



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 7, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present
 CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Present 2:10 p.m. to 3:15 P.M.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:10 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present until 5:19 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required <u>at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On Wednesday, December 31, 2008, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):

- A. Election of Chair and Vice Chair for 2009.

Ms. Gantz opened nominations for office of Chair and Vice-Chair.

1. Nomination for Chair: Susette Naylor.

A vote was taken and Susette Naylor was elected as Chair.

2. Nomination for Vice-Chair: Donald Sharpe.

A vote was taken and Donald Sharpe was elected as Vice-Chair.

- B. Appointments to Subcommittees.

Appointments were made to fill vacancies on the following subcommittees:

1. **HLC Consent Calendar: Sharpe.** Alternate: Adams.
2. **Sign Committee Liaison: Boucher.** Alternate: Pujo.
3. **Visual Art in Public Places: Naylor.** Alternate: Drury.
4. **West Beach Art Program Selection Panel: Drury.**
5. **Design Awards: Adams, Boucher and Pujo.**
6. **Designations: Boucher, Murray and Sharpe.**
7. **EPV Design Guidelines: Adams, Boucher, Naylor and Sharpe.**
8. **Events: Boucher and Drury.**
9. **Historic Surveys: Boucher, Murray and Sharpe.**
10. **State of the Art Gallery/State Street Installations: Boucher.** Alternate: Drury.

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

11. **Airport: Adams, Murray and Pujo,**
12. **Lower Mission Creek Design: Adams and Murray.**
13. **Plaza De La Guerra: Curtis, Pujo and Sharpe.**
14. **433 E. Cabrillo Blvd. (Waterfront Hotel): Adams, Pujo, Shallenberger, and Sharpe.**

C. Site Visit:

It was decided that a group site visit to 2300 Garden Street will take place on Monday, January 26, from 8:30 a.m. to 9:30 a.m. Mary Rose, agent for the applicant, discussed what the site visit would entail.

D. Public Comment:

No public comment.

E. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 10, 2008.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 10, 2008, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/3. (Curtis/Pujo/Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

F. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item I, 1220 Chapala Street, which was reviewed by Robert Adams.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

G. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Susan Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Chair Naylor would need to leave the meeting at 7:00 p.m. Commissioner Murray would be stepping down from items 8 and 14 at 1032 Olive Street and 1727 Prospect Avenue, respectively, and would leave the meeting at 5:00 p.m. Commissioner Adams would be stepping down on Item 13, 2134 Mission Ridge Road.
- b. The project at 710 Anacapa Street, which was postponed to today's meeting for final approval, was postponed indefinitely at the Owner's request.

Motion: To indefinitely postpone the review of the project at 710 Anacapa Street.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

2. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, distributed the 2009 meeting dates for the Designations and Survey Subcommittees.
3. Commissioner Adams announced that Edward Mazria, founder of Architecture 2030, will be presenting a lecture at UCSB's Campbell Hall on January 26 at 7:30 p.m. The lecture is entitled "Now, it's personal... Solving our energy, climate change and economic crisis."
4. Commissioner Drury announced that The Oak Group (Artists for Preservation) would be having an art exhibition at the Museum of Natural History through January 11.

5. Commission Drury announced that there was an article in the L.A. Times about recycling wood that would normally be sent to a landfill. It features Rob Bjorkund, Santa Barbara resident, who crafts furniture out of toppled city trees. (Chawkins, Steve. "A second life for toppled trees." Los Angeles Times January 5, 2009.) Commissioner Drury spoke to Mr. Bjorkund about the possibility of salvaging the wood from the Montecito Country Club badminton building.
6. Commissioner Shallenberger announced he would not be attending the January 26 site visit at 2300 Garden Street.

H. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Naylor reported that the draft for the updated EPV Guidelines is almost complete and will be presented to the HLC some time in February.

Commissioner Drury reported on the West Beach Art Program. The selection has been narrowed down to two artists.

I. Possible Ordinance Violations.

1. Commissioner Boucher inquired about or reported on the following:
 - a. The reconstruction of the City Landmark Mission Creek Bridge. Mr. Jacobus responded that it is actually a repair because the stones will be removed and placed back exactly as they had been. It appears the work is being done appropriately. The work is expected to be completed in two weeks.
 - b. The antennas on top of the Granada Theater. Mr. Jacobus responded that the applicant is within the 18 month window that they were given. Interior work is being done although the outside appears to have been completed.
 - c. Repair work at the City Landmark Cota-Knox House building located at 914 Anacapa Street. The work being performed does not appear to be authentic. Splashed mud shows through the white sprayed paint.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 423 W VICTORIA ST P-R Zone
(2:03) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-161-014
Application Number: MST2008-00374
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Kevin Strasburg
Business Name: Westside Community Center

(Proposal for improvements to the Westside Community Center to include a new concrete path, fencing, benches, and the addition of security lights. The proposal also includes a revised parking configuration which relocates six existing parking spaces and maintains the existing 43 parking spaces, revised landscaping, including the removal of six trees, the addition of 12 trees, and an irrigation system. No exterior alterations are proposed for the existing building.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Bryon Bass of Strata Science.)

Present: Keven Strasburg, City Park Project Technician

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and endorsed Mr. Bass's recommendation that, based on the fact that human remains have been previously found in fill deposits, archaeological monitoring of earthmoving activities should occur.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 411 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-018
Application Number: MST2008-00533
Owner: James T. Brous and Mary Scherer
Architect: Howard Wittausch

(Proposal for a new 1,824 square foot three-story single-family residence with roof decks at the second and third-floor levels and a detached 500 square foot two-car garage with roof deck. The existing 1,250 square foot one-story single family residence and detached 240 square foot garage will be demolished. The proposed total of 2,324 square feet on the 4,662 square foot lot is 98% of the maximum required FAR.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that it is considered that there would be minimal risk of adversely impacting cultural resources if the proposed construction plan were to be implemented, and accordingly no further archaeological work is recommended or necessary at this time.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Curtis/Shallanberger, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 416 & 418 MONTGOMERY ST R-2 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-393-003
Application Number: MST2008-00131
Owner: Dan Secord
Agent: Dave Tabor
Designer: Eric Swenumson
Landscape Architect: Earthform Design

(Proposal to convert two existing, one-story residential units to condominium units on an 8,598 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. Existing unit number one is a three-bedroom, 1,346 square foot unit. Existing unit number two is a two-bedroom, 1,063 square foot unit. An existing, detached two-car garage will remain. The proposal includes the addition of exterior storage spaces for each unit and two uncovered parking spaces (one for each unit) along the private alley off of Montgomery Street. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer Review of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that it is considered that there would be minimal risk of adversely impacting cultural resources if the proposed construction plan were to be implemented, and accordingly no further archaeological work is recommended or necessary at this time.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Sharpe/Curtis, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 1820-1826 DE LA VINA ST R-4 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-022-022
Application Number: MST2007-00590
Owner: Mark and Val Maldonado
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Concept Review of proposed future demolition of five existing residential units and construction of 10 to 14 condominium units. Three lots would be merged for a total site area of approximately 27,000 square feet. The exact scope of the proposed project has not yet been determined. The project will require Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Ken Victorino and David Stone of Dudek.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the reports conclusions and recommendations that, as the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

5. 1712 ANACAPA ST

R-2 Zone

(2:08)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-014

Application Number: MST2008-00435

Owner: Richard Untermann and Gail Elnicky

(Proposal to subdivide an existing 23,160 square foot lot and create a three-lot subdivision, requiring a street frontage waiver. Parcel 1 would be 7,102 square feet and would include the existing 2,140 square foot single-family residence with a new two-car garage. Parcel 2 would be 7,407 square feet with a new two-car garage and a new 1,800 square foot square foot single-family residence. Parcel 3 would be 8,650 square feet and would be the site for a future single-family residence with a two-car garage and a secondary dwelling unit. Pedestrian and vehicular access for all three units would be via a new 14' wide easement along the northwest property line.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone of Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the reports conclusions and recommendations that, due to minimal risk of impact of cultural resources from the proposed development, no further archaeological investigation is recommended or necessary at this time.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Drury/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:10 P.M. TO 2:14 P.M. ****

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

6. 1712 ANACAPA ST R-2 Zone

(2:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-014
 Application Number: MST2008-00435
 Owner: Richard Untermann and Gail Elnicky

(Proposal to subdivide an existing 23,160 square foot lot and create a three-lot subdivision, requiring a street frontage waiver. Parcel 1 would be 7,102 square feet and would include the existing 2,140 square foot single-family residence with a new two-car garage. Parcel 2 would be 7,407 square feet with a new two-car garage and a new 1,800 square foot square foot single-family residence. Parcel 3 would be 8,650 square feet and would be the site for a future single-family residence with a two-car garage and a secondary dwelling unit. Pedestrian and vehicular access for all three units would be via a new 14' wide easement along the northwest property line.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Historian.)

Present: Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant
 Richard Untermann, Applicant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that the report concluded that this building is not historically significant. If the HLC finds that the building does not have historical significance, it is out of the HLC's purview and would then be reviewed by the Single Family Design Board (SFDB). The project would be reviewed as a structure that is being altered, not preserved. The SFDB has neighborhood compatibility guidelines to make sure that the new building is compatible with its surrounding setting.

Commissioner Murray disclosed that she had spoken to the owner via telephone, but the conversation does not preclude her from reviewing the report.

Public comment opened at 2:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.
 Action: Shallanberger/Adams. Motion withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The consulting historian should revise the report to reflect the current project description, which includes a proposal for a three-lot project, with the understanding that it would not necessarily change the outcome of whether the building would be found to be historically significant. 2) The impact of this project on the surrounding neighborhood should be part of the report. 3) **The following existing elements should be addressed in the report:** a) the stone walls; b) Monterey style porch; c) detached garage; and d) Oak trees.

Action: Curtis/Sharpe, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

7. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD

E-1 Zone

(2:51)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018
Application Number: MST2006-00750
Owner: Emily and Blake Jones
Architect: Peter Becker

(This structure was found to be eligible for City Landmark status and is to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. The proposed changes are to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 699 square foot addition, 2,019 interior remodel, 100 square foot crawl space conversion for pool equipment and remodel of basement space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a new 220 square foot pergola with fireplace and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would include a remodel and window change. A modification is requested for conversion of a non-conforming garage to an accessory space.)

(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Historian.)

Present: Peter Becker, Architect
Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant
Rick Kaufman, Contractor

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that this project had been reviewed previously by the Commission. The roof tile had been taken off prior to photo documentation. The plans stated: "Where existing exterior plaster must be removed for repair or for waterproofing at chimneys and other areas, those areas are to be replastered to match exactly the existing plaster, finish, texture, detailing..." The "other areas" ended up being about 75% of the stucco that had been taken off the main structure and a smaller building was stripped down to the studs. The report adequately analyzes these issues. The building had qualified for the National Register, although that may not be the case anymore because many of the materials have been removed. The windows that were removed are being repaired and replaced so that the original wood windows are being saved.

Motion: To accept the report with the condition that the historical consultant shall monitor the project to ensure it is conducted as has been proposed.

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 8/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: The applicant is making a reasonable effort to try to resuscitate this older home. It is of concern to the Commission that this situation of work being done without prior review by the appropriate design review board has occurred previously. The consulting historian should monitor the work to assure that this situation does not happen again.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

8. 1032 OLIVE ST

R-3 Zone

(3:02)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-230-018

Application Number: MST2008-00239

Owner: Mark Mansfield and Monique Hartley

Architect: B3 Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story, single-family residence and detached one-car garage and construct a new two-story, multi-unit residential project of 5,956 square feet on a 7,500 square foot lot. The project site is located within the Demolition Review Study Area and the existing structure is greater than 50 years old. Staff Hearing Officer approval is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Dr. Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Historical Consultants
Mark Mansfield, Owner

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that this house is a Craftsman bungalow and does not have any exceptional qualities, structurally, in terms of its details. It has a perfectly symmetrical front façade, which is unusual for this type of structure. The report concluded that the house is not historically significant because it is not an exceptional example of its type or style. The stone wall in the front should be preserved and included in the new project.

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the following comments forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review: 1) The house contributes to the neighborhood character. 2) The applicant was asked to consider retaining the structure in the design of the project. 3) The applicant should be conscious of the project's affect on the church across the street.

Action: Adams/Sharpe, 6/2/0. (Drury/Pujo opposed because the house makes an important contribution to the streetscape and the neighborhood. Murray stepped down.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: The Commission regrets the loss of a home with elements that are much appreciated in the city, particularly in view of the potential for a historic district in that area and its contributing characteristics to the neighborhood.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

9. 1041 MISSION RIDGE RD A-1 Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-031-015
 Application Number: MST2008-00572
 Owner: Alan and Katherine Van Vliet

(Proposal to restore doors, windows, and shutters as well as stucco cladding to their original locations on a circa 1927 Interpretive Spanish Colonial Revival house. Also proposed is the installation of a limited number of new doors and windows, new terrace railing, and a new garage door. This will abate enforcement case ENF2008-00406.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Historian.)

Present: Ronald Nye, Historical Consultant
 Tom Jacobs, Architect
 Peter Copeland, General Contractor

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that this project proceeded without the appropriate design review and permit process. The report concluded that the house has historic significance and the work being done meets the Secretary of Interior Standards; therefore, the project does not have a negative impact on the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted with the comment that the historical consultant shall monitor the project to assure the mitigation measures are being met and shall submit a Letter Report to Staff indicating conformance with the historical conditions prior to final approval being given.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

10. 1120 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(3:41) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-034
 Application Number: MST2008-00585
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Victor Garza and Jessica Grant

(Proposal for changes to City Parking Lot #4 including improved access to the parking lot, a new ADA accessible kiosk, enhanced landscaping, restriped ADA parking spaces, and installation of underground fiber optic links.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Bob Cunningham and Nick Tharp, Arcadia Studio
 Victor Garza, City Parking/TMP Superintendent

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for final approval of details.

Action: Shallenberger/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

11. 0-300 W CABRILLO BLVD HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone

(3:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00122
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jeannette Candau, Redevelopment Specialist
 Architect: Conceptual Motion
 Landscape Architect: Earthform Design

(Proposed enhancements to pedestrian linkage between Stearns Wharf and the Harbor including pedestrian crossings across Cabrillo Boulevard to the beachfront, new benches, lighting, trash/recycle cans, news racks, repairs to existing sidewalks, modifications to seawalls, landscaping, improvements at Sea Landing, and viewing stations on West Beach. The Sign Program and Flag Program are subject to review by the Sign Committee. Project concurrently reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission and received Preliminary Approval on November 12, 2008.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Jeannette Candau, City Redevelopment Agency
 Edward de Vicente, Architect
 Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect

Motion: Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

12. 00 E CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone

(4:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
 Application Number: MST2004-00878
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Agent: Hal Hill, Project Manager
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Blvd. to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of excavation.)

(Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 029-07.)

Present: Hal Hill, City Public Works Project Manager
Kenneth Mineau, Appleton and Associates
David Black, Landscape Architect

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for details.
Action: Sharpe/Pujo, 8/0/1. (Shallanberger abstained.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

13. 2134 MISSION RIDGE RD A-1 Zone

(4:46) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-071-015
Application Number: MST2008-00271
Owner: Aoyama Living Trust
Architect: Paul Poirier

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and was determined to be eligible for Structure of Merit status. Proposal for a new 600 square foot swimming pool and 499 square foot detached pool cabana. There will be a total of 305 cubic yards of grading excavation on this one acre parcel located in the Hillside Design District. No alterations are proposed to the existing house or garage.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect
Patricia Aoyama, Owner

Motion: Continued indefinitely to allow for an Environmental Assessment with the following comments: 1) Restudy the windows and existing details in the main house in relationship to the pool house proportions. 2) The flat roof tile or another low key roof is acceptable.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Adams stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

14. 1727 PROSPECT AVE

R-2 Zone

(5:02)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-142-004

Application Number: MST2008-00583

Owner: Phil Larson, Larson Family Trust

Architect: Eric Swenumson

(The residence on this parcel is eligible for Structure of Merit status. Proposal to demolish an existing 18' x 18' two-car, detached garage and construct a new 20'-6" x 22'-6" two-car, detached garage. The existing garage has a lower level storage area of approximately 140 square feet, as will the new garage. The sandstone steps in the front yard are proposed to be relocated towards the center of the lot. A zoning modification is requested for the proposed garage expansion and relocation to encroach into the front yard setback on this 11,105 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. The proposed floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) will be 79.8% of the maximum required FAR.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Zoning Modification.)

Present: Eric Swenumson, Architect
Phil Larson, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:05 and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and to return to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) The design of the structure is compatible with the neighborhood and it would be an enhancement over the present conditions. 2) Study the redistribution of materials in a more traditional manner, leading to a simplification of the use in materials. 3) Pay more attention to the type of window detail, proportion and pattern being used; although subsidiary, it should still be related to the main building.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Murray stepped down.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

15. 110 W SOLA ST

C-2 Zone

(5:18) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-062-010
 Application Number: MST2007-00413
 Owner: Carmac & Associates, LLC
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to demolish an existing, one-story 15,730 square foot commercial office building and construct a new, three-story, 37'-6" tall mixed-use development. The project will comprise four residential condominium units ranging in size from 2,173 square feet to 3,060 square feet and three commercial condominium units totaling 2,424 square feet. Sixteen covered parking spaces will be provided on the ground level of this 15,930 square foot parcel. There will be approximately 470 cubic yards of grading excavation. This project will require Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map, the condominium development, and a zoning modification for encroachment into the interior yard setback at the west elevation. This project will also require an HLC waiver of the six-foot fence/decorative wall requirement at the property line between the subject parcel and the adjacent, residentially-zoned parcel. Original Historic Structures/Sites Report reviewed under MST2006-00427.)

(Third Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map, Zoning Modification, and Condominium Development. Project also requires an HLC waiver of the requirement for a fence or wall at the property line adjacent to a residential zone.)

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect

Public comment opened at 5:42 p.m.

Carolyn Dorrance, President of Institute of World Culture, expressed concern with the design impact, residential activity and compatibility with the neighborhood. She commented that a massive, Spanish Colonial building between two historic landmark Victorian homes is not compatible.

Kirk Gradin, Architect and member of the Institute of World Culture, commented that the main architectural concern is the four patios along the westerly side, facing the Mortimer Cook House.

Public comment closed at 5:49 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would support a nine foot, four inch plate height? 0/8.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments:**
1) This is an improved project. **2)** The majority of the Commission finds that the setback modifications are acceptable as requested. **3)** The mass, bulk, and scale are acceptable and the project is compatible with the neighborhood. **4)** A nine foot plate height is too high, but the Commission would support a maximum plate height of eight feet, six inches. **5)** Regarding the privacy relationship on the north elevation: raise the height of the wall, and study providing texture and openings instead of open railings. **6)** There should be more variation, such as the commercial versus residential. **7)** Suggestions were made regarding the use of landscape on the north wall, such as the use of a creeping vine.

Action: Pujo/Drury, 8/0/0. (Murray abstained.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM**

- A. 1117 STATE ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030
Application Number: MST2008-00566
Owner: 1129 State Street
Architect: Doug Reeves
(Proposal to remodel the facade of an existing storefront including relocating the doors and windows back to their historic location at the front property line.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- B. 100 E CARRILLO ST REC CENTER P-R Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-020
Application Number: MST2008-00064
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer
Business Name: Carrillo Recreation Center
(This is a City Landmark: "Recreation Center and Gymnasium." Proposal for structural upgrades, accessibility improvements to meet ADA requirements, upgrading of mechanical, plumbing and electrical systems, and changes to existing windows and rear stairs. Also proposed is to install a 17 kilowatt-peak (kWp) photo-voltaic panel system on the roof of the Gymnasium building on the same parcel but addressed as 114 E. Carrillo Street.)

(Review After Final of photovoltaic panels to be installed on the Carrillo Gymnasium rooftop as part of the rehabilitation of the Carrillo Recreation Center project.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW

- C. 528 STATE ST C-M Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-025
Application Number: MST2008-00261
Owner: Michael D. Stackpoole Trust
Designer: Eddie Deras
Business Name: Tribal Rugs & Art
(Proposal to remove an as-built tent structure at the rear of an existing 1,200 square foot single-story commercial building and construct a 1,200 square foot single-story addition. The project site is 2,500 square feet. The project will require Development Plan Approval for a commercial addition between 1,000 and 3,000 square feet and will abate enforcement case ENF2008-00405.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW

D. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD HRC-1/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013

Application Number: MST2008-00106

Owner: Fess Parker's Doubletree Hotel

Architect: Richard Six

(Proposal to repave and restripe existing parking lot in existing configuration and number of spaces. Modify accessible parking spaces to comply with ADA requirements, modify storm drain routing and add runoff pollution control and provide construction pollution control.)

(Final Approval of the Review After Final is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW

E. 424 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025

Application Number: MST2008-00346

Owner: Ray Mahboob

Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(Proposal for demolition, redesign, and reconstruction of an existing storefront.)

(Final Approval of construction details is requested.)

Final Approval with colors and shop drawings for the store and wrought iron to return to Staff.

NEW ITEM

F. 1715 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-101-021

Application Number: MST2008-00578

Owner: Ruth Hochman, Girsh Family Trust

Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Site of the Samuel Edwards House." Proposal to replace entry doors and install new wood windows on the east and south elevations, canvas awnings, roof equipment and screening, photovoltaic roof panels, and hardscape.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A3.0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

G. 418 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-024

Application Number: MST2008-00015

Owner: Gregory and Cheryl Young

Architect: Howard Wittausch

Business Name: Scavenge

(Proposal to remodel an existing retail storefront.)

(Review After Final of new rooftop equipment.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM

H. 209 PASEO NUEVO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002

Application Number: MST2008-00589

Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

Agent: Glenn Morris

Architect: Beacon Architectural

Business Name: Lush Cosmetics

(Minor exterior storefront improvements at an existing retail store in Paseo Nuevo.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

I. 1220 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-019

Application Number: MST2008-00584

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Agent: Victor Garza and Jessica Grant

(Proposal for changes to City Parking Lot #5 including paving changes for improved access, ADA striping, enhanced landscaping, and installation of underground fiber optic links.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:10 P.M. ****