



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, June 8, 2005

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

ANTHONY SPANN, Chair, Present, left at 1:56 p.m., returned at 2:58 p.m., left at 4:50 p.m., returned at 6:42 p.m.
 VADIM HSU, Vice-Chair, Present, left at 3:25 p.m., returned at 3:41 p.m.
 STEVE HAUSZ, Present at 3:24 p.m., left at 7:17 p.m., returned at 7:27 p.m.
 WILLIAM LA VOIE, Present
 ALEX PUJO, Present, left at 5:50 p.m.
 CAREN RAGER, Present, left at 4:19 p.m., returned at 4:50 p.m.
 PHILIP SUDING, Absent
 FERMINA MURRAY, Present, left at 2:58 p.m., returned at 3:20 p.m., left at 7:29 p.m., returned at 7:44 p.m.
 SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON, Present

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present
 JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present
 BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.

- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on June 3, 2005 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 25, 2005.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 25, 2005, with corrections.

Action: Pujo/Rager, 6/0/0.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Vadim Hsu.

Action: Pujo/Murray, 6/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Chair Spann announced the following:

- a) He will be leaving the meeting at 6:00 p.m.
- b) Alex Pujo will be leaving the meeting at 5:30 p.m.
- c) Steve Hausz will be arriving to the meeting at approximately 2:00 p.m.
- d) Phil Suding will be absent from the meeting.

2. Commissioner Rager announced she will step down from Item No. 16, 1210 State Street.

3. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

- a) Item No. 13, 1900 Lasuen Road, will be heard in the time slot for Item No. 16, 1210 State Street; and Item No. 16 will be heard in the time slot for Item No. 13.
- b) El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines Subcommittee will be held on Wednesday, July 6, 2005. Ms. Gantz requested attendance time preferences.

4. Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, announced the following:

- a) There will be two items coming before the Commission which include the Milpas to Hot Springs Operational Improvements Project and the Lower Mission Creek Design Project.
- b) There was a memorandum from the City of Santa Barbara attorney distributed to the Architectural Board of Review, the Historic Landmarks Commission, and the Planning Commission regarding conflict of interest. Mr. Limón stated that, in previous years, there have been various interpretations regarding what constitutes a conflict of interest, and it has since been determined that, to avoid such, Board Members, Commissioners, and Committee Members will no longer be able to bid on City projects. Mr. Limón noted a strong response from various Boards and Commissions regarding the restriction.
- c) The Architectural Board of Review has one vacancy and a potential future vacancy. Mr. Limón encouraged architects in the City of Santa Barbara to apply, and to contact him if they have any questions.

5. Commissioner Murray announced she will step down from Items No. 8 and 17, 333 Junipero Plaza.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT1. **1828 BATH ST**

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-021-032
 Application Number: MST2005-00076
 Owner: Edward St. George Revocable Trust
 Applicant: David Tabor
 Architect: Gil Barry

(Proposal to convert an existing 1,172 square foot duplex to condominiums and add a new 1,110 square foot condominium over a new 1,060 square foot four car garage on a 10,678 square foot lot. Proposal will also include demolishing 195 square feet of the existing single family residence and rebuilding 237 square feet resulting in a 42 square foot addition to the existing single family residence. A modification is requested to allow four uncovered parking spaces to encroach into the rear and interior setbacks.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Western Points Archaeology.)

(1:51)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that the grounds were devoid of archaeological or historic resource materials.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
 Action: La Voie/Naylor, 7/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT2. **1929 CLIFF DR**

C-P/R-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-015-016
 Application Number: MST2004-00492
 Owner: Tosco Corporation
 Architect: Lenvik & Minor Architects
 Applicant: John Price & Ed Edick

(Proposal to demolish an existing gas station, service bays, canopy, underground storage tanks and to construct a 2,534 square foot mini-mart with a gas station and attached drive-thru car wash on a 20,755 square foot lot. A Zoning Modification is requested to allow the car wash to encroach into the rear yard setback. The project requires Coastal Development Permit approval.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

(1:51)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that, once the pavement has been removed and the site cleared, construction should be temporarily suspended so that a City-qualified archaeologist can complete an intensive Phase I survey of the entire impact ground surface.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
 Action: Rager/Murray, 7/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**3. 1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
 Application Number: MST2005-00123
 Owner: Monte and Patricia Fligsten
 Designer: Laura Hanson

(This is a revised project description. This is on the Potential Historic Resource List (Hall Cottage/Park Residence). Demolition of the existing 759 square foot garage and 150 square foot shed, and construction of a new 733 square foot, three-car garage with a 464 square foot, second floor accessory space, all on a 25,425 square foot lot.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Stone Archaeological Consulting.)

(1:52)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated although the project description in this report no longer matches the project description being proposed, it adequately addresses the revised project because less work is being proposed. The applicant might return at a future date with a proposal for the portion of work that was just deleted but is still included in the report. Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations that no further measures are recommended.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.
 Action: Naylor/La Voie, 7/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**4. 428 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
 Application Number: MST2005-00079
 Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP
 Architect: DesignArc
 Business Name: Casa De Sevilla

(Proposed 1,000 square foot dining patio including an additional restroom, masonry wall, fountain, bar, and fabric awnings for an existing restaurant.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Heather Macfarlane.)

(1:52)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations for on-site monitoring of initial site preparation and an extended Phase I survey. Additionally, Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst, has requested that the survey (after removal of paving) be extended to the improvements that will be required in the Chapala Street right-of-way, and not just the lot itself.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the condition to incorporate Mr. Berman's suggestion.
 Action: Rager/Hsu, 7/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT5. **533 W GUTIERREZ ST** R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-003
 Application Number: MST2004-00264
 Owner: Gonzalez Family Trust
 Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to demolish two, one-story single-family residences. The proposal includes the construction of two new buildings with five, two- and three-story apartments. The project will result in two, one-bedroom apartments, two, two-bedroom apartments, and one, three-bedroom apartment. The five apartments will total 8,802 square feet on an 11,418 square foot lot. The proposal also includes the construction of three, two-car garages, two, one-car garages, and one uncovered parking space.)

(Continued review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D.)

(1:54)

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated the revisions requested at the last meeting have been incorporated into the revised report by the historical consultant.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Hsu, 7/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT6. **506 DE LA VISTA AVE** R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-032-002
 Application Number: MST2005-00154
 Applicant: Bob McPhillips
 Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal for a 423 square foot second story addition to an existing 843 square foot one-story residence and to construct a 402 square foot detached second floor accessory dwelling unit above a 480 square foot garage located on a 5,200 square foot lot. One uncovered parking space is provided to meet the parking requirements.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Shelley Bookspan, Ph.D.)

(1:55)

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations. Mr. Jacobus pointed out that the drawings do not indicate the siding material on the front elevation; however, this is clarified on page 1, bottom of the first paragraph.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 7/0/0.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT7. **1035 STATE ST** C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-032
 Application Number: MST2005-00095
 Owner: Howard Children Gift Trust
 Business Name: Business First National Bank
 Architect: Elisa Garcia
 Contractor: Thomas Bortolazzo Construction

(Revised Project Description: This is on the Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal to install a new ATM with an awning and light fixture on the east elevation, reinstall a night depository at the front entrance, and move an existing planter on the State Street frontage a few feet to the north.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Ronald L. Nye, Ph.D.)

(1:56)

Ronald Nye, Historian; and Gil Garcia, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated the report was requested on March 2, 2005. The original proposal showed the ATM being located below an existing window on the circa 1930 façade of the building. The current proposal places the ATM on the 1957 addition. The report concludes the ATM, as currently proposed, will not result in a significant visual impact. Staff agrees that, if the ATM is allowed to be placed on the State Street facade, the proposal is a reasonable way of accomplishing it.

In response to a question from the Commission, Mr. Jacobus stated the Commission can agree with the verbiage of the measures but not necessarily agree with the proposal.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following comments: 1) Restudy the following wording: a) page 7, paragraph F, b) page 8, paragraph 5 and item 7, c) page 10, bottom two paragraphs. 2) The Commission disagreed with the conclusion that the ATM is appropriate to the building or with El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines on the primary facade.

Action: La Voie/Murray.

Motion withdrawn.

Substitute

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Page 8: Reword paragraphs 5 and 7. 2) Page 10: Reword the last paragraph that speaks to the removal of the plaque. 3) Page 9: Provide the date that a former cream colored painted band was applied and discuss the appropriateness of the band on an historic building. 4) Provide discussion regarding the appropriateness of the design of the ATM on a historically significant building and how it conforms to El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines. 5) Analyze the possible impact of required lighting on the character of the structure.

Action: La Voie/Rager, 6/0/1. Spann stepped down.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

8. **333 JUNIPERO PLAZA** E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-261-003
 Application Number: MST2003-00911
 Owner: Roland & Mary Hanson
 Architect: Kent Mixon

(This is a City Landmark (Francisca de la Guerra Dibblee Residence). Proposal to convert an existing 520 square foot garage to storage use, and the construction of a detached 440 square foot, two-car garage with an attached 150 square foot storage area on the east side of the house. The project also includes removing two sets of trellis and fruit trees on the west side of the house, the construction of a 280 square foot master bath, a new door entry, and the reconfiguration of six courtyard openings on the south elevation. Additionally proposed is a 12 by 40 foot swimming pool, arbor, fountain, Zen garden, and new access to the upper garden.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Fermina B. Murray.)

(2:58)

Fermina Murray, Preparer; and Kent Mixon, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated given that: 1) the engineer has determined that the condition of the brick veneer poses a life safety issue, 2) the house also qualified as a landmark for its association with the De la Guerra and Dibblee families, and 3) that the proposed work will simulate the original thickness of the brick veneer with wood framing, Staff agrees with the conclusions and recommendations in the report.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with the following comments and added mitigation measures: 1) The applicant shall retain, for safe keeping, sections of moldings, a section of plaster, representative windows and doors, the plaster detail at the jam, and any other character defining elements. 2) The Historian is to return with a Letter Report that identifies the elements which should be archived. 3) Submit to City Staff a copy of the agreement between the owner and a City of Santa Barbara qualified Historian agreeing to the oversight of construction drawings and materials, methods, and means of construction to replicate all the features of the exterior. 4) The reconstruction of the building would be acceptable with these conditions.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 6/0/1. Murray stepped down.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

9. **428 CHAPALA ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
 Application Number: MST2005-00079
 Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP
 Architect: DesignArc
 Business Name: Casa De Sevilla

(Proposed 1,000 square foot dining patio including an additional restroom, masonry wall, fountain, bar, and fabric awnings for an existing restaurant.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

(3:20)

Pamela Post and Tim Hazeltine, Post/Hazeltine Associates; Mark Kirkhart, Architect; and Thomas Hashbarger, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jake Jacobus, Urban Historian, stated that Staff has read the report and agrees with the conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as submitted.

Action: La Voie/Pujo, 6/0/1. Hausz abstained.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

10. **428 CHAPALA ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026
 Application Number: MST2005-00079
 Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP
 Architect: DesignArc
 Business Name: Casa De Sevilla

(Proposed 1,000 square foot dining patio including an additional restroom, masonry wall, fountain, bar, and fabric awnings for an existing restaurant.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(3:25)

Mark Kirkhart, Architect; and Thomas Hashbarger, Architect, present.

Motion: Preliminary approval and a four week continuance with the condition that the applicant provide a complete landscape plan that shows additional landscaping on the whole site. Historic Resource Findings were made that the project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/0. Suding and Hsu absent.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED11. **1730 ANACAPA ST**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-015
 Application Number: MST2005-00123
 Owner: Monte and Patricia Fligsten
 Designer: Laura Hanson

(This is a revised project description. This is on the Potential Historic Resource List (Hall Cottage/Park Residence). Demolition of the existing 759 square foot garage and 150 square foot shed, and construction of a new 733 square foot, three-car garage with a 464 square foot, second floor accessory space, all on a 25,425 square foot lot.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT; ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(3:37)

Laura Hanson, Designer; and Monte Fligsten, Applicant, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment for the applicant to document the existing building and follow those details for the new design.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW12. **211 CASTILLO ST**

R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-022-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00277
 Owner: Charles Butler
 Applicant: Jan Hochhauser

(Concept review for a proposal to construct six, three-bedroom condominiums with underground parking.)

(Applicant requests comments with regard to size, bulk, and scale of the proposed project.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ZONING COMPLIANCE REVIEW, ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP.)

(3:48)

Charles Butler, Owner; Jan Hochhauser, Architect; and Nigel Gomersall, Architect, present.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates the early project review. 2) The Commission appreciates the underground parking but would like to see less parking and more in-grade planting. 3) Reduce the mass, bulk, and scale. The project as currently designed is unacceptable. 4) Add more landscaping. 5) Simplify the building forms.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**13. 1900 LASUEN RD**

R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022
 Application Number: MST99-00305
 Owner: Orient Express Hotels
 Architect: Henry Lenny
 Applicant: Tynan Group, Inc.
 Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(The main building is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure.)

(Fifth Concept Review.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED. PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

This item was taken out of order.

(7:11)

Henry Lenny, Architect; and Cameron Carey, Architect, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission understands that the chimney, brick terrace patio element, and dormer are not on the drawings and that the applicant will be showing rafters. 2) The Commission is pleased with the rustication of the base with stone and prefers additional rustication in a larger size and irregular shape of boulders and stones. 3) Do not add the molding at the top. 4) The majority of Commissioners prefer the horizontal lap siding and not the vertical board and batt. 5) The Commission requested that Staff prepare a resolution to designate the site as a Site of Merit.

Action: Naylor/Rager, 5/0/1. Hausz abstained.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**14. 901 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-313-018
 Application Number: MST2004-00052
 Owner: Richard Gunner
 Architect: Anthony Spann
 Business Name: Santa Barbara Inn

(Proposal to enlarge the main entry of the hotel. The project includes removal and relocation of two bedrooms and the third floor sun deck. The net increase of new floor area is 876 square feet; however there is a net decrease of 361 square feet of Measure E square footage. This project has been revised from the original submittal.)

(Fourth Concept Review. Review of exterior elevations.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES MODIFICATIONS. ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND COASTAL REVIEW COMPLETED.)

(4:50)

Rob Maday; Bill Harrison; and Bernard Austin, present.

Staff Comment: Jaime Limon, Design Review Supervisor, discussed various aspects of the proposal including the need for a landscape maintenance agreement for the City Parcel fronting Cabrillo Boulevard and stated the building set-back is not a problem due to the south elevation being an interior property line. Mr. Limon requested the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) review the improvements that are being proposed in the set-back area and make comments specifically to the Modification Hearing Officer with respect to the type of encroachment the HLC can support. Staff will be requesting a specific improvement of the pedestrian access along Milpas Street that will continue on along Cabrillo Boulevard. Staff understands that the project is a difficult project to review given the extensive changes planned and reminded the HLC to give clear direction to the applicant.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Commission greatly appreciates the considerable effort to provide a design conforming to the Historic Structures Ordinance. 2) The current proposal presented is a big improvement in addressing the prior concerns of the Commission and is moving in the right direction. 3) The building is too fractured and busy, but it has potential. 4) The elements of the design still lack a coherent style theme, and building composition. The predominant elements are suggestive of a Mission Revival Style, and the Commission suggests that this style, and its variations incorporating Monterey style balconies, could be used to resolve this disjunctive. 5) The symmetrical telescoping elements, and fenestration on the Milpas corner are suggestive of a modern design. An Asymmetrical composition of projecting elements would be more consistent with the Mission Revival style. 6) The elements of the Milpas/Cabrillo corner need to be composed into a unified design. Emphasizing the tower, giving some mass to the tower base was suggested. 7) The Commission noted that a more vertical proportion of openings is more appropriate for the styles of architecture acceptable in the district. 8) A computer or three-dimensional model would be helpful to the Commission in reviewing the proposal. 9) The Commission recommends modulation and detailing of the mass at the top of the building. 10) The southeast center element is successful; let those elements bleed over into other adjacent elements. Consider south elevation vertical elements. 11) Restudy the south elevation right lower arch under the tower. The majority of the Commission prefers the 5/25/05 south elevation; however, the comment about restudying the right lower arch does apply to this list. 12) Additional width is suggested at corners, especially at tower corners, to enhance the expression of masonry construction. 13) Where possible, bring the building mass to the ground. Where elements are required to be cantilevered due to existing conditions, a wood framed balcony system which can be found in the Mission Revival Style is recommended. 14) The tower elements at the corners of the buildings should be more expressive of masonry construction with a greater proportion of wall space to void (arch and balcony). The use of buttresses was also suggested. 15) The Commission would support the modifications for encroachment into the front yard setback for those elements which are required for aesthetic enhancement of the building, particularly its mass. 16) Study the use of 36" rail heights at the individual unit balconies to mitigate the proportion of rail to opening. 17) Study the use of garage doors to minimize the cantilever appearance over the parking. 18) Flair the walkways out at two locations - the corner tower elements as they project into the park space. 19) Redesign the pool enclosure pilasters to be consistent with the building design. 20) The Commission accepts the design of the wind screen – wrought iron frames with glazing.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 5/0/1. Spann stepped down.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

15. 1903 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-012
 Application Number: MST2005-00339
 Designer: Ruben Carmona
 Owner: Harrison Bull

(Proposal for interior alterations to construct a 680 square foot addition of new office space within an existing chapel building, remove existing painted glass window and construct a new bay window and balcony, and re-paint exterior of building.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES A MODIFICATION AND ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(6:42)

Ruben Carmona, Designer, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The small horizontal windows and proposed color are incompatible with the architectural style of the building. 2) The proposed balcony and bay window should replicate the existing bay window on the Pedregosa Street elevation. 3) Restudy the doors. 4) Restudy the handicap ramp and rail. 5) The proposed balcony is too wide. 6) Study the use of brackets on the new projection. 7) The parking area needs to be brought up to current standards in both parking demand and design. 8) A Historic Structures Report is requested.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 4/2/0. Hausz and Murray opposed.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

16. 1210 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2005-00323
 Owner: Granada Tower, LLC
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list. Proposal to replace the existing exterior fire escape stairs, construct a rooftop mechanical equipment screen, add rooftop windows, and uncover, rehabilitate, and add wrought iron balcony details to 12 original windows (two windows each on six floors) on the south elevation of the Granada Theatre.)

This item was taken out of order.

(4:19)

Brian Cearnal, Architect; Rob Rossi, Owner; and Glen Hartman, Co-Owner, present.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission appreciates the early project review. 2) The Commission favored Option #2 (enclosed stair which steps back) but would like to see different fenestration and roof that does not extend the mansard. 3) Additional details of the attic windows and roof equipment screen are required for adequate evaluation.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 7/0/1. Rager stepped down.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

17. 333 JUNIPERO PLAZA

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-261-003
 Application Number: MST2003-00911
 Owner: Roland & Mary Hanson
 Architect: Kent Mixon

(This is a City Landmark (Francisca de la Guerra Dibblee Residence). Proposal to convert an existing 520 square foot garage to storage use, and the construction of a detached 440 square foot, two-car garage with an attached 150 square foot storage area on the east side of the house. The project also includes removing two sets of trellis and fruit trees on the west side of the house, the construction of a 280 square foot master bath, a new door entry, and the reconfiguration of six courtyard openings on the south elevation. Additionally proposed is a 12 by 40 foot swimming pool, arbor, fountain, Zen garden, and new access to the upper garden.)

(Review of remodel of brick substrate and changes to previously approved parapet molding and garage terrace trellis.)

(REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

(7:29)

Kent Mixon, Architect; and Mary Hanson, Owner, present.

Public comment opened at 7:37 p.m. and seeing no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment to provide drawings that reflect the detailed changes replacing the brick. Findings were made that the project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource. Additionally, the reconstruction is being made primarily for the purpose of restoring the landmark to its original appearance in order to substantially aid in the preservation and of the landmark and that the proposed additions do not detract from the status or character of the building.

Action: La Voie/Rager, 5/0/1. Murray stepped down.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

18. **315 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00471
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Brian Cearnal & Christine Pierron
 Designer: LNI Custom Manufacturing

(The Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara (HASB) is proposing to demolish the existing commercial structures and construct 61 efficiency units and one manager's unit. Each unit would be 216 square feet in size and restricted to affordable rental housing targeted to households at or below sixty percent (60%) of area median income. The building would be a maximum of three stories in height, contain 2,051 square feet of common building area for resident services, and have 5,759 square feet of landscaped courtyards. Seventeen parking spaces would be located in the parking ground level garage and 10 guest spaces would be provided off site.)

(Review of bus stop shelter design.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION 030-04.)

(7:44)

Craig Shallenberger, Architect, present.

Motion: **Bus enclosure:** Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with the following comments:
 1) The location of the bus stop enclosure needs to be reconsidered. 2) Return to the Historic Landmarks Commission for further consideration following the Planning Commission review.

Landscape: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the comment that the proposed location of the electrical transformer is unacceptable at the front of the building due to a lack of space for landscape screening.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 5/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

19. **1035 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-281-032
 Application Number: MST2005-00095
 Owner: Howard Children Gift Trust
 Business Name: Business First National Bank
 Architect: Elisa Garcia
 Contractor: Thomas Bortolazzo Construction

(Revised Project Description: This is on the Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal to install a new ATM with an awning and light fixture on the east elevation, reinstall a night depository at the front entrance, and move an existing planter on the State Street frontage a few feet to the north.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS. ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

This item was taken out of order.

(2:31)

Gil Garcia, Architect; and Eloy Ortega, CEO, Business First National Bank, present.

Public comment opened at 2:44 p.m.

Louise Boucher, local resident, stated she would prefer to see the ATM machine located on the side of the building and not the State Street facade.

Public comment closed at 2:46 p.m.

Straw votes:

How many Commissioners can support the night depository in the location proposed? 5/1.

How many Commissioners can support the ATM, as is presently designed, in its location? 1/5.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Return with a revised Historic Structures Report. 2) Study the lighting, awning, and the design and installation of the machine. 3) The location of the night depository is acceptable; however, the Commission would prefer to see a smaller, recessed piece of equipment in a bronze finish. 4) The Commission does not consent to the location of the ATM machine until an appropriate design is proposed.

Action: La Voie/Naylor, 3/2/1. Hsu and Rager opposed. Spann stepped down.

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

- A. **401 W MONTECITO ST** C-2/SD-3 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-022-020
 Application Number: MST2001-00153
 Owner: Harbor Car Wash, Inc.
 Architect: Philip Chung
 Landscape Architect: Bob Cunningham

(Proposal to demolish the existing car-wash tunnel and construct a new 850 square foot car-wash tunnel at the rear of the existing building, and convert the existing lube bays to a 1,702 square foot food mart at an existing service station.)

(Review of A.C. condenser unit relocation.)

Continued two weeks with the comment to provide a fence detail.

CONTINUED ITEM

- B. **340 W CARRILLO ST** C-2 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-027
 Application Number: MST2001-00831
 Owner: George & Lena Dumas Trust
 Architect: Timothy Boe
 Business Name: USA Gasoline
 Architect: Jeff Gorrell

(The proposed project involves the demolition of an existing 1,330 square foot gas station with three service bays, and construction of a 1,701 square foot gas station/mini-market (2,038 square feet gross) with a 1,728 square foot pump island canopy and six parking spaces at the corner of Carrillo and Castillo Streets.)

(Final Approval of window details and lighting plan.)

Continued two weeks with the comment to return with a lighting plan and identification of plant material for the planter pots.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 312 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-021-002
 Application Number: MST2002-00171
 Owner: Frederick Lyle & Micholyn Brown
 Architect: Kirk Gradin

(This is a Structure of Merit. The proposed project involves the conversion of a 1,817 square foot residential building into a condominium unit; addition of 587 square feet; the construction of one attached condominium unit of 2,179 square feet. The conversion of the existing building (Unit A) is to legalize interior un-permitted work and to create a single-family unit out of four apartment units. Unit A is proposed as a two-story, three-bedroom, three-bathroom unit with a two-car garage located on the first floor. Unit B is proposed as a two-bedroom, two-bathroom residence with one covered and one uncovered parking space.)

(Review After Final of adding a stepped planter along the driveway.)

Final approval of the Review After Final with the conditions that the planter remain at grade in lieu of railroad tie solution and that existing stone wall be extended to grade.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 421 E FIGUEROA ST**

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-173-017
 Application Number: MST2004-00008
 Owner: Allen & Angela Zimmer
 Architect: Architects West

(This is a City Landmark: Arrellanes-Kirk Adobe. Proposal to demolish 1,000 square feet of an existing 1,810 square foot residence and add 2,330 square feet to the residence. Additionally, the applicant proposes to add two rental units totaling 5,335 square feet.)

(Final Review of details.)

Referred to the Full Board meeting.

(1:38)

Alan Zimmer, Architect, present.

Motion: Final approval as submitted.
 Action: Pujo/Murray, 7/0/0.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**E. 633 E CABRILLO BLVD**

HRC-1/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-013
 Application Number: MST2004-00653
 Owner: Fess Parker Doubletree Hotel
 Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal to make revisions to the existing patio, awnings, new flooring, garden walls, exterior fireplace, fountain, new door to be replaced with window; new awning at pre-function entrance.)

(Review After Final of fountain.)

Continued indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

NEW ITEM**F. 1919 STATE ST**

C-2/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-371-009
Application Number: MST2005-00342
Owner: Winnikoff Family Trust
Applicant: Lenvik & Minor Architects
Owner: Kadix LLC

(Proposal to replace all existing aluminum sliding windows with new aluminum awning windows. The proposal also includes the installation of two new windows at the ground floor (street) level.)

Final approval with the suggestion that the applicant consider a center mullion at the glazing divisions.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**G. 2050 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA**

SP-7 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-163-004
Application Number: MST97-00775
Agent: Suzanne Elledge
Agent: Alexandra Cole
Applicant: Michael Towbes
Architect: John Pitman
Business Name: Riviera Park

(Proposal to demolish an existing 9,467 square foot, two-story commercial building (Brooks Hall, former men's gym) and build a new two-story 12,369 square foot commercial office building. There are seven existing buildings and 267 parking spaces on this 8.63 acre lot. Fourteen new parking spaces are proposed.)

(Review After Final of street improvement plan and grading/drainage.)

Final approval of the Review After Final with the comment that Staff shall coordinate the applications of this project with that of 1900 Lasuen Road and Public Works with regard to the Alvarado and Lasuen intersection.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:52 P.M. ****