



# City of Santa Barbara

## Planning Division

### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 17, 2006

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

- PHILIP SUDING, Chair – Present, left from 4:45 p.m. to 4:54 p.m.
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair – Present
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present, left 4:38 p.m. to 4:41 p.m.
- STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:34 p.m.
- VADIM HSU – Present at 1:39 p.m., left from 2:55 p.m. to 2:58 p.m.
- ALEX PUJO – Present, left from 2:55 p.m. to 2:59 p.m., left at 4:24 p.m.
- CAREN RAGER – Present
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present
- DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
- ROGER HORTON – Absent
- WILLIAM MAHAN – Absent

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

**STAFF:**

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Absent
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)

<b>HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST</b> (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
<b>CONCEPT REVIEW</b>	Required	<u>Master Application &amp; Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
<b>PRELIMINARY REVIEW</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
<b>FINAL &amp; CONSENT</b>	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color &amp; Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

**PLEASE BE ADVISED**

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- \*\* **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov). If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

**LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

**NOTICE:**

- A. That on May 12, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

## A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

## B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 3, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 3, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Murray/La Voie, 7/0/1. Rager abstained.

## C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 8/0/0.

## D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

## 1. Ms. Gantz announced the following changes to the agenda:

- a) Commissioner Rager will be stepping down from Item 2 (1210 State Street), Item 3 (1210 State Street), and Items 7 and 8 (2300 Garden Street) on today's agenda.
- b) Item 15 on today's agenda, 803 Laguna Street, has been postponed four weeks to June 14<sup>th</sup>, at the applicant's request, while the Arborist Report is being prepared.
- c) The Lower Riviera Special Design Guidelines are scheduled to be reviewed by the City Council at the June 13<sup>th</sup> meeting and at least one Historic Landmarks Commission member is invited to represent the Commission and support the document. Ms. Boucher will agree to attend on behalf of HLC if it is in the evening. Ms. Murray will check her calendar to see if she can attend.
- d) Any items that are continued from today's meeting need to be continued to either the Consent agenda on May 31<sup>st</sup> or the Full Board agenda on June 14, 2006. The May 31<sup>st</sup> HLC meeting is already booked.

## 2. Ms. Murray announced she will be stepping down from Item 4, 420 East Anapamu Street, and Item 6, 2121 Garden Street.

## 3. Ms. Naylor announced she will be stepping down from Items 7 and 8, 2300 Garden Street.

4. Mr. Pujo announced he will be leaving around 4:30 p.m.
5. Mr. La Voie and Mr. Suding announced that they were expecting Planning Commissioner William Mahan to reactivate the George Washington Smith and Lockwood De Forest design awards. The HLC members were encouraged to write down their comments for a future discussion on the subject.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. Hsu reported that, on Saturday, May 13<sup>th</sup>, approximately 100 members of the public attended the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Open House meeting presented by Staff at the Faulkner Gallery. There were approximately 31 public speakers, 16 in favor and 15 in opposition. Many were unhappy with the content of the draft Ordinance. The Update Package will be reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review, Planning Commission, and Historic Landmarks Commission, then will return to the ABR for a final review be forwarded to City Council. The HLC will be reviewing the draft at its May 31<sup>st</sup> meeting.

Mr. Pujo commented that there were many architects in attendance, but none spoke in favor of numbers in general. At the NPO meeting Mr. William Mahan said that numbers, such as Floor to Lot Area Ratio (FAR), do not mean that a project is badly designed, they have nothing to do with esthetics, and that the Ordinance is simply one more regulation.

Mr. Hsu concluded that there is still substantial controversy over what should be an ordinance and what should be a guideline in terms of the draft FAR numbers that are still to be determined by the different boards and commissions.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

**DISCUSSION ITEM:**

(1:44)

**PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED FINANCIAL PLAN 2006-07; OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET FOCUS ON COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT, PLANNING DIVISION AND MAJOR WORKLOAD PROGRAMS.**

Present: Michele De Cant, Administrative Analyst II  
Paul Casey, Community Development Director  
Bettie Weiss, City Planner, present at 1:45.

Ms. De Cant distributed printed information and stated that the Planning Division's submittal will be presented to City Council on Friday, May 19, 2006, at 9:00 a.m.

Ms. Weiss stated that this is an overview of the financial plan that is presented each year and asked for comments after her presentation. Of interest to the boards and commissions that work with the Planning Division are the fee study and fee structure to support the design and development review processes, and major workload efforts.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments, suggestions, and/or questions:

1. Was pleased that incentive programs and historic districts are being given importance.
2. Referred to page C22 in the Annual Performance Plan for Fiscal Year 2007, under Design Review and Historic Preservation Program, where it speaks of "Present Preservation Economic/Financial Incentives program to City Council by June 30, 2007" and asked if it would include the Mills Act and whether the Mills Act is being pursued this year. Ms. Weiss responded that it does include the Mills Act and that Staff is currently working on having that program proposal ready by the given deadline.
3. Asked if the hours mentioned on page C23, (staff hours assisting the Development and Environmental Review Section and completing Historic Resource Evaluations) are directly related to historic resource reports and historic preservation related items. Ms. Weiss responded that the hours in the report are combined for the ABR, HLC, and PC Staff. HLC Staff does work at the Planning and Zoning counter and has contact with the public, which includes knowing the design review and planning process.
4. Showed concern that there are pending historic landmark designations, but much time is being spent on new projects so that there is no protection for many important structures that need to be recognized.
5. Suggested that Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, participate at a Staff level in encouraging landmarks to be created when they are landmark-worthy and inform the public that a landmark designation does not remove the property owner's rights.
6. Proposed that the "Excellence in Customer Service" that was talked about years ago be reviewed once again because it improved efficiency. The purpose would not be to lower the standards, but to improve the expediting of projects. It would especially be beneficial so that projects are not presented to the boards and commissions when they are incomplete or incompatible.
7. Commented that, with increased fees, applicants expect efficiency and a streamlined process. Ms. Weiss responded that the Commission will have an opportunity to make comments when the Draft Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance is reviewed by the HLC and whether there should be more items on the administrative level for review.
8. Requested an explanation of the Sphere of Influence. Ms. Weiss responded that citizens who live in the eastern Goleta area petitioned the City and Local Agency Formation Commission (LAFCO) to consider a possible future annexation. The first step is for LAFCO to look at what they call the Sphere of Influence. LAFCO felt that it would be most appropriate if the General Plan reflected the possibility of what residents in that community would like. The Land Use Element in the General Plan will be amended to state that possible future annexation could include the eastern Goleta area, which is essentially from Santa Barbara's western boundary to the City of Goleta.
9. Showed appreciation for a process that is clearer and more professionally handled in Santa Barbara than it is in other jurisdictions.

### **PRESENTATION ITEM:**

(2:11)

### **PRESERVE AMERICA PROGRAM.**

Present: Robert Ooley, County Architect

Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that a copy of the Council Agenda Report was given to the Commission members. A motion is sought recommending that City Council designate the City of Santa Barbara and join the Preserve America Program.

Mr. Ooley provided a brief description of the "Preserve America Program".

After doing a survey of the heritage resources from Winchester Canyon to Carpinteria, it made sense to designate the entire South Coast as a Preserve America area. There are also efforts to have the City of Santa Barbara designated as a World Heritage, by the United Nations, and others are working on those efforts.

The program for Preserve America gives neighborhoods access to funding for various heritage planning grants. The average grant is about \$250,000, and allows the planning groups to receive resources to complete neighborhood surveys and assist homeowners in landmarking their properties.

The application is almost complete and a draft was distributed to the Commission members. They were asked to send Mr. Ooley any comments that they may want to have incorporated in the final application.

The Acting Secretary of the Interior will be in Santa Barbara next month to designate the area and will assist in the setting of a plaque when she is here.

Motion: The Commission supports the designation of the City of Santa Barbara as a Preserve America community.

Action : Boucher/Rager, 9/0/0.

## **ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**

1. 29 S ALISOS ST R-2 Zone

(2:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-172-015  
Application Number: MST2006-00140  
Owner: Adrian A. and Rhonda R. Gutierrez  
Applicant: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to construct a two-story, 2,438 square foot, single family residence with attached two-car garage on an 8,250 square foot lot that has an existing 970 square foot single family dwelling. The project includes demolition of an existing 520 square foot garage/storage building. The proposal includes four parking spaces; two in the new garage attached to the new dwelling and two uncovered spaces.)

**(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Larry A. Carbone, Western Points Archaeology.)**

Staff comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations that no further archaeological investigation is recommended or necessary at this time.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Hsu, 9/0/0.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

## 2. 1210 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:16) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
Application Number: MST2005-00323  
Owner: Granada Tower LLC  
Architect: Brian Cearnal

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well and roof cupola for roof access, adding rooftop dormer and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor deck on the south elevation of the Granada Building. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

**(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Alexandra Cole, Historian  
Robin Rossi, Ownership

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and suggested that the following statements should be clarified, in both the report and by the applicant, indicating that the proposal includes three antenna towers: 1) On top of page 5, under Specific Project Effect 10, where it says to "bolt a temporary triangular antenna mount to the elevator roof". 2) Near the bottom of page 8, under Alteration 10, in the second paragraph, where it speaks of "the addition of three temporary antennas to the elevator/stair tower". Staff recommends that, as part of the required mitigation measure, a realistic time limit be set allowing the temporary installation of these towers because they will be highly visible while they are up.

Mr. Jacobus stated that the building has numerous addresses ranging from 1210 through 1216 State Street. Staff plans to determine a system to better identify the different projects. The Tower project may be designated as 1210 State Street and the Theater may be 1216 State Street.

Motion: Continued indefinitely pending the mock-up and evaluation of the mitigation measure with the temporary installation of the antennas not to exceed eighteen (18) months.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0. Rager stepped down.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

3. 1210 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019  
Application Number: MST2005-00323  
Owner: Granada Tower LLC  
Architect: Brian Cearnal

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to convert the 7th and 8th and a portion of the 9th floors (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well and roof cupola for roof access, adding rooftop dormer and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor deck on the south elevation of the Granada Building. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

**(Third Concept Review.)**

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect  
Robin Rossi, Ownership  
Diana Kelly, Project Manager  
Alexandra Cole, Historian

Public comment opened at 2:39.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed concern with the fire escape compromising the historic structure and that adding to the height of the building, especially the cupola, will detract from the ambiance of the City.

Public comment closed at 2:41.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments: 1) Adding a cupola to the roof of this building is problematic. 2) The majority of the Commissioners cannot support the additional height. 3) One Commissioner would entertain the cupola and open space pending presentation of the design.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 7/1/0. Hsu opposed. Rager stepped down.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

4. 420 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone

(2:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-005  
Application Number: MST2005-00442  
Owner: Glennon Mueller  
Architect: Lenvik & Minor

(The existing residence is Landmark-worthy. Proposal to construct two new condominium units adjacent to an existing single-family residence for a total of three two-story condominium units. An existing one-car garage is proposed to be demolished and replaced with three new two-car garages. A total of 3,770 square feet of living space and 1,377 square feet of garage space is proposed for the 9,044 square foot lot. Staff Hearing Officer approval is required for a modification for relief from the minimum dimensions for private outdoor living space, a tentative subdivision map, and the condominium development.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION FOR RELIEF FROM THE MINIMUM DIMENSIONS FOR PRIVATE OUTDOOR LIVING SPACE, A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, AND THE CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT.)**

Present: Jeff Gorrell, Architect  
Fae Perry, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:14.

A letter from Stuart and Laura Wilson, neighbor, expressing support for the proposed project was read into the record by Mr. Suding.

Ms. Deborah Clayton, neighbor, expressed support for the project.

Public comment closed at 3:17.

Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments: 1) Draw from the simple detailing found in the front portion of the house. 2) Study increasing planting areas by using more organic paving material; for example, grass pavers. 3) Restudy the garage elevation and its plane relationship with the porches. 4) Restudy composition of all elevations and the massing to create better architectural organization. 5) Study defining the ground floor on the elevations. 6) At least one Commissioner would like the applicant to continue to study a better separation between the existing and proposed buildings. 7) Plain, strong, and simple forms will be the most successful. 8) At least one Commissioner feels three units are too many. 9) Explore the use of planter pockets along the northerly property line.

Action: Pujo/Hsu, 7/1/1. La Voie opposed. Murray stepped down.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**

5. 715 SANTA BARBARA ST C-2 Zone

(3:35) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-081-007  
Application Number: MST2006-00279  
Owner: Santa Barbara Historical Society  
Architect: John Pitman  
Contractor: Frank Schipper

(Proposal for a new parking lot, electrical enclosure, landscaping and site remediation on two of three sites for the Santa Barbara Historical Museum (APNs 031-081-005 & 031-081-007) located at 715 Santa Barbara Street and 118 East De La Guerra Street. The third site at 136 East De La Guerra is within the County's jurisdiction.)

**(Concept Review)****(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCES FINDINGS)**

Present: John Pitman, Architect  
Martha Degasis, Arcadia Studio  
Amelia Coffee, Project Manager, URS Corporation

Staff comment: Barbara Shelton, Environmental Analyst, stated that Staff will be preparing a brief Staff Report that would allow for CEQA review and findings. There are three sites involved with different jurisdictional issues. Several prior documents have been received from the State and the County so that new significant environmental issues that would require a substantial additional review are not expected. It was requested that Ms. Shelton include, as part of the environmental review, photographs or documentation of the original landscape installation on the courtyard and the location of the fountain.

Public comment opened at 3:49.

Mr. Kellam De Forest said that he realizes that the central courtyard is on County land and out of the Commission's jurisdiction, but commented that he was sorry to see that the fountain was moved to the south end of the courtyard, contrary to the original plan of the designer.

Public comment closed at 3:51.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments and suggestions:

1) Architecture and detailing are very appropriate. 2) Proposed paving in the parking lot planter shall be removed and more landscape incorporated. 3) Commission is very pleased that the courtyard is not being developed. 4) The edges of the flagstone in the courtyard of the Historic adobe and the Covarrubias adobe shall be uneven. 5) Simplify proposed equipment pergola and match wood members of the existing pergola. 6) The Commission prefers that the fountain in the museum courtyard be in the center of the courtyard.

**FINAL REVIEW**

6. 2121 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(4:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-003  
 Application Number: MST2003-00748  
 Owner: Steve and Tamar Handleman

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Resources for Designation. Proposal for a new 660 square foot detached three-car garage, driveway, hedge, and garden improvements on a 25,464 square foot lot located in the Mission Area Special Design District. The proposal includes converting the existing two-car garage into an accessory space, some landscape plan changes, revised paving, and the removal of the existing driveway. Abatement of existing violations and re-roofing are being processed under a separate application.)

**(Review After Final of as-built improvements including landscape, hardscape, stone wall, entry gates, pillars and fountain. Modifications approved by Staff Hearing Officer on April 12, 2006.)**

Present: Steve Handleman, Owner

Motion: The Commission approves the wall and the fountain surround as built with the condition that the trash enclosure and the arbor bench be removed.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 3/4/1. Hsu/Suding/Naylor/Boucher opposed. La Voie abstained. Murray stepped down.

Motion failed.

Substitute Motion: Continued four weeks with the existing wall to be faced with sandstone in a pattern laid-up similar to others in the neighborhood, but shall not be encroaching onto the public sidewalk.

Action: La Voie/Hsu, 5/3/0. Hausz/Pujo/Naylor opposed. Murray stepped down.

Discussion after the motion: If applicant wishes to pursue the existing as-built design, they need to provide photo documentation of similarly designed existing walls in the neighborhood.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

7. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(4:24) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
 Application Number: MST2005-00241  
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company  
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus  
 Architect: M2 Architecture  
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates  
 Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

**(Continued Review After Final to change hinging on four pairs of doors and install six new roof vents and four new skylights on the Shop Building.)**

Present: Mary Rose, Agent for SRS Garden Street LLC  
Jorge Machin, Architect  
Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Motion: Final approval of the Review After Final changes as submitted.

Action: Boucher/La Voie, 6/0/0. Naylor/Rager stepped down.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

8. 2300 GARDEN ST

E-1 Zone

(4:28) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018  
Application Number: MST2006-00190  
Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC  
Applicant: Mary Rose  
Architect: Machin & Mead Architecture  
Contractor: Plant Construction Company  
Business Name: San Roque High School Garden St. Campus

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for seismic, safety, and utility upgrades in the Main Building of San Roque High School. Improvements include seismic strengthening, installation of new fire sprinkler system, accessibility upgrades including the installation of a new elevator, new drinking fountains, and restrooms. Exterior work includes new rooftop penetrations for ventilation, elevator overrun, and new handrails.)

#### **(Second Concept Review.)**

Present: Mary Rose, Agent for SRS Garden Street LLC  
Jorge Machin, Architect  
Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Motion: Final approval of the project and a two weeks continuance to the Consent Calendar for revised details with the following comments: 1) Simplify the front rail. 2) Simplify the pickets on the rail knuckles. 3) Rooftop elevator overrun is unacceptable. 4) Simplify the end panel on handrail shown on detail 2, Sheet AM3.5. 5) Restudy the guardrail elevation shown on detail 4, Sheet AM3.4; perhaps reducing the height of the cheek wall. 6) Commission recommends removal of the fire escape.

Action: Hsu/La Voie, 5/0/1. Naylor/Rager stepped down. Boucher abstained.

**FINAL REVIEW**

9. 1320 MORRISON AVE R-2 Zone  
(4:43) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-022  
Application Number: MST2005-00526  
Owner: Richard Mokler  
Architect: Ernest A. Watson

(This is a contributing structure to the proposed Bungalow Haven Historic District and is Structure of Merit-worthy. Proposal for a two-story addition to an existing 815 square foot single-family residence on a 6,069 square foot lot. The addition includes 748 square feet of living space and an 84 square foot second-story balcony. The existing 426 square foot detached garage will not be changed.)

**(Final Review of details.)**

Present: Richard Mokler, Owner  
Chris Johnson, Contractor

Motion: Final approval of details as submitted.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 7/0/1. La Voie abstained.

**HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

10. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone  
(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
Application Number: MST2005-00490  
Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
Architect: Henry Lenny  
Applicant: Project Solutions LLC  
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report for Group C prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)**

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian  
Henry Lenny, Architect  
James Jones and Minh Pham, Ownership Representatives

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and commented that the roof plan on Sheet A17.03 and the elevations on Sheet A17.09, which were the exteriors for building 17, were drawn incorrectly; however, in the structures report these errors do not impact the historian's analysis. The applicant has been asked to make the necessary corrections.

Mr. Jacobus pointed out that although the boulder shown on page 15, Plate 8, will not be moved along with the building, it will be photo-documented.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 7/0/0.

## **FINAL REVIEW**

### 11. 1900 LASUEN RD

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(4:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022  
 Application Number: MST2005-00490  
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels  
 Architect: Henry Lenny  
 Applicant: Project Solutions LLC  
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

**(Final Approval of Group C for buildings 17, 18 & 19 & landscaping.)**

**(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)**

Present: James Jones and Minh Pham, Ownership Representatives  
 Alexandra Cole, Historian, left at 5:01 p.m.  
 Henry Lenny, Architect  
 Katie O'Reilly Rogers, Landscape Architect, present at 4:52 p.m.

Motion: Final approval with the comment that the galvanized flashings and drip edges shall be identified as copper. Historic Resource findings: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Hsu/Murray, 8/0/0.

**\*\* RECESSED 5:08 P.M. TO 5:10 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

12. 916 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(5:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-052  
Application Number: MST2006-00180  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Architect: Jan Hochhauser  
Business Name: Fiesta Five Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit and new wrought iron grille over an existing mechanical vent to the exterior lobby area of Fiesta Five Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Ensure that the wood beam ceiling meets the fire code requirements and the anchoring is concealed. 2) The proposed enhancements are a big improvement and very much appreciated. 3) One Commissioner felt that reorganization of the steps, ramp, lift, and ticket booth should continue to be studied; combining the elements possibly into a more symmetrical arrangement. 4) The proposed ceiling grid is interesting and a vast improvement over the existing ceiling. 5) The majority of the Commissioners support the proposed improvements.

Action: Hsu/Boucher, 7/1/0. Hausz opposed.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

13. 8 W DE LA GUERRA C-2 Zone

(5:27) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-012  
Application Number: MST2006-00181  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Architect: Jan Hochhauser  
Business Name: Paseo Nuevo Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit in the exterior lobby wall of Paseo Nuevo Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect

Straw vote: How many of the Commissioners can support the location of the ticket dispenser as proposed? 6/2. Boucher/Murray opposed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the proposal is too contemporary.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 7/1/0. Boucher opposed.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

14. 618 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(5:38) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-030  
Application Number: MST2006-00182  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Architect: Jan Hochhauser  
Business Name: Metro 4 Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit in the exterior lobby wall of Metro 4 Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Second Concept Review.)**

Present: Jan Hochhauser, Architect

Straw votes: How many of the Commissioners can support the location of the kiosk as proposed?  
6/2. Murray/Boucher opposed.

How many of the Commissioners could support a kiosk made of all metal? 5/3.  
Boucher/Naylor/Murray opposed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that a contextual model is necessary to evaluate the scale.

Action: Naylor/Hsu, 6/2/0. Boucher/Murray opposed.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

15. 803 LAGUNA ST C-2 Zone

(5:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-025  
Application Number: MST2006-00147  
Owner: Senior Center of Santa Barbara Inc.  
Landscape Architect: Sydney Baumgartner  
Applicant: Linda Hughes

(Proposal to remove a large Eucalyptus tree situated near the northwest portion of the property. (Previous case numbers MST2003-00856 and MST2006-00019.))

**(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)**

Motion: Postponed four weeks to June 14, 2006, at applicant's request.

Action: Boucher/Rager, 8/0/0.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 800 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-010  
Application Number: MST2005-00529  
Owner: Westen Family Group  
Architect: Robert Klammer  
Contractor: Signal Construction Company  
Owner: SIMA El Paseo, LLC  
Owner: Trust for Historic Preservation  
Architect: Thomas Mea Machine & Mead Architectures

(Proposal to improve the existing alley behind 800 State Street immediately adjacent to the De La Guerra Adobe and connecting to the El Paseo Shopping Center. The proposal includes a new enclosure for the existing electrical service box and sump pump, replastering exterior walls, new doors, windows, light fixture, gate, and trash enclosure. The proposal also includes repaving with stamped concrete.)

**(Final Approval of light fixture and Review After Final to remove the following items from the previously-approved scope of work: door and window replacements, plastering, and electrical box enclosure. Work will now consist of repaving the alleyway, installing light fixture, and reconstruction of a rubble wall.)**

Final approval as submitted but approval does not include the light fixture and a recommendation that a stick fence with simple gate to match others on the parcel be constructed as shown on the drawing.

**FINAL REVIEW**B. 121 W DE LA GUERRA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-002  
Application Number: MST2004-00774  
Owner: The Rametto Company  
Applicant: Thomas Luria  
Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,200 square foot office building and 65 car parking lot and construct 14 residential condominium units (three of which are affordable), a new 3,310 square foot office building and parking for 44 cars, all on a 22,500 square foot parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Final Review of details.)**

Postponed two weeks to May 31, 2006, at applicant's request.

**FINAL REVIEW**C. 1235 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-006  
Application Number: MST2006-00252  
Owner: City of Santa Barbara  
Business Name: Louise Lowry Davis Center

(This is on the City's Potential Historic Resource List: Santa Barbara High School Science Building, constructed in 1922. It is also on the State Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to replace all 25 exterior windows with Marvin wood and aluminum clad windows. Divided light patterns are to match existing, and existing window frames shall be painted to match the new.)

**(Final Review of details.)**

Final approval as submitted in that the proposal is consistent with the original drawings of the building.

**FINAL REVIEW**D. 623 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-006  
Application Number: MST2005-00816  
Owner: Chaffee Family Survivors' Trust  
Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects

(Proposal for an 888 net square foot, one story addition (for storage purposes) to an existing 1,210 square foot commercial building resulting in a 2,488 square foot building on a 2,659 square foot lot in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. Parking will not be affected.)

**(Final Review of details.)**

Final approval of details as submitted.

**REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 1014 GARDEN ST C-2/R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-221-026  
Application Number: MST2002-00806  
Owner: Las Villas De Los Jardines, LLC  
Architect: Gil Garcia

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,072 square foot single-family residence and to construct a 5,379 square foot, two unit, three-story condominium on a 5,075 square foot lot. The first floor would consist of a four-car parking garage while the second and third floors would contain the habitable living areas.)

**(Review After Final of window changes.)**

Final approval of the modification to the bathroom windows on the third floor as noted in red on the drawings; and final approval of the bedroom windows as submitted.

**CONTINUED ITEM**

F. 14 E CARRILLO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-045  
Application Number: MST2006-00209  
Owner: L & S Hunt  
Architect: Richard Redmond  
Business Name: Montecito Bank & Trust

(This is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: Chamber of Commerce constructed in 1927. Proposal for the permanent installation of a generator to the first floor of an existing commercial building. Work includes the demolition of a portion of an existing elevator shaft, filling the existing door to the elevator shaft with concrete block, adding a concrete floor in the existing shaft at the penetration, adding a ceiling in the new generator opening and sprinklers to the enclosure, reinstalling an existing wrought iron gate, and adding a new wrought iron screen above the gate, all on a 6,602 square foot parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

**(Preliminary Review is requested.)**

Final approval of the project as submitted.

**NEW ITEM**

G. 101 E VICTORIA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-071-013  
Application Number: MST2006-00281  
Owner: 101 East Victoria  
Applicant: Eric Schott

(Concept Review for a proposal to construct exterior alterations to an existing commercial building and parking lot including planters, trellis, and front facade alterations. No new floor area.)

**(Concept Review)**

**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT)**

Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with positive comments.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:52 P.M. \*\***