



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 1, 2008

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

SUSETTE NAYLOR, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Absent
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Absent
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present until 6:30 p.m.
 FERMINA MURRAY – Absent
 ALEX PUJO – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:28 p.m. and again 5:19 p.m. until 5:25 p.m.
 TIM DOWNEY, City Urban Forest Superintendent – Present until 2:28 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items received a mailed notice and were subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project would be reviewed was listed to the left of each item on the agenda; and now the actual time is shown. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule was subject to change as cancellations occurred. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancelled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets were brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval would be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in these meetings, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the HLC after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, September 26, 2008, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 17, 2008.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 17, 2008, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Drury, 5/0/1. (Hausz abstained. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Susette Naylor; with the exception of Item G, which was reviewed by Robert Adams and Steve Hausz; and Item H, which was reviewed by Robert Adams.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Commissioners Curtis, Murray, and Sharpe would be absent from the meeting. Chair Naylor would be stepping down from Items 5, 7, and 9, at 128 Castillo Street, 15-17 W. Carrillo Street, and 28 W. Cabrillo Blvd., respectively.

- b) The annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is in progress and the recruitment schedule is as follows:

The application deadline for new advisory group members is Monday, November 3, at 5:30 p.m. Interviews by full City Council will take place November 11 at 4:00 p.m., November 18 at 3:30 p.m., and November 25 at 6:00 p.m., with appointments to be announced on Tuesday, December 16. Please note that any resignations must be received by the City Clerk's Office no later than Thursday, October 16, in order for the position to be included in this recruitment process. Recruitment information, the list of current vacancies and the application form is available from the City Clerk's office at City Hall or online at: www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards_and_Commissions/Application.htm.

There will be two HLC vacancies to fill on the HLC, those of Commissioners Hausz and Murray.

2. Commissioner Adams reported that the City Council denied the Trust for Historic Preservation's appeal of the Planning Commission approval for the project at 800 Santa Barbara Street. Commissioner Pujo, who was also in attendance at the hearing, requested that Staff plan a discussion between experts as to what the reconstruction and expansion of El Presidio involves. Mr. Limón responded that discussions with The Trust and the City Planner will be initiated and then it will be determined whether a formal discussion will be necessary.
3. Commissioner Adams highlighted the importance that other HLC members attend City Council and Planning Commission meetings related to projects with which the HLC is involved.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. TREE LANDSCAPING PROTECTION AND ENFORCEMENT

(1:50) Staff Presentation: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor; and Tim Downey, City Urban Forest Superintendent

Present: Jaime Limón, City Planning Division
Tim Downey, City Parks and Recreation Department

Mr. Limón stated that City Council charged City Staff to review the City's existing tree preservation enforcement regulations in order to strengthen them and evaluate whether their effectiveness could be improved upon. The City issues citations for unpermitted removal of trees and excessive pruning, but it is limited in its ability to charge larger fines. The purpose of the presentation was to explain how existing regulations are being used differently and the City's plans to initiate ordinance amendments.

Mr. Downey stated that approximately 350 individuals were invited to attend an educational workshop at the Louise Lowry Davis Center on September 22, 2008, to inform them of the existing regulations that are being enforced. Those invited included tree cutting companies, arborists, homeowners associations, property management agencies, and gardening companies.

Mr. Limón explained that City Staff from different departments met to discuss what improvements could be made and concluded that increased fine structures were needed. Mr. Downey commented that the proposed fine structure is based on whether the individual receiving the fine is a single-family homeowner, multi-family manager, or commercial vendor. The commercial vendor would be the most responsible with the highest fine, multi-family would be moderate, and the single-family being the lowest. The proposed amounts are open for consideration. The goal is compliance and not making money; yet, Staff feels that, if there is no increase in fines, there will not be any compliance.

Public comment opened at 2:00 p.m.

Cheri Rae, local resident, commented about a new property owner in her neighborhood who removed valuable specimen trees. The result was an environmental impact to wild creatures and loss of shade. It also contributed to an increase in petty theft and crime. Ms. Rae requested high fees be levied for those who ignore proper procedures. She suggested that the money received from fines be used to mitigate the loss of trees.

Gene Tyburn, local certified arborist, commented that all unlawful tree removals are done by gardeners as “midnight pruning.” Mr. Tyburn stressed the importance of not blaming contractors and stated that he is in the tree-saving business. He suggested that the City create a task force to enforce upon those who do not have a license and are not insured. If unpermitted tree work is being done, an officer could be called to request the company’s license and a citation be written immediately.

Public comment closed at 2:07 p.m.

Mr. Limón explained a new definition for landscape “maintenance” is being considered which may impact the projects that will be reviewed by the Commission and requested input on that issue along with the structure of fines for tree removals and excessive pruning.

The Commission had the following comments and discussion with Staff:

1. The three areas that are problematic: 1) lack of education with respect to the City’s role; 2) how responsive the City is to complaints; and 3) whether an increase of enforcement is needed for trees that are not protected by ordinance.
2. Violations appear to be an ongoing, wide-spread problem.
3. These efforts would enhance the preservation of the tree ordinance. Preservation of trees should also be included in Plan Santa Barbara (General Plan Update).
4. Skyline trees of large caliber that are not within the frontyard setback should also be protected. Mature canopy trees should be protected on those properties deemed historic, structure of merit, landmark, and any commercial and institutional properties.
5. As part of the education efforts, realtors should be contacted.
6. Greater citation authority should be given and the fine should depend on the severity of the violation. More substantial fines would discourage violations.
7. Responsiveness to a violation should be quicker.
8. A methodology should be established for determining who will be reviewing proposals, whether a permit could be granted for tree cutting, and the criteria that would be used to determine an acceptable amount of pruning.

9. As part of proactive efforts in informing people, anyone with a business license in the landscaping or gardening categories should be mailed information to make them aware. The City newsletter that goes out with the utility bill could also be useful.
10. The same landscape architects group that was gathered for the water conservation ordinance could meet to discuss this subject. Representatives from different boards and commissions should be included.
11. At least one Commissioner commented that the financial burden should be on the owners of the property, since they are making the decisions. Staff responded that the ability to go after both the contractor and the owner would not be affected.
12. As to the removal of trees for health and safety issues, the language should be clarified/strengthened for a systematic approach to replace trees on a mitigation ratio of one to one.
13. The City's urban forest is of great value and should be protected. Education is the key.

(Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.)

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1210 E MASON ST R-2 Zone

(2:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-142-002
 Application Number: MST2008-00298
 Owner: Walter Lositzki
 Applicant: Manuel Contreras

(Proposal to construct a new two-story 3,135 square foot duplex on a 6,000 square foot lot. Both units are proposed to have four bedrooms and three bathrooms. Unit one is proposed at 1,508 square feet and unit two is proposed at 1,589 square feet. The proposal includes the demolition of the existing 959 square foot single-family residence and a 355 square foot garage. A total of four attached parking spaces are proposed with three one-car garages, and a one-car carport, totaling 870 square feet. The removal of one tree in the front yard is proposed to access the driveway and garage number one. A total of 778 cubic yards of cut and fill, to be balanced on site, is proposed.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that, because the project would have no potential to result in impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are necessary.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

3. 1829 STATE ST

C-2/R-4 Zone

(2:29)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-007

Application Number: MST2004-00132

Owner: Emmet J. Hawkes Family Trust

Architect: Tom Ochsner

(This is a revised project description. Proposal for a mixed-use development on two separate parcels (027-031-007 for 1829 State Street and 027-031-006 for 11 W. Pedregosa Street). The commercial portion of the project would be located on the first and second floors of the three-story building facing State Street consisting of 3,000 square feet of retail space and 1,600 square feet of office space, with one residential unit on the second and third floors. The remaining residential units would be contained in a three-story building facing Pedregosa Street. The proposed residential unit mix includes four, three-bedroom units and three, two-bedroom units. The project includes 21 parking spaces, 14 of which are open spaces to allow for shared use. In addition, an existing single-family residence on the Pedregosa Street parcel is proposed to be demolished.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 044-07.)

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect
Phil Suding, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 2:43 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued four weeks with the following comments:
1) There continues to be concern with the stair. Provide a more sculptural solution.
2) The plaster eyebrow on the east elevation is not necessary as it is redundant to the roof above, does not occur anywhere else and does not seem to integrate into the design in any way. **3)** Resolve the arch on the east elevation. **4)** Regarding the bus stop, provide a more inclusive look at the way it is located, and the use of materials and columns.
5) Landscape: **a)** Resolve the use of two types of paving by enriching the concrete with more texture and tile, particularly at entrances. **b)** The use of the counterpoints of the fruitless olive and the bronze loquat is appreciated, but it was suggested to perhaps change the canopy trees to something more interesting. **c)** More variety of plants is requested in the parkway and perhaps more raised planters on the second floor. **d)** Expand the plant palette for the second floor. **6)** The metal railing on top of the stair guardrail is not supportable. The applicant should restudy all metal railings on top of plaster walls.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4 00 E ANAPAMU ST C-2 Zone

(3:08) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-0RW
 Application Number: MST2008-00338
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Blackbird Architects

(Proposal for new Metropolitan Transit District bus stop shelter designs for various downtown locations on City sidewalks.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

Present: Ken Radtkey and Kyle Bruce, Blackbird Architects
 David Damiano, Manager of Transit Development & Community Relations, MTD

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely with the following comments:
1) The Commission appreciates the applicant's response to previous comments and the interpretation of requests, including the level of detail at the connections and the way they are expressed. **2)** The integration of the super stop at Anacapa Street with the existing sidewalk paving is acceptable. **3)** At the Anapamu Street super stop the freestanding seating pedestals are of concern. The material should relate to the wall, but not necessarily match it.

Action: Pujo/Adams, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. 128 CASTILLO ST HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(3:27) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-061-001
 Application Number: MST2008-00329
 Owner: Epic Hospitality, LLC
 Designer: Saúl Cortez Landscape Design
 Business Name: Avania Inn

(Proposal for an as-built revised landscape plan at an existing three-story hotel. This application will abate ENF2008-00295. Changes consist of planter removal, tree and plant replacements, and walkway reconfiguration. No new square footage is proposed. A Coastal Exemption is required.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Saúl Cortez, Landscape Designer

Public comment opened at 3:32 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** **Preliminary Approval and continued four weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:** 1) The variety and diversity in the plant palette is appreciated. 2) It was requested that two more King palms be added on the east side of property. 3) Study the configuration of the plantings to have a more irregular and less symmetrical appearance. 4) It was recommended that boulders be added in the parkway strip. 5) On the Yanonali Street parkway, use the same planting approach as the parkway on Castillo Street. 6) In lieu of wheel stops, it was requested that the pavement be saw-cut and a continuous concrete curb be added to increase the planter width.
- Action:** Adams/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 1528 STATE ST C-2 Zone
(3:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-012
 Application Number: MST2008-00282
 Owner: Camilla Chandler Frost Trust
 Agent: Sharon Spear
 Designer: Mark Morando
 Architect: Steve Morando
 Business Name: Divine Inspiration Gallery of Fine Art

(Proposal to permit the following as-built alterations on a 1,225 square foot commercial building: new exterior paint colors, new wrought iron railings and driveway gate, new paving material on the front porch, new landscaping, new rear entry door, new 128 square foot detached storage shed, new entry door hardware, and new light fixtures. Also proposed but not yet installed are six new window awnings in tan Sunbrella fabric. Awning signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate application.)

(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Mark Morando, Agent

Public comment opened at 3:50 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** **Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:** 1) The body paint and awning color as presented are approved. 2) It would be preferred that the original front door be reinstalled for consistency with the era and style of the building. However, since the installed front door was approved on the Consent Calendar, it may remain as it is. 3) The pickets of the ramp railings should be vertical.
- Action:** Hausz/Drury, 4/2/0. (Adams opposed because he does not support the proposed awning color and Boucher opposed because she feels the project does not relate to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 15-17 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

(4:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-004
 Application Number: MST2008-00426
 Owner: 15 W. Carrillo Street, LLC
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a Structure of Merit: "15 W. Carrillo St. Building." Proposal to construct a new exit stair, door, and landing at the rear of a two-story commercial building.)

(Second Concept Review. Project requires Historic Resource Findings. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:06 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: **Preliminary Approval and continued four weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:** 1) Consider incorporating a planter or other sculptural element at the two piers on either end of the mid-landing. 2) Simplify the cantilever of lower landing, perhaps eliminating the two corbels and use more of a landscaping solution. 3) Study the solution at the base of the plaster wall to avoid an obvious stucco weep screed. 4) The landscape plan should be coordinated with the neighbor. 5) **The following Historic Resource Finding was made:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource

Action: Adams/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:14 P.M. TO 4:19 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

8. 500 NIÑOS DR P-R/SD-3 Zone

(4:19) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-382-002
 Application Number: MST2008-00436
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Tynan Group
 Architect: Blackbird Architects
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Zoological Gardens

(This site is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Site of Child's Estate and Chumash village archaeological site." Proposal for two off-exhibit small animal holding enclosures totaling 1,912 square feet to serve as a replacement for enclosures totaling 1,814 square feet to be demolished for the Discovery Pavillion project. These new open air enclosures will be roofed but unconditioned, and will have partial walls topped with chain link fencing. Coastal Review is required for this project located in the appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Comments only: project requires a Coastal Exclusion.)

- Present: Richard Bloch, Director of Santa Barbara Zoo
Adam Sharkey, Blackbird Architects
Tyler Salmon, Tynan Group
- Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for architectural details with the comment that more landscape should be provided.**
- Action: Hausz/Drury, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 28 W CABRILLO BLVD HRC-1/R-4/SD-3 Zone
(4:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-002
Application Number: MST2008-00401
Owner: Beach Motel Partners
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
Business Name: Harbor View Inn

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "La Casa Del Mar Motel." Proposal for a new one-story, 187 net square foot pool house and grill in an existing swimming pool area at the Harbor View Inn. Planning Commission approval is requested for a Coastal Development Permit for this work in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval of a Coastal Development Permit.)

- Present: Craig Shallenberger, Architect
Mark Romasanta, Representing Ownership

Public comment opened at 4:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners find that the proposed location is acceptable? 3/2.
(Adams/Pujo opposed.)

How many Commissioners find that the footprint of the proposed building is acceptable?
5/0.

How many Commissioners could support the approach taken to the parapets, including the tile cap and corner details? 4/1. (Drury opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support the fenestration as proposed with adjustments as needed to make all the lights of the windows have similar proportions? 5/0.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**
1) The footprint is supportable as proposed. **2)** There is no desirable location for the proposed building, but the Commission recognizes that what is proposed is a functional building; therefore, the proposed location is marginally acceptable. **3)** Adjust the window configuration so that all the lights of the windows have similar proportions. **4)** Introduce more landscaping around the perimeter to soften the building wherever possible. **5)** Some Commissioners feel that the architecture of the building could be studied to relate more to the existing buildings. **6)** When the project returns to HLC, provide a photo simulation or a three-dimensional model giving an impression of the landscape and a view from the pool.
- Action:** Boucher/Drury, 5/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

10. 1601 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-008
 Application Number: MST2008-00447
 Owner: El Prado Inn, LLC
 Architect: Kent Mixon
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: El Prado Inn

(Proposal for an 800 square foot exercise and bathroom addition and miscellaneous alterations including a new *porte-cochère*, new catwalk railings, new plaster columns, new swimming pool, and a new landscape plan at an existing three-story hotel. The existing parking lot providing 66 parking spaces will be repaved and restriped to provide the required 68 parking spaces. Grading of 48 cubic yards will be balanced on site.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Present: Kent Mixon, Architect
 Brian Brodersen, Landscape Architect
 Perry Naran, Representing Ownership

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

- Motion:** **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** **1)** There is a community benefit to the change of this building, but the proposal is not a minor remodel. **2)** The architecture needs to be rethought. It should be more in the tradition of El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District and not an extension of the 1960 modern style. **3) Landscape:**
a) The sandstone around the outside edges on State Street is supportable. **b)** The existing Ficus tree should remain.
- Action:** Pujo/Adams, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

11. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

(5:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
Application Number: MST2008-00313
Owner: Richard Gunner
Architect: William La Voie
Landscape Architect: Suding Design
Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal for alterations to an existing four-story, 43,354 square foot hotel. The project will consist of the following: Change the exterior facade design, enlarge the main entry, remove and relocate two units, relocate existing bar and restaurant, relocate existing hotel rooms, replace existing swimming pool and spa, remove existing equipment shed and replace it with a new, below-ground vault, redesign the landscape and hardscape, remove the entry area drive and two curb cuts and replace with landscaping, install new sidewalk, curb and gutter on the Milpas Street side, and repave and landscape the parking area. The net increase in new floor area is 492 square feet; however there is a net decrease of 780 square feet of Measure E floor area. The project will result in a 43,191 square foot structure. Zoning modifications were granted on August 24, 2005, and will expire in 2009. The architectural design has been revised from the original project design which received Preliminary Approval under application MST2004-00052. Coastal Review is required.)

(Preliminary Approval of a revised Landscape Plan is requested. Encroachments on adjacent City Park parcel have been eliminated from proposal.)

Present: William La Voie, Architect
Phil Suding, Landscape Architect
Richard Gunner, Owner

Motion: **Preliminary Approval of the revised landscape plan and continued indefinitely with the following condition and comment:** 1) Study the inclusion of additional canopy trees on the landscape plan for the restaurant patio. 2) The applicant was encouraged to continue negotiations with the Park and Recreation Department to pursue a resolution of the landscape design previously proposed for the public area on City land bordering the project site.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 4/2/0. (Adams/Hausz opposed because it is not an acceptable solution. Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: The improvements to the public areas on City property and the maintenance plan previously proposed by the applicant would be beneficial. The HLC requests that the Park and Recreation Department provide the applicant a speedier processing for the Park and Recreation Commission to review and provide a final decision. One Commissioner suggested that the applicant provide a better transition from lawn to pavement between the private property and public land.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

12. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(6:09) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
Application Number: MST2008-00362
Owner: Adame Trust
Agent: Shelley Bookspan
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Previous project on this site has been withdrawn and this is a revised project. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Myers Cottage." Proposal to demolish 985 square feet of the non-historic portion of an existing mixed-use building (currently 162.5 square feet of commercial space and 1,399 square feet of residential duplex space) resulting in a 418 square foot commercial space and 337 square foot commercial basement storage area. Also proposed is to construct a new, three-story, 3,035 square foot mixed-use building with 448 square feet of commercial space and a 1,941 square foot, three-bedroom residential unit. This will result in an increase of 1,040 square feet for commercial use, which will require Development Plan Approval findings. Two residential parking spaces and one commercial parking space will be provided in a ground level garage, as well as one uncovered handicapped accessible parking space. The project will include permeable paving, landscaping, irrigation, and drainage improvements of the site. There will be 514 cubic yards of grading, of which 86 cubic yards will be exported off site.)

(Review of revisions to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D.)

Present: Shelley Bookspan, Historical Consultant
Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Peikert Group Architects
Robert Fowler, Landscape Architect

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the changes requested by the Commission are reflected on the revised version of the report.

Public comment opened at 6:12 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: To accept the report with the following comments: 1) Several Commissioners disagree with the finding that the building is not Landmark-Worthy. 2) Several Commissioners disagreed with the phrase "the feeling is generally of dereliction" under the subheading "Seventh: Integrity of Feeling", in the Assessment of Historic Significance, and the historian was directed to change the word "dereliction" to "disrepair." 3) Provide Staff with one complete copy so that the multiple amendments to the report are combined.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Curtis/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

13. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(6:21) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
Application Number: MST2008-00362
Owner: Adame Trust
Agent: Shelley Bookspan
Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Previous project on this site has been withdrawn and this is a revised project. This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Myers Cottage." Proposal to demolish 985 square feet of the non-historic portion of an existing mixed-use building (currently 162.5 square feet of commercial space and 1,399 square feet of residential duplex space) resulting in a 418 square foot commercial space and 337 square foot commercial basement storage area. Also proposed is to construct a new, three-story, 3,035 square foot mixed-use building with 448 square feet of commercial space and a 1,941 square foot, three-bedroom residential unit. This will result in an increase of 1,040 square feet for commercial use, which will require Development Plan Approval findings. Two residential parking spaces and one commercial parking space will be provided in a ground level garage, as well as one uncovered handicapped accessible parking space. The project will include permeable paving, landscaping, irrigation, and drainage improvements of the site. There will be 514 cubic yards of grading, of which 86 cubic yards will be exported off site.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings.)

Present: Detlev Peikert and Lisa Plowman, Peikert Group Architects
Robert Fowler, Landscape Architect

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The mass, bulk and scale continue to be acceptable. 2) Two Commissioners cannot support the tower at all; one Commissioner believes it can be "massaged" to reflect previous comments made by the Commission. 3) Revise the corbels. 4) The added tree is much appreciated; it was suggested that it be a jacaranda, an olive tree, or something with height and canopy. 5) Eliminate the lawn to comply with the new drought-tolerant guidelines.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Curtis/Hausz/Murray/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

A. 791 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-006
Application Number: MST2008-00425
Owner: Ray Mahboob
Architect: Michael Holliday
Business Name: Silvergreens

(Proposal for a new exterior wall vent and new outdoor dining furniture including tables, chairs, umbrellas, and wall mounted heaters. The furniture encroaching into the public right-of-way will require approval of an Outdoor Dining License Application from the Public Works Department.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Continued two weeks to October 15, 2008.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 201 E FIGUEROA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-028
Application Number: MST2008-00424
Owner: Wells Family Trust
Architect: Michael Holliday

(Proposal to remove an existing wood entry trellis and existing wood window grilles and install new wood shutters with wrought iron details. Also proposed is to plaster the existing adobe landscape planters and walls and repaint the exterior of this 3,500 square foot, one-story commercial building.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Continued two weeks to October 15, 2008.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 1117 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-030
Application Number: MST2008-00414
Owner: 1129 State Street
Applicant: Klaus Graf
Architect: Lenvik and Minor
Contractor: Frank Schipper
Business Name: Antica

(Proposal to remove an existing 165 square foot trash enclosure and construct a new 420 square foot trash enclosure at the rear of a commercial building.)

(First Concept Review continued from September 17, 2008.)

Continued two weeks to October 15, 2008.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

D. 1722 STATE ST C-2/R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-021
Application Number: MST2005-00455
Owner: 1722 State Street Investors, LLC
Applicant: Howard Gross
Architect: Jan Hochhauser

(Proposal for a three story commercial mixed-use development consisting of ten residential condominium units with approximately 8,400 square feet of commercial development. The residential units would consist of six 3-bedroom units and four 2-bedroom units. One 3-bedroom unit would be affordable to middle-income. Parking to accommodate 55 cars will be located in a subterranean parking garage. The existing 7,200 square foot commercial structure on this 28,875 square foot lot will be demolished as part of this proposal.)

(Review After Final of proposed change of approved fountain tile and sandstone cap on garden wall.)

Final Approval as noted on Sheet A3.0. Statuary eagle on main tower is not approved.

NEW ITEM

E. 1123 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2008-00427
Owner: 1129 State Street
Applicant: D.A. Levy & Associates
Architect: RCE Construction & Engineering
Contractor: Burdg, Dunham & Associates
Business Name: Anthropologie

(This structure is on the City's list of potential historic resources and is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources: "San Marcos Court Building." Proposal for front and rear entry door changes in a retail store. At the front elevation, the project will entail relocating a pair of entry doors and enclosing the recessed area with windows to match existing. There will be an increase of 52.5 square feet of Measure "E" commercial square footage. Proposed signage to be reviewed under a separate application by the Sign Committee.)

Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following condition and comment: 1) The City Historian shall review alterations to be consistent with the previous Historic Structure/Sites Reports and to verify that it is not an adverse impact to the historic resource. 2) The door hardware is to be reviewed on the Consent Calendar.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

F. 16 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-044
Application Number: MST2008-00055
Owner: Masonic Properties Santa Barbara, Inc.
Applicant: Gil García
Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Masonic Temple." Proposal to relocate an existing ATM, replace a storefront window, add new plant pots and light fixtures, and paint a colored band on the exterior of the office of Santa Barbara Bank & Trust.)

(Review After Final of new awnings at the E. Carrillo Street elevation.)

Continued two weeks under new Master Application with the following comments: 1) Need more information on the awning material. 2) Item should be reviewed under the address of 24 E. Carrillo Street.

FINAL REVIEW

G. 928 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-032
Application Number: MST2007-00615
Owner: Llewellyn Goodfield Jr., Trustee
Applicant: Cearnal Andrulatitis
Business Name: Former Pier One Tenant Space

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Rogers Furniture Building." This is a revised project description: Proposal to remove an existing 4,375 square foot interior mezzanine and stairwell and the replacement of an existing elevator and stairs with new elevator and stairs at the rear of the building. Also proposed is a new secondary exit stair at the northeast corner of the building and construction of 3,706 square feet of new second story floor area. The existing north and south parapet wall will be raised to the height of the existing tile roof. The rear facade improvements include the relocation of the secondary exit door, restoring the existing rear door, and the addition of seven new windows.)

(Final Approval of materials details is requested.)

Final Approval with the following conditions: 1) The plaster-to-brick relationship at the north elevation, as well as at the front corner, shall be resolved in a future Review After Final hearing on the Consent Calendar. 2) One 36 inch box giant bird of paradise shall be planted in the parking lot planter.

FINAL REVIEW

H. 310 & 402 E ORTEGA ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-015
Application Number: MST2008-00299
Owner: City of Santa Barbara Public Works Department
Applicant: Bill Davis, City Project Engineer

(Proposal for installation of a 384.3 kilowatt-peak (kWp) photovoltaic solar panel project on eight City corporate yard buildings. The installation will consist of 1,830 modules, flush mounted on roofs. Three electrical equipment enclosures are proposed on grade at the exterior of the buildings.)

(Final Approval of the landscape plan details is requested.)

Continued two weeks to October 15, 2008.

**** THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:51 P.M. ****