



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, April 1, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, Chair – Present until 3:48 p.m.
 DONALD SHARPE, Vice-Chair – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Present 1:58 p.m. to 3:30 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Present until 3:00 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 HEATHER BAKER, Project Planner – Present until 2:10 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on March 27, 2009, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Public Comment:

Alex Pujo, local resident, commented about the tragic death of Adrianna Bachan, a Santa Barbara High School graduate, who was killed on Sunday in Los Angeles by a man who ran a red light. He mentioned that around 4,500 pedestrians get killed every year. That is the same number of all the American and coalition forces killed in Iraq in six years.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 18, 2009.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 4, 2009, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/1. (Pujo abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Chair Naylor would be stepping down from Items 9 through 15 at 2300 Garden Street.
- b) Commissioner Sharpe would be stepping down from Item 5 at 834 State Street.

2. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, responded to inquiries from neighbors about the property on 6 Rosemary Lane. The street has six Moody Sisters' cottages and five additional houses, four of which are compatible in materials with the Moody Sisters' cottages. The fifth house is a 1970 minimal Spanish style, which is the subject of a current remodel. The Spanish style of 6 Rosemary Lane makes the existing architecture incompatible with the character defining features of the neighborhood. It is also set back from the street differently from the other homes.

Mr. Jacobus believes the street is eligible to be designated a historic district. The lane with the six Moody Sisters' cottages and the four somewhat compatible houses would qualify, but 6 Rosemary Lane would be exempt. It will be more of a Craftsman style, but compatible with the rest of the neighborhood. The HLC does not have purview over the design of this house because it is not designated a historic structure and the street is not a historic district. Mr. Jacobus has recommended that the residents in the neighborhood begin a dialogue with the city to have the street designated a historic district.

Commissioner Murray asked if the owner is aware of the HLC Survey and Designations Subcommittees. She volunteered to work with the property owners in order to work on a formal survey and declaration. Mr. Limón responded that a survey may be conducted in the future, but the funding is limited and it will be some time for that neighborhood to be surveyed. There are two additional mechanisms to initiate a historic district: the neighbors could formally request designation of the neighborhood as a historic district or the Commission could ask that the homes be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Commissioner Drury commented that a Craftsman style cottage would be very attractive in that neighborhood and supports the proposed design for the property at 6 Rosemary Lane.

3. Commissioner Sharpe announced, as a member of the Santa Barbara Conservancy, that copies of the book entitled "Stone Architecture in Santa Barbara" will be made available at a book signing event occurring at Casa de La Guerra on Thursday, May 7 from 5:00 to 8:00 p.m. The book explores this extraordinary era between 1870 and 1940 of stone construction in Santa Barbara. The event is sponsored by the Santa Barbara Conservancy.
4. Mr. Limón announced a visit from representatives of the City of San Clemente ("The Spanish Village by the Sea") on Friday, April 3. They would like to have additional information on the history of the City of Santa Barbara and the development of the downtown parking system. A tour will be given by Mr. Jacobus and Commissioner Boucher.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Adams announced that a meeting of the Design Awards Subcommittee will be planned within a couple of months. Nominations should be submitted to Commissioner Adams.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. Review of Draft El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines final errata list and forward recommendation to City Council for adoption.

(1:48)

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner
Heather Baker, Project Planner

Ms. Baker reviewed the addendum to the latest errata list that was discussed with the EPV Guidelines Subcommittee. These are in response to recent comments from the public and the Commission.

The Commission expressed appreciation for Steve Hausz's efforts in providing photographs to serve as examples for both the updated Guidelines and the online photo gallery.

Public comment opened at 1:56 p.m.

Mary Louise Days, local resident, commented that the Presidio State Historic Park is important to mention in the Guidelines since the original El Pueblo Viejo District was created around the site of the Presidio.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to whether the publication of the updated Guidelines could wait until after the building heights charter amendment is settled in the November election. He also inquired about whether signage in EPV should be mentioned in the Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 1:59 p.m.

Mr. Limón responded that the updated Guidelines will be printed once the City Council adopts them and they will be made available online. Commissioner Boucher responded that the Sign Committee has the capability to determine the appropriateness of signage in EPV.

Mr. Limón mentioned that, if better drawings are received to replace the ones on page 61 (Misc. Roof Details), they will be routed to the EPV Guidelines Subcommittee before the updated version is finalized.

Commissioner Curtis suggested that the language on page 69, second paragraph, be replaced with: "Zoning regulations establish maximum allowable building envelopes. Designs for EPV which seek to fill the majority of the allowable envelope of the property are discouraged. Site specific evaluation, neighborhood compatibility and [remove the word "close"] proximity to historic resources are critical considerations for the designer as the Commission is charged to evaluate projects with these in mind."

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would like to leave the word "discouraged" in the second paragraph on page 69 of the updated guidelines? 9/0.

Motion: To accept the final errata changes, with the suggested language for the second paragraph on page 69, and forward a recommendation to City Council for adoption of the updated El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1631 SHORELINE DR

E-3/SD-3 Zone

(2:11) Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-022
Application Number: MST2008-00017
Owner: David Prenatt
Architect: Kavoian & Associates

(Proposal to remove as-built concrete and wood patios, stairways, and retaining walls to allow the lower bluff top area to return to its natural sloped condition. The project includes approximately 120 cubic yards of grading (40 cubic yards cut and 80 cubic yards fill) and the replanting the bluff top with native vegetation and installation of temporary drip irrigation. The area below the top of bluff would remain undisturbed. The existing 2,233 square foot one-story single family residence with attached 407 square foot garage is located on a 20,100 square foot parcel in the Hillside Design District. Planning Commission approval of a coastal development permit is requested.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone of Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that there will be minimal risk of impact to cultural resources during the proposed construction and no further archaeological investigation is recommended or necessary at this time.

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.
Action: Boucher/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

This item was reopened at 5:53 p.m. to answer the Commission's inquiry as to why paleontology was not included in the report.

Ms. Gantz stated that Melissa Hetrick, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner, provided the following information:

The Phase I report for 1631 Shoreline by Western Points Archaeology analyzed all potential cultural resources on the project site pursuant to the MEA Guidelines. The surface survey and document search revealed no pre-historic or historic archaeological or paleontological resources of note on the site. A few shells were found during the surface survey. However, the shells appeared to be decorative items placed on the site by the owners of the property and were not in-situ cultural resources of significance. The report concludes that no further investigation or monitoring is needed on the site due to the low potential for encountering significant cultural resources.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 505 WENTWORTH AVE R-3 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-143-010
 Application Number: MST2007-00345
 Owner: Wentworth Investors, LLC
 Architect: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal to construct three new two story residential condominiums on an existing 6,500 square foot vacant lot in the R-3 Zone. The proposal includes 2 two-bedroom units totaling 2,128 square feet and 1 one-bedroom unit totaling 1,042 square feet. An attached 438 square foot two-car garage is proposed for each unit. The parcel has a 2% slope and 256.7 yards of grading is proposed.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report and Addendum prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because no prehistoric cultural resource item or historic resource deposit was identified during the monitoring program, no further archaeological work is recommended for this property and construction can proceed. However; the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources would apply to the project.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.
 Action: Adams/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

4. 0-300 W CABRILLO BLVD HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2009-00118
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jeannette Candau, Redevelopment Specialist
 Applicant: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

(Proposal for a permanent public art installation consisting of four tile and brass mosaics at four new plaza areas along W. Cabrillo Blvd. and four new concrete benches along the Los Baños walkway.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Jeanette Candau, City Redevelopment Specialist
 Rafael Perea de la Cabada, Artist
 Lori Anne David, Artist

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.

Steve Hyslop, Chuck's Waterfront Grill and Harbor Merchant's Association, spoke in support of the project.

Public comment closed at 2:27 p.m.

Motion: **Final Approval of the project.**
Action: Boucher/Murray, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 834 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-021
 Application Number: MST2008-00071
 Owner: First States Investors 5000A, LLC
 Applicant: Yvonne Michals
 Architect: Steve Hausz
 Business Name: Bank of America

(Proposal to replace five automatic teller machines. New signage is to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.)

(Second Concept Review. Previous HLC comments of March 5, 2008, have expired. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Steve Hausz, Architect
 Fred Figueroa, Agent

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the Commission has discouraged ATMs directly facing State Street. He suggested that the ATM and night depository be made less obvious to help the ambience and to conform to the EPV Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 2:39 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners are comfortable with the amount of signage currently existing? No vote. It was clarified that less signage than what is existent would be preferred.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) The smaller ATM machines are an improvement and are appreciated. A smoother finish that is more consistent with other equipment on State Street would be preferred. 2) The preference is for the depository to remain where it is currently and that two equal sized ATMs be placed on the State Street side. 3) The use of tile as proposed is not acceptable. Restudy the tile surround, making better use of it, in recognition of the opening where it is located. The tile should blend better with both the architecture and the color of the building. It was suggested that tile with a more hand-finished look be used, with a decrease in quantity.

4) The following comments are to be forwarded to the Sign Committee:
a) Signage on each of the ATM machines that are facing the parking lot is not necessary.
b) The reverse halo lit signage facing State Street is not appropriate. It was suggested that a less modern style be used, such as that it be painted on the wall.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 1529 SANTA BARBARA ST R-3 Zone

(2:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-005
 Application Number: MST2009-00116
 Owner: The Unitarian Society of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Coop Community Energy

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Unitarian Society. Proposal for a 3.6 kilowatt roof mounted photovoltaic solar array to be installed on the rear, southwest corner of the Parish Hall on E. Arrellaga Street. The maximum distance from the roof to the top of the tallest panel is 7'-6" in height.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Chris Shorb, Cooperative Community Energy

Public comment opened at 3:02 p.m.

Don Bushnell, The Unitarian Society Religious Education Committee, commented that next year's curriculum will be called "Stewards of the Earth for Our Children." It will include the reduction of our carbon footprint and this installation will be used as an example.

Public comment closed at 3:02 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval with the condition that the photovoltaic panels shall be a dark color frame and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar for review of tree details, revised drawings including a section, and irrigation.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Commission comments: It is the hope of the Commission that, when it is time for the proposed panels to be replaced, new technology make available panels that are lower and more efficient.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

7. 209 E PEDREGOSA ST E-1 Zone

(3:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-382-009
 Application Number: MST2008-00074
 Owner: Gary Ricks
 Architect: Kurt Magness

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Palmer House," and is considered to be eligible for City Landmark status. This is a revised project description: Proposal to demolish 209 square feet of floor area in an existing, 5,603 square foot, one-story, single-family residence and construct an 815 square foot single-story addition. Ten cubic yards of grading excavation is proposed. This project will result in 6,209 square feet of development on a 33,750 square foot parcel, which is 127% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio. The project will be required to meet a Built Green two-star rating or equivalent.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Kurt Magness, Architect
Gary Ricks, Owner
Jock Angus, Contractor

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for architectural and landscape details with the following comments: 1) The placement of the fruit tree is acceptable and it should be in a 24 inch minimum box size. 2) Study the use of a different type of fruit tree.

Action: Pujo/Shallanberger, 8/0/1. (Murray abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 2014 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(3:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-331-016
Application Number: MST2009-00135
Owner: Gardner Family Trust
Contractor: Santa Barbara Landscapes

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Crocker Row." Proposal for a 50 square foot decorative water fountain to be located in the front yard of a 13,000 square foot parcel.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

Present: Ron Stotts and Matt Cota, Santa Barbara Landscapes

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the photographs presented do not show the sculpture in front of the house. This proposal will add more to the streetscape and distract from the historic house.

Public comment closed at 3:34 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) A water feature is supportable for this house. 2) The shape and height of the proposed fountain would not be appropriate to the structure's historicity and style of the architecture. A Mission Revival shape would be more appropriate. 3) There should be a more naturalistic point of view so that it blends in with the garden. 4) Softening the fountain with a seating area was suggested. 5) A photo simulation was suggested and a site section including the existing grade should be shown.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:48 P.M. TO 4:00 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT: PROJECT 1

9. 2300 GARDEN ST

RETIRED Zone

(4:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This addendum report is focused on changes to the Refectory Building including: redesign roof well, realign east stairs, add doors in east, south and west elevations, new courtyard, new wrought iron railing on west courtyard elevation, metal louver vent on west elevation, removal of wood surrounds on modern door of east elevation, and consider window changes to east and west elevations.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
 Jorge Machin, Architect
 Ken Mineau, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the Phase 1 Historic Structures/Sites Report will be provided for review at the next HLC meeting. This is actually a Focused Letter report and the complete HSSR will be required before any more addenda are scheduled for review by the Commission.

Public comment opened at 4:13 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to whether an addendum report can be accepted without the review and acceptance of the full historic structure/sites report.

Public comment closed at 4:13 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Adams/Shallanberger, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL: PROJECT 1

10. 2300 GARDEN ST

RETIRED Zone

(4:21)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
Application Number: MST2005-00241
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
Contractor: Plant Construction Company
Architect: M2 Architecture
Business Name: San Roque School Garden St. Campus

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Review After Final of proposed changes to approval for the Refectory Building including: redesign roof well, realign east stairs, add doors in east, south and west elevations, new courtyard landscaping, new wrought iron railing on west courtyard elevation, metal louver vent on west elevation, removal of wood surrounds on modern door of east elevation, and consider window changes to east and west elevations.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
Jorge Machin, Architect
Ken Mineau, Architect

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The proposed locations for the doors are appropriate. 2) Restudy the design of the hollow metal doors to possibly make them more attractive. 3) Of concern are the stairway relocation and portico on the east elevation. The portico seems unbalanced without the middle column. It was suggested that two columns be placed on either end of the portico. 4) **Landscaping:** a) Provide more plant variety with color and texture in the landscape plan. b) The use of more *Strelitzia reginae* (Bird of Paradise) plants was suggested. c) Do not use *Pittosporum undulatum* (Victorian Box).

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT: PROJECT 2

11. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(5:00)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
 Application Number: MST2006-00190
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose
 Architect: Machin & Mead Architecture
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque High School Garden St. Campus

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for seismic, safety, and utility upgrades in the Main Building of San Roque High School. Improvements include seismic strengthening, installation of new fire sprinkler system, accessibility upgrades including the installation of a new elevator, new drinking fountains, and restrooms. Exterior work includes new rooftop penetrations for ventilation, elevator overrun, and new handrails.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This addendum report is focused on a change to the method of structural strengthening of the front facade columns and the addition of a new roof well.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
 Jorge Machin, Architect
 Ken Mineau Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that this addendum involves the need for having construction elevator access into the building. Alternatives were considered at the rear of the building, but there was no practical place for a convenient loading area. Saw-cutting the stone was discussed, but it would not be a viable solution. The proposal is to carefully remove twenty stones, then number and store them. The openings will also be protected. Staff has read the report and agrees with the conclusion that the proposed method would be the safest way to accomplish the difficult task of installing the proposed elevator without having to cut into the original stones.

Motion: To accept the report with the condition that the following corrections be made and the revised report be submitted to Staff: **1)** On page 3, Item 14, the wording "and reconstruction of same" should be added at the end of the first sentence to reflect that both the removal and reinstallation of elements are to be monitored. **2)** Page 9 needs to be corrected under Standard 2 to read "therefore the proposed work meets Standard 2", instead of Standard 1. **3)** On page 10, Standard 10 is mentioned, but a conclusion needs to be stated.

Action: Curtis/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL: PROJECT 2

12. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(5:13)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
 Application Number: MST2006-00190
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose
 Architect: Machin & Mead Architecture
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque High School Garden St. Campus

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for seismic, safety, and utility upgrades in the Main Building of San Roque High School. Improvements include seismic strengthening, installation of new fire sprinkler system, accessibility upgrades including the installation of a new elevator, new drinking fountains, and restrooms. Exterior work includes new rooftop penetrations for ventilation, elevator overrun, and new handrails.)

(Review After Final of the following changes: change to the method of structural strengthening of the front facade columns, replacement of existing concrete cap at the second floor with composite concrete beam, the temporary removal of twenty stones and three adjacent windows for construction access, and the addition of a new roof well.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
 George Machin, Architect
 Ken Mineau, Architect

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Adams/Drury, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT: PROJECT 3

13. 2300 GARDEN ST

RETIRED Zone

(5:24)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00812
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: Appleton & Associates
 Contractor: Matt Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque High School

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This addendum report is focused on a change in the location of an accessible path on the southwest side of the gymnasium and restoration of the original stairs leading to the south side of the gymnasium.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
Jorge Machin, Architect
Ken Mineau, Architect

Mary Rose, applicant, made a brief presentation regarding the report.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Curtis/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL: PROJECT 3

14. 2300 GARDEN ST

RETIRED Zone

(5:32)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
Application Number: MST2005-00812
Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: Machin and Associates, Inc.
Business Name: San Roque High School

(The former St. Anthony's Seminary is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed changes to occur to the Gymnasium and Chapel. Interior work: seismic strengthening and upgrades for life safety consisting of a new elevator, fire sprinkler system, and accessibility upgrades including drinking fountains and signs. Exterior work: like-for-like replacement of the arcade stairs, new accessibility handrails, three new rooftop penetrations for exhaust vents at the Gymnasium, and a new switchgear box to house electrical service upgrade for the entire campus to be located on the west side of the Chapel in an existing niche.)

(Review After Final of change in location of accessible path on southwest side of the gymnasium and restoration of the original stairs leading to the south side of the gymnasium.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
Jorge Machin, Architect
Ken Mineau, Architect

Motion: Final Approval of the architectural changes as presented.

Action: Pujo/Curtis, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW: PROJECT 4

15. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(5:42)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-024
Application Number: MST2009-00009
Owner: San Roque School Charitable Trust
Agent: Mary Rose & Associates
Architect: M2 Architecture
Architect: Appleton & Associates

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is eligible for City Landmark status: "St. Anthony's Seminary." The original seismic and safety upgrade project approved under application MST2005-00241 has been revised to include the following changes: Proposal for the demolition of 1,803 square feet of floor area and stair at the south elevation, courtyard side, of the Infirmary Wing to create an accessible outdoor classroom with tiered seating and to extend the existing arcade roofline to cover an accessible path. The project will also include new accessible restrooms on the lower level, a technical mezzanine on the upper level, and the integration of handicapped access at the main level. Adjustments will be made at grade to the adjoining courtyard and walkways to meet accessibility, utility, and life safety standards. Portions of the roof above the south courtyard facade of the Infirmary Wing will be removed with the remaining to be upgraded to meet structural and seismic requirements, with the overall roof height to be lowered by 4.5 feet. An existing brick chimney and roof penetrations are also proposed to be removed. A partial demolition of the south-facing courtyard will allow the restoration of five original windows on the Main Building. An existing opening between the Main Wing and Infirmary Wing will be infilled with a new window to match the existing on this 12.3 acre parcel.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Historic Resource Findings.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant
George Machin, Architect
Ken Mineau, Architect

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment that more succulent color should be included in the landscape plan.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM**

A. 2030 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA STE 113 SP-7 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-163-004
Application Number: MST2009-00137
Owner: Michael Towbes
Applicant: Bob Anderson
Engineer: Ehlen Spiess & Haight, Inc.

(This structure is a designated City Landmark: "Furse Hall, Quadrangle Buildings, Ebbets Hall, and Grand Stair." Proposal for new air conditioning equipment at the Riviera Business Park. At the Main Quad, one existing condenser unit will be removed and two new condenser units will be installed on the roof behind the existing parapet wall. Also, one existing evaporator unit will be removed from the roof and two new evaporator units will be installed inside the building. At the West Quad, one existing exterior 3-ton air conditioning unit is proposed to be replaced with a new 4-ton unit on the roof in the same location behind the decorative parapet. At the North Hall, one roof mounted condenser unit will be relocated from the Main Quad to an at-grade concrete pad, which will be screened. Associated electrical panel upgrades and switches are also proposed in this project.)

(Project requires Historic Resource Findings and Findings for Alterations to an Historic Landmark.)

Final Approval as submitted and the following findings are made: 1) Historic Resource Findings: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource. **2) Alterations to a City Landmark Findings:** The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

CONTINUED ITEM

B. 916 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-052
Application Number: MST2009-00127
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Hochhauser Blatter Architects
Business Name: Fiesta Five Theatres

(Proposal to add a new wrought iron security gate at the front entry of the exterior lobby of a movie theater.)

(Second Concept Review.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 19 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-003
Application Number: MST2009-00097
Owner: The Volentine Foundation
Architect: Edwards - Pitman Architects

(Proposal for minor exterior alterations on the south elevation of an existing commercial building. The proposed work includes the following: demolish an existing exterior stairway, add a new second floor balcony with wrought iron rail; new awnings; add a new basement level window; and, change two existing solid doors to French doors.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 301 W PEDREGOSA ST R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-012-008
Application Number: MST2009-00025
Owner: Edward Gutierrez
Architect: David Ferrin

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Reynolds Bungalow/Etchelecu House." Proposal to demolish an existing, 159 square foot carport and construct an attached, 225 square foot one-car garage with a partially covered, 228 square foot roof deck. Also proposed is to demolish 70 square feet of interior floor area of the existing, one-story 955 square foot residence and construct a 372 square foot first floor addition and new rear deck totaling 297 square feet. No grading or excavation is proposed on this 5,264 square foot parcel. The proposed total of 1,482 square feet is 58.9% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**E. 500 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-241-038
Application Number: MST2009-00155
Owner: Ann Elizabeth Leslie Trust
Architect: Garcia Architects

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was found to be worthy of Structure of Merit status. Proposal for exterior changes to a commercial building including replacement of the front and rear entry doors, installation of security system lights and cameras, and a wrought iron security fence at the trash enclosure wall.)

Continued two weeks to April 18, 2009.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:54 P.M. ****