



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 3, 2006

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- PHILIP SUDING, Chair – Present at 1:40 p.m.
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair – Present, left at 5:13 p.m.
- LOUISE BOUCHER – Present
- STEVE HAUSZ – Present at 1:36 p.m., left 2:15 p.m. to 2:49 p.m., left 5:19 p.m. to 5:22 p.m.
- VADIM HSU – Present at 1:42 p.m.
- ALEX PUJO – Present, left 4:10 p.m. to 4:13 p.m.
- CAREN RAGER – Absent
- FERMINA MURRAY – Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present, left at 5:43 p.m.
- DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent
- ROGER HORTON – Present 1:44 p.m. to 3:04 p.m.
- WILLIAM MAHAN – Absent

ADVISORY MEMBER:

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present, left at 1:50 p.m. to 2:18 p.m., left 2:22 p.m. to 2:27 p.m., left 3:04 p.m. to 3:51 p.m., left at 4:35 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Present, left 4:52 p.m. to 5:16 p.m.
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present
- GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** **Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on April 28, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comments.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of April 19, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the Minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting of April 19, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 5/0/0.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 5/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following announcements:

- a) Commissioner Rager will be absent today.
- b) Commissioner La Voie will be leaving at 5:00 p.m.
- c) Commissioner Naylor will be stepping down from Items 12 and 13, 2300 Garden Street.
- d) Commissioner Murray will be stepping down from Item 5, 2100 Laguna Street.
- e) The project at 1314 Morrison Avenue, which was publicly noticed for today's hearing, has been indefinitely postponed at the applicant's request. A new mailed notice will be sent out prior to the next scheduled hearing.
- f) The project at 803 Laguna Street, which was continued to today's meeting, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request. The applicant is in the process of obtaining information requested by the Commission.
- g) The last three items on today's agenda (618 State Street, 8 West De La Guerra Street, and 916 State Street) have been postponed two weeks at applicant's request.

2. Mr. Hausz announced that he will be leaving at 2:15 p.m. and plans to return at around 3:00 p.m.
3. Heather Baker, Project Planner, announced that an Open House meeting will be held on Saturday, May 13th, 12:30-5:30 p.m., to introduce the Single Family Design Guidelines/Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance (SFDG/NPO) Draft Update Package to the Architectural Board of Review (ABR), Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC), Planning Commission (PC), and City Council members. The Open House will include exhibit viewing time, a staff presentation, a public hearing and informal question and answer time. After the Open House, the Update Package will be reviewed by the ABR, HLC and PC at their individual meetings, but the May 13th presentation will not be repeated. The Update Package is scheduled to be reviewed by the HLC Commission at their May 31st meeting for Staff to gather feedback.

Ms. Baker pointed out that there are about 100 single-family homes within El Pueblo Viejo District that at some time are reviewed by the HLC and the SFDG/NPO guidelines would have to be applied to those projects. The Commission's input would help assure that there is no conflict with the HLC's preservation goals. That is why the Commission's attendance is important and will also help Staff to be more efficient in incorporating the hearing bodies' comments in order to revise the Update Package that will later be presented to City Council.

Ms. Baker agreed to send the Commission a schedule of the Open House and to provide Ms. Boucher and Ms. Naylor with a video tape copy since they will not be able to attend.

4. Casa del Herrero had wished to give out a George Washington Smith award. Mr. La Voie informed them that the Historic Landmarks Commission has a history of giving an award with that same name. After some discussion, they agreed to call their award "Casa del Herrero George Washington Smith Award".

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Mr. La Voie announced that the Historic Landmarks Commission and the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) had a joint meeting where CalTrans was given final approval with revised drawings to return to the ABR Consent Calendar for the Highway 101 Milpas to Hot Springs improvements project.

Mr. Hsu announced that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance Update Steering Committee concluded after 32 meetings and urged all members to attend the May 13th Open House at the Faulkner Gallery.

Mr. Suding reported that he attended last week's State of the Art Gallery meeting. There will be a new installation on State Street beginning September 1, 2006. Councilmember Schneider also attended and asked why the Historic Landmarks Commission needs to review temporary installations. Mr. Suding informed her that HLC does review temporary installations and that, additionally, it will be a courtesy review.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

1. 23 N QUARANTINA ST M-1/SD-3 Zone
(1:44) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-030-012
Application Number: MST2006-00027
Owner: ASTI Holding Company LLC
Applicant: Lynn Rapp
(Proposal to relocate two 10,000 gallon wastewater storage tanks underground and install pump and air blower (approx 5'x3') equipment above ground.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Investigation Report prepared by John F. Romani, Compass Rose.)

Environmental Analyst Debra Andaloro had distributed a memo to the Commission with the following recommendations: Archaeological monitoring during all ground disturbing activities associated with the project including, but not limited to, grading, excavation, trenching, vegetation or paving removal and ground clearance in the areas identified in the report. The contract shall be in compliance with the City's MEA Guidelines and shall be subject to review and approval of the Environmental Analyst. Also, a final report of the results of the monitoring shall be submitted to the Environmental Analyst within 180 days of completion of the monitoring and prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Occupancy, whichever is earlier.

Staff comment: Debra Andaloro, Environmental Analyst, explained that prior to a decision being made on a project, information resources are required to be reviewed, a field survey needs to be undertaken, and an assessment of archaeological resources and an evaluation of potential project effects need to be provided. Many of the reports being submitted for review do not follow the contents and format requirements of the 2002 Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines for Archaeological Resources and Historic Structures and Sites. Ms. Andaloro has been working with archaeologists that regularly prepare Phase 1 Archaeological Resources Reports and Letter Reports and requiring them to do a complete evaluation.

Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the investigation supports the report's recommendations that a qualified archaeologist survey the property once pavement has been removed.

Ms. Andaloro explained that the subject report does not follow the format requirements for Phase 1 reports, there is no indication that the report preparer reviewed all the necessary resources, and the report simply defers further assessment until after pavement is removed and the field survey can occur. However, a revised report, dated April 30, 2006, has been prepared and submitted which addresses the inadequacies. Staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission accepts the revised report dated April 30, 2006, with no requirements for monitoring.

Motion: The Commission accepts the revised report as submitted.
Action: Boucher/Hsu, 8/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 1926 SANTA BARBARA ST E-1 Zone
(1:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-382-022

Application Number: MST2006-00177

Owner: Michael and Amy Mayfield

(This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: Kennedy House. Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report for a proposed residential addition.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine from Post/Hazeltine Associates
Vadim Hsu, Architect

Staff comment: Jake. Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. This house has been deemed a historic resource to the City. The report concludes that the changes and affected structures are not going to negatively impact the resource.

Public Comment opened at 2:00.

Mr. Robert Else, 1914 Santa Barbara Street, referred to a letter he provided for the Commission to review and distributed a set of photos of the property's surroundings. He expressed concern over the size, bulk, and scale of the proposed project. Ms. Anne Dundan said she agreed with the concerns addressed in the letter Mr. Else presented to the Commission.

Mr. Kellam De Forest, resident, asked how large was the original piece of property and if there was a landscape plan as part of the original design. He also asked if the plant life has been plotted in the plans for the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 2:04.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Incorporate a better site plan showing the full site and the proposed improvements and the significant landscape elements. 2) The adjoining parcels that were part of this estate should be delineated on an aerial map. 3) Commission is concerned with site relationships of proposed improvements with the existing house. 4) Size, bulk, and scale need to be addressed in the report.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0. Hsu stepped down.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 832 ORANGE AVE R-3 Zone

(2:12) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-024-002
Application Number: MST2005-00657
Owner: Lorenzo and Maria Martinez
Applicant: Manuel Contreras

(Proposal to demolish a 789 square foot residence and existing garage on a lot where two units currently exist. A new unit is proposed to be attached to the remaining 933 square foot unit to create a two-story, 3,344 square foot duplex, with a 406 square foot attached two-car garage. Two covered and two uncovered parking spaces are proposed. A modification is requested to allow one uncovered parking space to encroach into the required interior yard setback.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Carole Denardo.)

Present: Carole Denardo and David Lemon, Architectural Historians
Ceasar Cruz, Designer

Staff comment: Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that the amount of information and the layout of the report are impressive and greatly appreciated. Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following design review comments: 1) It is important that the addition does not overwhelm the modest original house. 2) Pay attention to the detailing. 3) The back house has an awkward entrance. A compromise must be achieved to provide an entrance that is inviting. 4) The location of the water heaters on the exterior of the house is inappropriate. 5) The drawings of the existing house should be representative of the photograph of the house.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 7/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

4. 421 E FIGUEROA ST R-3 Zone

(2:24) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-017
Application Number: MST2004-00008
Owner: Allen and Angela Zimmer
Architect: Architects West

(This is a City Landmark: Arrellanes-Kirk Adobe. Proposal to demolish 1,000 square feet of an existing 1,810 square foot residence and add 2,330 square feet to the residence. Additionally, the applicant proposes to add two rental units totaling 5,335 square feet.)

(Review of Historic Structures Letter Addendum prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian
Allen Zimmer, Architect

Staff comment: Mr. Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that a Historic Structures letter Addendum Report was requested when the Historic Landmarks Commission reviewed a revision to the project.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 7/0/0.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM:

(2:29)

REQUEST TO FORWARD THE LOWER RIVIERA SPECIAL DESIGN DISTRICT GUIDELINES TO CITY COUNCIL FOR ADOPTION.

The Lower Riviera Special Design District was created as part of the Demolition Review Ordinance Amendments in October 2004. Over the past few months, City Staff and volunteers from the Bungalow Haven Neighborhood Association have worked on creating draft guidelines which are intended to guide development within the Lower Riviera Special Design District in order to ensure its continuing compatibility to the proposed Bungalow Haven Historic District, which lies within its core. The guidelines, once adopted, will serve to assist property owners, architects, contractors, and commissions and design review boards to design projects that will be appropriate, compatible, and beneficial to the Special Design District, and to assist the City in reviewing applications for new projects and alterations to structures within, and in close proximity to, the proposed Historic District.

Present: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian
Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Mr. Limón stated that 300 neighborhood property owners were provided notice of this discussion meeting. The Special Design District Guidelines are an interim document and the Commission is being requested to decide as to whether the guidelines along with the revisions are ready to be presented to City Council.

Mr. Jacobus explained that the Special Design District Guidelines were revised in response to the Historic Landmarks Commission's comments and briefly reviewed the changes during the meeting. The preparers are also expecting comments from the Architectural Board of Review and the Planning Commission. The HLC members will be informed if there are any revisions before the final document is presented to City Council

Copies of letters received from the public were given to the Commission members and discussed by Mr. Jacobus. One of the letters was from a resident who requested to remain anonymous in fear of retribution. The anonymous writer is concerned that too many building regulations will affect the ability for residents to make necessary alterations to their buildings.

The other letter received was from Randy Wright, resident, addressing concerns relating to the Guideline's requirement that historically authentic materials be used in the renovation process that ignore modern practicality, such as maintainability and energy efficiency.

Mr. Jacobus explained that the preparers of the guidelines need equal input from the public, including those that are in opposition to an Historic Bungalow District, and are depending on neighbors to inform them of their preferences. Districting guidelines are being prepared to resolve issues relating to the creation of historic districts. Post/Hazeltine is also preparing a report to determine whether a historic district would be appropriate.

Public comment opened at 2:42.

Mr. Joe Rution, Bungalow Haven Neighborhood Association, briefly reviewed suggestions he submitted in a letter to the Commission relating to the revisions to the Guidelines that were made by Staff.

Public comment closed at 2:45.

Mr. Limón responded to Mr. Rution's suggestion that Section 11.3 "New Development – New Multi-Family Projects" be dropped. Staff carefully analyzed how the Special Design District area is zoned currently and found that the majority of the parcels contained within the Special Design and Historic Districts are zoned "multi-family". The Guidelines would be incomplete if they did not address the potential for second unit additions to bungalows and multi-unit projects to be constructed on larger parcels. The zoning guidelines do allow additions in the neighborhood and both guidelines must be compatible.

Mr. Jacobus commented that the wording on page 3, section 3.5, where it says "preservation of historically significant buildings outside of the Historic District may be accomplished through individual designation as City Structures of Merit or Landmarks" will be reviewed by Staff.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments, suggestions, and/or questions:

1. Stated that conflict between historic preservation and the zoning ordinance has been an issue in the past.
2. Agreed that language for multi-family projects should be in the Guidelines so that developers know that the Commission is looking for compatibility between the existing and proposed projects, and to clarify that multi-family units are not excluded in the Guidelines.
3. Spoke about the need to have specific language to emphasize that parking should be out of sight and that in special circumstances it can be in another area, but not in the front.
4. Commented on section 4.2, item C, where it says that one of the goals is to preserve the "pedestrian friendly" character of the area by minimizing the prominence of garages, and said that the concept of a two-car garage facing the street that eliminates the front porch does not avoid the parking of cars in full view outside the garage. Modifications for one car garages that are more historically appropriate should be addressed in the document. (Mr. Jacobus responded that language covering garages is in the Guidelines, but in a different section.)
5. Would like a stronger word than "promote" in item 4, on page 5, under section 4.3, where it says "promote the use of the Historic Building Code where appropriate" because the Code is a valuable resource to be used for preservation of historic structures.
6. Suggested that item 5 include the language "subject to architectural review of the expansion". The word "expanded" is unclear as to the extent of expansion and needs to be better defined to indicate how or by how much.

7. Requested clarification of letter E, under section 8.2 on page 7, where item 4 says “alterations that do not require a building permit but negatively affect an historic resource may be subject to scrutiny when a project is before the ABR or HLC”. (Mr. Limón responded that when an existing site has had alterations made to the property that are inconsistent with the historic appearance of the structures or have been painted with nontraditional colors, the Commission could require that alterations be returned to their original appearance.)

Public comment reopened at 2:57.

Ms. Kathleen Daig, 1429 Olive Street, expressed that too many regulations limit the ability of families to stay in the area and would like to be excluded from the bungalow historical district.

Public comment closed at 3:02.

Mr. Limón clarified that the City is not advocating a historic bungalow haven district at this time and that City Council formed the Special Design District in December 2004. The Special Design District Guidelines is clarifying and expanding on what guidelines apply to that special district.

Motion: The Commission forwards the Special Design District Guidelines to City Council with the following comments: 1) Modifications to allow one car garages that are more historically appropriate should be addressed in the document. 2) Should include specific language to emphasize that parking should be out of sight and not in the front of the house. 3) A stronger word than “promote” needs to be used in item 4, under section 4.3 on page 5. 4) Item 5, under section 4.3 on page 5, should include the language “subject to architectural review” and have the word “expanded” better defined. 5) Clarify item 4, in section 8.2, under letter E.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 9/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 2100 LAGUNA ST E-1 Zone

(3:04) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-263-016
 Application Number: MST2005-00539
 Owner: Jody Shields
 Applicant: Mark Shields
 Architect: Mark Shields

(This residence has been determined to be Structure of Merit-worthy. Proposal to construct a new 117 square foot bedroom on the first floor and a new 342 square foot, second floor bedroom addition. In addition to other interior remodeling of this existing 1,579 square foot single-story residence, the project also includes several garden site walls, an outdoor BBQ, and new on-grade patio. A modification is requested to encroach into the required open yard area of this parcel located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Part II.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

Present: Mark Shields, Owner/Designer
 Jody Shields, Owner

Public comment opened at 3:16.

Kellam De Forest expressed concern over the impact of a second story addition in the neighborhood.

The following letter was read into the record by Chair Suding:

Robin Jones, neighbor at 402 Plaza Rubio, stated that the applicant discussed the addition with their neighbors and she expressed support for the project. In addition, around a dozen other neighbors signed a petition showing support for the project.

Public comment closed at 3:18.

Straw vote: How many of the Commissioners are in favor of the modification of the side yard setback for the first story? 7/0/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the Commission supports the proposed design and finds that a four foot high wall at the front entrance is appropriate.

Action: Hausz/Pujo. Murray stepped down. 7/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 819 GARDEN ST C-2 Zone

(3:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-012-011
 Application Number: MST2005-00439
 Owner: Steven E. and Julie E. Shulem
 Architect: DesignARC
 Applicant: Karl Kras

(Proposal to demolish an existing 780 square foot office and construct a new four-story, 3,472 square foot mixed-use building on a 1,881 square foot lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. This development will be comprised of one 1,972 square foot two-bedroom unit, and 1,500 net square feet of office space. Four parking spaces will be provided: two on-site in a parking garage, and two on a separate parcel within 500 feet. A Zoning Modification is requested to provide less than the required 10% open space area.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY: PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION TO PROVIDE LESS THAN THE REQUIRED 10% OPEN SPACE AREA.)

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect from DesignARC
 Mark Shields, Designer
 Steven Shulem, Property Owner

- Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Elimination of the fourth floor as well as the applicant's willingness to work with the Commission is greatly appreciated. 2) Lower and push back the ridgeline/plate at the top of the third floor. 3) The Commission likes the Moorish detailing, but it must be simplified and more authentic. 4) Look to the Adamson House in Malibu for Moorish detailing. 5) A model may be helpful with respect to massing. 6) Pay attention to the large, massive building south of the project; do not emulate it. 7) Look to the Inn of the Spanish Garden for inspiration for massing. 8) Reduce the floor-to-floor heights, especially the garage level, to lower the overall height of the building. 9) Project should strive to be a great example for the block. 10) Restudy the two-story mirador.
- Action: Pujo/Hsu, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 210 W CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone
 (3:51) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-271-025
 Application Number: MST2005-00772
 Owner: Old Town Mall
 Owner: Steve Delson
 Architect: Conceptual Motion

(Proposal for demolition of the existing Radio Square shopping center which consists of approximately 18,000 s.f. of commercial square footage and the construction of a new four-story, mixed-use development. The proposed project will be comprised of 14,604 square feet of commercial space, 57,989 square feet of residential space, 6,674 square feet of commercial live/work space, 555 square feet of residential accessory space, and two levels of underground parking. There will be a total of 55 residential condominium units. A modification is requested for residential density on this 1.2 acre lot located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP, DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS, AND A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW BONUS DENSITY UNITS.)

- Present: Steve Yates, President of Conceptual Motion Company
 Gerhard Mayer, Architect from Conceptual Motion Company
 Steve Delson and Ian Brown, Owners
 Katie O'Reilly Rogers, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:10.

Mr. Kellam De Forest commented that the proposed project is too big for the lot size.

The following letters were read into the record by Chair Suding:

- 1) Jeffrey Paley, resident, expressed support for the project.
- 2) Robert Adams and Nancy Caponi, neighbors, showed numerous concerns relating to the proposed project including the impact that a large quantity of units would have on traffic, adequate open space available for the occupants, parking in the surrounding neighborhoods, and the massing of a four-story structure in the El Pueblo Viejo District.

Public comment closed at 4:14.

The Commission, either individually or collectively, had the following comments and/or suggestions:

- 1) The applicant's distinct presentation, great drawings, and images are greatly appreciated.
- 2) The size, bulk, and scale are of great concern; too much development is proposed on the site.
- 3) The paseos and affordable housing are greatly appreciated.
- 4) Four stories is not characteristic of Santa Barbara.
- 5) Draw inspiration from a village rather than from an urban center when considering size, bulk, and scale.
- 6) Street noise at the busy intersection is of concern.
- 7) Consider fewer paseos in favor of a larger central open space.
- 8) Study moving the taller elements away from the street.
- 9) Restudy the "ADA effect".

FINAL REVIEW

8. 121 W DE LA GUERRA ST C-2 Zone
 (4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-002
 Application Number: MST2004-00774
 Owner: The Rametto Company
 Applicant: Thomas Luria
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,200 square foot office building and 65 car parking lot and construct 14 residential condominium units (three of which are affordable), a new 3,310 square foot office building and parking for 44 cars, all on a 22,500 square foot parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Final Approval of the project is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 052-05.)

Present: Brian Cearnal and Joe Andrulaitis, Architects

Motion: Final approval of the project and details to return in two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Applicant is to return with an irrigation plan. 2) Return with lighting addressing the fluorescent fixture requirement and garage lighting for Commissioner Hausz to review. 3) Cover the exposed flashing shown on details 16 and 17 on Sheet A503. 4) The Commission recommends that the project also be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Board of Review.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

9. 1235 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

(4:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-006
 Application Number: MST2006-00252
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Business Name: Louise Lowry Davis Center

(This is on the City's Potential Historic Resource List: Santa Barbara High School Science Building, constructed in 1922. It is also on the State Historic Resources Inventory. Proposal to replace all 25 exterior windows with Marvin wood and aluminum clad windows. Divided light patterns are to match existing, and existing window frames shall be painted to match the new.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Present: Anna Lehr, Project Engineer, Facilities Management Division

Motion: Preliminary approval of the project and a two week continuance to the Consent Calendar with the following comments and conditions: 1) The proposed window manufacturer "Marvin" is acceptable. 2) Applicant is to provide the original working drawings of the building showing the configuration and detail of the windows. 3) The interior spacer and divider shall match the color of the exterior. The color recommended is medium bronze. 4) Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource nor detract from its character.

Action: Pujo/Hsu, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

10. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST E-1 Zone

(5:13) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002
 Application Number: MST2006-00191
 Owner: Marilyn Jorgenson
 Agent: Laura Bridley
 Architect: Arcadia Studio

(This is a City Landmark: Frothingham House and Garden. Proposal to replace four, two-light windows in one opening with three, three-light windows in three openings on the Garden Street elevation, construct a new exterior stucco screenwall, landing, and tile bench at the south elevation, and paint exterior of residence. New landscaping to include turf in the public right-of-way, new hedges in backyard, new ornamental plantings, and repairs to the lower terrace fountain. This parcel is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Part II.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK.)

Present: Laura Bridley, Agent
 Marilyn Jorgenson and Errol Jahnke, Owners
 Derrick Eochelberger, Landscape Architect from Acacia Landscaping

Public comment opened at 5:23.

Mr. Don Olson, neighbor, expressed support for the renovation of the historic structure.

Ms. Meredith Scott, Co-Chair for Child Abuse Listening Mediation (CALM) Design House, expressed support for the project and said that this home will be showcased by CALM.

Mr. Fred Clough, Board of Trustees President for CALM, expressed support for this opportunity to celebrate George Washington Smith and to improve the enhancement of the property.

Mr. Kellam De Forest expressed support for the proposal, but said he hopes that any fountains installed be consistent with G.W. Smith style.

Public comment closed at 5:26.

Motion: Final approval of the project and an indefinite continuance to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) Paint scraping analysis by a historian is acceptable and shall be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission. 2) Return with detailed drawings of the permanent fountains. Consideration should be given to minimal fountain design and fountain use. 3) Return with the foundation details for the screenwall. 4) Provide irrigation plan. 5) Historic Resource Findings: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource. 6) Findings for alterations to a City Landmark: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Boucher/Hsu, 7/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

11. 350 CHAPALA ST

(5:37) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-450-015
Application Number: MST2006-00251
Owner: Kay McMillan
Applicant: Chris Belanger
Designer: Chris Belanger

(Proposal to legalize the as-built conversion of an existing covered and partially enclosed porch to habitable living space of a third story residential condominium in the Chapala Lofts complex. This conversion entailed the removal of one pair of existing French doors, installation of one pair of new French doors, and relocation of the hot water heater closet door.)

Present: Chris Belanger, Designer

Motion: Final approval of proposal as submitted.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 7/0/0. Hsu opposed.

**** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:43 P.M. TO 6:00 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING

12. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(6:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00190
 Owner: SRS Garden Street LLC
 Applicant: Mary Rose
 Architect: Machin & Mead Architecture
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque High School Garden Street Campus

(This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal for seismic, safety, and utility upgrades in the Main Building of San Roque High School. Improvements include seismic strengthening, installation of new fire sprinkler system, accessibility upgrades including the installation of a new elevator, new drinking fountains, and restrooms. Exterior work includes new rooftop penetrations for ventilation, elevator overrun, and new handrails.)

Present: Jorge Machin, Architect
 Mary Rose, Representing Ownership
 Alexandra Cole, Historian

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Rooftop elevator overrun is unacceptable. 2) Simplify the end panel on handrail shown on detail 2, Sheet AM3.5. 3) Restudy the guardrail elevation shown on detail 4, Sheet AM3.4; perhaps reducing the height of the cheek wall. 5) Commission recommends removal of the fire escape.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 6/0/0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

13. 2300 GARDEN ST E-1 Zone

(6:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-140-018
 Application Number: MST2005-00241
 Owner: John Poucher, ESQ
 Contractor: Plant Construction Company
 Business Name: San Roque School Garden Street Campus
 Architect: M2 Architecture
 Agent: Mary Rose & Associates

(Seismic and safety upgrades to the kitchen and cafeteria building, infirmary, bell tower, chapel, mezzanines, and shop buildings at the existing St. Anthony's Seminary High School campus including accessibility improvements, fire sprinklers, interior elevators, removal of hazardous and toxic materials, and underground trenching for utilities. Only very minor exterior changes are proposed.)

(Change hinging on four pairs of doors and install six new roof vents and four new skylights on the Shop Building.)

Present: Jorge Machin, Architect
 Mary Rose, Representing Ownership
 Alexandra Cole, Historian

Straw votes: How many of the Commissioners can support skylights in any configuration? 1/5/0.
Hausz/Pujo/Murray/Suding/Bocher opposed.

How many of the Commissioners could accept changes to the north elevation, perhaps enlarging the windows to change the fenestration in lieu of skylights? 6/0/0.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments: 1) Skylights are unacceptable. 2) Proposed swinging doors are acceptable and applicant shall return with the hardware. 2) The hardware on the south elevation accessible doors shall also be reviewed.

Action: Boucher/Hausz, 6/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

14. 1320 MORRISON AVE

R-2 Zone

(6:48) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-091-022
Application Number: MST2005-00526
Owner: Richard Mokler
Architect: Ernest A. Watson

(This is a contributing structure to the proposed Bungalow Haven Historic District and is Structure of Merit worthy. Proposal for a two-story addition to an existing 815 square foot single-family residence on a 6,069 square foot lot. The addition includes 748 square feet of living space and an 84 square foot second-story balcony. The existing 426 square foot detached garage will not be changed.)

(Sixth Concept Review.)

**(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.
ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)**

Present: Richard Mokler, Owner
Ernest Watson, Architect

Motion: Preliminary approval of the project and a two weeks continuance with the following comments: 1) Knee brackets at the upper porch shall be eliminated. 2) Shorten the porch beam by approximately six inches. 3) Restudy handrail detailing.

Action: Hsu/Hausz, 6/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

15. 618 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-030
Application Number: MST2006-00182
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Jan Hochhauser
Business Name: Metro 4 Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit in the exterior lobby wall of Metro 4 Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Postponed two weeks at applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

16. 8 W DE LA GUERRA C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-012
Application Number: MST2006-00181
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Jan Hochhauser
Business Name: Paseo Nuevo Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit in the exterior lobby wall of Paseo Nuevo Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Postponed two weeks at applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

17. 916 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-052
Application Number: MST2006-00180
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Jan Hochhauser
Business Name: Fiesta Five Theatre

(Proposal to install an automatic ticket dispensing unit and new wrought iron grille over an existing mechanical vent to the exterior lobby area of Fiesta Five Theatre located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Postponed two weeks at applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR**NEW ITEM**

A. 2559 PUESTA DEL SOL E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 023-271-003
Application Number: MST2006-00253
Owner: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
Architect: Dwight Gregory
Business Name: Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History

(This is a City Structure of Merit: Museum of Natural History. Proposal to add an HVAC unit to the roof of the Marine/Geology building for air conditioning at a temporary exhibit gallery.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

Final approval as submitted with color to be Frazee # 8261W "Traditional Tan".

NEW ITEM

B. 14 E CARRILLO C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-045
Application Number: MST2006-00209
Owner: L. & S. Hunt
Architect: Richard Redmond
Business Name: Montecito Bank & Trust

(This is on the City's list of Potential Historic Resources: Chamber of Commerce constructed in 1927. Proposal for the permanent installation of a generator to the first floor of an existing commercial building. Work includes the demolition of a portion of an existing elevator shaft, filling the existing door to the elevator shaft with concrete block, adding a concrete floor in the existing shaft at the penetration, adding a ceiling in the new generator opening and sprinklers to the enclosure, reinstalling an existing wrought iron gate, and adding a new wrought iron screen above the gate, all on a 6,602 square foot parcel in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Continued indefinitely at applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW

C. 532 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-028
Application Number: MST2006-00206
Owner: Harrah Marvind
Business Name: Old King's Road

(Proposal to change the exterior colors of the building facade for Old King's Road located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Final approval as submitted with the body to be Benjamin Moore # HC45 "Shaker Beige", architectural moldings to be # HC46 "Jackson Tan", and window sashes to be # HC128N "Rich Burgundy".

FINAL REVIEW

D. 431 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-008
Application Number: MST2006-00102
Owner: W. & D. Faulding Family Trust
Applicant: Neil Advani
Designer: Diana Costea

(Proposal to replace existing entry door and storefront windows, add a new trellis, and repaint exterior of a one-story commercial building in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

Continued indefinitely at applicant's request.

FINAL REVIEW

E. 501 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-011
Application Number: MST2006-00149
Owner: 501 State Street, Inc.
Architect: Rex Ruskauff
Business Name: Santa Barbara Brewing Company

(Proposal to add a wrought iron fence and canvas awning at the north elevation to enclose an outdoor drinking area between buildings as required by Alcohol Beverage Control.)

(Final Approval of details.)

Final approval of details as noted on the drawings.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:55 P.M. ****