



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 2, 2005

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- ANTHONY SPANN, Chair, Present
- VADIM HSU, Vice-Chair, Present
- STEVE HAUSZ, Absent
- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Absent
- ALEX PUJO, Present at 1:41 p.m.
- CAREN RAGER, Present
- PHILIP SUDING, Present
- FERMINA MURRAY, Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON, Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present
- BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.

- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on January 28, 2005 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 19, 2005.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of January 19, 2005, with corrections.

Action: Naylor/Rager, 6/0/0.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Spann with the exception of Item F, which was reviewed by Vadim Hsu.

Action: Rager/Suding, 6/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

a) A reminder regarding the joint workshop on February 9, 2005 from 3:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. The Historic Landmarks Commission will attend the workshop along with the City Council, Planning Commission, Architectural Board of Review, and the Airport Commission to discuss the Airport Terminal Improvement Project.

b) The Appeal of the Red Tile Walk was denied at the City Council hearing on February 8, 2005.

2. Ms. Rager announced that she will step down from Item No. 6, 1214 State Street.

3. Philip Suding announced that he will step down from Item No. 4, 35 State Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Hsu stated that he attended the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance (NPO) meeting which focused on the Hillside Design Guidelines, height and width of buildings, and the control of spill down to meet the height requirements. Discussion also focused on retaining walls in the Hillside Design District and the definition of the Hillside Design District triggers.

Ms. Murray stated that she would like to schedule the next Designations Subcommittee meeting and that she will contact Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian to arrange the meeting.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**1. 508 E DE LA GUERRA ST**

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-101-018
 Application Number: MST2004-00233
 Owner: Joe Butler & Beatryce Family
 Architect: Hochhauser & Blatter

(The project consists of a lot line adjustment between two parcels (508 E. De la Guerra St. /APN 031-101-018 & 514 E. De la Guerra St. /APN 031-101-019). Four new condominium units in two (2) two-story buildings are proposed for the 508 E. De la Guerra St. parcel. Building A would consist of one (1) three-bedroom unit with an attached one-bedroom rental unit. Building B would consist of one (1) one-bedroom unit, one (1) two-bedroom unit and one (1) three-bedroom unit. Two new detached two-story apartments are proposed for the 514 E. De la Guerra St. parcel. Building A would be a one-bedroom apartment and Building B would be a three-bedroom apartment. Three single-family residences would be demolished on the 508 E. De la Guerra St. parcel and one single-family residence would be demolished on the 514 E. De la Guerra St. parcel.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report from Compass Rose Archaeological, Inc.)

(2:09)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow had reviewed the report and agreed with its conclusions and recommendations on December 16, 2004; however, because the project description on the agenda differed from the project description on the report, the Historic Landmarks Commission continued the project. After further research, it was found that the agenda contained the project description for only one of the two parcels. The current agenda shows the project descriptions for both parcels and match what was originally contained in the report. Ms. Gantz also stated that a U.C.S.B. letter is now inserted into the report.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as reviewed by Dr. Glassow and with the changes as submitted.
 Action: Suding/Murray, 7/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**2. 533 W GUTIERREZ ST**

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-003
 Application Number: MST2004-00264
 Owner: Gonzalez Family Trust
 Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to demolish two, one-story single-family residences. The proposal includes the construction of two new buildings with five, two- and three-story apartments. The project will result in two, one-bedroom apartments, two, two-bedroom apartments, and one, three-bedroom apartment. The five apartments will total 8,802 square feet on an 11,418 square foot lot. The proposal also includes the construction of three, two-car garages, two, one-car garages, and one uncovered parking space.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report from Western Points Archaeology.)

(2:12)

Jose Esparza, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated Dr. Glassow reported that, given the likely presence of a prehistoric site extending onto the property in question, he recommends an extended Phase I study rather than the monitoring that has been recommended by Western Points Archaeology. Dr. Glassow reported that the study will probably require shovel or auger testing. The extended Phase I report should include mapping of test locations and itemization of all finds by location depth so as to justify inferences and recommendations as specified in the Master Environmental Assessment Guidelines. Ms. Gantz also stated that Mr. Jacobus has indicated that this is an 1870's or early 1880's Italianate Victorian structure which may have historical significance or value and is requesting that the Historic Landmarks Commission determine whether a Historic Structures Report is warranted.

- Motion: The Commission accepts the report with Dr. Glassow's comments and the following comments:
1) Return with an extended Phase I report. 2) Return with a Historic Structures Report.
- Action: Hsu/Suding, 7/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

3. **623 STATE ST** C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-006
 Application Number: MST2004-00802
 Owner: Chaffee Family Survivors Trust
 Applicant: Brandon Mix
 Designer: Sam Linhardt
 Agent: Raymond Appleton

(Revised proposal to remove two single existing entrance doors located on either side of the storefront and construct a centered, recessed, double-doored entrance, and make interior tenant improvements to create a 1,300 square foot coffee shop. The existing tiled facade and stained glass transom will be studied for possible alteration.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

(2:18)

Brandon Mix, Applicant; and Peter Hunt, Architect, present.

- Motion: Preliminary approval with the following conditions: 1) Consider eliminating the railing or design it in a way that is more integrated with the sign on the facade. 2) Restudy the moldings and proportions of the entablatures, columns, and capitals to be more traditional. 3) Provide all details, including the leaded glass and storefront. 4) Provide details for the rear elevation. 5) No colors are approved at this time.

Action: Pujo/Suding, 6/1/0. Naylor abstained. La Voie and Hausz absent.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

4. **35 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-102-004
 Application Number: MST97-00357
 Business Name: Ritz-Carlton Club
 Applicant: Santa Barbara Beach Properties, LP
 Architect: Doug Singletary
 Landscape Architect: Philip Suding
 Engineer: Patrick Gibson & Bryan Mayeda
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Engineer: Penfield & Smith

(Proposal for the Ritz-Carlton Club involving the private redevelopment of portions of three blocks of properties located at 22-120 State Street, 15 East Mason Street, 125 State Street, and the State Street right-of-way between Mission Creek and the Union Pacific Railroad right of way.)

(Review After Final of additional street improvements.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH CITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION NO. 01-103.)

(2:51)

Rob Maday, Agent, present.

Staff Comment: Debra Andaloro, Project Planner, stated that Public Works Engineering is concerned that the plans submitted are not construction level plans and do not show utilities or cross sections. Ms. Andaloro stated that in her discussion with Mr. Limon, he felt that it is the Landscape Architects responsibility to investigate locations of the utilities so as to not interfere with some of the infrastructure on State Street. Ms. Andaloro also stated that Public Works Engineering is concerned with the impact the bricks being proposed on the Mission Creek bridge and that the

proposed trees may not be able to be planted in the proposed locations due to the impact to an existing storm drain. Also, Public Works Transportation does not support the two trees planted in the driveway location of 14 State Street due to a visibility impediment, nor do they support narrowing any of the driveway aprons in this area. Finally, Ms. Andaloro stated that it has been determined that the Parks and Recreation Commission did in fact review and approve the removal of the two existing street trees in the subject area, and that according to Parks and Recreation Department staff, the proposed landscape plan does not require review and approval by The Commission.

The Commission took no action.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

5. 1345 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-131-002
 Application Number: MST2005-00003
 Owner: Betty Howard, Trustee
 Architect: Rodney Stone
 Contractor: Sierra Pacific
 Business Name: Fremont Investment

(Proposal to upgrade existing parking stalls to meet ADA requirements, remove existing window, add new door, tiled walkway, landscaping, and interior tenant improvements.)

(3:07)

Rodney Stone, Architect; and Stephanie Bolten, Architect, present.

Public comment opened at 3:14 p.m.

Kellem De Forest stated his concern regarding removal of the tree and the possibility of adding an additional tree. Mr. De Forest also expressed his concern with the size of the proposed sign.

Public comment closed at 3:15 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Maximize the landscaping around the entire building. 2) Mitigate the loss of two trees. 3) Paving material is not acceptable. Consider using brick at entries to match lower and mid-State Street. 4) Provide a traditional handrail detail for the front door. 5) Recess the door in the rear. 6) Narrow the driveway curb cut. 7) Consider adding the trellis back.

Action: Suding/Hsu, 7/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 1214 STATE ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves restoration of the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Continued review of rear marquee and balcony details.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04. PRELIMINARY APPROVAL MAY BE GRANTED IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(3:25)

Steve Metsch, Architect, and Monisha Adnani, Project Manager for the Granada Theatre, present.

Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Jessica Grant, Associate Planner, could not attend the meeting; however, she wanted to relay to the applicant and the Commission that the entrance doors are to be wood, with no glass, and that if there is a balcony shown above the marquee, the project will require an Environmental Impact Report.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project with the comment that the approval does not include the marquee, the balcony above the marquee, or front exit doors.

Action: Naylor/Hsu. 5/1/1. Rager stepped down. Murray abstained. La Voie and Hausz absent.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

7. 601 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-123-018
 Application Number: MST2003-00834
 Owner: Eleonora Hofmann
 Architect: Doug Reeves
 Business Name: Enterprise Rent-a-Car

(Proposal to demolish a 1,256 square foot commercial structure with a covered canopy and to construct a one-story 980 square foot retail/commercial building on an 8,980 square foot lot. This proposal also includes new electrical, landscaping and reworking of curb cuts and sidewalks.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH THE CHAPALA STREET DESIGN GUIDELINES.)

(3:40)

Doug Reeves, Architect, present.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would prefer the wainscot be painted a different color than the body of the building? 4/3.

Motion: Final approval of the building and a two-week continuance to the Consent Calendar with the following comments and conditions: 1) Return with details of the landscaping, colors, and weep screed. 2) Revise the light fixture to show the accurate type of bulb. 3) Screen the site. 4) The approval excludes off-site improvements.

Action: Hsu/Suding, 7/0/0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

CONTINUED ITEM

A. 721 CHAPALA ST

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-006
 Application Number: MST2002-00405
 Owner: Chadwick Pacific, LP
 Architect: Peikert Group Architects
 Applicant: Bermant Development Company

(Proposal to demolish an existing 9,788 square foot commercial building and six residential units totaling 2,700 square feet, and to construct 9,788 square feet of commercial space, 29 residential units (including 12 bonus density units) totaling 43,357 square feet, and a 25,533 square foot on-grade parking structure.)

(Final review of details.)

(1:38)

Gordon Brewer and Carrie Bingham, Architects, present.

Staff Comment: Renee Brooke, Associate Planner, stated that she had talked with a representative from the Peikert Group about whether the A/C units could encroach into the required private outdoor living space and it was determined that they could not. Ms. Brooke stated that compliance with the Noise Ordinance for interior noise levels would be a Building and Safety Division decision. Noise levels in the required private outdoor living spaces would likely need to be evaluated in a noise study. Ms. Brooke stated that she has not yet seen the new version of the plan to determine if the location of the units comply with these requirements.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Staff is to determine if a noise study is required for the units private open space. 2) Study the location of the units to see if it meets the Noise Ordinance. 3) The Commission is extremely concerned with the visual and noise impact of the condenser units.

Action: Naylor/Suding, 4/3/0. Hsu, Rager and Murray opposed.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 401 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-020
 Application Number: MST2004-00601
 Owner: 401 East Carrillo Street, LLC
 Applicant: Tracy Burnell
 Owner: Allen Moelleken

(Proposal for an exterior alteration to the building facade including a new entry wall, new columns, windows, planters, and roof equipment.)

(Final review of details.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 1329 GARDEN ST**

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-072-005
 Application Number: MST2005-00006
 Owner: Waltraud Hartmann
 Architect: Pete Ehlen

(This is an enforcement case. Proposal to remove a roof and replace it with a 275 square foot deck on an existing two-story duplex.)

(Final review of details. Abatement of ENF2004-00691.)

Final Approval of the details as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**D. 533 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-001
 Application Number: MST2005-00028
 Business Name: Starbucks
 Owner: Tamara Erickson
 Applicant: Art Martin

(Proposed privacy screening of windows on the Cota Street elevation.)

Final Approval as submitted with the comment that the existing glass is to remain as is with no film or photos attached to window. It was suggested to place a historic photo on wall behind the glass.

NEW ITEM

- E. **17 W CANON PERDIDO ST** C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-001
Application Number: MST2005-00045
Owner: Redevelopment Agency/Santa Barbara
Applicant: Ken Quayle
Business Name: Nordstrom

(This is an enforcement case. Proposal to permit as-built bird netting around the perimeter of the third floor restaurant terrace.)

Continued two weeks to the Full Board.

NEW ITEM

- F. **206 E ANAPAMU ST** C-2 Zone
Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-039
Application Number: MST2005-00046
Owner: Storke/Schauer LTD
Applicant: Suding Design Landscape Architects
Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects
Business Name: Northern Trust Bank

(Proposed landscape renovation including the removal of three raised planters on the Anapamu Street elevation.)

Final Approval as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:57 P.M. ****