



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 23, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Moore.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Moore, Cunningham, Insua (at 3:05 p.m.), Six, and Watkins (until 5:40 p.m.)
Members absent: Olson
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 5:40 p.m.), Ozyilmaz, and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott
2. Jose Arturo Gallegos

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **September 9, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **August 26, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Public comment opened at 3:07 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 3:09 p.m.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 23, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Members Cunningham and Six.

Action: Cunningham/Moore, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:

- a. 1108 Olive Street has been appealed to City Council, and is scheduled to be heard on September 24, 2019. Mr. Ozyilmaz requested that a member of the Board representing the prevailing vote attend the meeting. Board member Six confirmed that he will represent the Board at the City Council hearing.
- b. Item 4, 15 S. Alisos Street has been postponed to the October 7, 2019 agenda at the applicant's request.
- c. Item 6, 219 E. Haley has been postponed at the applicant's request.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

F. The American Institute of Architects Santa Barbara announced their 11th annual ArchitecTours event, October 5, 2019. The Theme is "The Art of Architecture" This year's tour will celebrate the intersection of art and architecture and will explore nine exceptional projects illustrating the diversity of Art and Architecture from Montecito to Goleta.

(3:15PM) FINAL APPROVAL

1. **101 S CANADA ST**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-231-016
 Zone: R-2
 Application Number: PLN2016-00536
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Applicant: On Design LLC

(Proposal for three condominium units. Project consists of the construction of a 4,176 square foot, two-story duplex and a 631 square foot three-car garage on a 13,153 square foot lot. The existing 1,046 square foot single-family residence would remain, and would be remodeled to include a 754 square foot second-story addition above a new 457 square foot two-car garage, and one-car carport. The development on site will be 7,064 square feet with a residential density of 10 dwelling units per acre on an R-2 (Two-Unit Residential) zoned lot with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium Density Residential (max 12 du/acre. There will be 525 cubic yards of grading excavation and 635 cubic yards of fill dirt. Also proposed is the demolition of two unpermitted sheds and a two-car garage. This proposal will address violations identified in Enforcement Case ENF2016-01675.)

Final Approval is requested. Project plans require substantial conformance with the plans granted Project Design Approval on June 3, 2019.

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Noah Greer, Applicant, On Design LLC; Sam Maphis, Landscape Architect, Earthform Design; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott. Jose Arturo Gallegos ceded time to Ms. Gott.

Public comment closed at 3:45 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Provide more dimensional interest to the rake ends of the balconies; both at the balcony level and the rake level.
2. Select a new balcony material instead of the proposed red wood. Resolve issues with regards to the durability of the deck.
3. Provide stucco below the weep screed if the weep screed configuration allows.
4. Gutters and downspouts shall be painted galvanized and use traditional configurations such as half round gutters and round gutters.
5. Small inset tiles surrounding windows and doors shall either return to the doors and windows completely or be removed from the project.
6. All roof tiles shall be a red blend. Eliminate the dark chocolate tile. Provide a sample red blend roof tiles.
7. All balcony connectors shall be concealed.
8. The six-inch increase in the ridge height is not that significant and is acceptable if the eaves and plate heights stay the same.

- 9. Refine the shapes of the corbels and scalloped details throughout project.
- 10. The 13-inch increase in height on the first level is acceptable and not a significant impact to the neighbors as it screened by a developed Eugenia hedge.
- 11. At all property lines where the increase in height on the first floor occurs, the landscape plan shall have either an existing or introduced Eugenia hedge of significant height to screen the elevation changes.
- 12. Show plant sizes and quantities on the landscape plan.
- 13. The backflow preventer needs to be located on the irrigation plan and screened on the planting plan.
- 14. Any exposed metal around windows shall be painted to match windows.
- 15. Present a solution to the handrail and stairways at the entrance of building A in the next set of drawings.
- 16. The landscape light mounting straps on the trees shall be expandable.
- 17. Note on the site plan or planting plan the appropriate time for pruning the jacaranda tree in order to avoid the nesting season.
- 18. Provide additional dimension for all wood detailing and plaster shapes.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

(4:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

2. 1317 PUNTA GORDA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-300-017
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2018-00627
 Owner: Jim Carr
 Applicant: Tom Ochsner, Architect
 Landscape Architect: Charles McClure

(Proposal for seven new residential duplexes developed under the Average Unit-Size Density Program (AUD). Project includes demolition of an existing single residential unit, asphalt driveway, and site paving, and the construction of four residential structures housing 14 two-bedroom units ranging in size from 815 to 1,034 square feet with an average unit size of 896 square feet. The proposed density for this 23,847 square foot parcel is 25 dwelling units per acre on a site with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Additional site improvements include a new parking lot with 14 parking spaces for the residential units, a permeable paver driveway, bicycle parking, common areas, fencing, paths, paved and landscaped area, and trash enclosure.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan and conditions for the Average Unit-Size Density program annual residents survey. Project was last reviewed on May 6, 2019. Action is required by November 8, 2019.

Actual time: 4:47 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Applicant; and Charles McClure, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Ozilymaz stated that the project is under the California Permit Streamlining Act and requires action by November 8, 2019.

Public comment opened at 4:57 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

2. Anna Marie Gott, Jose Arturo Gallegos ceded time to Ms. Gott.
3. Luis Fernandez
4. John Campanella, in support.

Public comment closed at 5:04 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely back to the Full Board with comments:

1. The proposed site plan is adequate. The shifting of the several structures on site creates variety in interest that is both compelling and appropriate in that it minimizes apparent overall mass of site and proposed construction. It provides interesting site lines of the surrounding views to both inhabitants of the sites and neighboring community.
2. The Alternative Open Yard design is acceptable, as it supports the enhanced characteristics of the architecture and provides a unique sense of shared amenities not commonly found in multifamily housing.
3. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and the immediate neighborhood. The project consists of one and two story units, as found in the neighborhood. The finished materials of the roof and siding is also consistently found throughout the neighborhood because the project uses wood siding and composition shingles. The proportion of the individual units on site also closely mimic the housing found close to the property, and is also commonly featured in the larger community.
 - c. As explained in comment 3.b, the architecture of the proposed development is consistent in mass, bulk, and scale of units typically found in this neighborhood.
 - d. There are no adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources that will be negatively impacted by the development.
 - e. The design of the project does not diminish established scenic public vistas. This is demonstrated by the overall low height of the project, and the majority of structures on site are two story.
 - f. The landscape design is innovative and includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping for the inhabitants. The project preserves the two existing Oak trees on site while providing a variety of different scales of interactions within the landscape for tenants in their respective units and also within the development itself.

4. Build up the design of the pergola between Unit 11 and Unit 13, providing larger dimensions for the proposed wood framing system of the trellis. Reinforce that the pergola is acting on an axis and is an established node.
5. Explore the feasibility of adding a pergola adjacent to parking space 5 under the Oak tree as a gathering point and have it act as an axis for the property.
6. Study the glazing locations of each respective unit and how they impact privacy concerns.
7. Establish a criteria of window patterning that is compatible and consistent within each architectural building but also among the development itself.
8. Provide more contrast and differentiation in body colors.

Action: Watkins/Cunningham, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

*** The item was re-opened at 5:36 ***

Motion: Project Design Approval and continue indefinitely back to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board makes the finding that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
2. The project must comply with the yearly reporting for AUD projects.

Action: Watkins/Moore, 5/0/0. (Olson absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(4:45PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

3. 16 W MISSION ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-311-014
 Zone: C-G
 Application Number: PLN2019-00398
 Owner: Nancy Ann Jenkins
 Applicant: Heidi Jones

(Proposal for the conversion of an existing commercial complex into a residential complex using the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) program and the State Bonus Density Law. Project entails an interior conversion of the existing floor area to include a unit mix of nine studio, eleven one-bedroom, and three two-bedroom units ranging in size from 330 square feet and 895 square feet with an average unit size of 520 square feet. The proposed density on this 28,224 square foot lot is 35 dwelling units per acre on a lot with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium High Density Residential which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre, and using the State's Bonus Density Law which allows for up to 11% more units above base density. As part of the State Density Bonus Law, the proposed conversion includes two units designated for "Very Low" income level tenants. Also proposed is a 130 square foot addition.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 5:40 p.m.

Present: Heidi Jones, Agent, Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services, Inc.; John Beauchamp, Architect; Lane Goodkind, Landscape Architect; and Ellen Kokinda, Administrative Analyst II, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 6:06 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 6:07 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. This is a great project that intends to reuse the existing building and create additional housing.
2. The conceptual landscape design is supportable.
3. The Board looks forward to more developed details and specifications.
4. Provide additional trees on the northern property line at the parking lot.
5. The proposed parking lot pole-mounted lighting is acceptable. However the proposed lighting interior to the building courtyard and other areas needs restudy. The lighting shall be uniform and selected based on the style of the building.
6. Remove all surface mounted conduit and air conditioning units that exist on the exterior of the building.
7. Make every effort to identify potential code issues that may impact exterior appearance of the building.
8. The Board highly recommends that the Owner considers repainting the entire building after repairs.

Action: Moore/Cunningham, 4/0/0. (Olson and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

(5:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

4. 15 S ALISOS ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-172-018

Zone: R-2

Application Number: PLN2019-00339

Owner: Three J Investment Alisos, LLC

Applicant: Michael Holliday

(THIS IS A REVISED PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposal for a new permanent supportive housing project administered through the Salvation Army. The project consists of the construction of a 2,767 square foot, 10 bedroom manufactured housing facility to match the materials, design and finishes of the existing adjacent structures. A wooden deck on the west side of the new building will provide ADA ramp compliant access to new structure. The driveway area behind the existing home will be modified to accommodate an ADA van parking space and three standard parking spaces. New landscaping and site drainage are also proposed.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following design guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Item postponed two weeks at the applicant’s request.

(6:00PM) FINAL APPROVAL

- 5. 1412 CASTILLO ST**
- Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-052-024
- Zone: R-MH
- Application Number: PLN2016-00529
- Owner: Charles and Sylvia Butler Trust
Charles and Sylvia Butler, Trustees
- Applicant: Craig Goodman, Architect

(THIS IS A REVISED PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposal for a new residential project using the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD). The project will comprise the remodel of two existing units and the construction of two additional units. Unit mix will include two, 2-bedroom units and two, 3-bedroom units ranging in size from 899 to 1,147 square feet with an average unit size of 997 square feet. The proposed density on this 8,172 square foot parcel will be 22 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan land use designation of Medium-High Density Residential, 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Also proposed are four covered and three uncovered parking spaces; as well as a new deck, landscaping, and trellis. Project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2016-01132.)

Final approval is requested. Project requires substantial conformance to the plans granted Project Design Approval on June 4, 2018.

Actual time: 6:28 p.m.

Present: Craig Goodman, Architect; and Charles Butler, Owner

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz stated that the project was granted Project Design Approval on June 4, 2018. No action can be taken today due to a lack of four voting members.

Public comment opened at 7:19 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

- 1. Anna Marie Gott

Public comment closed at 7:22 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely:

1. Applicant to solve the substantial conformance issue of the ridge height of the front unit. Applicant to either request a revised Project Design Approval or return with a design that matches the original ridge height of the front unit given Project Design Approval on June 4, 2018.
2. Simplify design of the fences and the entry features.
3. Provide an improved landscape plan.

Action: Cunningham/Moore, 2/0/2. (Insua and Six abstained. Olson and Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

(7:00PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL**6. 219 E HALEY ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-014
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PLN2016-00078
Owner: Price Living Trust
Applicant: Ed De Vicente, Architect

(Proposal for a new mixed-use development using the Average Unit Density (AUD) Incentive Program. The proposal includes the demolition of seven existing structures housing eight residential units and the construction of a four-story, 35 unit, mixed-use development. Unit mix will include 14 two-bedroom units, 16 one-bedroom units, and 5 studios ranging in size from 412 to 1,011 square feet, with an average unit size of 719 square feet. Also proposed are two commercial spaces totaling 1,816 square feet. The proposed density on this 25,541 square foot parcel will be 63 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use designation of Commercial Industrial/Medium High Residential, 37-63 dwelling units per acre in the Priority Housing Overlay. There will be 35 covered parking spaces for the residential units and 5 covered parking spaces for the commercial area, with 38 spaces required. Planning Commission review is required.)

Item postponed two weeks at the applicant's request.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:02 P.M.