



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 10, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Absent
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
 ALEX PUJO – Present at 1:48 p.m.
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Present at 2:39 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, June 5, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:32):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 27, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 27, 2009, with correction.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 5/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Murray/Naylor/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Shallanberger, 6/0/0. (Curtis abstained on Items B and C. Murray/Naylor/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Chair Naylor and Commissioner Murray would be absent and Commissioner Pujo would be arriving at around 2:30 p.m.
2. Mr. Jacobus announced that at the next HLC meeting two items will be heard: 1) The possible Structure of Merit designation of the property at 1809 Stanwood Drive; and 2) discussion of an update to the City's Potential List.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Boucher reported on the Survey Subcommittee meeting that was held in the morning.

- F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 314 E PADRE ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-002
Application Number: MST2009-00277
Owner: Melanie Craft Ellison
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing, two-story, 1,212 square foot single-family dwelling and associated hardscape features.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design Associates

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because no cultural resource site or material is likely to be located within the proposed area of potential effect, then no further archaeological work is recommended or necessary at this time.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/0. (Murray/Naylor/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**2. 314 E PADRE ST/ 2050 GARDEN ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:49) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-002
Application Number: MST2009-00277
Owner: Melanie Craft Ellison
Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing, two-story, 1,212 square foot single-family dwelling and associated hardscape features.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design Associates
Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the new property owner is proposing to restore the size of the lot to the original configuration before it was subdivided. The reconstruction is proposed to be traditional, but the solar panels have been planned in such a way that they would not be visible from any public right-of-way. Staff has read the report and recommends its approval.

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked if any part of the building's façade has been covered over with new construction or if it is all part of the original building.

Public comment closed at 1:57 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the comment that it is an excellent report.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

3. **314 E PADRE ST**

E-1 Zone

(1:58)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-002

Application Number: MST2009-00277

Owner: Melanie Craft Ellison

Architect: Harrison Design Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing, two-story, 1,212 square foot single-family dwelling and associated hardscape features.)

(Project requires review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report and Historic Structures/Sites Report.)

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Harrison Design Associates

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. **631 OLIVE ST**

C-M Zone

(2:02)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-005

Application Number: MST2008-00577

Owner: Carl E. and Constance K. Lindberg

Applicant: Sefton Graham

(Proposal for a new medical marijuana dispensary with a change of use of the existing residence to commercial use, and prior removal of a front porch.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
Carl Lindberg, Owner

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the house has wide board novelty siding, with high plate heights and a shuttle house shape so that it warranted an investigation. The report determined that the house is not historically significant. The house was moved onto the site, it is within a deteriorated setting and the house has had many alterations. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Adams, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

5. **309 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

(2:12)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-034

Application Number: MST2009-00247

Owner: Lyons Bourget Family Ltd. Partnership

Applicant: Lang Sligh

Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting

Historical Consultant: Post/Hazeltine Associates

(Historic Structures Report for a proposal to demolish an existing single-family residence and detached accessory structure. There are no plans to construct new buildings at this time.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Lang Sligh, Applicant

Pamela Post and Timothy Hazeltine, Historical Consultants

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the purpose of the report was to determine whether the house has historic significance that would not allow demolition to take place. The house has an unusual shape and turn-of-the-century architecture with tapered craftsman columns, indicating that it has had alterations. The report determined that the building is not landmark worthy, but meets eligibility criteria as a possible Structure of Merit.

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the path of demolishing the building should not be taken until it is known what would be constructed in its place.

Public comment closed at 2:15 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Shallanberger, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**6. 2300 GARDEN ST**

RETIRED Zone

(2:33)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review of Historic Structures Letter Addendum Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This report is focused on proposed changes to the entry doors and walkway of the existing Shop Building.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant
 Mary Rose, Agent

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the report is centering around improvements to a Shop that is a secondary structure on the site.

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Public comment reopened at 2:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, local resident, asked if the sandstone can be saved under the State Historical Building Code and to what extent does the ADA requirement demand a completely smooth surface.

Public comment reclosed at 2:40 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the comment that the applicant should consider reusing or storing the better parts of the sandstone patio for future use.

Action: Adams/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**7. 2300 GARDEN ST**

RETIRED Zone

(2:43)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review After Final of revisions to the existing Shop Building including changes to doors and windows on north and south elevations, structural upgrades to exterior walls, mechanical upgrades due to relocated restrooms, and installation of a proposed new kiln.)

Present: Mary Rose, Agent
 Jorge Machin, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:47 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval of Review After Final with the following conditions: 1) Incorporate a minimum 15-gallon palm tree. 2) Carefully remove sandstone pavers for future use at another part of the site.

Action: Adams/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW**8. 418 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(2:53)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024
 Application Number: MST2009-00236
 Owner: Gregory & Cheryl Young
 Architect: Howard Wittausch
 Business Name: India House

(Proposal to abate enforcement case ENF2009-00268 to upgrade roof trusses and remodel an existing storefront entry. The entry remodel will consist of recessing the storefront entrance 12'- 6" to provide covered, outdoor dining at the streetfront. This will result in a Measure E square footage credit of 488 square feet.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Howard Wittausch, Architect
 Krishan Gupta, Tenant

Public comment opened at 3:06 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with the comment that any proposed light fixtures shall conform to the Outdoor Lighting and Streetlight Design Guidelines and any signage shall be reviewed by the Sign Committee.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 6/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: The proposed light fixtures, although not part of this application, were reviewed and the Commission found them to be acceptable.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

9. **318 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-020

Application Number: MST2009-00245

Owner: 318 State St Properties, LLC

Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Seaside Oil Company Building and Showroom aka Andalucia Building." Proposal to demolish an existing 2,436 square foot building at the rear portion of 314 State Street and construct a new trash enclosure and loading dock. Proposed for the rear structure of 318 State Street is a facade remodel including new awnings, doors, and windows. Also proposed is a reconfiguration and associated landscaping of five parking lots including the addition of 16 new parking spaces for a total of 84 parking spaces. These spaces are proposed to be the designated parking for the five parcels from 314 through 324 State Street, 323 and 327 Anacapa Street, and 24 E. Gutierrez Street. The proposal includes preservation of the existing historic arcade and front building located at 318 State Street. No new square footage is proposed.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment, Historic Resource findings, and a shared parking agreement.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect
Peter Lewis, Owner
Phil Suding, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, asked if the plan for conversion of a huge multi-story structure is no longer being proposed. He also asked if the Moorish façade on State Street is to remain and whether the existing building needs preparation of a historic structures report.

Mr. Cearnal responded that this proposal is not affecting the front façade and it is an alternative to the multi-story structure previously proposed. Staff stated that both an addendum letter to the Historic Structures/Sites Report and an addendum to the Archaeology Report are being prepared.

Public comment closed at 3:26 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The proposed California sycamore (*Platanus racemosa*) is acceptable. 2) It was suggested that one Oak tree be included. 3) It would be preferred that *Melaleuca* not be included in the center of the parking lot. 4) Study the use of Berkeley sage (*Carex tumulicola*).

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 6/0/0. (Shallanberger stepped down. Murray/Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM****A. 27 PARKER WAY C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-252-007
Application Number: MST2008-00520
Owner: Dario Pini
Designer: Catherine Dunbar

(Proposal for a new 6'-0" tall, 21'-0" wide CMU and plaster trash enclosure with a tiled roof overhang and fire sprinklers at a mixed-use site. Approval of this project will abate ENF2008-01142.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet 1.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1221 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-018
Application Number: MST2009-00201
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court LP
Architect: Lenvik & Minor
Business Name: Victoria Court Retail Complex

(This structure is on the **City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Victoria Court, formerly Sears."** Proposal for three new wrought iron security gates at existing pedestrian entrances to Victoria Court retail complex.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 916 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-052
Application Number: MST2009-00127
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Hochhauser Blatter Architects
Business Name: Fiesta Five Theatres

(Proposal to add a new wrought iron security gate at the front entry of the exterior lobby of a movie theater.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A-0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

D. 625 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-005
Application Number: MST2004-00721
Owner: Jaime M. Flores
Owner: Sid Carrera
Applicant: Dawn Sherry
Business Name: Chad's

(This is a **Structure of Merit: "Sherman Residence."** Proposal to add the following to Chad's Restaurant: a 291 square foot storage area, an 894 square foot bar area and a 113 square foot restroom to the existing 1,935 square foot restaurant and to abate the violations outlined in ENF2004-00484 and ENF2004-00529. The project also includes reconfiguring the parking and expanding the outdoor seating. Two parcels (037-123-005 & 037-123-017) would be merged as part of the project.)

(Review After Final of proposed window and door changes, relocation of electrical panel, and change to awnings.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

E. 1727 PROSPECT AVE R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-142-004
Application Number: MST2008-00517
Owner: Larson Family Trust
Architect: Amy Taylor

(This structure is eligible for Structure of Merit designation. Proposal to replace the existing exterior wood siding on the main residence with Hardi-shingle, replace existing windows in the same-sized openings and configuration, and add a pair of double columns at the front porch. Also proposed is to add 152 square feet to an existing rear balcony and new stairs leading to the backyard.)

(Review After Final of minor exterior changes to approved plans.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

F. 2300 GARDEN ST RETIRED Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
Application Number: MST2005-00241
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: M2 Architecture
Architect: Appleton & Associates, Inc.
Contractor: Matt Construction Company
Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review After Final of chimney cap detail and door hardware.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:32 P.M.
WITH CONDOLESCENCES GIVEN TO ALEXANDRA COLE
FOR THE TRAGIC DEATH OF HER SON LUKE****