



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 11, 2007

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present
 ALEX PUJO, *Vice-Chair* – Present until 5:00 p.m.
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
 KEN CURTIS – Present
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:51 p.m.
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
 DONALD SHARPE – Present
 DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
 ROGER HORTON – Absent
 STELLA LARSON – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on July 6, 2007 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:32):

- A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 27, 2007.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of June 27, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 4/0/4. (Curtis/Murray/Naylor/Sharpe abstained.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Pujo/Murray, 7/0/1. (Curtis abstained.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) She welcomed Ken Curtis as the newest member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, who is filling the ninth HLC seat vacated by Vadim Hsu in January.
- b) Commissioner Naylor would be stepping down from Item #9, 28 W. Cabrillo/1 State Street.
- c) Commissioner Steve Hausz would be late to the meeting.
- d) Reminded the Commissioners of the Special Joint Worksession on July 18th, and stated Ms. Weiss would be speaking in more detail about that meeting.

2. Bettie Weiss, City Planner, gave a briefing on the purpose, objectives and format of the Special Joint Worksession with City Council, Planning Commission, Historic Landmarks Commission and the Architectural Board of Review that will take place on Wednesday, July 18, 2007, at the Cabrillo Arts Pavilion from 8:30 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.

3. Mr. Pujo announced he would be leaving the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Mr. Adams reported on the Awards Subcommittee and stated that the award plaques are ready to be presented (the Braille Institute is to receive the George Washington Smith Award and the Lockwood De Forest Award; and Barbara Lowenthal will be given the Saint Barbara Award). Ms. Gantz agreed to find out if the awards ceremony can be placed on the City Council agenda in early to mid-august.
2. Ms. Boucher reported on the Events Subcommittee and stated that Mr. Pujo agreed to be the host of this year's HLC summer get-together. The HLC members agreed to set the date as Saturday, August 18th.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 911 & 913 LAGUNA ST C-2 Zone
(1:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-012
Application Number: MST2007-00210
Owner: Mr. and Mrs. Nick Tomkins
Architect: Ray Ketzel

(Proposal to demolish two single-family residences totaling 1,676 square feet and construct a new, three story, single-family residence of 3,374 net square feet including a 287 square foot basement mechanical room, a 273 square foot attached garage and a 228 square foot carport. The project will require overall site grading of 260 cubic yards. Zoning modifications are requested for the proposed garage to encroach into the front and interior yard setbacks, the proposed carport to encroach into the front yard setback, for portions of the second floor roof to encroach into the interior yard setback, and for the third floor to encroach into the interior yard setback. The proposal has a floor-to-lot area ratio of .67 on this commercially-zoned, 5,031 square foot parcel.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that, because there is at least a moderate potential of exposing buried cultural resources during construction ground disturbances, an archaeological monitoring program is recommended to be conducted while construction excavation and grading occurs.

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m.

Paula Westbury, local resident, commented that the house should be saved without any demolition.

Public comment closed at 1:52 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report as presented with Dr. Glassow's comments that an archaeological monitoring program is to be conducted while construction excavation and grading occurs.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Curtis abstained. Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST R-3 Zone

(1:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00364
 Owner: Ruth E. Mudry Trust
 Owner: Casas Del Parque, LLC
 Applicant: Blankenship Construction
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct four, two-story residential condominium units. Three of the units would be approximately 1,000 square feet and one unit would be approximately 1,100 square feet. Each unit would have an attached two-car garage for a total of eight parking spaces on the 10,048 square foot parcel. The proposal includes demolition of all existing structures and there would be 140 yards of cut and fill grading outside the building footprints. The project will require Planning Commission approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that, although Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations, Environmental Analyst Debra Andaloro is recommending that the report be accepted with the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources but without the recommendation for archaeological monitoring. Reasons for this recommendation: The report revealed that the potential for an archaeological deposit buried in alluvial soil at this location is evaluated as low; four archaeological surveys were completed adjacent to, directly across from, and below the parcel with negative results; no indication of a prehistoric or historical archaeological site or artifacts older than 50 years was observed within the parcel and none have been previously recorded within a quarter mile of the parcel; and, no significant historic archaeological remains or artifacts are anticipated to occur subsurface within the parcel based on its building history.

Public comment opened at 1:55 p.m.

Michael Seligman, resident, commented about the importance of keeping the old character of the town and that some of the buildings represent California bungalows that are gradually being destroyed to construct high rise buildings. He stated he does not believe that, if artifacts are found, the investor or developer would stop construction due to the financial impacts, so that it would be better to have monitoring during construction.

Paula Westbury, resident, commented that the site should be protected and not be excavated.

Lowell Dabbs, resident, provided pictures to give the HLC an idea of the property's context, although he was made aware that the proposed project is not being reviewed at this time.

The Chair recognized receipt of petitions handed to him by Ms. Westbury.

Public comment closed at 2:05 p.m.

Motion: To accept the report with the standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archeological resources; no monitoring is required.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/3. (Curtis/Hausz/Naylor abstained.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 300 W ORTEGA ST DUMMY Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-073-0RW
 Application Number: MST2007-00239
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jim Colton

(Demolish and replace Ortega Street Bridge over Mission Creek. Transitions above and below the bridge would be installed.)

(Review Historical Resources Evaluation Report prepared by Peggy Beedle, Applied Earthworks, Inc.)

Present: Jim Colton, City Engineering Department
 Peggy Beedle, Architectural Historian

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the report is in the State format and includes an analysis of various buildings. The report concludes that there is a potential for a National Registry Historic District on the Lower Westside where this property is located. The area is also scheduled to be surveyed by the City.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Pujol/Adams, 8/0/1. (Curtis abstained.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone

(2:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00750
 Owner: Emily and Blake Jones
 Applicant: Peter Becker

(Proposed changes to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 611 square foot addition, 1,373 interior remodel, and conversion of 2,079 square feet of basement to habitable space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a 350 square foot pool cabana, and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would remain unchanged. A modification is requested to allow a portion of a driveway retaining wall to encroach into the front yard setback.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Pam Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that most of the house's original features are intact. The report concludes that the house is landmark-worthy and that the cumulative changes are not going to have a negative impact on the historic resource.

Public comment opened at 2:22 p.m.

Paula Westbury, resident, objected to building a pool where proposed because she believes the site was an Indian burial ground.

Public comment closed at 2:22 p.m.

Motion: **To accept the report with the following condition and comments:** 1) Mitigation measure 1, on page 46, shall be removed from the report where it states to “step the roof of the addition down to differentiate the addition from the existing wing.” 2) The Commission would recommend that the house be placed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources in view of the report’s conclusion that the property is landmark-worthy. 3) Staff is to review the plan drawings and the required mitigation measures specified in the report to determine which have and which have not been met by the applicant.

Action: Naylor/Murray, 8/0/1. (Curtis abstained.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

5. 1811 EL ENCANTO RD E-1 Zone

(2:29) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00750
 Owner: Emily and Blake Jones
 Applicant: Peter Becker

(Proposed changes to a site comprised of two existing single-family residences. A remodel and addition is proposed for one of the residences including a 611 square foot addition, 1,373 interior remodel, and conversion of 2,079 square feet of basement to habitable space. New structures would include a 750 square foot detached garage, a 350 square foot pool cabana, and a new 20' x 50' swimming pool. The other residence would remain unchanged. A modification is requested to allow a portion of a driveway retaining wall to encroach into the front yard setback.)

(Consideration of a structure to be added to the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.)

Present: Blake Jones, Owner

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the property owner has waived his right to the 60-day waiting period required prior to Staff sending the notice of the Commission’s hearing to consider placing the property on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources.

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, stated that the proposed front seems to be a drastic landscape change with the fencing and new stairs down to the garden.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Motion: To place the property on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and to place the property on the City's list of Structures of Merit. The Commission encourages the property owner to pursue City Landmark status.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 8/0/1. (Curtis abstained.) Motion carried.

Staff note: Placing the property on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources will give the HLC purview of the project's design review.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

6. West Beach Pedestrian Improvement Project HC/P-R/SD-3 Zone
 (2:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00122
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Conceptual Motion Company
 Designer: Jeannette Candau

(Proposed enhancements to pedestrian linkage between Stearns Wharf and the Harbor including pedestrian crossings across Cabrillo Boulevard to the beachfront, new benches, lighting, trash/recycle cans, news racks, repairs to existing sidewalks, landscaping, improvements at Sea Landing, and viewing stations on West Beach. The project will require coastal review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

Present: Jeannette Candau, City Redevelopment Agency
 Steve Yates and Neil Dipaola, Conceptual Motion

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, explained that this parcel is in both the ABR's and the HLC's jurisdiction, with the majority of the work in HLC's jurisdiction. In order to ensure consistency, Staff is requesting that the HLC be the primary design review body. The development process for this project will be:

- Comments from HLC with the project forwarded to the Planning Commission for approval of the Coastal Development Permit;
- The project will return to HLC for Preliminary Approval and continued to ABR Consent for concurrence with the HLC preliminary approval;
- The project will then be forwarded back to the HLC for Final Approval;
- Lastly, it will return to ABR Consent for Final Approval.

Ms. Gantz also stated that there was an error made on the mailing list for the mailed notice for this project and some of the neighborhood organizations that would have been included were inadvertently omitted. Ms. Gantz explained that the Commission could still proceed with the Concept Review today, but no action could be taken by the Commission anyway because the Archaeological Resources Report is still to be submitted and the environmental assessment is not complete. The project will be re-noticed for the next review and will include the neighborhood organizations.

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m.

Katie Mickey, local resident, stated that it is important that a barrier be created between the pedestrian walkway and the bicycle pathway. She commented that the sea wall may have a structural value considering the potential rise in the ocean level as the climate changes. Ms. Mickey spoke about the Blue Line project endorsed by the City Council to bring attention to that possibility. She reported that there have been occasions in Santa Barbara's history when the sea level did flow into Cabrillo Boulevard.

Eric Schwartz, local resident, commented that two veterans have been killed crossing Cabrillo Boulevard and that the proposal is a good plan to get pedestrians across the street safely and facilitate a better flow of pedestrians in the entire area. The plan is well thought-out and useful with the exception of the impact on pedestrians that would flow on to the Class I Caltrans bike path. Mr. Schwartz read from the Caltrans Highway Design Manual, first paragraph, under Topic 1003 - Design Criteria. He mentioned that others use the bike path, such as skateboarders and surries, increasing the probability of causing injury to pedestrians. He highlighted the benefits of *not* having dual use by pedestrians and bicycles on the same path. He quoted Section 21966 of the California Vehicle Code where it states that "no pedestrian shall proceed along a bike path where there is an adjacent pedestrian facility available." If openings were cut into the sea wall to allow a flow of pedestrians into the bike path, the problem would worsen. There should be a plan that does not violate the law, includes signage enforcement, accommodates and keeps pedestrians separated, and keeps the flow rate criteria in mind.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, commended the designers of the project for removing the "viewing plazas" from west beach and for providing safe crosswalks. He would like to see that the historic sea wall be preserved and commented that it is an important part of Santa Barbara.

Public comment closed at 3:05 p.m.

Additional Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, commented that an exact construction date for the current sea wall could not be found in the historical records, but it was built some time after the 1920s. It is Staff's opinion that it is not historical.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments, suggestions, and/or questions:

1. There was consensus supporting the design.
2. Urged the applicant to provide more planting and a more natural and less formal approach.
3. Most of the Commissioners support breaking the sea wall; although, true to the Secretary of Interior's Standards, would also like to see a differentiation in the material of where the sea wall is broken.
4. Supports the effort to separate pedestrian from vehicular traffic (both bicycle and automobile).
5. Directed applicant to provide an enhanced pedestrian experience along Cabrillo Blvd. by adding landscaping along the sidewalk.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 1115 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(3:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-019
Application Number: MST2007-00330
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Agent: Victor Garza

(Proposal to remove an existing 85 foot tall, 26" diameter Lemon Gum Eucalyptus tree located behind City Parking Lot 7 next to the Central Library and adjacent to the rear of the La Arcada building. The tree is proposed to be removed due to root damage to a retaining wall.)

Present: Victor Garza, City Parking/TMP Superintendent
Bill Spiewak, Consulting Arborist
Timothy Downey, City Arborist

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m.

The following people expressed support for the removal of the Eucalyptus tree:

1. Trevor Martinson, local architect representing La Arcada, reviewed the history of La Arcada Building on the property and stated that, at the time of the parking lot construction in 1968/1969, the only wall in place was the La Arcada retaining wall. He mentioned that the issue is that the City has built on top of La Arcada's wall, although not reviewed or approved by a design review board. He stated that the wall is in imminent danger of collapsing. Until it is fixed, La Arcada would like to have this issue before the City Council in order to seek indemnification for anything that may happen during the time it takes to have the wall repaired properly. He stated that two exits from La Arcada Building need to use the passage where the tree is located and that public exit way requirements must be met.

The following people expressed opposition to the removal of the Eucalyptus tree:

1. Laurel Clayton, local resident, suggested rebuilding a much stronger retaining wall in front of the wall that exists to make it sturdier, rather than sacrifice the gorgeous tree.
2. Kellam De Forest, local resident, stated the HLC has historically been in favor of preserving significant trees and commented every effort should be made to shore up the retaining wall or build around it in order to preserve this tree.

Chair La Voie acknowledged receipt of four letters from the public expressing opposition to the removal of the Eucalyptus tree:

1. Barry Semler, local resident, wrote that concrete retaining walls can be replaced, but the amount of years it takes for any tree to achieve 85 feet in height clearly qualifies this tree as a part of the history of the community. Suggested looking into an alternative solution and urged the Commission to consider the historic value of the irreplaceable vegetation that has greatly contributed to the community's beauty.
2. Christopher and Laurel Clayton, local residents, wrote that the removal of the tree would do nothing to restore the structural integrity of the retaining wall that would, in all likelihood, be further damaged during the tree removal process and probably require complete reconstruction. She believes cutting the tree would not be cost-effective and would be environmentally unfriendly behavior. The tree enhances the aesthetic visual quality and assists in maintaining the air quality.

3. Jamie O'Toole, local resident, wrote that the tree is still healthy and offers shade in a suffering hot world that is quickly becoming denuded of trees at an alarming rate. He suggested finding a sustainable way to fix the retaining wall that will not be destructive to the environment.
4. Wanda Weston, local resident, wrote that removing the tree for the reasons given is shameful because these trees are not replaceable and that street and wall adjustments can be made.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** 1) The Eucalyptus tree is to be retained and the applicant should provide a design for stabilization of the retaining wall and solve other requirements, such as adequate access to and exiting from the building. 2) The Commission considers the tree a character defining element of the paseo; it is a skyline tree that contributes to the environment of the library, courthouse, paseo, and parking garage. It provides a mitigation for the unfortunate elevation of the parking garage and La Arcada Building.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

Commission comment: It is the Commission's desire that none of the trees be removed and that the landscaping in the paseo be enhanced.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 1535 SANTA BARBARA ST R-3 Zone
 (3:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-241-005
 Application Number: MST2007-00266
 Owner: The Unitarian Society of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Unitarian Church." Proposal for a partial interior remodel of three existing buildings, accessibility and upgrading of architectural finishes, replacement of 11 windows in the Parish Hall, enclosing the 310 square foot loggia on the east side of the Parish Hall, adding a new terrace with new 506 square foot storage room below, landscape and hardscape improvements in the Jefferson Hall Courtyard, and exterior remodel of Jefferson Hall. Also proposed is to install a 56 square foot elevator in the Blake Building and to add new landscape and hardscape in The Parish Hall Courtyard.)

(ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT COMPLETED.)

Present: Detlev Peikert and April Palencia, Peikert Group Architects
 Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
 Rob Fowler, Landscape Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian, disclosed that, although a member of the congregation and on the church's building committee, she does not consider it to be a conflict of interest because she has been the voice of the historic preservation side of the project.

Chair La Voie requested that Staff speak to the City Attorney's Office to determine whether it would be considered a conflict of interest for Alexandra Cole, as a member of the congregation, to prepare the Historic Structures Report for the church. Staff is to report back at the next HLC meeting.

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, stated that a Historic Structures Report for this project would be most necessary. It would answer questions of the impacts of raising the courtyard, the enclosing of the arcade, the original design and position of the courtyard fountain, and the location of all the mature trees. He would like to have determined exactly who built the accessory buildings.

Paula Westbury, local resident, commented there should not be any digging on the property, is opposed to expanding the church, and requested that the rock on the side garden be left in its current place.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to allow the preparation of a Historic Structures Report, in particular to include the enclosure of the loggia, the changes to the surroundings, and the functioning of the property.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW – CONTINUED

9. 28 W CABRILLO BLVD & 1 STATE ST HRC-1/R-4/SD-3 Zone

(5:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-002
 Application Number: MST2007-00276
 Owner: Beach Motel Partners
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
 Business Name: Harbor View Inn Spa

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "La Casa Del Mar Motel." Proposal to convert an existing 1,812 square foot hotel conference room to a guest spa and 668 square feet of exterior improvements including a new Jacuzzi spa and privacy wall at an existing patio at the Harbor View Inn. Staff Hearing Officer approval for three zoning modifications will be required for the Jacuzzi to be located within 15 feet of the front lot line; existing overheight hedges and new wall to be located within ten feet of a front lot line; and, to add a new door within the required 30 foot front yard setback on this 67,122 square foot parcel in the non-appealable jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ZONING MODIFICATIONS.)

This item was heard out of order.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment that the Commission would support the modification for encroachment contingent upon the following: 1) Provide an artistic embellishment of the wall. 2) Include landscaping in the design. 3) Applicant is to check on the legality of the existing hedge height.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 6/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Naylor stepped down. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

10. 31 W CARRILLO ST

C-2 Zone

(4:27) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-001
 Application Number: MST2007-00004
 Owner: Due West, LLP
 Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.
 Architect: Backen Gillam
 Designer: Ann Kale & Associates
 Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio
 Business Name: Hotel Andalucía

(Proposed door and window changes to the south elevation and *porte-cochère* and new light fixtures, awnings, and planters on the south and west elevations. Also proposed is to change out existing tile and add new tile in the *porte-cochère* and the addition of four decorative flags over the vehicle entry on Carrillo Street.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

This item was heard out of order.

Present: James Gillam, Architect
 Derrik Eichelberger, Landscape Architect
 Ann Kale, Lighting Designer

Straw votes: How many Commissioners could support the combination of colors for the awnings as proposed? 4/4. (Pujo/Hausz/Sharpe/Boucher opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support the awnings to be only in the black cherry color? 1/7. (All but Commissioner Naylor opposed.)

Motion: **Continued indefinitely with the following comments:** **1)** The flags' two colors as proposed are acceptable. **2)** The proposal is acceptable with the following changes: **a)** The valance should be straight on the arched awnings. **b)** There should be pebbled glass in the canopy. **c)** The color of the proposed iron of the awnings is to match the color of the ironwork that is existing on the building. **d)** It was recommended that the glass and the light fixtures be opalescent. **e)** Provide additional ironwork details and larger cut sheets of selected items. **f)** Requested CAD level drawings at the next review.

Action: Hausz/Sharpe, 8/0/1. (Curtis abstained.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

11. 1214 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(5:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips Metsch Sweeney Moore Architects
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources "Granada theatre and offices." The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of The 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Continued Review After Final of marquee design.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04.)

Present: Fernando Duarte, Duarte Designs
 Steve Metsch, Architect
 Monisha Adnani, Project Manager
 Trent Lyon, Representing Ownership

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would find the proposed clear light bulb for the lighting acceptable? 8/0.

How many Commissioners would prefer to see the lighting as LED? 0/8. (All opposed.)

Motion: **Continued indefinitely for applicant to return with details of the marquee and the following comments:** 1) The lighting shall be changed to a fiber optic system. 2) The recommended color is dark bronze, pending seeing it in a large sample on the building. 3) The changes to the composition of the raised decoration are acceptable as proposed.

Action: Murray/Hausz, 5/1/2. (Naylor opposed. Boucher/Curtis abstained. Pujo absent.)
 Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

12. 636 STATE ST C-M Zone

(5:41) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-001
Application Number: MST2007-00257
Owner: Gallina Family Trust
Applicant: Derrick Prudigalidad
Architect: Kenneth Gruskin

(Proposal for exterior alterations to include a complete demolition and rebuild of the streetscape facade, finishes, doors, and windows. Proposed new signage to be reviewed by the Sign Committee under a separate permit.)

Present: Mike Robinson, Representing Derrick Prudigalidad

Motion: **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) Provide a proposal for the restoration of the storefront to the earliest condition that can be found. 2) Give a better indication on the drawings of what is existing and what is new. 3) Use a more traditional color and material palette. 4) Brick pavers would not be supportable. 5) The drawings should be reflective of traditional detailing and not something contemporary or so simplistic. 6) Having a drywall panel dropping down behind the transoms is strongly discouraged. 7) The Commission would not support gray, blue-gray or black colors, except for minor accents, ironwork, or fixtures.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 8/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

Commission comment: The proposed signage is questionable, although not under the purview of this Commission.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(5:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST2007-00296
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Applicant: El Encanto, Inc.
Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to demolish an existing 3,078 square foot cottage (#12 "Overlook") and to construct a new 3,250 net square foot Spanish style cottage at El Encanto Hotel. Regrading and landscaping will also be included in this project.)

(This proposal was last heard as a Discussion Item on September 6, 2006, under MST2005-00490.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE DETERMINATION.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 Minh Pham, Representing Ownership

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Provide four feet of landscaping between the pathways and the building. 2) The architecture is generally acceptable, but needs to be reduced in size.

Action: Adams/Boucher, 8/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

NEW ITEM

1021 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(6:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-016
 Application Number: MST2007-00340
 Owner: ITC Group, LLC
 Applicant: Joseph Schweke
 Business Name: Bella Rosa (Formerly Day Dreams)

(Proposal to change the exterior paint color of an existing commercial building and abate ENF2007-00606 by posting address number on street frontage.)

This item had been postponed indefinitely on the Consent Calendar due to applicant's absence.

Present: Joseph Schweke, Applicant

Motion: To reopen the Consent Calendar for reconsideration of Item H.

Action: Naylor/Adams, 8/0/0. (Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Final approval with the following conditions: 1) The body color shall be Ace Paint "Hint of Gold" # C21-2. 2) The storefront shall be a light mahogany faux finish (as shown on the sample provided).

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 7/0/1. (Curtis abstained. Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. 721 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-026
 Application Number: MST2002-00405
 Owner: Chadwick Pacific, LP
 Architect: Michael Holliday
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects
 Applicant: Bermant Development Company

(Proposal to demolish an existing 9,788 square foot commercial building and six residential units totaling 2,700 square feet, and to construct 9,788 square feet of commercial space, 29 residential units (including 12 bonus density units) totaling 43,357 square feet, and a 25,533 square foot on-grade parking structure.)

(Review After Final of proposed revision to move a recessed exterior door and glass sidelight and changes to an exterior paved planting area. Relocation of the door will result in 29 net square feet of new interior square footage.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 005-04.)

This item was postponed indefinitely at applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

B. 523 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-021
Application Number: MST2004-00854
Owner: Leon Olson
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal for a three-story, mixed-use development consisting of seven residential condominium units and two commercial units. The total net residential square footage is proposed at 17,281 square feet and the commercial units are 1,218 and 1,334 net square feet each, for a total of 2,552 square feet. Nineteen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Review After Final lighting details including the addition of seven ground-mounted bollard fixtures proposed in the public alley.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 001-06.)

Final approval of Review After Final as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 801 GARDEN ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-029
Application Number: MST2007-00308
Owner: FBK Investments, LLC
Contractor: Gencon Development, Inc.
Business Name: Antioch University

(This structure is on the City's Potential List of Historic Resources: "Neighborhood House" and is eligible for designation as a City Landmark. Proposal to approve an as-built second floor wrought iron railing installed to replace a deteriorated Monterey style wooden railing. This is to abate violation ENF2007-00528.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Continued two weeks.

CONTINUED ITEM

D. 431 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-008
Application Number: MST2007-00237
Owner: William and Dolores Faulding
Applicant: Santokh Singh
Contractor: Joe Khalaf
Business Name: All India Cafe

(Proposal to permit new "as-built" rooftop equipment to abate violation ENF2007-00294.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

Final approval as noted on drawings.

FINAL REVIEW

E. 1710 MIRA VISTA AVE E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-015
Application Number: MST2007-00014
Owner: Christine McLaughlin
Applicant: Vadim Hsu
Contractor: Douglas Dafoe

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for a new swimming pool and a 313 square foot cabana structure on a 16,094 square foot parcel currently developed with an existing single-family residence. Zoning modifications are requested to allow the cabana to encroach into the front yard setback and to be located in the remaining front yard. This application includes abatement of ENF2007-00139 for overheight hedges.)

(Final Approval of architectural details is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 041-07.)

Final approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM

F. 1 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-017
Application Number: MST2007-00297
Owner: Romasanta Family Living Trust 12/3/03
Architect: Larry Clark
Business Name: Eladio's Restaurant

(Proposal for rooftop equipment screening with wrought iron grillework and bird netting.)

(Second Concept Review.)

This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

NEW ITEM

G. 800 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-010
Application Number: MST2007-00341
Owner: Westen Family Group
Architect: M2 Architecture

(Proposal to install one 4'-2" tall iron bollard at the service alley on De La Guerra Street.)

Final approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM

H. 1021 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-016
Application Number: MST2007-00340
Owner: ITC Group, LLC
Applicant: Joseph Schweke
Business Name: Bella Rosa (Formerly Day Dreams)

(Proposal to change the exterior paint color of an existing commercial building and abate ENF2007-00606 by posting address number on street frontage.)

This item was postponed indefinitely due to applicant's absence.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**I. 700 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-009

Application Number: MST2007-00240

Owner: Santa Barbara High School District

(This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara High School Building." Courtesy review of a proposal for new outdoor benches and trash receptacles.)

(Review After Final of proposed change in specified benches.)

Final approval of Review After Final as noted on drawings.

NEW ITEM**J. 428 CHAPALA ST C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026

Application Number: MST2005-00079

Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP

Architect: DesignARC

Business Name: Casa De Sevilla

(Proposal to reinstate a previously approved project that expired. The project includes a 1,000 square foot dining patio including an additional restroom, masonry wall, fountain, bar, and fabric awnings for an existing restaurant.)

(Request for reinstatement of Historic Landmarks Commission approval previously granted on September 28, 2005.)

Final approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:11 P.M. ****