



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, January 10, 2007**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present until 5:01 p.m.; and at 5:04 p.m.  
 ALEX PUJO, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
 ROBERT ADAMS – Present  
 LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
 STEVE HAUSZ – Present from 1:35 p.m. to 4:22 p.m.; and at 4:27 p.m.  
 FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
 SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present until 6:26 p.m.  
 DONALD SHARPE – Present

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** ROGER HORTON – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** STELLA LARSON – Present until 6:02 p.m.

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent  
 JAN HUBBELL, Senior Planner – Present 3:39 p.m. to 4:22 p.m.  
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present  
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present  
 GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

*Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)*

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on January 5, 2007 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

**SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING:****GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Election of Chair and Vice-Chair.

Ms. Gantz opened nominations for office of Chair and Vice-Chair.

1. Nominations for Chair: William La Voie.

**A vote was taken and William La Voie was elected as Chair.**

2. Nominations for Vice-Chair: Alex Pujo and Susette Naylor (declined).

**A vote was taken and Alex Pujo was elected as Vice-Chair.**

- B. Appointments to subcommittees.

Appointments were made to fill vacancies on the following subcommittees:

1. **HLC Consent Calendar: La Voie.** Alternate: Pujo.
2. **Sign Committee Liaison: Hausz.** Alternate: Boucher.
3. **Visual Art in Public Places: Naylor.** Alternate: Adams.
4. **Design Awards: Boucher, Adams, and Sharpe.**
5. **Designations: Boucher, Murray, and Sharpe.**
6. **EPV Design Guidelines: Boucher, Hausz, La Voie, Naylor, and Sharpe.**
7. **State of the Art Gallery/State St. Installations: Adams and Boucher.**
8. **Historic Surveys: Boucher, Murray, and Sharpe.**
9. **Events: Boucher and Hausz.**

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

10. **Streetlighting Master Plan: Hausz.**
11. **West Cabrillo Sidewalk Replacement: Adams and La Voie.**
12. **Airport: La Voie, Murray, and Pujo.**
13. **Plaza De La Guerra: Hausz and Sharpe.**
14. **Hwy 101 Improvements: Adams and Pujo.**
15. **Lower Mission Creek Design: Adams.**
16. **Cabrillo Blvd. Bridge Replacement: Adams, La Voie, and Murray.**

## C. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Marck Aguilar, Redevelopment Specialist, stated that the State Street Beautification project is in its fourth phase and that it has been almost six years since the last phase was completed. The Redevelopment Agency is operating under a plan that has been reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission, the Street Tree Advisory Committee, and the Park & Recreation Commission. Mr. Aguilar also stated that many of the trees that were removed from the 400- and 500-blocks of State Street would not transplant well and will be replaced to enhance the diversity of trees on State Street. Placement of the new trees will improve the visibility of the storefronts and building architecture.

Mr. Adams verified that the plaques used for the trees being removed are in safe-keeping and will be reinstalled.

## D. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 13, 2006.

**Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 13, 2006, with corrections.**

Action: Hausz/Murray, 6/0/0. (Adams/Sharpe abstained.) Motion carried.

## E. Consent Calendar.

**Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.**

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

## F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Don Sharpe and Robert Adams were introduced to the public and welcomed back to the Historic Landmarks Commission.
- b) Commissioner Vadim Hsu resigned from the Historic Landmarks Commission effective 12/31/06. This will create a vacancy on the HLC that may possibly last until July, when the City Clerk's office may be able to do a special recruitment for this seat.

## 2. Chair La Voie recognized Stella Larson as the new Planning Commission Liaison for the Historic Landmarks Commission.

## G. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

## H. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 1:58 P.M. TO 2:01 P.M. \*\***

**PUBLIC HEARING**

(2:01)

To consider adopting a resolution to recommend that City Council designate the following buildings as City Landmarks: the Huning Mansion at 1732 Santa Barbara Street (APN 027-112-001); the D'Alfonso House at 1710 Mira Vista Avenue (APN 019-090-015); and the Franceschi House at 1510 Mission Ridge Road (APN 019-101-009). – Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian.

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, gave the Staff presentation, he reviewed the findings of significance, and requested that the Historic Landmarks Commission recommend to the City Council that it designate these three properties as City Landmarks.

Public comment opened at 2:09 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, expressed appreciation for the official landmarking of these three properties. He pointed out that the Pearl Chase Society has been working on these properties for some time. He reported that the fundraising for rehabilitation of the Franceschi House is well on its way.

Public comment closed at 2:11 p.m.

Chair La Voie asked about the limits of the landmarking for the Franceschi House. Mr. Jacobus responded that the landmarking is for the house itself and five feet around the house, but not the entire site. He explained that the Commission does have the ability to determine whether alterations to the landscaping affect the house.

**Motion: Recommend to City Council the designation of the Huning Mansion, the D'Alfonso House, and the Franceschi House as City Landmarks.**

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 2215 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone  
 (2:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-201-022  
 Application Number: MST2006-00396  
 Owner: Gilbert García and Martha Correa  
 Architect: Gilbert García

(Proposal for a secondary dwelling unit to be added to an existing 2,947 square foot single-family residence on a 15,675 square foot lot in the Mission Area Special Design District. The proposal is for a 404 square foot one-story addition and conversion of a 162 square foot storage area to create a 566 square foot one-bedroom unit and add one uncovered parking space.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane and Michael H. Imwalle, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)**

Present: Heather Macfarlane, Preparer of the Report

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations and that the parcel shall be monitored by a qualified archaeologist during initial ground clearing and grading.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report.**

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

2. 1746 PROSPECT AVE R-2 Zone

(2:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-141-029  
Application Number: MST2006-00719  
Owner: Michael D. McCaskey

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report focused on the proposed addition of two dormers to the front elevation of a single-family residence on a 4,533 square foot parcel.)

**(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan.)**

Present: Dr. Shelley Bookspan, Preparer of the Report

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report as presented.**

Action: Murray/Adams, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:18 P.M. TO 2:22 \*\***

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

3. 1221 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

(2:22) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-034  
Application Number: MST2003-00908  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Heather Horne  
Applicant: John Schoof  
Architect: Henry Lenny

(This is a revised project. The proposal is to construct a new parking structure composed of two floors below grade and four floors above grade. The project would provide approximately 575 parking stalls and would include approximately 10,000 square feet of staff offices, a bicycle parking station and public restrooms in Parking Lot No. 6, located at the rear of the Granada Theater building.)

**(Continued request to change landscaping in Anacapa Street parkway strip from eight Brisbane Box trees to three King Palm trees.)**

Present: Browning Allen, Transportation Manager  
Tully Clifford, Supervising Transportation Engineer  
Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect  
Victor Garza, Parking/TMP Superintendent  
Dion Tait, Parking Supervisor

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission does not agree with the argument that the number of trees should be reduced from four to three due to the configuration of the turning lanes. 2) The Commission supports the new design as proposed with eight King Palms, three Firewheel trees, and one Schefflera. 3) The other low level landscaping shown on the original plan is also to be incorporated.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 4/4/0. (Adams/Boucher/Murray/Sharpe opposed.) Motion failed.

Public hearing opened at 2:41 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, commented that the object of the Brisbane Box trees was to hide/soften the parking structure. He received an email from a landscape architect stating that he has never seen a Brisbane Box tree with a trunk diameter greater than 12 inches, and that it is considered one of the best street trees in southern California. Mr. Forest also commented that King Palms would never soften the streetscape.

Public comment closed at 2:42 p.m.

### **Substitute**

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) There is a need for softening the frontscape because the garage is so close to the street and walkway. 2) The design is to incorporate more Firewheel trees in an appropriate one-to-one replacement since there are plenty of King Palms already.

**Action:** Boucher/Sharpe, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

4. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone  
 (2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
 Application Number: MST2004-00005  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts  
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore  
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

**(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report dealing with proposed changes to the approved plans for the east elevation prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)**

**Present:** Tim Hazeltine and Pamela Post, Post/Hazeltine Associates  
 Steve Metsch, Architect  
 Monisha Adnani, Project Manager

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. He clarified that Figure 4 shows a man-door that was not shown in the larger fold-out drawings included in the report.

**Motion:**        **The Commission accepts the report with the condition that the report be modified to provide on page 7, paragraph 4, a clarification that the use of goose neck lamps are not typical for a high style building.**

Action:        Hausz/Naylor, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

## **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

5.        1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone  
 (2:57)    Assessor's Parcel Number:    039-183-019  
           Application Number:        MST2004-00005  
           Owner:                        Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts  
           Architect:                    Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore  
           Business Name:                Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

**(Review After Final of installation of goose-neck lamps over poster display cases on east and south elevations.)**

Present:        Steve Metsch, Architect  
                   Monisha Adnani, Project Manager

Straw vote:    How many Commissioners regret the loss of the marquee? 8/0/0.

Public comment opened at 3:09 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, pointed out that structures like the Arlington and El Paseo have wrought iron lanterns that provide alleyway lighting. He commented that wrought iron lanterns would be appropriate and something for the Commission to consider.

Public comment closed at 3:09 p.m.

Straw vote:    How many Commissioners support the inconsistency in size and shape of any of the apertures and decorations? 1/7/0. (All but Naylor opposed.)

- Motion:** Continued two weeks with the comment that the Commission regrets the loss of the marquee, will not support the use of goose-neck lamps, and would like to see a better resolution of the elevation in a less arbitrary manner.
- Action:** Pujo/Hausz, 0/8/0. (Murray opposed because she prefers the previously approved plan.) Motion failed.

**Substitute**

- Motion:** **The Commission wants the applicant to return to the previously approved design.**
- Action:** Adams/Boucher, 7/1/0. (La Voie opposed.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

6. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone  
 (3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL, AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

**Present:** James Jones and Minh Pham, Representing Ownership  
 Henry Lenny, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, commended the applicant for bringing back the Maxfield Perrish style vases and expressed his desire that they remain.

Public comment closed at 3:23 p.m.

- Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The Commission requests a better integration of the design elements to create less of an intervention into the landscape. 2) Resolve the elevator and steps. 3) Study any resolution that can be done to minimize the amount of berming on to the structure. 4) Programmatic constraints on the design need to be reconsidered, including the requirement for a second exit and washrooms up on the pool deck level.
- Action:** Naylor/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

7. 433 E CABRILLO HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone  
(3:37) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009

Application Number: MST95-00175

Agent: Richard Fogg

Applicant: Parker Family Trust

Architect: Daun St. Amand

Architect: Henry Lenny

Architect: Gregory Burnett

Business Name: Park Plaza Hotel

(This is a revised proposal for a 150-room, three-story luxury hotel located on a three-acre development envelope that received a substantial conformance determination on June 1, 2001. The proposal is a 196,715 square foot hotel that includes 128 subterranean level parking spaces, pool cabana, spas, health club, meeting rooms, and restaurant. The project previously received preliminary approval from the Historic Landmarks Commission on August 15, 2001.)

**(Continued In-Progress Review of design changes to exterior elevations including doors, windows and balconies. Massing and footprint of the building remains unmodified.)**

**(PROJECT MAY REQUIRE SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE DETERMINATION AND COMPLIANCE WITH CITY ORDINANCE NO. 4920.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect  
Greg Burnett, Gensler Architects  
Jan Hubbell, Senior Planner

Staff comment: Jan Hubbell, Senior Planner, stated that the primary design details are what need to be dealt with for this project. The footprint of the hotel project is well established at this point; therefore, there will be no need for additional Planning Commission review unless there are significant changes to square footage for the various uses.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support what will be appearing to be a masonry balcony of this size and cantilever, as opposed to wrought iron as was previously recommended?  
0/8/0.

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** **1)** Reduce the cantilever of the masonry-looking balconies, or change the character of the balcony. **2)** The proposed entry canopy is modern and it does not match the rest of the building. Glass and iron was suggested. **3)** The brick chimneys seem to be out of character. Perhaps they should be expressed in stucco and not proud of the building. **4)** Reiterated comments made at the November 29, 2006, meeting: **a)** Retain the tower as a focal element. **b)** Restudy the balcony on the round towers, perhaps increasing the corbelling on either end of the towers to make the cantilever credible, as opposed to a steel frame. **5)** The balconies over the arches have a credibility problem by being so close to the top of the arches.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**DISCUSSION ITEM**

8. 12 E MONTECITO ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:58) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-016  
Application Number: MST95-00044  
Applicant: Redevelopment Agency  
Architect: Gregory Burnett  
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(Proposal to construct an 11,091 square foot two-story youth hostel with 100 beds and 60 parking spaces on a vacant parcel.)

**(Discussion of a revised design of a previously approved youth hostel.)**

Present: Fess Parker, Owner  
Henry Lenny, Architect  
Greg Burnett, Gensler Architects  
Jan Hubbell, Senior Planner

Staff comment: Jan Hubbell, Senior Planner, stated that the primary design details are what need to be dealt with for this project. The footprint of the hotel project is well established at this point; therefore, there will be no need for additional Planning Commission review unless there are significant changes to square footage for the various uses.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, inquired as to how long the landscape open area on State Street will remain open and landscaped before it is developed for commercial use.

Public comment closed at 4:15 p.m.

Mr. Parker commented as to the cost imposed upon the owner due to this project not going forward.

**The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments, suggestions, and/or questions:** 1) The Commission supports the simplicity of the building. 2) The building is not well integrated into the site and the site design does not fit the building. 3) The previous design, whatever its shortcomings architecturally, seemed to suit the site and its use better than what is currently being proposed. 4) The revised design is completely different from the previously approved plans. If there is to be considerable redesign, it should be to improve on the original plan's characteristics, rather than abandoning them. 5) Issues were raised as to adequate screening for the landscape area from the freeway. 6) Issues were raised as to the site context, site design, and site land usage that seem to be inadequately addressed and would not meet the Commission's approval. 7) Comments were made as to the massing of the building as it relates to a symmetrical plan on the site. 8) The original proposal would be more inviting to young people staying at the hostel. 9) At least two Commissioners commented that the proposal seems to be an arbitrary design that is unwilling to deviate from the revisions that have already been reviewed by the Commission in previous meetings. 10) Confirmed with applicant that underground parking is no longer being considered.

**Chair request:**

This project, if it returns for HLC review, should be presented as a regular agenda item.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

## 9. 800 SANTA BARBARA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:22) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-028  
 Application Number: MST2006-00129  
 Owner: 800 Santa Barbara Street Investment Company  
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects  
 Landscape Architect: Van Atta & Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,965 square foot office building and construct a three-story mixed-use project comprised of eight residential and two commercial condominium units on an 18,713 square foot parcel. Thirty underground parking spaces would be provided. Planning Commission approval will be required for a lot line adjustment of 1,529 square feet from adjacent parcel number 031-012-027 to meet residential density requirements.)

**(Third Concept Review.)****(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)**

Present: Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect  
 Brian Cearnal and Craig Shallenberger, Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects

Public comment opened at 4:37 p.m.

Gordon Sichi, Anacapa School Head of Faculty, expressed appreciation that the project changed the use along the school site that may prevent noise complaints from future residents. He stated that the school continues to be concerned about safety issues, access to the school's parking, and non-interruption of the school's activities during the construction process.

Kellam De Forest, resident, commented that retaining the paseo and its view-line, and the landscaping on the corner of Santa Barbara and De La Guerra Streets is appreciated. He asked about the use of black acacia. He also inquired about the proposed setback on Santa Barbara Street. Mr. La Voie responded that the Commission has extensively discussed the setback from Santa Barbara Street and the proposal has been revised accordingly.

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a wall in back of the sandstone wall of a height approximately five feet higher than the sidewalk elevation and separated from the sandstone wall by agaves? 6/2/0.

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely and the Commission forwards the project to the Planning Commission with positive comments:** **1)** The Commission likes the project as a whole, in particular: **a)** how it addresses the corner; **b)** the landscape screen provided from the corner; **c)** how the project has been pulled back from Anacapa School, providing a landscape buffer; **d)** and the change of use from residential to commercial facing the school. **2)** Areas that need additional attention are: **a)** the bridge, with the recommendation that it not be roofed; and **b)** that the plate heights be lowered to the extent possible so that the building accurately mimics the Monterey style. **3)** Further recommendations: **a)** the reuse of the existing brick paving; and **b)** keep the paving simple and rustic so that it is more in keeping with the Monterey style.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

10. 1528 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(4:58) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-232-012  
Application Number: MST2005-00389  
Owner: Bradley 2001 Family Trust Agreement  
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(Proposed demolition of 1,290 square feet of commercial space and construction of a new 4,100 square foot commercial space and three new residential condominium units, ranging from 2,120 to 2,782 square feet. The proposal includes 15 parking spaces.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 070-06.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal and Craig Shallanberger, Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects

Public comment opened at 5:08 p.m.

George Eskin, adjacent neighbor, commented on the Notice process, the Historic Landmarks Commission's pervue, and due process issues. He also expressed concern about parking, blocking public views, and privacy issues.

Public comment closed at 5:20 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary approval with the following comments and the observation that this is an approval of a building that originally was presented to the HLC some time ago and the Commission agreed with the proposal at that time. 1) Explore introducing landscape at the front of the building between the commercial entry and parking entry by encroaching into the parking garage space below. Explore landscaping in front and any other location possible. 2) Details of the building shall be of the highest quality. 3) The hardscape should be unique to the project and of the highest quality.

Action: Hausz/La Voie, 4/4/0. (Adams/Murray/Sharpe/Boucher opposed.) Motion failed.

**First Substitute**

Motion: Indefinite continuance accepting the design as a schematic design with the applicant to return with design development drawings. Wherever possible, applicant should include additional landscape elements.

Action: Motion withdrawn.

**Second Substitute**

Motion: **Preliminary approval and indefinitely continued with the following comments:**  
1) The Commission made the observation that this is an approval of a building that originally was presented to the HLC some time ago and the Commission agreed with such proposal at that time. 2) Applicant is to explore introducing landscape at the front of the building between the commercial entry and the parking entry by encroaching into the parking garage space below, and at any other locations possible. 3) The details of the building shall be of the highest quality. 4) The hardscape should be unique to the project and of the highest quality. 5) Applicant shall return in-progress with design element drawings.

Action: Hausz/La Voie. 4/2/2. (Boucher/Murray opposed. Adams/Sharpe abstained.)  
Motion carried.

**Commission Request:**

Agendize a discussion of procedures relating to graphic requirements for preliminary review.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

11. 721 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(5:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-006  
 Application Number: MST2006-00732  
 Applicant: Peikert Group  
 Business Name: Paseo Chapala  
 (Appeal of SGN2006-00134, denial of building name sign.)

Present: Detlev Peikert and Bonnie Sangster, Peikert Group Architects

**Motion: The Commission upholds the denial of the Sign Committee and recommends that the signage be placed in a location near the primary pedestrian entrance, recognizing the difficulty in naming a building that is designed to look like several independent buildings.**

Action: Murray/Naylor, 7/0/1. (Sharpe abstained.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

12. 734 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone

(6:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-191-001  
 Application Number: MST2006-00556  
 Owner: Evans Stout  
 Applicant: Tim Steele

(This is a City Landmark: Little Granada Residence. Proposal to add a 362 square foot, one-story workshop with a 150 square foot basement to an existing 2,596 square foot single-family residence on a 6,966 square foot parcel. Also proposed is the construction of a 13' x 30' in-ground swimming pool.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK.)**

Present: Tim Steele, Architect

Public comment opened at 6:14 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, expressed concern about the many changes proposed that will affect this historical landmark, including the swimming pool and lawn areas. Chair La Voie responded that a Historic Structures Report that considered the threshold of significance of the landmark has been reviewed and accepted by the Commission.

Public comment closed at 6:15 p.m.

**Motion:** **Continued two weeks with the following comments:** 1) The applicant is to provide more complete design elevations in order to receive preliminary approval. The Commission is accepting the design presented today as a basis for obtaining such preliminary approval. 2) Applicant is to provide additional detailing of the pool and the building. 3) The Commission accepts removal of the retaining wall that runs through the middle of the site in the interest of providing a functional swimming pool in the rear yard.

**Action:** Pujo/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

13. 322 E MICHELTORENA ST R-3 Zone  
 (6:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-021-023  
 Application Number: MST2006-00697  
 Owner: Santa Barbara Properties, Ltd.  
 Agent: Don Royale  
 Applicant: Michael Porter

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Holman Court & Winegar Boarding House." Proposal to legalize the as-built replacement of three wooden windows (one large eight-light window with wood muntions flanked by two, four-light windows with wood muntions) with a smaller, horizontal aluminum window. Also requested is to permit the removal of one exit door and two windows and filling in the openings with plaster. These changes were made to an existing ground floor unit of a fourplex facing E. Micheltorena Street.)

#### **(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)**

**Present:** Don Royale, Agent  
 Michael Porter, Applicant

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the building in question is not historically significant, but does share a common parcel with a bungalow court, which is on the City's Potential Historic Structures List.

**Motion:** **Continued indefinitely and this issue is referred to the Architectural Board of Review with the following comments:** 1) The windows, as installed, are not acceptable. 2) Replacement windows should be of appropriate proportion for the style and period of the building; and the window components should maintain the period character of the building.

**Action:** Hausz/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Naylor absent.) Motion carried.

**CONSENT CALENDAR****REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

A. 2201 LAGUNA ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-005  
Application Number: MST2004-00548  
Owner: Old Mission Santa Barbara  
Applicant: Grant Castleberg

(Proposal to relocate 15 Stations of the Cross Monuments (concrete and mosaic tile monuments) from an adjacent parcel to the Mission site. Work to include new paving, fencing, gates, benches, planting, and tree removal.)

**(Review of added memorial monument.)**

**Review After Final withdrawn at owner's request.**

**NEW ITEM**

B. 717 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-018  
Application Number: MST2006-00724  
Owner: Robert Bernheim  
Applicant: Christine Pierron  
Business Name: Spirits In Stone

(This is a City Landmark: "Alexander or White House Building." Proposal to replace an existing metal display window with a new wood window. The size and shape of the window are to remain the same, but the mullion pattern is different.)

**Final approval as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM**

C. 1021 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-006  
Application Number: MST2006-00747  
Owner: Pueblo Associates, Ltd.  
Applicant: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architecture  
Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(Proposal to modify the existing west entry gate for improved security. The work will entail the removal of an existing wood gate and corner plaster bollard and the installation of a new wrought iron gate and rail at the existing plaster wall. The new ironwork will be compatible with wrought iron at the existing stair on the same face.)

**Final approval with material to be Option 2 in copper .**

**NEW ITEM**

- D. 31 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-001  
Application Number: MST2007-00004  
Owner: Due West, LLP  
Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.  
Architect: Backen Gillam  
Business Name: Hotel Andalucia  
(Proposed door and window changes to the south elevation and to the porte-cochere.)

**Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.**

**NEW ITEM**

- E. 1635 STATE ST C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-181-005  
Application Number: MST2006-00761  
Owner: Joe & Beatryce Butler Family Revocable Trust  
Architect: Gil García  
(Proposal to permit the removal of an existing wood patio and stairs and the as-built construction of a new sandstone patio over concrete with new wood railing. Approval will abate ENF2006-01002.)

**Final approval as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM**

- F. 1221 STATE ST 203 C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-182-005  
Application Number: MST2007-00007  
Owner: 1221 Victoria Court, LP  
Architect: David Burke  
Business Name: Soho Restaurant  
(This is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: "Victoria Court." Proposal to remove approximately 85 linear feet of existing recessed sheet metal planter boxes currently installed in the top of the plaster wall surrounding the upstairs outdoor patio and cover over the resultant opening with a sheet metal closure and decorative ceramic tile cap and apron on a 10,996 square foot commercial lot.)

**Project withdrawn at applicant's request.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:44 P.M. \*\***