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 24, 2009, with corrections.

Action: Adams/Drury, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Alex Pujo.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Pujo and Sharpe would be absent from today's meeting.
- b) On August 4, the Ordinance Committee will discuss and consider a draft ordinance to implement the Mills Act, as well as other incentives such as zoning and parking relief. Staff will email the staff report sometime around the end of the month.
- c) On July 23, the Planning Commission will consider a substantial conformance determination for the raptor enclosure project at the Natural History Museum, which received HLC preliminary approval on April 15. No HLC representatives are requested for that hearing.

2. Commissioner Drury announced he would not be attending the meeting of July 22.

3. Commissioner Adams reported that a drought tolerant lawn substitute is being considered for the historic train station. The HLC should interact with Alison Jordan, City Water Resources Specialist, either on Consent or with the Full Board. Commissioner Boucher added that the idea was to restore it as closely as possible to the way it was landscaped historically. Commissioner Adams responded that it appears what is being proposed will meet the historical criteria.

4. Commissioner Shallenberger announced that the AIA Santa Barbara Chapter is holding Architectural Appreciation Weeks from July 6 through July 17. There will be a guided tour on July 11 of five AIA architects' homes that they designed for their own use. Commissioner Adams added that film screenings of a Flying A Studio documentary will be held on July 10 at Santa Barbara City College East Campus, Administration Building. The famous 1913 Flying A Studios are part of the home tours as well.
5. Commissioner Adams announced that the HLC Summer Party will be held in his home on Sunday, August 16, from 5 to 7 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

DISCUSSION ITEM

(1:42) Proposal by Santa Barbara Beautiful for redesigned commemorative tree plaques.

Present: Tim Downey, City Arborist/Urban Forest Superintendent
Robert Adams, Santa Barbara Beautiful
Steve Hausz, Volunteer

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked what Santa Barbara Beautiful plans to do with the existing plaques and whether the new proposed ones will be replacing the ones that are not currently in good condition. Mr. Adams responded that the current plaques will be reviewed for replacement on a case-by-case basis.

Public comment closed at 1:48 p.m.

The discussion was held and the Commission expressed appreciation for the thoughtfulness of the new plaque design. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:55 P.M TO 1:56 P.M. ****

DISCUSSION ITEM

(1:56) The City's proposal to require that Historic Structures Reports (HSRs) and Archaeological Reports be submitted digitally in Portable Document Format (PDF) and procedures on distribution of the reports to the HLC.

Present: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian
Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Public comment opened at 2:01 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked if the reports in PDF format would be made available before the HLC reviews and approves them. Mr. Jacobus responded that the reports would be posted on the City's web site.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

Commission comments: (Pujo/Sharpe absent.)

1. It would be preferred that the project plans continue to be sent via U.S. mail for a more accurate review and to make notes.
2. There was a consensus for a trial period since most Commissioners are able to review reports better in written form than on a computer screen. Also, Commissioners use the hard copy to write notes, which would be more difficult in PDF format.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 900/902 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone
(2:17) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019
Application Number: MST2009-00242
Owner: Howard Trust
Agent: Ronald Nye
(Review of a Historic Structures/Sites Report to assess the historical value of an existing two-story commercial building.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D., Historian.)

Present: Troy White, Dudek
Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that, although the building is on the City's Potential Historic Structures List, the report concludes that the structure does not have historic merit. In addition, the structure is not the most exceptional example of an architectural style. Mr. Jacobus added that any future proposed projects would be under the HLC's purview since the site is within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that most Historic Structures/Sites Reports deal with a proposed project and it is difficult to assess whether a site would be impacted without one. Mr. Jacobus responded that, if the building had been found to be historically significant, the historical consultant would have to return with a letter addendum to the HSSR with a design analysis.

Public comment closed at 2:26 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted and to remove the structure from the City's List of Potential Historic Structures.

Action: Curtis/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

2. 2050 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(2:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-001
 Application Number: MST2009-00289
 Owner: Melanie Ellison
 Agent: Barbara Lowenthal
 Architect: Harrison Design Associates
 Contractor: Giffin & Crane General Contractor

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was determined to be eligible for City Landmark status: "Crointher Residence, Crocker Row." This project involves 2050 Garden Street and 314 E. Padre Street. Proposal to demolish an existing, detached 482 square foot garage and construction of a new, detached 500 square foot garage, a 96 square foot workshop, and a 272 square foot accessory structure. Also proposed is a new motor court and driveway, 570 square foot pergola, and a completely new landscape plan including two benches, fountain, and bird bath. Proposed alterations to the existing 3,522 square foot two-story, single-family dwelling include extending the front porch, several door and window changes, and relocating a passage door in an existing garden wall. Zoning Modifications are requested for encroachment into the front and interior yard setbacks. The project will require a voluntary lot merger of this parcel with 314 E. Padre Street. Demolition of the existing single-family dwelling at 314 E. Padre was approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission under application MST2009-00277.)

(Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment, Zoning Modifications, and a voluntary lot merger.)

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Agent
 Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect
 Bernard Austin, Harrison Design Associates
 Dan Fromanek, General Contractor
 Pam Post, Historical Consultant

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments:** **1)** The modifications for the front porch, as well as the landscape features including benches, birth bath and fountain area, are supportable. **2)** The Commission finds the proposal to be a commendable project. **3)** The expression of the garage as a similar style and feel in terms of grandeur and aesthetics to the house is appropriate to the estate feel of the property, now that the parcels are being merged. It provides coherence and unity to the site. **4)** The reuse of the olive trees is appreciated. **5)** Consider vine pockets for the pergola and provide a softening of the southeast portion of the pergola in the service corridor. **6)** Evergreen pears would be appropriate for framing the garage. **7)** Caution should be taken regarding the sandstone pattern that is to be used in the fireplace area. **8)** In returning the structure to its historic feel, take caution with respect to construction and expression of new materials and techniques. **9)** Provide more information as to topographic changes, fill, and retaining walls.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. 28 ANACAPA ST

OC/SD-3 Zone

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-009
 Application Number: MST2009-00193
 Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
 Owner: Jason Leggitt
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Single concept review of a proposal to construct a new brick entry paseo to connect two privately owned parcels at 28 and 32 Anacapa Street to a City parking lot located at 15 Santa Barbara Street. The project would include the relocation of a city streetlight and an existing palm tree, four new stone columns, and new landscaping. The proposal would not eliminate any parking lot spaces and no exterior alterations are proposed to the buildings at 28 and 32 Anacapa Street at this time. The project is located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and will require a Coastal Exemption.)

(Comments only; one review.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked whether the project ties in with La Entrada/Ritz-Carlton. He also asked about existing structures on the site. Mr. Lenny responded that La Entrada is two blocks away and there are modest buildings currently on the site.

Public comment closed at 3:19 p.m.

Commission comments:

1. The majority of the Commission feels that a paseo system in the area is welcome.
2. More thought should be given on appropriate uses and how the paseo concept presented would connect into the continuation of an overall paseo system.
3. The majority feel that the style, size, and intimation of grandeur that the columns have are too much of an incremental change in the "Funk Zone."
4. A similarity between the stone building and the "Funk Zone" would be more successful than having this property completely imitate the Chase Palm Park theme. A neighborhood difference between the two areas should be evident.
5. Plant material should be livelier than a boxwood hedge in an eight foot wide brick walkway, with flower color, boldness, succulents, and perhaps a tying-in of the landscaping to the beach.
6. The walkway should be softer than the brick proposed by using less of a hard and formal surface. It was suggested that decomposed granite be used.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

4. 811 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone
 (3:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-008
 Application Number: MST2009-00317
 Owner: State of California
 Agent: Anthony Spann
 Applicant: Michael Imwalle

(Proposal for the demolition of 695 square feet of floor area damaged in a fire and construction of new 44 linear foot screen wall. Also proposed is to construct a new 16'-9" frame wall to repair an existing commercial space adjacent to the removed floor area. This project will result in a 695 square foot Measure "E" credit on a 2,388 square foot parcel.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Tony Spann, Board of Directors, SBTHP
 Sally Fohse, Associate Director for Business Affairs, SBTHP

Public comment opened at 3:40 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, confirmed that the building that burned down on the Santa Barbara Street side was not an important feature of the streetscape.

Public comment closed at 3:40 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following landscape comments: 1) Consider the Cordyline species instead of the Evergreen Pear tree (*Pyrus kawakamii*) because it looks great in a courtyard and with agaves. 2) It was suggested that the Indian hawthorne (*Raphiolepis indica*) found in the front bed on Santa Barbara Street be replaced with Kangaroo paw (*Haemodoraceae*) or Flax (*Linum usitatissimum*), which have more presence and are low-maintenance. 3) If ground cover is needed, chalk fingers (*Senecio mandraliscae*) would be appropriate as being low and tough. 4) Six to eight agaves would be more appropriate than the thirteen proposed.

Action: Adams/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 102 W PEDREGOSA ST R-4 Zone

(3:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-363-011
Application Number: MST2009-00307
Owner: Patrick Tack
Architect: Cliff Hickman

(One or more of these structures is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Wyles House." Proposal for exterior changes to an existing four-unit residential development including the following: demolish an existing deteriorated four-car garage, new electrical meters, gas meters and water meters, new concrete driveway and parking area, stair repair and replacement, new guardrails, new doors and windows, and new exterior paint, all on a 14,495 square foot parcel.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Patrick Tack, Owner
Cliff Hickman, Designer

Public comment opened at 4:03 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** **1)** The applicant's efforts to try to save the building, rather than demolish it, is much appreciated. **2)** The removal of the existing oak trees is of concern. Every effort should be made to preserve the trees by possibly replanting them to a different area of the site. **3)** The drawings and photographs should accurately reflect what is on site now, including the tree specimens currently on the site; and the plans and graphic representations should be more specific and complete with respect to what is being proposed.

Action: Shallanberger/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**FINAL REVIEW****A. 509 STATE ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-009
Application Number: MST2009-00290
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio
Business Name: Cabana Restaurant

(Proposal to remove an existing storefront and recess the new storefront 15'-0" to create an outdoor dining area. This project will result in a credit of 375 square feet of Measure "E" floor area.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018
Application Number: MST2006-00750
Owner: Emily and Blake Jones
Architect: Peter Becker

(This structure was found to be eligible for City Landmark status and is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The proposed changes are to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 699 square foot addition, 2,019 interior remodel, 100 square foot crawl space conversion for pool equipment and remodel of basement space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a new 220 square foot pergola with fireplace and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would include a remodel and window change. A modification is requested for conversion of a non-conforming garage to an accessory space.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved exterior paint colors.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 437 STATE ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-006
Application Number: MST2009-00308
Owner: Terrence Yee, Trustee
Agent: John Chaves
Architect: Jeff Shelton
Business Name: Mini Mart

(Proposal to repaint the exterior of an existing commercial building.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

D. 2 W MISSION ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-311-013
Application Number: MST2009-00314
Owner: Tafejian Family Trust
Applicant: Francisca Edwards
Architect: Gil Garcia
Business Name: Santa Barbara Green Care Collective

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 600 square foot commercial building including new storefront window glass, six exterior dome cameras, and a new recessed door entry, resulting in a credit of 15 square feet of Measure "E" floor area. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Performance Standard Permit is requested for a Medical Marijuana Dispensary.)

(Project requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a medical marijuana dispensary.)

Final Approval with the conditions that the entry door and sidelight shall have powder-coated finish to match window trim color, and as noted on Sheet A-3.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

E. 1715 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-021
Application Number: MST2008-00578
Owner: Girsh Family Trust
Owner: Ruth Hochman
Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Site of the Samuel Edwards House." Proposal to replace entry doors and install new wood windows on the east and south elevations, canvas awnings, roof equipment and screening, photovoltaic roof panels, and hardscape.)

(Review After Final of proposed changes to approved windows at entry.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on Sheet A3.0.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:17 P.M. ****