



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, September 20, 2006 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **1:33 P.M.**

COMMISSION MEMBERS:
 PHILIP SUDING, Chair, Present
 WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair, Present
 LOUISE BOUCHER, Present
 STEVE HAUSZ, Present
 VADIM HSU, Present at 2:25 p.m.
 ALEX PUJO, Present
 CAREN RAGER, Present
 FERMINA MURRAY, Present
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, Absent
 DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent
 ROGER HORTON, Absent
 WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present
 JAN HUBBELL, SENIOR PLANNER, Present
 DEBRA ANDALORO, ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYST/PROJECT PLANNER, Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, URBAN HISTORIAN, Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II, Present
 KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on September 15, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 6, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 6 2006, with corrections.

Action: La Voie/Rager, 6/0/1. (Naylor/Hsu absent. Hausz abstained.)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Commissioner La Voie, with the exception of Item F, 115 W Canon Perdido, which was reviewed by Commissioner Suding.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a) Commissioner Naylor will be absent from today's meeting.
- b) Commissioner Hsu will be arriving around 2:15 p.m.
- c) Chair Suding will be stepping down on Items 4 & 5, 35 State Street.
- d) Commissioners Hsu and LaVoie will be stepping down on Item 16, 801 State Street.
- e) Commissioner Rager will be stepping down on Items 6 & 7, 1214 State Street, and Item 20, 2300 Garden Street, respectively.
- f) Items 11 & 12, 1900 Lasuen, have been postponed indefinitely to the Full Board at the applicant's request.

Motion: To continue indefinitely Items 11 & 12, 1900 Lasuen, at the applicant's request.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

2. Commissioner Hausz announced he will be stepping down from Item 15, 33 E. Canon Perdido Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner La Voie reviewed the second version of the Airport Terminal Project's new location and configuration which will be reviewed by the HLC in two weeks.

Commissioner Hausz reported on last Wednesday's Plaza De La Guerra Subcommittee meeting to review three proposals of the landscape architecture. They determined that any widening of the sidewalks or roadway would result in an approximate 22% loss in plaza area of the proposed project. This underscores the importance of a report recommending to City Council an expanded scope to resolve parking, widening sidewalk, and roadway issues when the proposed project is heard at City Council on October 3rd. Mr. Jacobus has been requested to make an historical assessment, and as yet, has not found any historical significance related to the proposed project. He will continue his historical research.

Commissioner La Voie reported that the Cabrillo Blvd./Mission Creek Bridge reconstruction project was given clearer direction by the Subcommittee to construct the bridge on the north side of the Castagnola building; and the part of the bridge in front of the building should look like the building and not the bridge. The Subcommittee was comfortable with the proposed prime-interpretive 1927 period design of the bridge. Mr. Jacobus also mentioned other proposed changes such as the removal of the balcony structure in front of the Rusty's Pizza and extending the new bridge all the way to the corner of Helena Avenue.

Commissioner La Voie reported on last Tuesday's Planning Commission and City Council joint session on housing issues which focused on mixed-used housing in the City. He shared reactions to the appeal of the project at 3408 & 3412 State Street.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 336 N MILPAS ST C-2 Zone
 (1:49) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-371-021
 Application Number: MST2006-00236
 Owner: EHE Realty Company
 Architect: Paul Poirier
 Business Name: Long's Drugs

(Proposal for a new one-story 12,121 square foot commercial building and a 49 space parking lot for Long's Drugs at the northwest corner of Milpas and Gutierrez Streets. The proposal includes the voluntary merger of three lots totaling 39,130 square feet and demolition of three existing non-residential buildings totaling 12,919 square feet.

(The project requires Development Plan approval.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Paul Poirier, Architect
 Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post-Hazeltine Associates

- Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following conditions: 1) Various date corrections shall be made on page 7 and 14, with “early 1970’s”, and “1988” amended to “1979” respectively. 2) Figure 2, Item 336 is mislabeled as Item 328 and shall be corrected. 3) On page 21, Item F shall state that, “...the property at 328 N. Milpas Street does *not* qualify...”. 4) The HLC forwards the recommendation to the ABR to retain the original setback of the building. It was recommended that various aspects of the building could be preserved such as the pilasters and window transoms. One Commissioner would also like to see a less generically designed replacement structure to include elements of the moderne style as recommended in the report.
- Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 630 ANACAPA ST C-M Zone
 (1:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-011
 Application Number: MST2005-00798
 Owner: James Craviotto
 Applicant: Tynan Group
 Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal to demolish an existing 2,155 square foot house, 506 square foot garage, and 5,507 square feet of commercial buildings and construct a four-level mixed-use project (three stories above-ground and one-story underground) with 11,507 square feet of commercial space and 10 residential condominium units (three studios and seven two-bedroom units). A total of 34 parking spaces will be provided with 18 spaces for the larger condominiums in separate two-car garages and 16 spaces for the studios and commercial use in an underground parking structure. The two parcels involved (031-151-011 at 630 Anacapa Street and 031-151-001 at 634 Anacapa Street) total approximately 21,000 square feet. The project will require a voluntary lot merger and Planning Commission approval of the Development Plan and for a Tentative Subdivision Map for the condominium development.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates.)

- Motion: The Commission accepts the report.
 Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. 6100 HOLLISTER AVE
 (1:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2005-00480
 Owner: Karen Ramsdell/City of Santa Barbara
 Business Name: Citrix Centre
 Agent: Susan McLaughlin
 Applicant: Andrew Bermant
 Agent: Laurel Fisher Perez
 Architect: Brian Poliquin

(Proposal to develop a mixed use industrial and commercial development, totaling 180,000 square feet located in sub-area #2 and sub-area #3 of the Santa Barbara Airport Area Specific Plan.)

(Review of Proposal to Prepare Phase 3 Data Recovery Excavations and Construction Monitoring CA-SBA-59 prepared by Science Applications International Corporation.)

Staff comment: Ms. Debra Andaloro, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed and accepts the report for a Phase III Data Recovery Program and concludes that the previous and current archaeological investigations support the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Present: David Stone, Stone Archaeological Consulting
Susan McLaughlin, SEPPS
Jeff Dunbar, Forward Planner from Bermant Development Company

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Boucher/Murray, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent).

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

4. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
Application Number: MST97-00357
Business Name: Ritz-Carlton Club
Applicant: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, L P
Architect: Doug Singletary
Landscape Architect: Philip Suding
Engineer: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda
Agent: Ken Marshall
Engineer: Penfield & Smith

(Proposal for the Ritz-Carlton Club involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

(Review of Final Phase 3 Evaluation and Data Recovery Program Report prepared by Michael H. Imwalle and Heather Macfarlane, Macfarlane Archaeological Consultants.)

Present: Heather Macfarlane, Archaeologist
Troy White, Property Owner Representative

Staff comment: Ms. Debra Andaloro, Environmental Analyst/Project Planner, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusion regarding the recommendation that further continued monitoring is required on the site until the Phase III Data Recovery is complete with staff's separate recommendation that continued monitoring be required regardless during all site grading.

Motion: The Commission accepts the draft report, with the conditions that: 1) Continued monitoring shall be required. 2) Dewatering and grading shall proceed on the site in the interim. 3) Further comments by Dr. Glassow shall be addressed in the final report. 4) Exhibits shall be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission and included in the final report.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 6/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent. Suding stepped down).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 35 STATE ST

HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(2:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
Application Number: MST97-00357
Business Name: Ritz-Carlton Club
Applicant: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, L P
Architect: Doug Singletary
Landscape Architect: Philip Suding
Engineer: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda
Agent: Ken Marshall
Engineer: Penfield & Smith

(Proposal for the Ritz-Carlton Club involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

(Revised Preliminary Approval of Area "A" is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 01-103.)

Present: Doug Singletary, Architect
Ken Marshall, Dudek & Associates

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would support the presently proposed delineation of the building? 7/0.

How many Commissioners would support more aesthetically pleasing entrances and doors? 7/0.

Motion: Continued 28 days for a Letter Report and structural analysis with the following comments: 1) Commission supports the proposal but would like the revised Historic Structures Report to address the date of the two door entrances along Mason Street, and to address the two entrances in a more aesthetic manner. 2) The lower roof parapet above the south portion of the building shall be simplified for easier resolution with the top of the roof tile.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor absent. Suding stepped down.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

6. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:37) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second-floor lobby area.)

(The following items are to be reviewed: 1.) Letters submitted to address Conditions of Approval of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted August 23, 2006, regarding the use of CenterCore technology to reinforce the theater wall and proof of physical condition of the decorative plaster surface of the interior pilasters. 2.) Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post-Hazeltine Associates related to the added structural columns on the south elevation.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Architect
 Monisha Adnani, Architect and Project Manager
 Pamela Post, Post-Hazeltine Associates

Staff comment: Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations with the comment that a large vertical surface will be less noticeable than the shadow lines created by the buttresses, and requests that Page 4, Section 4.2 of the report restate and clarify that, "...the buttress would extend from ground level to the bottom cord of the roof tresses behind the parapet."

Motion 1: The Commission accepts the addendum to the report relating to the added structural columns on the south elevation, with the deletion of Item 6. Page 4, Section 4.2 of the report shall restate and clarify that, "...the buttress would extend from ground level to the bottom cord of the roof tresses behind the parapet."

Action: Pujou/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Naylor absent. Rager stepped down.)

Motion 2: The Commission accepts the two letters submitted addressing the Conditions of Approval of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted August 23, 2006, regarding the use of CenterCore technology to reinforce the theater wall and proof of physical condition of the decorative plaster surface of the interior pilasters.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor absent. Rager stepped down.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

7. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada Tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second-floor lobby area.)

(Continued Review After Final of added structural columns on the south elevation.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Applicant
 Monisha Adnani, Architect and Project Manager

Motion: Final approval of the Review After Final of the added structural columns and pilasters on the south elevation as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 6/1/0. (La Voie opposed. Rager stepped down. Naylor absent.)

***** **THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:53 P.M. UNTIL 3:01 P.M.** *****

DISCUSSION ITEM

8. 12 E MONTECITO ST HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

(3:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-051-016
 Application Number: MST95-00044
 Applicant: Redevelopment Agency
 Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio

(Proposal to construct an 11,091 square foot two-story youth hostel with 100 beds and 60 parking spaces on a vacant parcel.)

(Discussion of a revised design of a previously approved youth hostel.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Staff Comment: Jan Hubbell, Senior Planner, explained to the Commission that the item is only for discussion because the Redevelopment Agency, which own most of Lot 2, is undecided on whether they will be participating in the proposed project.

Commission

Comments: 1) The Commission does not accept the portion of the lot that is allocated to the hostel since it is too small, in the wrong location, and inadequate. 2) Applicant shall provide a context of the site with aerial and neighborhood photo documentation. 3) The hostel is not adequate in proving public room sizes or open spaces. 4) The Commission is disappointed with the reduction of an essential community amenity and the lack of expediency and implementation. 5) The Commission remains open about a creative solution. 6) The piece-meal approach to the development of the site is not acceptable. 7) The proposed site plan does not conform to the previously approved project.

DISCUSSION ITEM

9. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:42) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST99-00305
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

(Discussion of proposed minor wall bump-out at bathroom on east side of Building 11.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 James Jones, Representing Ownership
 Trish Allen, SEPPS

Commission

Comments: 1) The Commission supports the proposal as presented and accepts a change in the window location as presented and the deletion of the gable on the north elevation. 2) At this time, the Commission declines to comment on the modification request for the interior yard setback until further information is provided, e.g., the property lines must be shown on the plans.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:53) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Final Approval of the architecture for Units 4, 25, 26, and 29 of Group K is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect
 Minh Pham, representing Ownership
 Trish Allen, SEPPS

Motion: Final Approval with details to return in two weeks to the Consent Calendar with following conditions: 1) Proceed with developing the octagonal column, but eliminate the down spout in front of the column. 2) All details on Building 25 shall match the existing. 3) The Commission encourages and supports a Fire Department variance for wood members based upon conformance to an historic building in an historic district. 4) The project shall not have any exposed flashing over plaster. 5) Plaster shall go to grade, particularly on Details 1 and 8 on Sheet A00.12.01. 6) On Sheet A00.12.00, Roof Section, Detail 12, use finish board on roof decking. 7) On Sheet A00.12.02, use finish board on wood decking edge. 8) On Sheet A29.09.00, Details 3 and 4, change detailing of the lunette window. 9) On Sheet A29.09.00, Detail 2, eliminate the tile cap on the cheek (concrete) wall (adjacent to the stairwell). 10) On Sheet A29.09.00, Detail 2 on same Sheet, revise the column on first floor.

Action: Rager/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.)

***** **THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:15 P.M. UNTIL 4:25 P.M.** *****

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

11. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued review of proposed valet parking structure and tennis court of Group L.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; THIS PORTION OF THE PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

12. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(4:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00490
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Motion: Continued indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

13. 222 W ALAMAR AVE

R-3/SD-2 Zone

(4:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-213-008
Application Number: MST2006-00318
Owner: Kevin Fewell
Applicant: Jim Donohoe
Architect: On Design Architecture and Planning

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "McKain Residence." Proposal to demolish an existing 1,486 square foot single-family residence and detached 220 square foot garage and construct three new condominium units totaling 2,627 square feet. Five parking spaces will be provided in three attached garages totaling 1,070 square feet. This approximately 5,800 square foot parcel is located outside of El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Staff Hearing officer approval will be required for a front yard setback modification.)

(Note: Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by Historic Landmarks Commission on November 11, 2004, under MST2004-00741.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A FRONT YARD SETBACK MODIFICATION.)

Present: Justin Van Mullem, Architect
Jim Donohoe, Applicant

Public comment opened at 4:39 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, interested party, expressed concern regarding the trailer park and how the applicant would screen the trailer park from public view.

Ms. Gantz made note that a letter was submitted and distributed to all Board members from Ms. Marlene Gillilou, an adjacent neighbor, expressing her concern regarding privacy and parking issues of the proposed project.

Public comment ended at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments: 1) The proposal needs to reflect the architecture of the existing residence conforming to the Historic Structures Report. 2) The building mass needs resolution, particularly with respect to the first and second floors. 3) Lower the first and second floor plate heights. 4) The architecture shall draw inspiration from two-story American Gothic architecture. 5) Site plan is ingenious, particularly with respect to the location of front and rear doors; however, some issues such as the connection to open space need to be resolved. 6) The setback modification is supportable. 7) Restudy the positive and negative space on the elevations. 8) The third-floor roof deck should be restudied for a better solution; at least one Commissioner supported it. 9) Simplify the massing of roof lines more in the direction of the existing structure. 10) Resolve massing relationships, particularly with respect to the front and the rear. 11) Consider the double use of the driveway being utilized for open space and drive, and using alternative materials. 12) If included, the third story element should look more like a cupola.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.)

FINAL REVIEW

14. 523 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(4:56) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-021
 Application Number: MST2004-00854
 Owner: Leon Olson
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal for a three-story mixed-use development consisting of seven residential condominium units and two commercial units. The total net residential square footage is proposed at 17,281 square feet and the commercial units are 1,218 and 1,334 net square feet each, for a total of 2,552 square feet. Nineteen parking spaces are proposed.)

(Final Approval of the landscaping is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 001-06.)

Present: David Black, Landscape Architect

Motion 1: Final Approval of the Landscape Plan.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

15. 33 E CANON PERDIDO ST C-2 Zone

(4:59) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-009
 Application Number: MST2006-00067
 Owner: Lobero Theatre Foundation
 Applicant: David Asbell, Executive Director
 Applicant: Maryanne Clark
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a City Landmark: Lobero Theatre. Proposal for the temporary installation of a 30'x 50' tent for use in the courtyard behind the theatre. This tent will be erected during times of inclement weather for the protection of patrons attending receptions and other events. The tent is expected to be used approximately 39 days during the months of October through April.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK.)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect
 David Asbell, Executive Director of the Lobero Theatre

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would prefer a permanent awning over the ticket sales door?
 1/7. Therefore, by default, the awning should be temporary.

How many Commissioners would support a permanent attachment of the awning to the building? 8/0.

How many Commissioners would support a multi-color concept for the fabric? 8/0.

- Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments: 1) Trying to force the symmetry is not important. 2) The Commission accepts the proposal presented today with the comments that the awning should be removable, the awning attached to the ticket office shall also be removable, and the fabric used should be multi-colored. 3) Applicant is requested to provide a larger color panel for review by the Commission.
- Action: Pujo/Rager, 7/0/0. (Hausz stepped down. Naylor absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

16. 801 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(5:31) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013
 Application Number: MST2006-00154
 Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust 5/9/84
 Architect: Vadim Hsu
 Business Name: Rocks Restaurant & Lounge

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Las Tiendas Building." Proposal to construct a 2,353 square foot third-story addition on an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The addition will be comprised of a new kitchen, bar, and indoor and outdoor patron seating areas, and will result in a structure that is a maximum of 35'-0" tall at the roof ridge line. The project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

Present: Vadim Hsu, Architect
 Kim and Tammy Hughes, Property Owners
 Koji Nomura, Owner of Rocks Restaurant & Lounge

Mr. Hsu clarified that the project description should be corrected to "Proposal to construct a third-story addition of 1,034 square feet of enclosed space, and 1,320 square foot of outdoor dining area for a total gross of 2,354 square feet on an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District."

Public comment opened at 5:33 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern regarding the roof guard and requested the applicant to clarify the height of the roof. Mr. Hsu clarified that the proposal set the plate and roof height with the intention that the existing mansard would help create the "guard rail" and remain as part of the existing building.

Public comment ended at 5:34 p.m.

- Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates the response to prior comments and finds the mass, bulk, and scale acceptable as currently proposed. 2) Study ways to screen the wall on the adjacent building at the third floor. 3) Applicant shall return with more details, particularly on the tower, and missing tower elevations; include other preliminary zoning plan check items such as square footages, scope of work, and project statistics prior to Preliminary Approval. 4) Include fenestration detail on the adjacent building. 5) Applicant shall also provide all elevations prior to Preliminary Approval.
- Action: Pujo/Suding, 4/2/0. (Murray/Boucher opposed. Hsu/La Voie stepped down. Naylor absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

17. 1101 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(5:49) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-232-018
Application Number: MST2006-00515
Owner: 1101 Investors, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to convert approximately 2,900 square feet of existing garage space to commercial office space, infilling a portion of the existing colonnade with a storefront window system. The existing parking lot would be restriped to accommodate the revisions, and a total of four parking spaces would be eliminated on this approximately 10,988 square foot lot located in the 100% Zone of Benefit. The project would require Development Plan Approval findings.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

Present: Craig Shallenberger, Architect

Ms. Gantz read comments from Judy Johnduff, Assistant Transportation Planner:

Pedestrian Access – “The proposed door off the main entrance aisle creates a conflict point between pedestrians and vehicles entering the garage and should be relocated.” There was also a request to clarify how pedestrians would access the garage from the street and the new office area.

Pedestrian Visibility – “There is a concern that the proposed exit driveway on Anacapa Street... does not meet the pedestrian sight visibility standards of the City for pedestrians on the Anacapa Street sidewalk. Each entrance and exit to a parking lot shall be constructed and maintained so that a pedestrian within ten feet of the driveway is visible to the driver when the vehicle is stopped at the property line.”

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments: 1) More traditional windows need to be proposed with perhaps wood being more acceptable. 2) The existing storefront system shall be replaced with something to match the accepted proposal. 3) Correct the sizes of the proposed light fixtures on the elevations. 4) At least one Commissioner accepted the existing storefront system. 5) The detailing and thickness of the columns at the entry and exit at Anacapa Street are extremely important. 6) Show any proposed and existing lighting in the garage.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

18. 331 E VICTORIA ST

R-3 Zone

(6:06) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-084-004
Application Number: MST2005-00752
Owner: Raymond Hicks

(This is a revised Project Description. Proposal to demolish an existing two-story, five unit apartment building, two one-story cottages, and a detached two-car garage, and construct three two-story duplex condominium units (total of six units) with underground parking totaling 14 parking spaces all on a 13,497 square foot lot in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The existing square footage to be demolished totals 4,032 square feet, and the proposed new square footage totals 13,925 square feet (9,168 square feet of living space and 4,757 square feet of underground garage/basement space.) Planning Commission approval is requested for a Tentative Subdivision Map and a condominium development.)

(Third Concept Review. Note: Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by Historic Landmarks Commission on February 22, 2006.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)

Present: Raymond Hicks, Property Owner

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with the following comments: 1) Study proportions of the rebuilt building, particularly the E. Victoria St. elevation. Restoration of the house is appreciated, but be careful and consistent with the detailing. 2) The proposal is moving in the right direction. 3) Add a buffer against the west wall of the lower level floor plan, particularly closest to east Victoria Street. 4) Generous landscaping shall be incorporated into the project to offset the inability to plant over the garage. 5) Provide a landscape plan, as soon as possible, so the Commission can get an understanding of the green space. 6) Porches should be more prominent. 7) Study the massing of the rear structures to become more subordinate to the main house. 8) The project is perhaps exemplary for an infill project. 9) Study switching the locations of buildings 5 and 6.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 7/0/0. (Naylor/Hsu absent.)

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

19. 710 ANACAPA ST

C-2 Zone

(6:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-013
 Application Number: MST2006-00312
 Owner: Carlos Adame
 Agent: Lisa Plowman
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(Concept Review only of a proposal for a new 5,390 square foot, four-story mixed-use development including the preservation of a structure on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources (Myers Cottage). The project will include new construction at ground level to provide commercial space and commercial and residential garages, a second level terrace to provide a platform for the raised historic structure housing office/retail space, and new construction at the rear housing two 3-bedroom condominiums. Staff Hearing Officer approval will be required for the Development Plan, a Tentative Subdivision Map for the condominium development, and a Modification for the 10% open space requirement.)

(Review of revised Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan.)

Present: Lisa Plowman, Agent
 Shelley Bookspan, Agent/Historian
 Carlos Adame, Owner

Public comment opened at 6:33 p.m.

Mr. Kellam De Forest, interested party, submitted comments and a list of interested parties into the record and summarized their concerns regarding the importance of the historic nature of the existing structure.

Mr. Todd Boehr, neighbor, expressed concern regarding preservation of the historic Gothic style structure of the proposed project.

Ms. Susan Chamberlin, local historian, expressed concern regarding preservation of the historic Gothic style structure of the proposed project.

Public comment ended at 6:38 p.m.

Staff comment: Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, reviewed the report and clarified for the Board that the existing building was deemed Structure of Merit-worthy, but not deemed a landmark-worthy.

Motion 1: To initiate landmark designation proceedings for the existing structure.
 Action: Rager/Boucher, 7/1/0. (Hausz opposed. Naylor absent.)

Motion 2: To accept the report but disagreeing with the findings and threshold of significance, and finding the building worthy to become a City Landmark reasoning that it is the last surviving example of this period of worker housing in size and scale representing an era in the El Pueblo Viejo district, particularly on Anacapa Street, and has been a visible neighborhood feature since its construction.
 Action: La Voie/Hausz, 8/0/0. (Naylor absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

20. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(7:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00311
 Owner: SRS Garden Street, LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose & Associates
 Architect: Machin & Mead
 Contractor: Plant Construction

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposed upgrade of site utilities including electrical, gas, and plumbing comprised of trenchwork on existing roadways and in front of the main building, new transformer on concrete pad, new switchgear, and four new fire hydrants. Accessibility improvements will be in conformance with current California Building Code to be implemented in phases related to building upgrades under separate permits. Some parking spaces are proposed to be either slightly shifted or relocated to accommodate accessibility route.)

(Continued Fourth Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

Present: Mary Rose, Agent
 Jorge Machin, Architect
 Chad Rober, Exteriors/Landscape Architect
 Carson Wollert, Associate Engineer for MNS Engineers, Inc.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would prefer similar lighting to what is found at the Riviera?
 1/5.

How many Commissioners can support the Aneron Style No. II Victorian lighting fixtures? 6/0.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments: 1) The Commission supports use of the Teka landscape lighting as sample provided, with the conditions that it have a solid cone at the top, a small finial added to the top, the finish shall not have a clear coat and be allowed to verdigris. 2) The stone pedestrian gate as presented is acceptable with the modification (delineation) of the voussoirs (i.e., sandstone blocks). 3) The eight parking spaces proposed in the northeast corner is an acceptable location with further modification and further study. Configuration of the parking, i.e., the slope, and perhaps straightening out the configuration of the spaces would improve the efficiency of the parking based upon preliminary review. 4) The Commission requests photo documentation of the palm tree at the entrance and the south elevation (i.e., from the bottom of the lawn looking back) with the structures superimposed (drawn) upon the elevations. 5) The Commission recommends the use of the Aneron Style No. II Victorian fluted concrete base, and the lantern shown on top of it in the cut sheet provided.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 6/0/0. (Rager stepped down. Naylor/Boucher absent).

CONSENT CALENDAR**CONTINUED ITEM**

A. 302 W MICHELTORENA ST R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-212-012
Application Number: MST2006-00448
Owner: Ruben Montes
Designer: William Breau

(This property is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for construction of a patio cover, door alteration, and exterior utility hookups at an existing six-unit residential structure located on a 6,381 square foot lot.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

Preliminary Approval and continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

FINAL REVIEW

B. 1811 STATE ST C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-031-012
Application Number: MST2006-00468
Owner: 1811 State Street, LLC
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposed facade remodel of an existing two-story commercial building and minor third floor addition of approximately 36 square feet to provide rooftop access.)

(Final Approval of details is requested.)

Final Approval as noted on the east elevation.

NEW ITEM

C. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
Application Number: MST99-00305
Owner: Orient Express Hotels
Architect: Henry Lenny
Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

(Review of Main Building Salvage Plan.)

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar.

NEW ITEM

D. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2006-00560
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Architect: Dwight Gregory, AIA

(This is a Structure of Merit: Museum of Natural History. Proposal to convert an existing storage area to a work area with minor door and window changes at the rear of the Maximus Storage building.)

Final Approval with the condition that the details shall match the existing.

NEW ITEM

E. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
 Application Number: MST2006-00559
 Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
 Architect: Dwight Gregory, AIA

(This is a Structure of Merit: Museum of Natural History. Proposal to add a rooftop HVAC unit on the Bird Habitat Hall.)

Final Approval as noted on north elevation and roof plan.

FINAL REVIEW

F. 115 W CANON PERDIDO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-022
 Application Number: MST2005-00554
 Owner: General Telephone Company California
 Applicant: Michael Morgan
 Architect: JTC Architects
 Applicant: Jim Tousignant
 Business Name: Verizon California, Inc.

(The project consists of a proposal for a voluntary lot merger of ten legal lots consisting of approximately 2.2 acres, into two lots and a subsequent lot line adjustment of the two resulting lots. The existing Verizon Building (101 W. Canon Perdido Street) would be located on proposed Parcel 1 and the existing annex building (115 W. Canon Perdido Street) would be located on proposed Parcel 2. Proposed improvements for both parcels include the reconfiguration of parking spaces, additional landscaping and new chain link fencing. The existing exterior metal stairs located at the rear of the Verizon building would be reconfigured and the exit stairs at the rear of the annex building are proposed to be enclosed.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 051-06.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:32 P.M. ****