



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, October 18, 2006

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, Chair – Present
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- STEVE HAUSZ – Absent
- VADIM HSU – Present from 1:36 p.m. to 3:28 p.m. and at 3:43 p.m.
- ALEX PUJO – Absent
- CAREN RAGER – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
- DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
- ROGER HORTON – Absent
- WILLIAM MAHAN – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
- HEATHER BAKER, Project Planner – Present 1:33 p.m. to 1:44 p.m.
- DEBRA ANDALORO, Project Planner – Present 1:49 p.m. to 2:19 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present until 4:21 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on October 13, 2006, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:34):

- A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 4, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of October 4, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 6/0/1. (Rager abstained. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Rager, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a) Chair Suding will be stepping down from Item 1, 35 State Street. Commissioner Naylor will be stepping down from Item 10, 2300 Garden Street, and will be leaving the meeting at 5:00 p.m. today. Commissioner Rager will be stepping down from Items 7 and 8, 1214 State Street, and Item 10, 2300 Garden Street.
- b) Commissioner Hausz will be absent today.
- c) The utility upgrade project at 2300 Garden Street, which was postponed two weeks to today's hearing, has been postponed for another two weeks to November 1, 2006, at Staff's request. Staff is still waiting for the Archaeological Letter Report to be submitted.
- d) Item 9 on today's agenda, which is the proposed project at 800 Santa Barbara Street, has been postponed to November 15, 2006, at the applicant's request.

- e) The County Architect Robert Ooley gave a presentation to the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) last May regarding the “Preserve America” program. The program allocates funding for heritage planning grants, provides access to resources to complete neighborhood surveys, and assists homeowners in landmarking their properties. Subsequent to that meeting, the City Council recommended designation of Santa Barbara as a “Preserve America” community and the Acting Secretary of the Interior made that designation. A welcome sign has been received to be installed at some key point in the city welcoming people to Santa Barbara as a Preserve America community. Staff requested that the HLC members, over the next couple of weeks, think about a possible location for placement of the sign and on the November 1st agenda there will be a discussion on where the sign should be placed. Mr. Jacobus added that the “Preserve America” program’s main purpose is to help promote heritage tourism throughout the country. The metal welcome sign is meant to be placed on a street pole at a main point of entry to the City. He explained that if the Commission does not feel that a metal sign is appropriate (e.g., in El Pueblo Viejo District), the logo and sign can be placed on different material, such as a tile background.
 - f) There will be a Designations Subcommittee meeting on Wednesday, November 1st, at 10:00 a.m. in the Housing and Redevelopment Conference Room on the second floor at 630 Garden Street.
 - g) Two copies of the original 1924 Olmsted & Cheney Plans are now available to HLC members on a temporary loan basis. HLC members can contact Susan Gantz to borrow the plans.
 - h) The Commission was reminded that the application deadline for boards and commissions is November 6, 2006. Applications and appointment information can be obtained from the City Clerk’s office at City Hall. The three commissioners coming to the close of their current terms, Alex Pujo, Caren Rager, and Phil Suding, are eligible to reapply for another four year term.
- 2. Heather Baker, Project Planner, spoke about the Solar Design Guidelines and Recognition Awards program. Ms. Baker requested that the Commission review the documents and provide written comments at the scheduled November 1st discussion meeting. Staff plans to present the revised Guidelines with the Commission’s input to City Council in the month of November.
 - 3. Ms. Boucher announced that the Commission’s annual holiday party will be December 10th at Don Sharpe’s home. A sign-up sheet will be provided at the next HLC meeting.
 - 4. Mr. Suding requested that the HLC members think of possible nominees worthy of the Saint Barbara Award for individuals who perform outstanding service to enhance and preserve the built environment of Santa Barbara, the Lockwood De Forest Award for excellence in landscape architecture and non-habitable structures, the G.W. Smith Award for exemplary design in architecture, and the Pearl Chase Award for exemplary design in historic architecture (either new, renovated or conserved).

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. 35 STATE ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone
(1:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004

Application Number: MST97-00357
Applicant: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP
Agent: Ken Marshall
Architect: Doug Singletary
Landscape Architect: Philip Suding
Engineers: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda
Business Name: Ritz-Carlton Club

(Proposal for the Ritz-Carlton Club involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right-of-way.)

(Update on progress of HLC-requested information from hearing of September 20, 2006.)

Present: Doug Singletary, Architect
Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
Colin Blaney, Principal, Crosby Group

Straw votes: How many of the Commissioners could support reconstruction of the building? 0/6/0.
(All Commissioners opposed.)

How many of the Commissioners could support reconstruction of the State Street façade only? 0/6/0. (All Commissioners opposed.)

How many of the Commissioners could support retention of only the State and Mason Streets façade with minor alterations, which would be the cut-in of the driveway entrance? 4/2/0. (Rager/Hsu opposed.)

How many Commissioners could support the retention of all four exterior walls? 6/0/0.

Staff comments: Debra Andaloro, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst, stated that the applicant was given approval by the Planning Commission (PC) for a project design as shown on the PC signed plans. The building may not be able to be preserved as originally anticipated; therefore, the applicant needs a revised preliminary approval because what was given PC approval may now have to be changed. A variety of methods are being explored to have the building continue to look as it does today and the HLC could approve a design that is compatible with the originally PC approved plans.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments, suggestions, and/or questions:

1. Confirmed that the building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and stated that the Historic Structures Report found that it is worthy of being a structure of merit.
2. Verified that it was not a condition of approval that it be designated as a landmark.
3. Requested that the applicant rate the difficulty of each of the options presented.
4. Expressed reservation that they do not want to see the arcade filled in or iron braces in the front of the building and do not want to see the building look any different than it does today.
5. Asked the applicant if it would be possible to rebuild the arcade.

6. Verified that the existing structural condition of the building is a concrete frame, analyzable and URM (unreinforced masonry).
7. Clarified that the suggestion to replace the arches with a currently code compliant arch system was referring to reconstruction, not preservation.
8. Asked if a new wall (concrete or steel) could be built inside the existing façade of the State Street elevation to support, give the lateral needed, and leave the existing storefront as-is.
9. Confirmed that the portion of the building that is above the first floor is URM, so that there is no reinforcement.
10. Asked if applicant has considered a less invasive system, such as a center-core.
11. Stated the Commission's concern is that the building will not look the same if reconstructed, will look as if it was built in recent years, and will lose all of its character.
12. Asked if saving the building's historic fabric has been budgeted and if the applicant can afford it.
13. Stated that any changes proposed need to be minimized.
14. Stated that the Commission would like to know how the building can continue looking as it does now and if the applicant can make it happen.
15. Clarified that the plans presented are a draft only.

Motion: Continued two weeks with direction to return with further details to answer and address Commission concerns, to prepare an Historic Structures Report evaluating applicant proposals for the California Hotel, and to provide the cost of applicant proposals for the California Hotel.

Action: Hsu/Naylor (Suding stepped down. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion withdrawn (comments only).

Motion withdrawn.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

2. 924 PHILINDA AVE C-2 Zone
 (2:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-002
 Application Number: MST2005-00778
 Owner: Lance Kronberg
 Applicant: Laura Bridley
 Architect: Dave Jones

(Proposal for a condominium conversion of an existing 4,638 square foot apartment building consisting of four three-bedroom units and to convert four single-car carports to single-car garages and construct one new single-car garage with deck on top. Also proposed on this 14,941 square foot lot is to provide one new uncovered parking space, a new trash enclosure, and a new patio area.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions regarding the lack of potential for significant archaeological resources to be present.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 6/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo/Suding absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 930 PHILINDA AVE C-2 Zone

(2:22) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-001
 Application Number: MST2005-00823
 Owner: Rosario Perry
 Agent: Laura Bridley
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(Proposal to convert 4 existing apartments to 4 condominiums. The project also includes converting a 4-car carport to a 4-car garage as well as several improvements and alterations to the site. A mutual access agreement for reciprocal use of the driveway serving 924 Philinda and 930 Philinda is also proposed.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

Staff comments: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions regarding the lack of potential for significant archaeological resources to be present.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Rager/Murray, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 318 W FIGUEROA ST R-4 Zone

(2:23) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-025
 Application Number: MST2006-00150
 Owner: John H. Kingsbury
 Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal to add two, two-story units to an existing 1,168 square foot, one-story single-family residence resulting in a residential triplex. The new units will be approximately 927 square feet each and the proposal includes three garage parking spaces and three uncovered parking spaces on the 7,521 square foot lot.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D.)

Present: Ronald Nye, Historian
 Rex Ruskauff, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Murray/Naylor, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

5. 1129 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2006-00197
Owner: 1129 State Street
Architect: Douglas Keep
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and the California Inventory of Historic Resources: San Marcos Court Building. Proposed exterior renovations as follows: At the east elevation, remove existing first-floor awnings, reconfigure entry, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, add cornice dentil molding to match existing, add cornice band below second story windows, add new windows and entry doors, and repaint exterior. At the interior arcade off State Street, reconfigure windows and doors and add a tile wainscot. At the courtyard south wall, restore arched openings to match original design (currently filled in), restore existing paving material, reconfigure existing planting areas and add a low curb, and add new plantings in selected areas. At the west elevation, reconfigure stairs to combine 1123 and 1129 rear entrances, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, and remove existing tile roof appendage. This parcel is approximately 52,801 square feet and is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Carole Denardo.)

Present: Douglas Keep, Architect

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated this was an Addendum which the Commission requested based on a current proposal to update the storefronts on one portion of the building. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. He highlighted that one of the issues the report focused on was the addition of the rod iron and steel canopies in the front of the building. Although that is a traditional element particularly in the South, it is not common in southern California cities because of the climate. The report highlights the fact that the building traditionally has had cloth awnings and recommended that the applicant take that direction if shade devices are desired.

Public comment opened at 2:29 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest asked if, with the closing of Copeland's Sports, the courtyard can be restored and commented that the courtyard had been compromised by the extension of the Woolworth store.

Public comment closed at 2:30 p.m.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 1129 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:31) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037
Application Number: MST2006-00197
Owner: 1129 State Street
Architect: Douglas Keep
Landscape Architect: Martha Degasis

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and the California Inventory of Historic Resources: San Marcos Court Building. Proposed exterior renovations as follows: At the east elevation, remove existing first-floor awnings, reconfigure entry, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, add cornice dentil molding to match existing, add cornice band below second story windows, add new windows and entry doors, and repaint exterior. At the interior arcade off State Street, reconfigure windows and doors and add a tile wainscot. At the courtyard south wall, restore arched openings to match original design (currently filled in), restore existing paving material, reconfigure existing planting areas and add a low curb, and add new plantings in selected areas. At the west elevation, reconfigure stairs to combine 1123 and 1129 rear entrances, install new precast entry surrounds to match existing moldings, and remove existing tile roof appendage. This parcel is approximately 52,801 square feet and is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Present: Douglas Keep, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:11 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest commented that returning the courtyard to its original configuration may not be possible. He asked what happened to the arches shown on the building in the Historic Structures Report, Figure A-3, and requested that the arches be recreated and that the entrance be fixed-up.

Public comment closed at 3:13 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates owner's efforts to fix-up this building. 2) On the arcade elevation, steel awnings should be replaced with an entablature and/or casings around them. 3) On the State Street elevation, a frame and panel treatment of the area above the awnings is better than the lack of ornamentation. 4) It was recommended that the small window on the west elevation parking lot be covered with a *reja*. 5) The arcade architecture should be less postmodern and have more Spanish Renaissance detailing.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

7. 1214 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
Application Number: MST2004-00005
Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report regarding the proposed revised north elevation prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Architect
Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates

Staff comments: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff received a letter from the applicants regarding the Post/Hazeltine Associates advisory recommendations contained in the report addressing aesthetic issues. The Commission will address those issues through the ongoing review of the project. Staff has read the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Rager stepped down. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

8. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Review After Final of revised north elevation.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Architect
 Monisha Adnani, Project Manager

Straw vote: How many Commissioners could support a more traditional treatment of the doorway and windows? 3/3/0.

How many Commissioners could support a more simple treatment (i.e., back of house as shown)? 3/3/0.

Motion: Final approval of Review After Final as submitted with the following comments: 1) The windows should take cues from the front of the building. 2) Reconfigure the window arrangement. 3) The doorway and windows should strike a balance between fitting into El Pueblo Viejo District and being back of house, more simple.

Action: Motion withdrawn. No vote taken.

First

Substitute Motion: Final approval of Review After Final as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 3/3/0. (Boucher/La Voie/Murray opposed. Rager stepped down. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion failed.

Second

Substitute Motion: Final approval of the Review After Final and details to return to the Consent Calendar in two weeks with the following comments: 1) The applicant shall incorporate a minor embellishment of the door surround. 2) Some attention shall be paid to the design of the opposing cheek wall.

Action: La Voie/Hsu, 6/0/0. (Rager stepped down. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:10 P.M. TO 3:12 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 800 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-028
 Application Number: MST2006-00129
 Owner: 800 Santa Barbara Street Investment Company
 Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services
 Architect: Brian Cearnal
 Landscape Architect: Van Atta & Associates

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,965 square foot office building and construct a three-story mixed-use project comprised of eight residential and two commercial condominium units on an 18,713 square foot parcel. Thirty underground parking spaces would be provided. Planning Commission approval will be required for a lot line adjustment of 1,529 square feet from adjacent parcel number 031-012-027 to meet residential density requirements.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

This item was postponed to November 15th at applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

10. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(3:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00611
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose
 Architect: Machin & Mead Architecture

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to replace an existing wall with a new eight-foot tall by 12-inch wide by 45-foot long wall at the northern property line to the north of the shop building. The proposal also includes a new curved stone toe protection wall which will be approximately two feet tall by two feet thick by 45 feet long at the base of the existing retaining wall near the northeast side of the property. Replacement of landscaping is also proposed on this 11.92 acre parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Part II.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Present: Mary Rose, Applicant

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated this project will require archaeological monitoring.

Public comment opened at 3:18 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest asked if it has been discovered how old the walls are and commented they should be preserved as much as possible.

Ms. Rose responded that the age of the walls is not known, but every effort is being made to protect the oldest known wall, although it no longer has a foundation.

Public comment closed at 3:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comments: 1) The proposed wall should be separate and distinct in material from the existing wall that is to remain. 2) The chain link fence is not acceptable.

Action: La Voie, Hsu, 5/0/0. (Naylor/Rager stepped down. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:28 P.M. TO 3:32 P.M. ****

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

11. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued In-Progress Review of architectural details for Main Building of Group B.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 James Jones and Minh Pham, Representing Ownership

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates the much improved drawings. 2) The mechanical screen needs to be mocked-up on the site. 3) The mechanical screen needs to be more detailed as if it was intentionally meant to be part of building. 4) On the south elevation, the area above the brick columns needs more detail.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

12. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST99-00305
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
Architect: Henry Lenny
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes Buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

(Continued Review After Final of minor wall bump-out on east side of Building 11.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION TO ENCROACH INTO THE INTERIOR YARD SETBACK AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
James Jones and Minh Pham, Representing Ownership
Trish Allen, SEPPS

Staff comments: Kathleen Kennedy, Assistant Planner, stated that the building is currently encroaching into the setback and that the proposal is a minor modification with a small encroachment. Although Staff has not formulated a recommendation for the Planning Commission and Staff Hearing Officer (SHO) at this point, Staff is leaning towards being in support of the applicant's proposal.

Straw vote: How many of the Commissioners are in favor of the modification for encroachment into the interior setback? 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely to return to the Consent Calendar for final approval after Planning Commission/Staff Hearing Officer's action with the comment that the Commission's support of the modification is based on unusual site constraints and building preservation.

Action: Hsu/Rager, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed. Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. 514 STATE ST C-M Zone

(3:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-037
 Application Number: MST2006-00615
 Owner: Judith Garrett
 Designer: Josh Blumer
 Business Name: Sandbar

(Exterior patio improvements for Sandbar restaurant including a new wrought iron enclosure, tables, and chairs, new built-in seating along the north end of the patio, new fire pit, replacement of exterior doors, repair and replacement of exterior flooring, and removal of existing planters.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Present: Josh Blumer and Diana Costea, Designers from AB Design Studio

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The majority of the Commission feels uneasy about the living room/curtain treatment of the patio in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. 2) The space should look more like an outdoor space as opposed to a living room. 3) Equipment (e.g., TV, cords, lights, etc.) needs to be permanently screened. 4) At least one Commissioner is not convinced of the furniture style. 5) Traditional light fixtures proposed on the adjacent building are not appropriate to that building. 6) Applicant should address all existing violations (e.g., heaters). 7) The awning structure needs to be screened and made to look like the building architecture. 8) At least two Commissioners felt that a more permanent solution to screening the space underneath the steel and canvas awning should be studied. 9) Applicant should add details and dimensions for awning spears. 10) The Commission supports the iron face detail within the sidewalk. 11) Restudy the gas fire pit to eliminate the recessed kick plate. 12) The proposed furniture shall be compatible with the ultimately proposed/accepted style of the patio.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz/Pujo absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

A. 26 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-031
 Application Number: MST2006-00588
 Owner: Peoples' Self-Help Housing Corporation
 Engineer: John Maloney
 Business Name: Victoria Hotel

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Victoria Hotel and shops. Proposal to upgrade electrical service with installation of new electrical metering equipment.)

(Final approval of subpanel enclosure details.)

Final Approval with changes to return to Staff as noted on drawings.

CONTINUED ITEM

- B. 302 W MICHELTORENA ST R-4 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-012
Application Number: MST2006-00448
Owner: Ruben Montes
Designer: William Breau

(This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for construction of a patio cover, door alteration, and exterior utility hookups at an existing six-unit residential structure located on a 6,381 square foot lot.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval of project as submitted.

NEW ITEM

- C. 228 E DE LA GUERRA ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-082-005
Application Number: MST2006-00526
Owner: Norma Cuellar-Birkland
Contractor: Nelson Ramirez
Contractor: Jose Hernandez

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Belen Castro Residence." Proposal to replace deteriorating eaves, rain gutters, and failing stone retaining wall.)

Continued indefinitely.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- D. 123 E CANON PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-291-029
Application Number: MST2002-00778
Applicant: State of California
Agent: Jarrell Jackman
Agent: Mike Imwalle
Architect: Norman Caldwell
Business Name: El Presidio Historic Park
Business Name: Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation

(This site is a State Historic Park and a City Landmark. Proposed reconstruction of northwest corner of Spanish Royal Presidio. New construction of adobe structures, yard walls, defense wall, and restrooms. A portion of the new construction would encroach into Canon Perdido Street which will require City Council approval.)

(Review After Final of reduced scope of work. Original design reviewed and approved under MST97-00760. Project subsequently split into three phases.)

Final Approval of Review After Final as submitted.

NEW ITEM

E. 530 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-026
Application Number: MST2006-00619
Owner: McColm Family Trust 8/13/99
Applicant: Kandur, Inc.
Designer: Magi Myggen
Business Name: Open Wide Modern Furniture

(Proposal to reinstall, repair (weld sawcuts), and repaint wrought iron entry surround that was removed, and repaint exterior storefront of the former RADD retail store. Reinstallation and repair of wrought iron will abate ENF2006-00848.)

Final Approval with changes to return to Staff.

NEW ITEM

F. 610 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-132-019
Application Number: MST2006-00616
Owner: PDJ Partnership
Owner: Peter Lewis
Agent: Rob Maday
Business Name: Cost Plus World Market

(Proposal to repair and repaint an existing raised planter and install one 96" box Magnolia grandiflora at the rear of World Market retail store. Previous tree was removed by order of the City Arborist due to safety concerns.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:27 P.M. ****