



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, December 13, 2006**      **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**      **1:30 P.M.**

- COMMISSION MEMBERS:**      PHILIP SUDING, Chair, Present (out from 2:10 to 2:15 p.m.; out 2:28 to 3:25 p.m.)  
    WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair, Present  
    LOUISE BOUCHER, Present until 6:00 p.m.  
    STEVE HAUSZ, Present (arrived at 2:21 p.m. and left at 6:00 p.m.)  
    VADIM HSU, Present (out from 1:58 to 2:11 p.m.)  
    ALEX PUJO, Present  
    CAREN RAGER, Present  
    FERMINA MURRAY, Present  
    SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present
- ADVISORY MEMBER:**      DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent
- CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**      ROGER HORTON, Absent
- PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**      WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent
- STAFF:**      JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent  
                          JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present  
                          SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II, Present  
                          GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary, Absent  
                          GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on Friday, December 8, 2006, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

## A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

## B. Approval of the minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 29, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Pujo/Rager, 6/0/2. Motion carried. (Murray/Suding abstained. Hausz absent).

## C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Commissioner La Voie, with the exception of Item H, reviewed by Chair Suding.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Hausz absent.)

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a. Chair Suding will step down from Item 5, 35 State Street, and Item 9, 1221 Anacapa Street.
- b. The review of 800 Santa Barbara has been postponed to January 10, 2007, at Staff's request.
- c. Review of the project at 1900 Lasuen Rd., Group B Main Building, has been postponed to January 10, 2007, at the applicant's request.
- d. Ms. Gantz thanked Commissioners Suding and Rager for their years of service since March 2001 and January 2003 respectively, on the Historic Landmarks Commission.

## 2. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

- a. The Solar Design Guidelines were adopted by City Council on December 5, 2006. A review process for implementation thresholds will be developed. Changes requested by the Commission cannot increase the cost of the proposal by more than 20%.

- b. The Lower Riviera Design Guidelines will be presented to the City Council on December 19, 2006.
  - c. On February 7, 2007, the HLC will discuss a proposal to remove approximately 15 properties from the list of potential historic structures.
3. Commissioner Suding made the following announcements:
- a. Nominations are being accepted for the St. Barbara award, for an exemplary person in service to the City of Santa Barbara; the Lockwood de Forest Award, for an exemplary landscape or open space; and the George Washington Smith Award, for exemplary architecture.
  - b. A joint meeting with the ABR will take place later this evening for a review of the Airport Terminal proposal.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.
- No subcommittee reports.
- F. Possible Ordinance Violations.
- No violations reported.

**MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM:**

(1:50)

**CONSIDERATION OF INTENT TO HOLD A PUBLIC HEARING.**

The Commission was requested to adopt a resolution of intention to hold a Public Hearing on January 10, 2007, to consider City Landmark designations of the following structures: The Mission Revival house at 1732 Santa Barbara Street (APN 027-112-001); the Stick/Eastlake style house at 319 West Ortega Street (APN 037-113-004); the Spanish Colonial Revival style house at 1710 Mira Vista Avenue (APN 019-090-015); and the Franceschi House at 1510 Mission Ridge Road (APN 019-101-009).

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that a public hearing will be held on January 10, 2007, to consider the designation of 1732 Santa Barbara Street, 1710 Mira Vista Avenue, and 1510 Mission Ridge Road. The property at 319 W. Ortega will be considered at a later date.

**Motion:** To hold a public hearing.

Action: Boucher/Rager, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Hausz/Hsu absent.)

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 116 E YANONALI ST OC/SD-3 Zone

(1:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-083-018  
Application Number: MST2006-00361  
Owner: 116 East Yanonali, LLC  
Owner: DBN Yanonali, LLC  
Architect: The Conceptual Motion Company

(Proposal to construct a three story mixed-use building consisting of six residential units totaling 8,588 square feet and six new commercial spaces totaling 4,615 square feet. The proposal includes demolition of the existing 7,343 square foot warehouse/office on the 11,880 square foot parcel, located in the Coastal Zone. Modifications would be required to provide fewer than the required number of parking spaces and less than the required open yard area.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that archaeological monitoring be required during initial ground disturbing activities to further reduce disturbances to unknown archeological resources.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the conditions of monitoring.**

Action: La Voie/Murray, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Hausz/Hsu absent.)

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

2. 210 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025  
Application Number: MST2005-00772  
Owner: Old Town Mall  
Owner: Steve Delson  
Architect: Conceptual Motion

(Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of approximately 18,000 square feet of commercial square footage and the construction of a new four-story, mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 14,604 square feet of commercial space, 57,989 square feet of residential space, 6,674 square feet of commercial live/work space, 555 square feet of residential accessory space, and two levels of underground parking. There will be a total of 55 residential condominium units. A modification is requested for residential density on this 1.2 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommended mitigation measures on page 17 of the report.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report with mitigation conditions.**

Action: Boucher/Rager, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Hausz/Hsu absent.)

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

3. 734 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone  
 (1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-191-001  
 Application Number: MST2006-00556  
 Owner: Evans Stout  
 Applicant: Tim Steele

(This is a City Landmark: Little Granada Residence. Proposal to add a 362 square foot, one-story workshop with a 150 square foot basement to an existing 2,596 square foot single-family residence on a 6,966 square foot parcel. Also proposed is the construction of a 13' x 30' in-ground swimming pool. A zoning modification is requested for encroachment into the front yard setback.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. The prospect of finding archeological resources is unlikely and no mitigation measures are necessary.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report.**

Action: Murray/Rager, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Hausz/Hsu absent.)

**\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 1:56 P.M. UNTIL 2:05 P.M. \*\***

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

4. 734 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone  
 (2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-191-001  
 Application Number: MST2006-00556  
 Owner: Evans Stout  
 Applicant: Tim Steele

(This is a City Landmark: Little Granada Residence. Proposal to add a 362 square foot, one-story workshop with a 150 square foot basement to an existing 2,596 square foot single-family residence on a 6,966 square foot parcel. Also proposed is the construction of a 13' x 30' in-ground swimming pool. A zoning modification is requested for encroachment into the front yard setback.)

**(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)**

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations found in the report.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report.**

Action: La Voie/Pujo, 6/1/0. Motion carried. Boucher opposed. (Hausz/Hsu absent.)

**\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 2:08 P.M. UNTIL 2:14 P.M. \*\***

**DISCUSSION ITEM**

5. 35 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004  
 Application Number: MST97-00357  
 Applicant: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP  
 Agent: Ken Marshall  
 Architect: Doug Singletary  
 Landscape Architect: Philip Suding  
 Engineer: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda  
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith Engineers, Inc.  
 Business Name: Ritz-Carlton Club

(Proposal for the Ritz-Carlton Club involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

**(Update on progress of HLC-requested information from hearing of November 15, 2006, and preliminary review of draft historic structures assessment.)**

**Motion: Continued indefinitely, due to the applicant's absence.**

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down. Hausz absent.)

**ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

6. 00 W CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW  
 Application Number: MST2004-00878  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Agent: Hal Hill, Project Manager II  
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Blvd. to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of excavation.)

**(Review of Memorandum and Archaeological Survey Report which together constitute a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that given the prospect of buried prehistoric deposits an archeologist shall monitor all earth moving activity associated with the project.

**Motion: The Commission accepts the report.**

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 8/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Revised.

**Revised**

**Motion:** **The Commission accepts the report, with the correction** that the HLC is not an *Advisory Commission*.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 8/0/0. (Hausz absent.)

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

## 7. 00 W CABRILLO BLVD

P-R/SD-3 Zone

(2:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW  
 Application Number: MST2004-00878  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Agent: Hal Hill, Project Manager II  
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Blvd. to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of excavation.)

**(Review of Memorandum and Historic Property Survey Report, Historical Resources Evaluation Report, Finding of Adverse Effect, and Programmatic Section 4F Evaluation prepared by Applied EarthWorks, Inc.)**

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations found in the report, with some minor typo corrections as noted. The Commission received a memo, dated December 8, 2006, from Michael Berman, Project Planner, requesting that the Commission approve the Historic Structures Report with amendments to Section 6.1 of the Programmatic Section 4F Document.

**Motion:** **The Commission accepts the report with the following amendment** to Item 1 of the December 8, 2006, memorandum: "The 1928 bridge railing would be replicated except for the area in front of the building now housing Rusty's Pizza Parlor. In the relocation a masonry wall with a stucco finish that is compatible with the building style will be constructed. The wall will be topped with a wrought iron railing ~~that will not obscure a view of the patio of the building.~~"

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/1. (Hausz abstained.)

**\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 2:27 P.M. UNTIL 2:29 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

8. 00 W CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone  
(2:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW  
Application Number: MST2004-00878  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Agent: Hal Hill, Project Manager II  
Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Boulevard to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of excavation.)

**(Third Concept Review.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)**

Present: David Black, Landscape Architect  
Pat Kelly, Assistant Director of Public Works.

Mr. Kelly stated that two alternatives have been considered for the site:

- Alternative 1: Focuses on a design that keeps the existing bridge deck.
- Alternative 2: A design for replacement of the existing bridge deck.

Mr. Kelly further stated that it would be more cost effective to replace the bridge rather than trying to rehabilitate the bridge, and replacement of the bridge would result in less disruption to the creek.

Sub-Committee Comments: Commissioner La Voie reported that 90% of the current submittal has been reviewed by the Sub-Committee, and a curvilinear approach to the wrought iron was suggested to the applicant.

Public comment opened at 2:45 p.m.

Virginia Castagnola-Hunter, resident, expressed concern with tampering of private property, and taking away the patio at the subject property.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely, and referred to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) The Board supports the design elements and their execution. 2) Provide a final restudy of the wrought iron.

Action: LaVoie/Pujo, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 2:55 P.M. UNTIL 3:00 P.M. \*\***

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

9. 1221 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(2:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-034  
 Application Number: MST2003-00908  
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
 Applicant: John Schoof  
 Agent: Heather Horne  
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(This is a revised project. The proposal is to construct a new parking structure composed of two floors below grade and four floors above grade. The project would provide approximately 575 parking stalls and would include approximately 10,000 square feet of staff offices, a bicycle parking station and public restrooms in Parking Lot No. 6, located at the rear of the Granada Theater building.)

**(Continued request to change landscaping in Anacapa Street parkway strip from eight Brisbane Box trees to three King Palm trees.)**

Present: Browning Allen, Transportation Department  
 Tully Clifford, Transportation Department  
 Dion Tait, Downtown Parking

Straw Vote: How many Commissioners feel that there are other trees with an appropriate sized trunk that also provide enough height and canopy? 6/0/0.

Public comment opened at 3:16 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, expressed concern about the importance of keeping large canopy trees in Santa Barbara, and suggested using Brisbane Box trees.

Public comment closed at 3:18 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued to January 10, 2007, with the following comments: 1) Provide a substitute canopy tree that meets safety requirements. 2) Provide an evaluation of the Brisbane Box tree grown in root barriers, as to what age it exceeds 12 inches diameter in Southern California.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 8/0/0. Motion carried. (Suding stepped down.)

**DISCUSSION ITEM**

(3:25)

**AIRPORT TERMINAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECT**Joint meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission and the Architectural Board of Review.

(Review and comment on proposed site plan, architecture, and landscaping for the Airline Terminal Improvement Project.)

ABR Members present: Chair Bruce Bartlett, Christopher Manson-Hing, Gary Mosel, Randy Mudge, Dawn Sherry, Mark Wienke.

HLC Members present: Chair Philip Suding, William La Voie, Louise Boucher, Steve Hausz, Vadim Hsu, Alex Pujo, Caren Rager, Fermina Murray, Susette Naylor.

Others present: Fred Sweeney, Architect; Joe Grogan, Architect; Laurie Owens, Airport Project Planner; Karen Ramsdell, Airport Director; Justine Leong, Architect.

Presentation: Fred Sweeney provided, by means of PowerPoint slides, color drawings, site plans, and sketches, a detailed presentation of the components for the proposed project.

Public comment opened at 4:21 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, stated that he would like to see more shade trees at the airport and suggested using boxed orange trees.

Public comment closed at 4:22 p.m.

Straw vote: How many support an uncovered connection between the two buildings? 12/2/0.

**Commission Comments:** 1) Most of the Commissioners feel the proposal promises to be a very nice building. The applicant has succeeded in using an architectural vocabulary that works for the function of the building and its relationship to the historic structure. 2) The ABR and the HLC like the bold statement of the entry. However, there are too many small things going on at the back that are too logical\*, and in need of more romance. 3) The iconic element at the rear should stay, but the rest of the building needs to come down in scale so that the iconic element maintains its importance and bigness. 4) The rotunda element is almost as big as the entry, and it needs to become smaller. 5) The entry component from the long term parking, the gazebo or pergola, appears out of scale and needs to be subservient to both the original and the new buildings. 6) The Commissions are in favor of more landscaping. There is support for orange trees, but perhaps relocated to create a spacious plaza entryway. 7) Restudy the Santa Barbara tropical experience so that it bleeds out more and is not just grass and palm trees. 8) Add more landscaping in the car rental area, perhaps green ground would be a mitigating measure. 9) The Commission shares the City Council's desire to incorporate green element solutions whenever possible in that they would have a drastic impact on this building. 10) Both Commissions recommend serious consideration of relocating the historic building as noted on the plans. 11) One ABR member does not support the project for the size, bulk, and scale. 12) Airports in southern climates are more successful when they are more open and the interior/exterior relationship appears more casual. 13) The Commissions are not in favor of requiring a weather-proof connection with long-term parking.

\* too rigidly organized

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

10. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(5:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates. This addendum is focused on the reconstruction of the Main Building of Group B.)**

Staff comment: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner stated that Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations found in the report.

**Motion: Commission accepts the report as presented.**  
 Action: Boucher/Rager, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

11. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(5:18) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL, AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect.

**Motion:** Continued to January 10, 2007, back to the Full Board with the following comments: 1) The character, placement, and size of the restroom building are not acceptable. Study use of adjacent space for the restroom function. 2) Retain the planar quality of the existing lawn. Minimize berming against the pool. 3) Study the stairs from the pool deck to the terrace. 4) At least two Commissioners cannot support this proposal.

**Action:** Pujo/Hausz, 6/3/0. Motion Carried. (Naylor, La Voie, Boucher opposed.)

**\*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:44 P.M. TO 6:02 P.M. \*\***

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

12. 1025 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone  
 (6:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-007  
 Application Number: MST2006-00224  
 Owner: Haywards Family Partnership  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects

(Proposal to demolish 15,371 square feet of existing commercial buildings, demolish surface parking with 45 spaces and construct a new, four-story mixed-use project with 27,145 square feet of underground parking including 66 covered parking spaces, 14,168 square feet of commercial space and 25,419 square feet of one, two and three bedroom condominium units (15 units total) on four separate parcels (APNs 029-211-006, -007, -008, and -009) totaling 31,310 square feet. Two of the condominium units would be affordable. Approximately 10,000 cubic yards of grading excavation is proposed as a part of this project. Planning Commission approval will be required for a Tentative Subdivision Map, a modification of the 10% open space requirement, and a modification of the lot area requirements to allow two over-density units.)

**(Third Concept Review.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)**

**Present:** Brian Cearnal, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:13 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, resident, stated that the project is better, but looks like it might be competing with the County Court House. Mr. De Forest suggested planting shade trees.

Chair Suding read into the record comments from Robert Maxim, resident, stating that the building is bulky and too tall. Mr. Maxim requested consideration of the visual aspects of the Courthouse as approaching Santa Barbara Street from the south.

Public comment closed at 6:17 p.m.

**Motion:** Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments: 1) The east elevation is at a good Santa Barbara scale. 2) The fourth-floor east, north and south elevations need more romance and traditional detailing. 3) Retain all landscape areas, particularly the areas behind the sidewalk on Santa Barbara Street. 4) The mass, bulk, and scale are appropriate; however, the Commission reserves the right to finesse the mass, bulk, and scale at a later time when the elevations are developed at a larger graphic scale.

Action: La Voie/Murray, 4/3/0. Motion carried. (Hsu, Naylor, and Pujo opposed due to lack of uniformity and in fairness toward all applicants. Boucher/Hausz absent.)

**Motion: To withdraw the previous motion.**

Action: La Voie/Murray 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Hausz absent.)

**Substitute**

**Motion: Continued indefinitely back to the Full Board with the following comments: 1) The applicant is to provide larger scale elevations and a complete conceptual landscape plan after DART application. 2) The east elevation is at an appropriate Santa Barbara scale. 3) The fourth floor east, north and south elevations need more romance and traditional detailing. 4) Retain all landscape areas, particularly behind the sidewalk on Santa Barbara Street. 5) The mass, bulk and scale are generally acceptable.**

Action: La Voie/Pujo 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Hausz absent.)

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

13. 222 W ALAMAR AVE

R-3/SD-2 Zone

(6:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-213-008  
 Application Number: MST2006-00318  
 Owner: Kevin Fewell  
 Applicant: Jim Donohoe  
 Architect: On Design Architecture and Planning

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "McKain Residence." Proposal to demolish an existing 1,486 square foot single-family residence and detached 220 square foot garage and construct three new condominium units totaling 2,627 square feet. Five parking spaces will be provided in three attached garages totaling 1,070 square feet. This approximately 6,000 square foot parcel is located outside of El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Staff Hearing officer approval will be required for a front yard setback modification.)

**(Second Concept Review. Note: Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by Historic Landmarks Commission on November 11, 2004, under MST2004-00741.)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A FRONT YARD SETBACK MODIFICATION.)**

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Architect.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer with the following comments: 1) The site plan is still ingenious. 2) The Commission appreciates the open space that is now on the first floor level. 3) The Commission still supports the modification for the reduction in parking spaces, and setback. 4) Continue to study the surface materials of the driveway. 5) Study moving the Unit A and Unit C trash enclosures so the porches can be larger and perhaps turn the corner. 6) Resolve the entrance delineation to Unit B. 7) Carve out as much of the driveway for landscape as possible. 8) The majority of the Commission felt that the American Gothic style should be simplified, with less ornamentation and decoration, in a more folk style to capture the charm of the existing building. 9) Use a horizontal siding and composition roof. At least one Commissioner supports the metal standing seam roofing. 10) Study the fenestration on all elevations.**

Action: Hsu/Pujo, 9/0/0. Motion carried. (Boucher/Hausz absent.)

**CONSENT CALENDAR****NEW ITEM**

A. 836 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-001

Application Number: MST2006-00694

Owner: U.S.A.

Architect: Robert J. Coles, Jr.

Business Name: U.S. Post office - Main Branch

(This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara Post office." Proposal to restore the existing metal clad entry doors at the Anacapa and Cañón Perdido Street façades.)

**(This is a courtesy review.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

B. 105 ONTARE HILLS LN A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-160-028

Application Number: MST2006-00366

Owner: Theodore Smyth, Jr.

Agent: Sophie Calvin

(Proposed 323 square foot addition and 1,280 square foot cabana to an existing single-family residence with detached garage and storage.)

**(Review After Final of changes to cabana design.)**

**Final Approval as submitted.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

C. 2201 LAGUNA ST E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-005

Application Number: MST2004-00548

Owner: Old Mission Santa Barbara

Applicant: Grant Castleberg

(Proposal to relocate 15 Stations of the Cross Monuments (concrete and mosaic tile monuments) from an adjacent parcel to the Mission site. Work to include new paving, fencing, gates, benches, planting, and tree removal.)

**(Review of added monument with donor names.)**

**Continued to January 10, 2007.**

**NEW ITEM**

- D. 721 E COTA ST R-3 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-110-004  
Application Number: MST2006-00707  
Owner: Santa Barbara High School District  
Applicant: Richard Krystian  
Architect: Kruger Bensen Ziemer Architects  
(This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara Junior High School." Proposal to install a new gate and railing to secure exterior stairs.)

**Final Approval as noted on the drawings with revised drawings to be submitted to Staff prior to permit issuance. Historic findings made. Findings for alterations to a City Landmark made.**

**NEW ITEM**

- E. 834 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-001  
Application Number: MST2006-00708  
Owner: State of California  
Agent: Jarrell Jackman  
Applicant: Ron Benson  
Business Name: Panino  
(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Moulet House, Chinese Koumintang Party Headquarters." As-built proposal for eight metal tables, 24 stackable metal chairs, and six umbrellas. (Approval of this proposal will abate ENF2006-00476.))

**Final Approval as submitted, with the comment that chairs are to be black color.**

**NEW ITEM**

- F. 1324 STATE G C-2 Zone  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-132-015  
Application Number: MST2006-00710  
Owner: Arlington Plaza, LLC  
Architect: Sherry & Associates Architects  
Business Name: Bella Dolce Bakery  
(Proposal to install a rooftop make-up air unit at the Arlington Plaza shopping center.)

**Final Approval as noted on the plans.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

## G. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST99-00305  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Agent: Project Solutions, LLC  
Agent: Trish Allen, SEPPS, Inc.  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

**(Final approval of Review After Final of minor wall bump-out on east side of Building 11.)**

**(REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 086-06 AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)**

**Final Approval as submitted. Historic Resources findings were made.**

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

## H. 421 E FIGUEROA ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-017  
Application Number: MST2004-00008  
Owner: Allen & Angela Zimmer  
Architect: Architects West

(This is a City Landmark: Arrellanes-Kirk Adobe. Proposal to demolish 1,000 square feet of an existing 1,810 square foot residence and add 2,330 square feet to the residence. Additionally, the applicant proposes to add two rental units totaling 5,335 square feet.)

**(Review After Final of change to landscaping and new historic plaque.)**

**(REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 038-06.)**

**Final Approval as submitted of the landscaping. The plaque shall be located parallel to the sidewalk, and inset onto the wall west of the driveway.**

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:18 P.M. \*\***