



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 9, 2008

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
 KEN CURTIS – Present  
 MICHAEL DRURY – Present  
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:36 p.m.  
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present until 6:36 p.m.  
 ALEX PUJO – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

ROGER HORTON – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

STELLA LARSON – Present at 4:00 p.m.

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 1:53 and again 2:54 p.m. to 3:47 p.m.  
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present  
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Present  
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

| <b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b><br>(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details) |           |   |
|--|-----------|---|
| <b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>  | Required  | <u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)<br><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.<br><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the <u>time of submittal &amp; each time plans are revised</u> .<br><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)<br><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.<br><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable. |
|  | Suggested | <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.<br><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.<br><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.  |
| <b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>  | Required  | Same as above with the following additions:<br><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.<br><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.<br><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. <u>Plans</u> to include street parkway strips.   |
|  | Suggested | <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.<br><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.<br>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.   |
| <b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>   | Required  | Same as above with the following additions:<br><u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.<br><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.<br><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.<br><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.<br><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.  |

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The time the item was reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would have been postponed indefinitely. If an applicant canceled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval.
- \*\* **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if someone needs special assistance to participate in a meeting, the Planning Division would need to be contacted at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting would enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday; or by email at [sgantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov](mailto:sgantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov). Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Thursday, July 3, 2008, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable by Friday, July 11<sup>th</sup>, on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking Online Meetings.

**GENERAL BUSINESS (1:30):**

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 25, 2008.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 25, 2008, with corrections.**

Action: Adams/Murray, 8/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe; with the exception of Item E, 1212 De La Vina Street, which was reviewed by Robert Adams.**

Action: Boucher/Curtis, 8/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Chair Sharpe introduced Michael Drury as the newly appointed HLC Commissioner.
2. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, on behalf of the City Staff, recognized William La Voie's years of commitment as a citizen volunteer on the Historic Landmarks Commission. He was first appointed to the HLC in 1994 and served until the year 2000. He was reappointed in 2002 and, overall, he served over 12 years on the Commission. Mr. La Voie shared his architectural and historical expertise with Staff and applicants in the community, and his active and strong voice on historic preservation issues was always appreciated. Mr. Limón personally thanked Mr. La Voie for his attendance at various Planning Commission and City Council appeals representing the HLC in a strong and eloquent manner. Chair Sharpe added that Mr. La Voie also served on the Airport Design Subcommittee and the Highway 101 Subcommittee, where he spent much time sharing his knowledge. Mr. La Voie will continue working on the update of El Pueblo Viejo District Design Guidelines.

3. Commissioner Naylor announced she would be leaving at 6:00 p.m.
4. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
  - a) Commissioner Naylor would be stepping down from Item 12, 518 State Street, and Commissioners Adams and Sharpe would be stepping down from Item 13, 210 W. Carrillo Street.
  - b) Item 8, 914 Santa Barbara Street, was postponed indefinitely; and Item 9 referenced at the 200 Block of State Street was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

**Motion: To postpone Item 8 indefinitely and Item 9 two weeks at the applicants' request.**

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 8/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.
  - c) The HLC was reminded that the Planning Commission will review the revised Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel on July 17; Commissioner Pujo had agreed to attend that hearing to represent the Commission, but now will be unable to attend. Robert Adams has agreed to represent the Commission. Also, the Planning Commission's approval of the proposed project at 800 Santa Barbara Street has been appealed and will be heard by the City Council at the September 30, 2008 meeting. Staff requested that someone represent the HLC at that hearing.

Commissioners Adams and Pujo agreed to represent the Commission at the appeal for the 800 Santa Barbara Street project.
  - d) The State Office of Historic Preservation will award the Historic Landmarks Commission a Resolution of Commendation on Friday, July 25, at 9:00 a.m. in the Presidio Chapel. Mayor Blum will attend and the HLC is invited.
  - e) An election of officers will be conducted at the next HLC meeting.

#### E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Boucher reported on the Designations Subcommittee that met in the morning. Representatives from the San Roque School and the law firm of Price, Postel & Parma LLC attended the hearing for the property at 2300 Garden Street (formerly St. Anthony's Seminary). The Historic Structures/Sites Report will be prepared by Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant. There seems to be an inclination in support for the designation of the structure as a City Landmark by the property owner.
2. Commissioners Adams and Hausz attempted to attend the City Council's Ordinance Committee on Tuesday, July 8, regarding Zoning Ordinance updates, but the Committee did not meet. They wanted to speak about the HLC concerns with regard to no setback requirement for residential areas in mixed-use projects and commercial properties. Commissioner Hausz commented that it would be helpful to clearly state in the update to the Zoning Ordinance that design review boards have the discretion, considering the context, that a certain amount of setback is required for the residential areas in mixed-use projects. The HLC is also concerned about the lack of requirement of a minimum amount of commercial square footage in mixed-use projects.

Mr. Limón stated that the goal is to clarify the Zoning Ordinance section so that there is consistency among all sections. Although Staff will be introducing recommended amendments of the Zoning Ordinance to the City Council on July 29, Staff will be returning to present updated recommended amendments involving new project compatibility findings at the August 19 Ordinance Committee meeting. That would be the time for the HLC members to express their concerns regarding residential setbacks.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

1. Commissioner Boucher requested an update on the entry door violation reported for Rockin' Yogurt located at 620 State Street. Staff will follow-up with the City enforcement officer.
2. Commissioner Hausz requested an update on the violation reported for the plastic drapes and heaters for Stateside Restaurant at La Arcada, 1114 State Street. Staff will research the status of the enforcement case.

### **ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 130 S ALISOS ST

R-3 Zone

**(1:49)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-212-014  
 Application Number: MST2005-00447  
 Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust  
 Agent: Dave Tabor  
 Designer: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal for one new two-bedroom 1,005 square foot residential condominium to be built above two new two-car garages and attached to an existing three-plex on a 16,686 square foot lot in the R-3 Zone. The site is currently developed with four, two-bedroom, residential apartments, three in an existing two-story triplex and the fourth unit as a one-story, single family unit. The proposal includes alterations and small additions to the four existing units and condominium conversion. The proposal will result in a total of five residential condominiums and will involve a two-story four-plex [each unit with two-bedrooms ranging in size from 1,005 to 1,129 square feet] and a one-story three bedroom unit at 1,244 square feet. The project will include 10 covered parking spaces in five new two-car garages. This includes the to two new two-car garages to be attached to the four-plex and three new detached two-car garages. The project requires review by the Planning Commission for a Condominium Conversion and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that the potential for buried cultural resource remains being encountered during construction ground disturbance is considered to be very low to negligible.

**Motion:** To accept the report as presented.  
**Action:** Hausz/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

2. 231-235 E COTA ST C-M Zone

**(1:50)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-031  
Application Number: MST2008-00068  
Owner: Alano Club of Santa Barbara  
Architect: Vadim Hsu  
Contractor: Daniel Michaelson

(Proposal for a comprehensive remodel and tenant improvements of the site and building including accessibility improvements, new exterior exit stairs, re-roofing, repainting, replacement of windows, recommission of the second floor by reconfiguring the parking layout, and a new landscape plan including the removal of 11 trees.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**  
Action: Hausz/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

3. 1022 LAGUNA ST R-3 Zone

**(1:51)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-022  
Application Number: MST2008-00213  
Owner: David and Laura Correia  
Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to rebuild an existing 238 square foot garage like-for-like, construct a 408 square foot addition, and add a new front and rear porch on an existing 817 square foot single-family residence. This project will result in a development of 1,225 square feet.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that the potential for buried cultural resource remains being encountered during construction ground disturbance is considered to be very low to negligible.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**  
Action: Hausz/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

4. 617 BRADBURY AVE C-2 Zone

**(1:51)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-122-006  
 Application Number: MST2007-00559  
 Owner: Leed Santa Barbara, LLC  
 Architect: Design to the Nines

(Proposal to demolish an existing 458 square foot single-family residence and construct a new two-story mixed-use LEED Certified development of 1,604 square feet of commercial space on the ground floor and two, one-bedroom condominium units on the second level on a 5,000 square foot lot in the C-2 zone. Residential unit A is proposed at 1,085 square feet and residential unit B at 1,070 square feet. The proposed project would include roof gardens, solar panels, wind turbines, and permeable pavement for driveways and sidewalks. Also proposed is a shared bicycle storage area and bathroom for LEED Certification points. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Approval Findings for new commercial square footage.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project would not have the potential to result in significant impacts on either prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no mitigation measures are required.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**  
 Action: Boucher/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

5. 316 CASTILLO ST C-2 Zone

**(1:52)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-232-015  
 Application Number: MST2008-00038  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Genealogical Society  
 Architect: Gary Jensen

(Proposal to construct a 2,709 square foot one-story library addition, new patio cover at the interior courtyard, and make interior alterations. Also proposed is a new screen wall to be constructed around an existing electrical panel next to the driveway. The project will result in 6,995 square feet of development on this 20,040 square foot parcel.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane and Michael H. Imwalle, MacFarlane Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because the proposed project should have no effect on extant prehistoric or historic archaeological resources, no further archaeological investigations are recommended at this time.

**Motion: To accept the report as submitted.**  
 Action: Hausz/Adams, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:53 P.M. TO 2:08 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING**

6. 209 E PEDREGOSA ST

E-1 Zone

**(2:08)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-382-009  
Application Number: MST2008-00074  
Owner: Gary Ricks  
Designer: Joaquin Ornelas

(This is a revised project description in that the interior finished attic space has been increased from 1,110 square feet to 1,414 square feet. This single-family dwelling is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Palmer House." Proposal to add six roof dormers and an internal stairway to create a second floor consisting of a 1,414 square foot master bedroom suite. Also proposed is a new exterior stairway from the master suite to the backyard, and to lower hedge heights adjacent to the driveway and uncovered parking space to 3.5' maximum. The proposed project will result in 6,602 square feet of development on a 33,750 square foot parcel, which is 136% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio the project is also required to meet a Built Green two-star rating or equivalent.)

**(Project requires Environmental Assessment.)**

Present: Joaquin Ornelas, Agent

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the building is an unusual example of the craftsman style. The previous project initially proposed for this site by a previous architect did not trigger the need for the preparation of a Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR). All the proposed changes were at the rear of the house, which had received many alterations so that the historic integrity was no longer intact.

Ms. Gantz stated that the hedge is over the height allowed by the City Ordinance, but comments were received from neighbors that they would like the hedge to remain as-is on Santa Barbara Street. The zoning/enforcement supervisor has determined that the hedge on Pedregosa Street can remain. The hedge on Santa Barbara and East Pedregosa Streets would be acceptable in the current height; except that, for safety reasons, the hedge will need to be lowered per Zoning Ordinance to 3 ½ feet around the parking space and driveway for a distance of ten feet on both sides.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would agree that the preparation of a Historic Structures/Sites Report is needed? 9/0.

Public comment opened at 2:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, stated that the house is shielded from Santa Barbara and Pedregosa Streets by a high hedge. If the hedge is lowered to the City Ordinance level, the project would be very visible from the street.

Public comment closed at 2:28 p.m.

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) Provide an Historic Structures/Sites Report. 2) Provide a complete site plan indicating all trees on site. 3) In order to assess the visual impact, provide a digital 3-D model.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

## 7. 1200 BLK STATE ST

**(2:31)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 99-MSC-ART

Application Number: MST2008-00321

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Santa Barbara County Arts Commission

(Proposed installation of eight sculptures to be affixed to existing sculpture pads in various locations on State Street from Cota Street to Victoria Street. The installation is scheduled to be in place from August 9, 2008 through November 15, 2008.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is submitted.)**

Present: Rita Ferri, Visual Arts Coordinator, County of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about the design of the signage labels, their frames and stands.

Public comment closed at 2:58 p.m.

Ms. Ferry responded that the stainless steel plaques were previously reviewed and approved.

**Motion: Final Approval with the comment that a serif font shall be used on the plaques.**

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

## 8. 914 SANTA BARBARA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-292-031

Application Number: MST2008-00269

Owner: State of California

Designer: Kelly-Ondre Construction

Contractor: Dan George

Business Name: Alhecama Theater Site

(This site is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: "Festival Arts School of Santa Barbara". This is a revised project description. Proposal to add a new handicap ramp and to replace two aluminum awnings with a single wood awning. Also proposed on a different building on the site is the installation of a photovoltaic system consisting of 21 panels covering an area of 266 square feet. The photovoltaic installation would be entirely hidden from public view by an existing parapet.)

**(Revised Preliminary Approval is requested. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**This item was postponed indefinitely at applicant's request.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

## 9. 200 BLK STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-026  
 Application Number: MST2008-00250  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Agent: Jessica Grant

(Proposed installation of fiber optic cable in existing conduits and proposed new trenches to link parking lots 2, 3, 4, 5, 10, 11, 12 and 13. Also proposed is the installation of new revenue control equipment at City Parking Lots 2 through 5 and 7 through 13 and four above-ground electronic control equipment cabinets at various intersections along State Street. These involve the rights-of-way in the following locations: 200 - 600 Block of State Street, 00 Block of Ortega Street, 400 - 600 Block of Anacapa Street, 00 W. to 00 E. Block of Carrillo Street, and 900 - 1300 Block of Chapala Street.)

**(Third Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at applicant's request.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

## 10. 631 GARDEN ST

C-M Zone

**(3:06)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-152-028  
 Application Number: MST2007-00089  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: Renee Brooke  
 Architect: Paul Poirier

(Proposal for the interior and exterior remodel of an existing 3,746 square foot building and an existing 1,443 square foot building including the following improvements: Provide ADA compliant restrooms for new community arts workshop use. Provide new overhead door with man door and transom window in three existing open bays. Install new doors and windows in other existing openings. Site improvements to include replacing existing gates and fencing with new brick walls and wrought iron gates, changes to the parking layout to accommodate future City Water Department facility improvements, partial replacement of existing landscaping and new additional landscaping, and minor grading to allow for ADA accessibility. No additional floor area will be added.)

**(Review After Final of gate designs and minor site wall revision.)**

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect  
 David Shelton, Designer

Public comment opened at 3:27 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the designs are wonderful, but he questioned if and how they fit into El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 3:28 p.m.

**Motion:** **Preliminary Approval of Review After Final for the gate designs and continued four weeks for final approval of details with the following comments:** 1) The designs were found to be appropriate to El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. 2) It was preferred that the material not be painted. The bare metal should be coated, oiled or preserved in some way, allowing the material to be revealed through it. 3) Children and pets should be considered in the scale of the openings. 4) The lettering shall be a maximum of ten inches. 5) The purple color is not supportable. 6) A plaque telling the mythological story of each gate design is not supportable.

Action: Adams/Pujo, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**Motion:** **Final Approval of Review After Final for the revision to the perimeter wall.**

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:47 P.M. TO 4:09 P.M. \*\***

### **IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

11. 801 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

**(4:09)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013

Application Number: MST2006-00154

Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust

Architect: Vadim Hsu

Business Name: Pirhana Restaurant and Lounge

(This is a revised project description. This is a Structure of Merit: "Las Tiendas Building." Proposal to construct a 1,080 square foot third story addition and add 607 square feet of additional basement floor area for mechanical and accessory use in an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The project consists of alterations and additions comprised of two new kitchens, two bars, 961 square feet of third story outdoor patron seating, and new patron seating in the basement, which was formerly used as a commercial kitchen and storage. The project will result in a structure that is a maximum of 35'-0" tall at the roof ridge line. The project requires revised Development Plan Approval findings.)

**(Second In-Progress Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

Present: Vadim Hsu, Architect

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the model provided by the applicant is appreciated. He stated that, from a distance, the opening at the end of the arcade on the rooftop facing De La Guerra Street looks empty.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** **1)** The element of the third story massing (previously referred to as the tower) is successful as presented. **2)** The vibrancy of the awning colors is appreciated, but study the awning support to avoid sagging. **3)** It was suggested that the opening of the arcade be hipped to solve the problems noted by the Commission. **4)** The rooftop equipment should be below the top of the tile parapet. **5)** Accommodate an irrigation system for the planting areas and pots. **6)** All the capitals facing De La Guerra Street should be the same width.
- Action:** Hausz/Pujo, 8/1/0. (Boucher opposed.) Motion carried.

### PRELIMINARY REVIEW

12. 518 STATE ST C-M Zone  
**(4:49)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-046  
 Application Number: MST2005-00477  
 Owner: Charles and Georgetta M. Craviotto Trust  
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(The project consists of a proposal to construct a new two-story mixed-use building with 2,487 square feet (net) of commercial space on the first floor and two apartments [one studio unit and one (1) one-bedroom unit] on the second floor, on a 3,544 square foot parcel. The existing 302 square feet (net) of non-residential space would be demolished. The project will require 2,185 square feet of non-residential square footage from the minor and small addition categories and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification to allow no onsite residential parking.)

**(Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 038-07.)**

- Present:** Jim Craviotto, Owner  
 Brian Cearnal and Jeff Hornbuckle, Cearnal Andrulitis, LLC

Public comment opened at 4:57 p.m.

Patricia Hiles, local resident, expressed concern that no parking spaces are being proposed for the two residential units.

Public comment closed at 5:01 p.m.

- Motion:** **Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks for an in-progress review with the following comments:** **1)** Sliding doors are not traditional in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Provide alternate solutions for the entry design and the sliding doors. Study possibly incorporating three pairs of French doors. **2)** The ironwork is a nice detail and it is greatly appreciated. **3)** It was suggested that plant pots be placed on the balcony floor at the residential unit entries.
- Action:** Hausz/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

13. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

**(5:09)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
 Application Number: MST2007-00554  
 Owner: Old Town Mall  
 Owner: Steve Delson and Ian Brown  
 Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 32 residential condominium units [27 market rate and 5 affordable]. A modification to allow the 5 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

**(Sixth Concept Review. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 013-08.)**

Present: Steve Yates, Gerhard Mayer and Ryan Mills, Architects

Public comment opened at 5:15 p.m., reopened at 5:40 p.m. and again at 6:18 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented about Building 2 at the corner and that its one-story element should be eliminated from the project. Since the corner of De La Vina and Carrillo Streets is very important, he would like to see the corner enhanced.

Mr. de Forest commented about Building 3 that it would be appropriate for the building to be all one color. He stated that El Paseo, which is the most successful *paseo* in Santa Barbara, is completely white.

Public comment closed at 5:16 p.m., closed again at 5:42 p.m., and again at 6:19 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would prefer color variations as opposed to texture variations to differentiate the buildings? No vote.

**Motion:** **Continued four weeks with the following comments:** 1) Do not rely on color to break up the buildings and rely instead on design to make the differentiation. One color could be used as a unifying factor for the entire development.

**As to Building 1A:** 2) The massing and the details are coming along satisfactorily. 3) Resolve the mixture of the types of arches on the east elevation. 4) The base of the arch at the south elevation should be wider in perception than the two pairs of windows above, so that the entry composition is visually more comfortable. 5) On the third floor of the south elevation, study centering the top floor fenestration within the mass of the ridge.

**Building 1B:** 6) The use of rustic workable shutters on the east elevation is a good feature. 7) The whimsical features flanking the roof at the east elevation should be carried consistently throughout. 8) The design of this building is not as successful as the design of Building 1A. Study providing integration, unity, and simplification; but, differentiate with some personality either with color, texture or through design, resulting in a common theme. 9) The third floor roof deck railings on the south elevation should be integrated better. 10) The west elevation is not as successful as the east elevation. It should be less harsh, better integrated, and more poetic in its design.

**Building 2:** 11) This is an important building because of its corner location, and it should be enhanced. 12) The building is successful in that the bigger part of the building was organized with a break in the middle. 13) Some Commissioners feel that the one story element appropriately breaks up the mass of the façade, but its importance could be diminished by having it pulled back so that it does not project out as much. 14) The overly differentiation of elements contradicts the intent of breaking up the building. It would be more successful if only certain areas were broken up.

**Building 3:** 15) Consider the lighting in the garages to be integrated into the ceiling, instead of having it hanging. 16) Provide more of a perception of mass at the garage opening supporting the masonry above on the south elevation. 17) Some simplification of the second story above the garage is desired. 18) The bold chamfer at the south elevation was well received. 19) Shorten the length and regularity of the balconies at the East A and East B elevations to lessen the dreaded “motel effect.” 20) The building should not have over-ornamentation because the building itself is quite simple. 21) A finer treatment of the arcade on East A, as suppose to the width of the columns between, will make it seem more open and less massive.

**Building 4:** 22) The exterior stair that is not ornamentation, but manages to ornament the building just the same, is appreciated. 23) Study a solution to the conflict between the desire for simplification and articulation; and plainness versus ornamentation. 24) Although none of the building’s elevations will be seen from the street, some in and out of the mass, without the loss of floor space, was suggested. 25) The top two floors that have exactly the same floor plan should be expressed as such on the outside of the building. 26) The over-differentiation and use of the painted brick is a problem. 27) The mass and punctuation within the mass is more successful with continuing proportions of the Spanish Mediterranean style.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down.) Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

14. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

**(6:37)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2007-00140  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(Multiple buildings are designated as Structures of Merit. Proposal for a revised Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel. The project involves a proposal for the elimination of tennis courts, the construction of valet parking above and operations facility below [Group L]; a swimming pool with fitness center below [Group E]; reapproval of Cottages 27 and 28 [Group N]; and, construction of six new cottages [Mission Village] with partial underground parking on the northeast portion of the property [Group M]. Phase 1 of the project [MST99-00305] is complete; portions of Phase 2 of the project [previously reviewed under MST2005-00490] including Groups E, L, and N, require Planning Commission approval and are being reviewed with this Phase 3 of the project with Group M, which requires Planning Commission approval as well.)

**(Ninth Concept Review focused on Group L, Operations Facility/Valet Parking.)**

Present: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers  
 Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant  
 Henry Lenny, Architect  
 James Jones, Representing Ownership  
 Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 7:02 p.m.

1. Jan von Yurt, neighbor, commented that he and some neighbors were in support of the underground parking, but is disappointed that the proposal has changed. He expressed concern with the setback modifications being requested by the applicant, the impact of construction on the neighborhood, and the traffic impacts that would result from the proposed valet parking.
2. Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that having a wall around the parking lot with hedges would solve problems addressed and that a higher wall may block much of the noise. He commended the owners of the property for retaining the historical aspects of the site. Mr. de Forest requested that historic sandstone be used to replace the modern stone brick pillars.

Public comment closed at 7:16 p.m.

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:**  
**1)** Lower the parking at the beginning of the ramp by several feet, continue with a reasonable slope for drainage, and end it with at least a five foot high wall at the lowest end to reduce headlights shining onto Alvarado Street from the parking lot. **2)** The Commission would not object to having open parking at this site. **3)** A 60 foot long screen wall would be adequate to mitigate the impact of automobiles. **4)** The break in the walls with skylights is acceptable. **5)** An increase in lighting should not be included. **6)** The noise produced by the valet parking should be reduced as much as possible. **7)** A plaster wall in lieu of sandstone would be more appropriate and would save money, which could then be redirected to lowering the parking. **8)** Keep intact as many pruned eucalyptus trees as possible on the north side of the property. Plant canopy trees around the perimeter of the property, in particular on Alvarado Street.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

## CONSENT CALENDAR

### NEW ITEM

- A. 11 W VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone  
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-001  
 Application Number: MST2008-00303  
 Owner: 1221 Victoria Court  
 Agent: Lenvik & Minor  
 (Proposal to enlarge an existing electrical equipment enclosure. There will be no new floor area.)

**Final Approval with the condition that all exposed conduit and piping above the existing enclosure be removed and reinstalled out of sight.**

**FINAL REVIEW****B. 1019 STATE ST C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-017  
Application Number: MST2008-00217  
Owner: Ray Mahboob  
Architect: Gregory Rech, Architects West  
Business Name: American Apparel

(Proposal to replace an existing, one-story commercial storefront and move the entry doors closer to the street, resulting in a 134 square foot addition.)

**(Final Approval of the project is requested.)**

**Postponed indefinitely at applicant's request.**

**FINAL REVIEW****C. 1732 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-001  
Application Number: MST2008-00122  
Owner: Brian P. Gregory  
Designer: Christopher De Rose

(This structure is a City Landmark: "Huning Mansion." Proposal for a new 660 square foot detached one-story garage comprised of two parking spaces of 500 square feet and 160 square feet of accessory workshop area. Two Zoning Modifications will be required for encroaching into the interior yard setback and the required open yard area on this 19,884 square foot parcel developed with an existing 4,603 square foot single-family residence.)

**(Final Approval of gate and driveway details is requested. Project must comply with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 042-08.)**

**Postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****D. 209 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-012  
Application Number: MST2005-00266  
Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency  
Agent: Marck Aguilar  
Business Name: Amtrak Passenger Station

(This is a City Landmark: "Southern Pacific Railroad Station." Proposal to place a rail car on existing rail spur at the west end of the existing rail station.)

**(Review After Final of proposed changes including eastward extension of rails, relocation of one streetlight pole, reconstruction of concrete curb, one cubic yards of grading at public viewing area, relocation of brass placard, relocation of existing railcar stop, and relocation of one existing accessible parking space.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted, including the addition of disabled-person accessible crosswalks to railcar display site; with the exception of the relocation of one existing accessible parking space, which is no longer part of this proposal.**

**CONTINUED ITEM**

E. 1212 DE LA VINA ST P-R Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-004  
Application Number: MST2008-00247  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Keven Strasburg

(Proposed restriping and upgrade of an existing parking lot which serves the Spencer Adams Lawn Bowl Club. This parking lot will be brought up to City standards with new interior finger planters, landscaping, irrigation, directional arrows, and signage. There are 27 existing parking spaces and one ADA parking space is proposed to be taken away. Additional work includes improvements to existing stairs from Anapamu Street and the introduction of a bioswale in an existing planter.)

**Final Approval as noted on Sheet 3.**

**\*\* THE FULL BOARD MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:37 P.M. \*\***