



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 14, 2008

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present
 DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Absent
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:36 p.m.
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
 ALEX PUJO – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON – Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STELLA LARSON – Present until 2:45 p.m.

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 3:15 p.m. and again at 3:56 p.m.
 KATHLEEN KENNEDY, Associate Planner – Present from 2:35 p.m. to 3:38 p.m.
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present until 3:56 p.m.
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the <u>time of submittal & each time plans are revised</u> . <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The time the item was reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It was suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff would have notified applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence was required. If an applicant was not present, the item would have been postponed indefinitely. If an applicant canceled or postponed an item without providing advance notice, the item would be postponed indefinitely and would not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission Approval.
- ** **Decisions of the HLC may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if someone needs special assistance to participate in a meeting, the Planning Division would need to be contacted at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting would enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday; or by email at sgantz@SantaBarbaraCA.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on Friday, May 9, 2008, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. A live broadcast can also be seen via personal computer by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable by Friday, May 16th, on computers with high speed internet access by going to www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking Online Meetings.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:31):

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 30, 2008.

Motion: To review the April 30, 2008, minutes at the next HLC meeting scheduled for May 28, 2008.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0. (Curtis/Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Jacobus made the following announcements:

- a) Item 9, 710 Anacapa Street, was postponed at the applicant's request. In its place, Item E, 915 State Street, from the Consent Calendar would be reviewed by the Full Board.
- b) Item G, 224 E Islay Street, on the Consent Calendar was referred to the Full Board for review.
- c) The Pearl Chase Society would be conducting its annual historic home tour on Sunday, May 18th, as part of Historic Preservation Month.
- d) Paula Westbury, local resident, submitted letters expressing opposition to each project being reviewed. The letters will be placed in the individual project files for reference.

2. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a) The review of the Consent Calendar on May 28th will be held in the Fishbowl Conference Room at 630 Garden Street instead of the regular location. The Full Board meeting will take place at the regular location in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.
- b) Commission Curtis would be absent from the meeting.
- c) The City is currently recruiting for two Architectural Board of Review Landscape Architect vacancies. The deadline for submittal of applications is May 19th, but may remain open until the vacancies are filled. In the interim, Staff is looking into the possibility of setting up assistance for the review of landscape plans or providing focused training for current board members. The Board may also ask for assistance from landscape architects participating in other boards and commissions.
- d) Mr. Limón provided the Commission copies of handouts he obtained at a recent American Planning Association conference with information about historic preservation and sustainability conflicts. Mr. Limón plans to meet with other City planners along with commissioners that attended the conference to share information in order to debrief the boards and commissions. Copies of additional CEQA related information have been ordered for the HLC to use as a reference.
- e) The Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines along with the streetlight standards have been updated and will be reviewed in draft form by the Commission to be discussed at a future meeting.

Commissioner Hausz stated that a summary of changes will be included with the updated draft.

- f) Staff is attempting to solve issues related to electrical equipment on private property and in the public right-of-way. Southern California Edison has been contacted with respect to developing installation standards as to how and where meters are being proposed for placement. Mr. Limón requested that a commission member be appointed to work with Staff in order to provide information to electrical contractors for electrical installations.

Commissioner Hausz volunteered to represent the Commission in those efforts.

With respect to the public right-of-way, SCE is being informed as to when the City needs to be consulted on the placement of underground vaults and electrical transformers.

3. Commissioner Naylor announced she would step down from Item 1 and Item 12, 1704 Paterna Road and 928 State Street, respectively.
4. Commissioner Sharpe announced that the HLC spring/summer get together will be held on Sunday, June 8th. Commissioner Boucher added that she will circulate a sign-up sheet for Commissioners to indicate what they would like to share.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Commissioner Adams reported that the Airport Subcommittee asked him to provide feedback with respect to the proposed landscape plan and he found that it is heading in a good direction.
2. Commissioner Adams reported on the Wine Cask Subcommittee that has been working on restoring the courtyard and reported that the construction of the approved plan is progressing.
3. Commissioner Boucher reported that it has been discussed as to whether contributions for the art that will be installed on State Street in August should be limited strictly to local artists.
4. Commissioner Boucher reported that the Designations Subcommittee met in the morning.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Chair La Voie stated that the Paseo Chapala landscape plan being displayed on the second floor of the building does not appear as approved by the HLC and requested that Staff investigate.

NEW ITEM – Referred from the Consent Calendar

224 E ISLAY ST

E-1 Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-003
 Application Number: MST2008-00216
 Owner: Robert W. and Marti Strong
 Contractor: Charles Breiticode

(Proposed re-roof of an existing residence on the Potential Historic List. Replace existing dimensional asphalt shingle with Carriage House Shingles (Georgian Brick Color).)

Present: David Burry, Home Roofing
 Charles Breitkopf, General Contractor

Motion: Final Approval of shingles in Carriage House Shangle Brownstone color.
Action: Pujol/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 1704 PATERNA RD

E-1 Zone

(1:58) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-184-008
 Application Number: MST2008-00208
 Owner: Eileen Haber

(Proposal to remove an existing pergola, add a new foyer, and construct a new enclosed sun porch and guest bedroom. Also proposed is to enlarge the dining room and kitchen, add a new "mud room," bathroom and entry at the rear elevation, and to repair and restore the exterior and interior portions damaged by fire on the second floor.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Fermina B. Murray, Consultant Historian.)

Present: Eileen Haber, Owner
 Fermina Murray, Consulting Historian

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that, although this property was severely damaged by fire, an Historic Structures/Sites Report was requested. Mr. Jacobus mentioned that an architect has been hired by the applicant and the plans will be reviewed by the Commission at a later date. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

First

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (Naylor stepped down. Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

Second

Motion: To begin the process to place the structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 6/0/0. (Naylor stepped down.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 125 S CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ M-1/SD-3 Zone

(2:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-029

Application Number: MST2007-00274

Owner: Redevelopment Agency of the City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Renee Brooke

(Request for review of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report for future development of the site, the scope of which is unknown at this time.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane and Michael H. Imwalle, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)

Present: Michael Berman, City Environmental Analyst

Staff comments: Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, stated that that the report has been reviewed and has been found to be consistent with the City MEA (Master Environmental Assessment document). Mr. Berman commented that Dr. Glassow reviewed and agreed with the first draft of the report.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

3. 1978 MISSION RIDGE RD A-1 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00375
 Owner: Farrokh Nazerian
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(This structure is eligible to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a potential City Landmark. Proposal to convert an existing 400 square foot two-car garage into a home gym and construct a new 920 square foot four-car garage. The proposed project will require a Zoning Modification to construct more than 750 square feet of garage floor area on this 2.5 acre parcel currently developed with a 3,600 square foot single-family residence and 2,400 square feet of accessory space located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Consideration of a structure to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as being eligible for City Landmark status.)

Present: Farrokh and Sally Nazerian, Owners
 Henry Lenny, Architect

A letter was received from Robert and Elizabeth Leslie, neighbors, expressing concern over 1920s and 1930s homes that are being replaced with "modern" buildings, uncontrolled development, and the loss of the city's small town rustic feeling.

Motion: To add this property to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 1978 MISSION RIDGE RD A-1 Zone

(2:11) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00375
 Owner: Farrokh Nazerian
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(This structure is eligible to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a potential City Landmark. Proposal to convert an existing 400 square foot two-car garage into a home gym and construct a new 920 square foot four-car garage. The proposed project will require a Zoning Modification to construct more than 750 square feet of garage floor area on this 2.5 acre parcel currently developed with a 3,600 square foot single-family residence and 2,400 square feet of accessory space located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Review of revised Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Farrokh and Sally Nazerian, Owners
 Henry Lenny, Architect
 Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that a Historic Structures/Sites Report was requested because Staff believes that the house is landmark worthy. Staff agrees with the report's conclusion that the addition of the garage and the alteration of the garage doors would not have a negative impact because it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Public comment opened at 2:16 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he had requested that research be done about the landscaping designer and said he was pleased to see that, instead of destroying the garage, another use was being proposed.

Katherine Calise, neighbor, spoke in support of the project.

Public comment closed at 2:20 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted disagreeing with the finding that this structure qualifies only as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1978 MISSION RIDGE RD

A-1 Zone

(2:22)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-083-001

Application Number: MST2006-00375

Owner: Nazerian, Farrokh Nazerian

Architect: Henry Lenny

(This structure is eligible to be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as a potential City Landmark. Proposal to convert an existing 400 square foot two-car garage into a home gym and construct a new 920 square foot four-car garage. The proposed project will require a Zoning Modification to construct more than 750 square feet of garage floor area on this 2.5 acre parcel currently developed with a 3,600 square foot single-family residence and 2,400 square feet of accessory space located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Zoning Modification.)

Present: Farrokh and Sally Nazerian, Owners
Henry Lenny, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the location is a logical one for the proposed four car garage since the old garage is being converted, but suggested that a Spanish revival style be considered for the new garage.

Public comment closed at 2:27 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following positive comments: 1) The size and location of the new garage are supportable because: a) It would provide a covered parking for the owners' vehicles. b) It is done in consistency with the existing site development (i.e., the stone encasement). c) It is proposed to be located at an inconspicuous part of the site, buried into the site, and would not be visible from a neighboring property. 2) The Commission appreciates that the removal and moving of the olive trees is being done in a sensitive manner. 3) Provide a landscape solution to the entry court.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

6. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:39)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00296
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish an existing 3,078 square foot cottage (#12 "Overlook") and to construct a new 3,250 net square foot Spanish style cottage at El Encanto Hotel. Regrading and landscaping will also be included in this project.)

(Review of Letter Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This report addresses the impacts from the demolition of Building 12 and the design and construction of a new Building 12 within the historic setting of Building 11.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historical Consultant
 Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff is concerned over the spatial relationship between the new Building 12 and the existing Building 11. He requested that the issue of the proximity be discussed by the Commission. Staff has read the report and generally agrees with its recommendations and conclusions.

Public comment opened at 2:43 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the overall impression is that every Cottage is being replaced and expressed concern that everything is being torn down. Mr. Jacobus responded that the cottages being torn down have been determined to not have historic significance.

Public comment closed 2:44 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

7. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00140
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. This is a revised Project Description: Proposal for a revised Master Plan for El Encanto Hotel. The project involves the construction of valet parking and operations facility below (Group L); a swimming pool with fitness center below (Group E); reapproval of Cottages 27 and 28 (Group N); and, construction of six new cottages (Mission Village) with partial underground parking on the northeast portion of the property (Group M). Phase 1 of the project (MST99-00305) is complete; portions of Phase 2 of the project (previously reviewed under MST2005-00490) including Groups E, L, and N, require Planning Commission approval and are being reviewed with this Phase 3 of the project with Group M, which requires Planning Commission approval as well.))

(Sixth Concept Review. Review of Group L.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission approval.)

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Henry Lenny, Architect
 Minh Pham, Representing Ownership
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:06 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that it now seems that the parking will no longer be hidden and commented that the parking lot needs be surrounded by walls so that it is out of public view.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the proposed construction of a valet parking above grade (as part of Group L) is not acceptable.

Action: Sharpe/Naylor, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: Chair La Voie commented that this project should have been publicly noticed with the new project description and revised Master Plan. He requested that an accurate description of the particular portion of the project being presented to the Commission be specified on future agendas.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:19 P.M. TO 3:28 P.M. ****

FINAL REVIEW

8. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2008-00211
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

(Proposal to demolish cottages 22, 23, & 24 of Group M, Mission Village, including foundations, patios, decks, stairs, garden walls and retaining walls. No new development is proposed with this application.)

(Final approval is requested.)

(Environmental Assessment is required.)

Present: Trish Allen, SEPPS
 Minh Pham, Representing Ownership
 Kathleen Kennedy, City Associate Planner

Public comment opened at 3:35 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that demolition permits without some idea of what is being envisioned to replace what is being demolished would not be appropriate.

Public comment closed at 3:36 p.m.

Motion: **Continued two weeks for the applicant to return with a site plan indicating the following:** 1) Identify all trees, and provide the species and pictures of any significant tall trees in the demolition area. 2) Show all the landscape material that are four inches and greater in diameter, particularly identifying the plant material to be removed.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 710 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
 Application Number: MST2006-00312
 Owner: Carlos Adame
 Agent: Lisa Plowman
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is a revised proposal for a 2,989 square foot of new construction consisting of a two-story, mixed-use building, and a trash enclosure at the rear of a 5,846 square foot lot, which includes a three-bedroom residential condominium and a 490 square foot commercial condominium space on the first floor. The project includes the preservation of 450 square feet of an existing 1,562 square foot single family residence which is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Myers Cottage) which will be relocated nine feet to the west and converted to a commercial condominium. Parking is provided in a two-car residential garage, one covered non-residential parking space, and one uncovered commercial accessible parking space. The existing stone site wall will be preserved.)

(Fifth Concept Review.)

(Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map, Modifications, Development Plan Approval Findings, and approval of the Condominium Development.)

This item was withdrawn by the applicant and the project will be resubmitted under a separate application as a new project.

FINAL REVIEW – Referred from Consent Calendar

915 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(3:38)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-039
Application Number: MST2007-00545
Owner: Hughes Survivor`s Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Business Name: Former Boon Mee Tenant Space

(Proposal to remodel the front and rear facades of an existing commercial building. The alterations include enclosing the existing entry area resulting in a 42 square foot addition, and a new trash enclosure within the existing building footprint at the rear of this 3,727 square foot commercial building.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

Present: Adam Cunningham, Designer/Project Manager
David Hughes, Owner

Motion: **Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:** 1) The drawings should be revised showing a more accurate representation of the design sketch that was previously approved by the Commission. 2) Should the owner wish to demolish the non-visible portions of the building, the Commission would have no objection and the preliminary approval would still stand.

Action: Hausz/Adams, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed. Naylor stepped down. Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. 914 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:48)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-047

Application Number: MST2007-00541

Owner: Redevelopment Agency of the City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Victor Garza

Architect: Paul Poirier

(Proposal to demolish five arcades at City Parking Lot #2 and replace with enhanced landscaping and planters at the W. Cañón Perdido Street elevation. The existing raised planters on the north and east elevations are proposed to be clad in sandstone. On the north elevation, new landscaping will include four Sweetshade trees, one Queensland Umbrella tree, two Giant Birds of Paradise, one Jacaranda tree, and nine Tree Ferns. One eight foot tall King Palm tree will be removed. On the east elevation, one Cork Oak tree will be replaced with a more appropriate specimen, and six Tree Ferns and six Pygmy Date Palms will be planted. On the south elevation, two Eucalyptus citriodora trees will be replaced.)

(Third Concept Review. Request for a separate demolition permit approval due to structural safety concerns.)

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect
 Jessica Grant, Project Planner/Transportation Department
 Victor Garza, City Parking/TMP Superintendent

Chair La Voie announced the ten calendar day appeal period to the City Council.

Motion: Final Approval of the demolition permit and Preliminary Approval of the proposed scheme as presented.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 2/6/0. (Adams/Boucher/Hausz/La Voie/Murray/Naylor opposed. Curtis absent.) Motion failed.

Substitute

Motion: Final Approval of the demolition permit with the condition that a revised scheme shall be resubmitted within six months that complies with the City's lighting and architectural standards in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Action: Pujo/Sharpe, 7/1/0. (Pujo opposed on the grounds that the condition is an excessive requirement. Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comments: The demolition permit is for the structurally compromised arcades. At the November 14, 2007, HLC meeting, the Commission made the following comments, which were included in the motion: 1) The landscaping plan was good, but the architecture was not and the HLC requested more architectural solutions to improve this problem. 2) It was suggested that, instead of spending money on the removal and reconstruction of the arcades, the money should be spent in other architectural enhancements. 3) Provide balcony details. 4) Simplify the painting details. 5) Keep the level of the lighting in the fixtures as low as possible.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

11. 210 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(4:09)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025

Application Number: MST2007-00554

Owner: Old Town Mall

Owner: Steve Delson and Ian Brown

Architect: Conceptual Motion

(This is a revised project. Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of 18,547 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new three-story mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 12,851 square feet (net) of commercial space and two levels of underground parking with 122 parking spaces. There will be a total of 32 residential condominium units (27 market rate and 5 affordable). A modification to allow the 5 bonus density affordable units is requested. The project site is a 1.17 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The previous proposal under MST2005-00772 has been withdrawn.)

(Preliminary Approval of the project is requested.)**(Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution # 013-08.)**

Present: Steve Yates and Brian Mills, Architects

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that the lower plaza be rectangular.

Public comment closed at 4:15 p.m.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) The Commission prefers Option B of the north elevation. 2) It was recommendation that the arch be refined, particularly as it relates to the corner and to the eave. 3) Option B satisfies the requested mitigation for the northern portion of the building.*

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 6/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe stepped down. Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

Staff comment: Preliminary approval was not requested, only an In-Progress Review of the north elevation of the project.

* On March 19, 2008, the Commission stated that, regarding the impact to the potential historic resources to the north, a mitigation of the mass of that portion of the building would be an adequate mitigation of any impact to the neighborhood to the north.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:20 P.M. TO 4:33 P.M. ****

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

12. 928 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(4:33)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-032
Application Number: MST2007-00615
Owner: Llewellyn Goodfield Jr., Trustee
Applicant: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Rogers Furniture Building." This is a revised project description: Proposal to remove an existing 4,375 square foot interior mezzanine and stairwell and the replacement of an existing elevator and stairs with new elevator and stairs at the rear of the building. Also proposed is a new secondary exit stair at the northeast corner of the building and construction of 3,706 square feet of new second story floor area. The existing north and south parapet wall will be raised to the height of the existing tile roof. The rear facade improvements include the relocation of the secondary exit door, restoring the existing rear door, and the addition of seven new windows.)

(Revised Preliminary Approval of a revised project is requested.)

Present: Adam Cunningham, Designer/Project Manager

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented that he would like to be assured that no change to the State Street façade is being proposed because it is a very important historical part of the building and this is one of the buildings that contribute to the ambiance on State Street.

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The design of the parking lot elevation should be more integrated. 2) The following details should be corrected as follows: a) The exterior doors should be recessed per Detail 13 on page A09.5. b) Sheet metal over flashing should never be placed in visible locations; therefore, Details 12-8 are not acceptable. c) Detail 15 is not acceptable as shown on Sheet A09.5. d) There is concern that, on Details 3 and 12, the vents in the corner's moldings are too visible. e) Place a note on Detail 9 to include a mortar to cover exposed flashing.

Action: Hausz/Adams, 6/0/0. (Murray/Naylor stepped down. Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

Staff comment: Historic Resource findings will need to be made once preliminary approval of the project is given.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

13. 1903 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(4:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-012
 Application Number: MST2008-00070
 Owner: Harrison Bull
 Architect: Charles McClure, Landscape Architect
 Business Name: Re/Max

(Proposal for approval of an as-built landscape plan and lighting to abate ENF2006-00615. Approval of as-built signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee.)

(Third Concept Review.)

Present: Charles McClure and Michelle Hochrein, Landscape Architects
 Adam Setter, Co-Owner

A letter was received from Kathiann Brown, local resident, expressing concern that the proposed plan falls short of all the mandatory measures noted on the Compliance Statement for Low-Water Using Landscape Design.

Motion: Final Approval as submitted with the following condition and comment: 1) The proposed magnolia trees shall be placed in 24 inch boxes and the remainder as specified on the plans. 2) The flag pole lighting appears to be pre-existing and the sign and sign's lighting are not part of this approval.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

14. 2201 LAGUNA ST E-1 Zone

(5:11) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-005
 Application Number: MST2008-00200
 Owner: Old Mission Santa Barbara
 Applicant: David Wilks

(This is a City Landmark, State Historic Landmark, and is on the National Register of Historic Places: "Old Mission Santa Barbara." Proposal to demolish an existing 580 square foot shed at the rear of the property and rebuild a new 30 square foot trash enclosure and 343 square foot storage shed on a 13 acre lot in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. An existing adobe wall will be retained and incorporated into the new trash enclosure, and the new storage shed will have a stucco finish with a tile roof.)

(Second Concept Review. This was continued two weeks on April 30, 2008, from the Consent Agenda to the Full Board.)

(Requires Environmental Assessment, Historic Resource findings, and findings for Alterations to a City Landmark.)

Present: David Wilks, General Manager
 Kristina Foss, Museum Director

- Motion:** Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar for applicant to return with an alternative plan for a non-stucco storage shed.
- Action:** Sharpe/Adams, 8/0/0. (Curtis absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- A. 721 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-026
Application Number: MST2002-00405
Owner: Chadwick Pacific, LP
Applicant: Bermant Development Company
Architect: Peikert Group Architects
Architect: Michael Holliday

(Proposal to demolish an existing 9,788 square foot commercial building and six residential units totaling 2,700 square feet, and to construct 9,788 square feet of commercial space, 29 residential units(including 12 bonus density units) totaling 43,357 square feet, and a 25,533 square foot on-grade parking structure.)

(Review After Final of outdoor patio dining tables, chairs, umbrellas and heaters to be placed outside of The public right-of-way.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- B. 721 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-026
Application Number: MST2002-00405
Owner: Chadwick Pacific, LP
Architect: Peikert Group Architects
Applicant: Bermant Development Company
Architect: Michael Holliday

(Proposal to demolish an existing 9,788 square foot commercial building and six residential units totaling 2,700 square feet, and to construct 9,788 square feet of commercial space, 29 residential units(including 12 bonus density units) totaling 43,357 square feet, and a 25,533 square foot on-grade parking structure.)

(Review After Final of change to electrical transformer screen as viewed from De La Guerra Street.)

Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Augment the landscaping to show substantial landscaping at entry gap in screen. 2) Provide a photo to show what part of the architecture the proposed screen is to match.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 1528 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-012
Application Number: MST2008-00187
Owner: Camilla Chandler Frost
Designer: Melgoza- Odale, Inc.
Agent: Sharon Spear

(Proposal to replace two existing 4' x 6' windows with 8' x 5' windows and the front and rear entry doors in an existing one-story commercial building.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Final Approval as submitted.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

D. 219 EQUESTRIAN AVE R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-122-013
Application Number: MST2005-00127
Owner: Berkus Family Partnership, LP
Architect: Keith Rivera
Landscape Architect: Earthform Design

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,683 square foot duplex and construct a new, one-story 784 square foot one-bedroom residence with a 792 square foot non-habitable cellar and a 438 square foot two-car carport on a 3,444 square foot lot. A modification was granted to provide less than the required 10% open space.)

(Continued Review After Final of proposed changes to approved landscape plan including hardscape material, rooftop potted plants, hedge material, patio arrangement, and other planting materials.)

Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that the dimondia ground cover between stones be continued to within 12 inches of garage doors.

FINAL REVIEW

E. 915 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-039
Application Number: MST2007-00545
Owner: Hughes Survivor`S Trust
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP
Business Name: Former Boon Mee Tenant Space

(Proposal to remodel the front and rear facades of an existing commercial building. The alterations include enclosing the existing entry area resulting in a 42 square foot addition, and a new trash enclosure within the existing building footprint at the rear of this 3,727 square foot commercial building.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

This item was referred to the Full Board.

NEW ITEM

F. 2255 MODOC RD E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-021-002
Application Number: MST2008-00168
Owner: Santa Barbara High School District
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer

(This is a City Landmark: "LaCumbre Junior High School." This is a courtesy review of a proposal to install two new portable classrooms totaling 960 square feet, remove two existing portable classrooms at a different location, and install 63 linear feet of 3' high black vinyl fencing.)

(Comments only; Courtesy review of City School Facility.)

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

G. 224 E ISLAY ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-112-003
Application Number: MST2008-00216
Owner: Robert W. and Marti Strong
Contractor: Charles Breiticode

(Proposed re-roof of an existing residence on the Potential Historic List. Replace existing dimensional asphalt shingle with Carriage House Shingles (Georgian Brick Color).)

This item was referred to the Full Board.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:28 P.M. ****