



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
NOVEMBER 4, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Moore.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Moore, Cunningham (absent 4:51 – 6:25 p.m.), Insua, Olson, and Watkins (4:51 – 6:24 p.m.)
Members absent: Six
Staff present: Ozyilmaz, Ternovskaya, and John Doimas, Assistant City Attorney (until 6:30 p.m.)

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Rick Closson

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **October 21, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Six and absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **October 28, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Watkins and Cunningham.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 0/0/0. (Watkins and Six absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 4, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Cunningham and Watkins.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Six absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:

- a. Item 4, 29 S. Milpas has been postponed two weeks due to a lack of a quorum.
- b. The Olive Mill Roundabout review is scheduled for the November 18, 2019 agenda.
- c. Board member Cunningham will be recusing himself from hearing Item 3, 219 E. Haley and Item 4, 29 S. Milpas.
- d. Board member Six will be absent from the meeting.
- e. Board member Watkins will be present during Item 3, 219 E. Haley St.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(3:15PM) DISCUSSION ITEM

1. DISCUSSION ON THE AVERAGE UNIT-SIZE DENSITY (AUD) INCENTIVE PROGRAM

Reference Number: PLN2019-00249

Staff: Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician II

(Discussion on the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program.)

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Present: Dan Gullett, Principal Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:24 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

- 1. Anna Marie Gott
- 2. Rick Closson

Written correspondence from Sally Sphar and Rick Closson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:29 p.m.

Board comments:

1. Board Member Olson would like to see the review of the in-lieu parking fees that would be allowed for developers building housing in the Downtown area. He would like Staff reports to be provided to the Board during the review of AUD projects.
2. Board Member Insua would like to see detailed preliminary Staff review of projects before they come before the ABR so that any questions that may arise during the design review meeting can be well addressed. He would like to see examples from other communities faced with a similar problem of facilitating housing, and how they have tackled those challenges.
3. Board Member Cunningham is not opposed to the transition to floor-to-lot-area ratios (FAR) and the potentially limited parking.
4. Chair Moore is supportive of the transition from regulating housing by density to limiting building size based on FAR. He believes this will help the AUD projects move forward through the design review process, provide a larger variety of unit types, and provide additional smaller units. He is concerned about retaining as much open space and landscaping as possible throughout AUD projects. Ample open space and landscaping is an element which sets Santa Barbara apart from other communities. Further, he would like to see a bigger push for a variety of unit types.

(3:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**2. 335 E GUTIERREZ ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-282-009
 Zone: M-I
 Application Number: PLN2019-00275
 Owners: Stanley W. and Lynn E. Ashcraft
 Applicant: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal for a new commercial structure. Project consists of the demolition of both an existing 1,914 square foot damaged retail building, and an existing 1,132 square foot storage building, as well as the construction of a new 2,858 square foot warehouse building. An existing 1,125 square storage building is proposed to remain. Three parking spaces are also proposed. Project requires Development Plan Approval findings pursuant to the City's Growth Management Program. Project will abate violations identified in enforcement case ENF2017-01280.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Manual. Project was last reviewed on July 15, 2019.

Actual time: 4:02 p.m.

Present: Peter Ehlen, Applicant; and Charles McClure, Landscape Architect

Public comment opened at 4:19 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

Written correspondence from Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:23 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel that the colors as presented are appropriate? 3/1 Passed

Motion: Project Design Approval with comments:

1. Applicant has the option to return with different color schemes. The colors as presented are acceptable.
2. The Board makes the following Development Plan Approval findings:
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title.
 - b. The proposed non-residential square footage is consistent with the principles of sound community planning, due to the project's M-I zoning and Industrial General Plan Land Use Designation. The project is proposed to store wood products to serve the existing adjacent Hayward Lumber use. The project will provide the three parking spaces for the 2,858 square foot of warehouse space and will meet the City's Parking Design Standards; and,
 - c. The proposed warehouse will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community's aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk or scale of the development are consistent with Title 30 of the Zoning Ordinance as it will be below the maximum allowed height of 45 feet. The project exhibits an enhanced utilitarian aesthetic consistent with existing surrounding development. For these reasons the project can be found compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code; and,
 - d. The proposed development is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy, as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 30.170.030. The proposal will receive nonresidential square footage allocation from the Minor and Small Addition Floor Area categories.
3. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. There are no adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping is provided by the project.
4. The Board makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Six absent.) Motion carried.

(4:35PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

- 3. 219 E HALEY ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2016-00078
Owner: Price Living Trust
John Price, Trustee
Applicant: Ed De Vicente

(Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units and the construction of a four-story, 35 unit, mixed-use development. Unit mix will include 14 two-bedroom units, 16 one-bedroom units, and 5 studios ranging in size from 412 to 1,011 square feet, with an average unit size of 719 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 1,816 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,541 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 35 covered parking spaces for the residential units and 5 covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 38 spaces required. Project requires a Development Plan Approval finding for a Small Non-Residential Addition as defined in section 30.170.020 of the Municipal Code.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on March 25, 2019.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contract work with the owner.

Actual time: 4:51 p.m.

Present: Ed De Vicente, Applicant, DMHA; Ryan Mills, DMHA; Kim True, Landscape Architect; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:25 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott
2. John Campanella
3. Robert Hunter

Written correspondence from Kaitlyn Landfield, Anne & Bill Dewey, Carla Lejade, Jackson Snyder, Kyle Sullivan, Lori Rafferty, Patrick Gordon, and Patrick Morgan was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:30 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. Update all elevations to provide a faint massing of the full project.
2. Provide architectural elements, or treatments and finishes, to reduce the apparent massing of the project along the podium walls.
3. Provide architectural elements to better articulate the rooflines on the east elevation.
4. Applicant to provide details of doors and windows, guard rails, balconies, and proposed site fountains.

Action: Watkins/Olson, 3/1/0. (Moore opposed. Cunningham and Six absent.) Motion carried.

(6:00PM) NEW ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL**4. 29 S MILPAS**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-171-024
 Zone: C-R
 Application Number: PLN2019-00460
 Owner: S & P Investments
 Applicant: Paul Poirier

(Proposal for rooftop equipment and trash enclosure. Project consists of the installation of a rooftop HVAC system and refrigeration units, as well as four 12 foot tall sound screening walls. Also proposed is a trash compactor adjacent to the north east corner on the structure.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Haley/Milpas Design Manual.

Item postponed two weeks for due to a lack of quorum.

(6:25PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**5. 720 W PEDREGOSA ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-122-016
 Zone: R-2
 Application Number: PLN2019-00498
 Owner: David Chavez
 Applicant: Jose Luis Esparza

(Proposal for a new two story residence. Project proposes to retain the existing residence on site, demolish the existing 1-car garage, and construct a 1,404 square foot three bedroom, three bathroom residence and a 472 square foot two car garage. Other alterations include demolishing of a 103 square foot porch, new water meter, new gas meter, and new underground utilities. A hedge on the front property line is also proposed to be trimmed.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliances with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 6:24 p.m.

Present: Jose Luis Esparza, Applicant; David Chavez, Owner; and Jacob Chavez, Owner

Public comment opened at 6:35 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The proposed design is acceptable.
2. The architecture is acceptable and fits well into neighborhood.
3. Reduce the width of driveway to the greatest extent possible.
4. Provide as much landscaping planting area between the driveway and the proposed residence as possible.
5. Contact Parks division and determine what the designated street tree is and determine if one can be planted in the parkway.
6. Return with all details required to make the Project Compatibility Analysis.

Action: Moore/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Watkins and Six absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:47 P.M. ***