



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, January 5, 2005

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:34 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

- WILLIAM LA VOIE, Chair, Absent
- ANTHONY SPANN, Vice-Chair, Present
- STEVE HAUSZ, Present
- VADIM HSU, Present
- ALEX PUJO, Absent
- CAREN RAGER, Present, left at 1:46 p.m., returned at 1:57 p.m., left at 4:41 p.m., returned at 5:13 p.m.
- PHILIP SUDING, Present, left at 4:24 p.m., returned at 4:28 p.m., left at 5:01 p.m., returned at 5:05 p.m., left at 5:14 p.m.
- FERMINA MURRAY, Present
- SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

ROGER HORTON, Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

WILLIAM MAHAN, Present at 4:41 p.m., left at 5:12 p.m.

STAFF:

- JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Present at 3:20 p.m., left at 3:33 p.m., returned at 4:48 p.m., left at 5:01 p.m., returned at 5:09 p.m., left at 5:45 p.m.
- JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Absent
- SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician I, Present, left at 4:21 p.m., returned at 4:22 p.m., left at 4:26 p.m., returned at 4:28 p.m.
- BARBARA WALSH, Recording Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** **Many of the items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- ** **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. in the City Clerk's office, at the Central Library, and www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.**

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Land Use Controls or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on December 30, 2004 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the Community Development bulletin board, in the office of the City Clerk, and on the bulletin board on the outside of City Hall.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 15, 2004.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of December 15, 2004, with corrections.

Action: Naylor/Hausz, 7/0/0.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Anthony Spann.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 7/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Vice Chair Spann announced that Fermina Murray has been appointed to the Commission and Steve Hausz has been reappointed.

2. Ms. Gantz announced the following:

a) Item No. 4, 121 W. De La Guerra, has been postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Motion: Postpone Item No. 4, 121 W. De La Guerra, indefinitely.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 7/0/0.

b) A joint meeting of the City Council, Planning Commission, Architectural Board of Review, Historic Landmarks Commission, and Airport Commission is scheduled for February 9, 2005, from 3:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. to discuss the airline terminal project. This meeting will take place at the airport.

c) There will be a meeting of the 721 Chapala Street Subcommittee at 10:00 a.m. on January, 19, 2005, in the David Gebhard Public Meeting Room.

d) At the next Historic Landmarks Commission meeting on January 19, 2005, the Commission will need to re-appoint Commission members to replace Alex Cole for the Designations Subcommittee, the Historic Surveys Subcommittee, and the Lower Mission Creek Design Subcommittee.

e) The Historic Landmarks Commission is invited to the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation's Annual Meeting on Saturday, January 15th, in the Presidio Chapel at 129 E. Canon Perdido Street. The meeting begins at 2:00 p.m. There will be an unveiling of the northwest corner at 3:00 p.m., and a reception immediately following.

f) Stella Larson has submitted a letter in which she requests that the City of Santa Barbara consider Landmark status for five or six original acorn style streetlights on Loma Alta (as it approaches McKinnley School). Ms. Gantz stated that the Commission will need to refer this matter to the Designation Subcommittee for their consideration.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Hsu stated that he had attended the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance meeting in mid-December, where the issue of Floor to Area Ratio (FAR) was re-opened. A consensus was reached that FARs were appropriate for certain lot sizes with a threshold as a design to standard and a maximum as an absolute. Discussion also focused on exceptional architecture, and a variance process as opposed to the modification process. Mr. Hsu stated that the actual numbers are still being considered and discussion focused on smaller lots and garages being included in the FARs.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT1. **1655 SHORELINE DR**

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-173-025
 Application Number: MST2004-00097
 Owner: Isabelle Herin, Trustee
 Architect: Gregory Jenkins
 Owner: William Cook

(Proposal for a 2,267 square foot two-story addition to an existing 1,629 square foot residence. This includes a 53 square foot addition to an existing garage. This project is located in the Hillside Design District and in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report from Stone Archaeological Consulting.)**(1:46)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, announced that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with Dr. Glassow's comments.
 Action: Hausz/Suding, 7/0/0.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT2. **929 E CANON PERDIDO ST**

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-315-010
 Application Number: MST2004-00565
 Owners: Wilma Rodriguez and Mr. & Mrs. Lua
 Architect: Jose Esparza

(Proposal to demolish an existing 630 square foot single family residence and a 505 square foot garage to construct a 2,638 square foot two-story duplex, consisting of a 1,200 square foot three-bedroom unit and a 582 square foot accessory dwelling unit with an attached 773 square foot three-car garage on a 5,000 square foot lot.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report by Western Points Archaeology.)**(1:46)**

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, announced that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and questions the interpretation that the parcel has one to four feet of fill covering the original ground surface (p. 14). He stated that, as a neighbor, he has noticed most often streets and sidewalks are cut to create level surfaces, leaving house lots with banks bordering the sidewalk. Since minimal fill exists on the property (and this has happened in the vicinity of 929 East Canon Perdido), then the results of the archaeological survey would be reliable. However, if fill does cover most or all of the property, then there is a prospect for undisturbed buried deposits, and the archaeological survey should then be considered unreliable.

Ms. Gantz stated that Environmental Analyst, Barbara Shelton, discussed Dr. Glassow's comments with Larry Carbone, the archaeologist, and that Mr. Carbone confirmed there is clearly fill on the site. In reconsidering the sensitivity level

of the area due to historic and prehistoric archaeological sites recorded within close proximity of this site, the report has been revised by Mr. Carbone to include a recommendation for earthwork monitoring associated with the project. Ms. Gantz stated that Staff recommends approval of the report as revised.

Public comment opened at 1:48 p.m.

Christine Newhouser, neighbor, questioned at what point in the process she can address the architecture of the project.

Public comment closed at 1:50 p.m.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with Dr. Glassow's comments with the stipulation that the archaeological monitoring program be conducted.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 6/0/1. Rager stepped down.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

3. **615 DEL MONTE AVE** R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-022-008
 Application Number: MST2004-00064
 Owner: Rigo Vela
 Architect: Jose Esparza
 Applicant: Rigo Vela

(This is a revised project to demolish 1,090 square foot existing residence and carport. The proposal involves a new two story 2,048 square foot duplex with two attached 2-car garages on a 5,080 square foot lot.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report by Western Points Archaeology.)

(1:49)

Staff Comment: Susan Gantz, Planning Technician, stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report with Dr. Glassow's comments.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 7/0/0.

DISCUSSION ITEM

(1:57) Rob Dayton, Supervising Transportation Planner, stated that the Transportation Division has been working on the draft Pedestrian Master Plan and that the Planning Commission and Transportation Circulation Committee have requested both the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) and the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) make comments on Chapter 8 of the plan. Mr. Dayton went on to state that the Pedestrian Design Guide would be a benefit to designers, land developers, and engineers in the City. Mr. Dayton stated that suggestions from the HLC and ABR will be incorporated into the Guide, and Transportation will then return to the Planning Commission with those changes.

The Commissioners, either individually or collectively, made the following comments and suggestions:

1. On page 156, add a definition of the "Waiver of Remonstrance."
2. On page 160, make a new reference to "Table A-1."
3. On pages 160 and 166, clarify the wording regarding the intent of the driveway apron.
4. On page 161, include "sandstone curbs" and "brick pavers" under the material list. Also, indicate that concrete pavers are typically not allowed in the Historic Landmarks Commission District except in the Chapala Street Corridor.
5. On page 161, consider changing the words "comparative cost" to reflect that this is actually a five year window and delete the word "comparative."
6. Include a section that refers to the El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines.
7. On page 163, under the "Frontage Zone," change the word "shy" and add "shy away."
8. On page 165, add the El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines in addressing the furnishings.
9. Address the safety issues of raised medians and pedestrian crosswalks.

10. Address more strongly the language regarding the historic character of the neighborhoods and the streetscape.
11. Add more verbiage regarding tree overhang and outline the requirements.
12. The Commission expressed appreciation for the Guide.
13. Incorporate a section that describes how to handle difficult or non-conforming conditions.
14. Incorporate a section that addresses car overhang into sidewalks.
15. Add a glossary of technical terms.

(THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:19 P.M. TO 2:33 P.M.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. **121 W DE LA GUERRA ST** C-2 Zone
- Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-002
 Application Number: MST2004-00774
 Owner: The Rametto Company
 Applicant: Thomas Luria
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,200 square foot commercial building and construct a three-story mixed use building with 52 parking spaces below. The development would be composed of 3,052 square feet of commercial space and 13 residential condominium units, two of which are proposed to be affordable.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

5. **315 W CARRILLO ST** C-2 Zone
- Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00471
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Brian Cearnal & Christine Pierron
 Designer: LNI Custom Manufacturing

(The Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara (HASB) is proposing to demolish the existing commercial structures and construct 61 efficiency units and one manager's unit. Each unit would be 216 square feet in size and restricted to affordable rental housing targeted to households at or below sixty percent (60%) of area median income. The building would be a maximum of three stories in height, contain 2,051 square feet of common building area for resident services, and have 5,759 square feet of landscaped courtyards. Seventeen parking spaces would be located in the parking ground level garage and 10 guest spaces would be provided off site.)

(Review of bus shelter design.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 030-04.)

(2:33)

David Damiano, Santa Barbara Metropolitan Transit District, present.

Staff Comment: Susan McLaughlin, Assistant Transportation Planner, stated that there were Planning Commission comments regarding pedestrian access on the sidewalk and incorporating the bus shelter into the existing sidewalk. Ms. McLaughlin stated that Transportation Planning would like to see the most recent design incorporated into a site plan before the bus shelter is approved and would also like to see adequate space for pedestrian traffic, a bench, and a trash receptacle.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners can support a freestanding metal structure? 5/2.
How many Commissioners can support a structure integrated into the architecture of the building? 7/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission feels that the best approach would be for the bus shelter to be incorporated into the architecture of the building. 2) Return with a more complete presentation to include a larger scale site plan, building elevation (with the bus stop), a trash receptacle, and benches. 3) If the freestanding bus stop continues to be the applicant's choice, the design should be significantly more traditional in design and detailing.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 7/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

6. 721 E COTA ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-110-004
Application Number: MST2004-00406
Owner: Santa Barbara Junior High School
Architect: Kruger, Benson, Ziemer Architects
Applicant: Joe Wilcox

(Proposal to construct an ADA accessible ramp at the entrance to the main building of Santa Barbara Junior High School. This is a City Landmark. Resolution #85-041, March 26, 1985.)

(Final Review of ADA entry ramp.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS.)

(2:48)

Joe Wilcox, Applicant, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments: 1) The Commission would like to see the balusters eliminated. 2) The skate stops shown are to be decorative steel. 3) The stair details need to be revised to show vertical risers. 4) Show the use of brick with the detailing of the stairs to match existing. 5) The plaster finishes are to match the existing building.

Action: Hausz/Suding, 6/1/0. Naylor opposed.

Motion: Reopen the motion.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 7/0/0.

Amended

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board for the Commission to make Historic Resource findings with the following comments: 1) The Commission would like to see the balusters eliminated. 2) The skate stops shown are to be decorative steel. 3) The stair details need to be revised to show vertical risers. 4) Show the use of brick with the detailing of the stairs to match existing. 5) The plaster finishes are to match the existing building.

Action: Hausz/Hsu, 4/2/1. Suding and Naylor opposed. Murray abstained.

(THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:59 P.M. TO 3:16 P.M.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**7. 623 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-006
Application Number: MST2004-00802
Owner: Chaffee Family Survivor Trust
Applicant: Brandon Mix
Designer: Sam Linhardt
Agent: Raymond Appleton

(Proposal to demolish 138 square feet of the existing store frontage, add an approximately 391 square foot covered entry, and make interior tenant improvements to create a 1,300 square foot coffee shop.)

(Second Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(3:16)

Raymond Appleton, Agent; Brandon Mix, Applicant; and Peter Hunt, Architect, present.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the comment that the facade as proposed is not acceptable and to restudy new elements to be more in conformance with the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Action: Hausz/Naylor, 7/0/0.

FINAL REVIEW**8. 401 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-222-020
Application Number: MST2004-00601
Owner: 401 East Carrillo Street, LLC
Applicant: Tracy Burnell
Owner: Allen Moelleken

(Proposal for an exterior alteration to the building facade including a new entry wall, new columns, windows, planters, and roof equipment.)

(Final Review of details.)

(3:46)

Britt Jewett, Architect; and Scott Branch, Architect, present.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners think that the emergency generator screen is not acceptable and that the emergency generator should be restudied? 7/0.

Motion: Final approval of the project and a two week continuance to the Consent Calendar for final approval of the details with the following comments and conditions. 1) Sheet D1, detail 4: The brick parapet cap should be thicker. 2) Sheet D1, detail 12: Use an alternate solution that incorporates plaster beneath the weep screed. 3) Sheet D2, detail 7: Recess the window further into the building. 4) Sheet D2, detail 15: The rail shall have a more traditional detail, possibly lamb's tongue. 5) No exposed metal flashing on the parapet. 6) Restudy screening of the emergency generator. Either incorporate it into the architecture or relocate it.

Action: Rager/Hausz, 6/0/1. Murray abstained.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**9. 523 CHAPALA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-163-021
 Application Number: MST2004-00854
 Owner: Leon Olson
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(Proposal for seven residential condominium units and two commercial units. The total residential square footage is proposed at 20,031 and the commercial units are 1,366 and 1,634 square feet each, for a total of 3,000 square feet.)

(Concept Review requested prior to PRT process.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

(4:07)

Jeff Shelton, Architect; Leon Olson, Owner; and Carlo Sarmiento, Owner, present.

Public comment opened at 4:18 p.m.

Louise Boucher, local resident, stated her concern regarding the impact of the project on the Brinkerhoff Historic District.

Public comment closed at 4:18 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a courtyard type building? 5/2.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The Commission agrees that the architecture is beautiful. 2) The majority of Commissioners believe the building is too large and the mass needs to be reduced either by reducing the size of the rooms or by reducing the number of units. 3) One Commissioner thought the courtyard should be brought down to the ground floor. 4) The Commission felt the project is incompatible with the neighboring homes and particularly, the Brinkerhoff Avenue Historic District.

Action: Suding/Hausz, 7/0/0.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**10. 1214 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019
 Application Number: MST2004-00005
 Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts
 Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore
 Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves restoration of the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99 foot long, five foot wide and 60 foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80 foot long, 10 foot wide and 78 foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Revised east elevation.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04. PRELIMINARY APPROVAL MAY BE GRANTED IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

(4:43)

Bill Mahan, Planning Commission; Steve Metsch, Architect; and Monisha Adnani, Architect, present.

Staff Comment: Jessica Grant, Case Planner, stated that the Planning Commission has commented on both the east elevation and west (front) elevation of the building. Ms. Grant explained that, regarding the east elevation, the Planning Commission requested that the Historic Landmarks Commission restudy all non-State Street elevations in collaboration with a qualified historian and include architectural embellishments, as long as significant historic impacts do not result from those embellishments. Ms. Grant stated that the Historic Structures Report recommended that the east side (back of the stage house) be kept simple with poured-in-place concrete, whereas the Historic Landmarks Commission suggested adding minor detailing to the blank wall. At the Planning Commission meeting, it was decided to add more to the back of the stage house. Ms. Grant stated that if it is decided today to add embellishments to the east elevation, the Urban Historian should review the project. In regards to the elevation of the building, the Planning Commission has encouraged the use of glass doors at the main entrance and installation of a terrace on the marquee, which would be designed in a manner that does not result in significant environmental impacts. Ms. Grant stated that the applicants have proposed glass doors in the front for various reasons, but the Historic Structures Report suggested the doors be of a simple, wooden style. In regards to the terrace, Ms. Grant said there is a difference of opinion between the Historic Landmarks Commission and the Historic Structures Report. Ms. Grant also stated that it has been recommended that the applicant team pursue landmark status of the Granada Theatre.

Bill Mahan, Planning Commission, stated that the Planning Commission had studied the Historic Structures Report and that, as they understood it, the historic construction method of planked concrete needs to be preserved. Mr. Mahan stated that the Planning Commission felt very strongly that there is an opportunity for the south, north, and east elevations to be completed to match the front style of the building, although not as elaborately. The Planning Commission felt there is nothing in the report prohibiting embellishment and recognized that the 1920's style of concrete work needs to be preserved. In regards to the terrace above the marquee, Mr. Mahan said that the Planning Commission felt there is a functional opportunity for that area to be used for parades and other State Street events.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners can support the cornice embellishment? 1/5.
 How many Commissioners can support the mural? 2/4.
 How many Commissioners can support the earlier concept design? None.
 How many Commissioners can support the project as previously approved? Unanimous.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment that the Commission does not accept the proposed changes and the previous approval stands.

Action: Naylor/Suding, 4/1/1. Hsu opposed. Rager stepped down.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW

11. **820 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-024
 Application Number: MST2004-00855
 Business Name: 24 Hour Fitness
 Owner: EPP office Building, LLC
 Agent: Vogue Signs

(Proposal to install an 8.66 square foot projecting sign, a 2.81 square foot wall sign and a 3.47 square foot wall sign in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. There is an existing Sign Program for the El Paseo Building.) (Appeal of the December 1, 2004 decision of the Sign Committee regarding signs for 24 Hour Fitness under SGN2004-00091.)

(5:13)

Bill Fancher, Fancher Development Services Representative; Nina Ray, Fancher Development Services Representative; Ron Wilkenson, Sign Representative, and Dawn Ziemer, Sign Committee, present.

Staff Comment: Dave Sullivan, Sign Committee Planning Technician, stated that the project was presented to the Sign Committee on December 1, 2004 and was denied with the following comments: 1) The denial was at the request of the applicant and the Committee had expressed the desire to continue working with the applicant. 2) The signs were not consistent with the Spanish lettering and colors consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. 3) The blade sign was over sized for its purpose in a "pedestrian friendly" Landmark District.

Ms. Ziemer, Sign Committee member, stated that the Sign Committee felt that the sign did not blend in with the existing signage already established in the El Paseo area and it did not meet the requirements that the Sign Committee asks of the businesses that are in the El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.

Staff Comment: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, stated that the Historic Landmarks Commission can accept or reject one or all three signs that are proposed. Mr. Limon explained that the Commission can also accept a sign that the Sign Committee has denied, however, and if the Commission decides to deny the application, they can then ask the applicant if they would like to make changes based on the Commission's direction. Mr. Limón went on to state that in the case that the project is denied, the applicant has the ability to appeal to the City Council within 10 days. Mr. Limón also explained that a motion which states "without prejudice" means that the applicant can return to the Commission with a new proposal.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners believe that signs B1 and B2 are less important than sign A? None.
How many Commissioners believe that signs B1 and B2 have the same importance as sign A? Unanimous.

Motion: Denial without prejudice of the appeal with the comment that the signs are not in conformance with the Sign Ordinance and Sign Guidelines which state: "Signs in El Pueblo Viejo District shall contribute to the retention or restoration of the historical character of the area," and the following additional comments:

Sign A: 1) The sign does not meet the El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines. 2) The shape, colors, and lettering of the sign do not conform to the El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines.

Signs B1 & B2: 1) The shape, the manner in which the signs are mounted to the building, the colors, and the letters are not in conformance with the El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines.

Action: Hsu/Rager, 6/0/0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

A. **217 STATE ST** HRC-2/SD-3 Zone
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-042-011
 Application Number: MST2003-00014
 Owner: Young America's Foundation
 Business Name: Reagan Ranch Visitor's Center
 Architect: Jan Hochhauser
 Landscape Architect: David Black

(Proposal for exterior remodel and interior alterations to an existing 19,500 square foot, four-story structure located on an 8,410 square foot lot. The project involves a 954 sq. ft. floor area increase (internal), reconstruction of windows, roof and penthouse. New entrance portico is also proposed. This structure, the Neal Hotel Building, is on the City Potential Historic Resource List.)

(Review After Final of clay roofing tile.)

Final Approval of the Review After Final with the condition that the "Redlands Palmilla" clay roof tile be secured with wire, with double starter course set in mortar, with all hips and ridges set in mortar, and 15% random field of booster tiles set in mortar.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 8 E FIGUEROA ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-282-001
Application Number: MST2004-00837
Owner: Levon Investments
Architect: James LeCron

(Proposal to remodel existing ground floor lobby and enclose 175 square feet of exterior lobby space. New entry doors, tile floor, and light fixtures are proposed.)

(Review of final details.)

Postponed indefinitely due to the applicant's absence.

NEW ITEM**C. 803 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-012
Application Number: MST2004-00860
Owner: ESJ Centers
Applicant: Burl Wood
Business Name: Left at Albuquerque

(Proposal to replace existing heating units for outdoor sidewalk dining area.)

Continued indefinitely with the comment that the applicant is to study a different type of heating unit.

NEW ITEM**D. 320 W CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-033
Application Number: MST2004-00882
Owner: Lawrence Broida
Architect: Rex Ruskauff
Business Name: Ducati of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to replace an existing window with a French door and replace an existing door with a new window. Add an additional French door.)

Final approval of the project with the following conditions: 1) The storefront doors are not to have divided lites. 2) The glazing stops are to be beveled. 3) Existing electrical meters and boxes on the north elevation are to be enclosed to hide exposed installations and conduits and are to be painted to match the existing building.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:50 P.M. ****