



City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
APRIL 8, 2019

3:00 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Wm. Howard Wittausch, *Vice Chair*
Bob Cunningham
Ivan Insua
Leon A. Olson
Richard Six
David R. Watkins

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

John Campanella

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Matthew Ozyilmaz, Planning Technician
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Moore.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Moore, Wittausch, Cunningham, Insua (at 3:26 p.m.), Olson, Six, and Watkins (absent 3:18 - 3:41 p.m.)
Members absent: None
Staff present: Ostrenger (until 6:45 p.m.), Ozyilmaz, and Ternovskaya

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott
2. Jessica Metzger, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 25, 2019**, as submitted.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 5/0/1. (Moore abstained. Insua absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 8, 2019**, as reviewed by Board Member Wittausch.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 6/0/0. (Insua absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Ostrenger announced that she would be leaving the meeting after 5:30 p.m.
2. Mr. Ozyilmaz announced the following:
 - a. The annual recruitment for City Advisory Group members is now in progress. The resignation deadline for current Advisory Group Members who otherwise would not be at the end of their term was last Thursday, April 4th. This notice of resignation will allow the position to be included in the current recruitment process. The application deadline for new appointments is Tuesday, April 23, 2019, at 5:00 p.m. Interviews by the City Council will take place on Tuesday, May 7, 2019, at 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 14, 2019, at 4:00 p.m., and Tuesday, May 21, 2019, at 6:00 p.m. New Advisory Group members will be appointed on Tuesday, June 18, 2019. General information about each advisory group and the Application for Appointment, list of vacancies, vacancy notices, and recruitment schedule may be obtained by accessing the City's website at: [santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards and Commissions/](http://santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Boards%20and%20Commissions/), or from the City Clerk's Office.
 - b. Item 1, 101 S. Canada St. has been postponed to April 22, 2019.
 - c. The applicant's appeal for 711 N. Milpas St. was upheld by City Council.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(3:15PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

1. **101 S CANADA ST**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-231-016
 Zone: R-2
 Application Number: PLN2016-00536
 Owner: Edward St. George
 Applicant: On Design LLC

(Proposal for a Tentative Parcel Map for a three-unit condominium development including construction of a 4,176 square foot, two-story duplex and a 631 square foot three-car garage on a 13,153 square foot lot. The existing 1,046 square foot single-family residence would remain, and would be remodeled to include a 754 square foot second-story addition above a new 457 square foot two-car garage and one-car carport. The development on site will be 7,064 square feet with a residential density of 10 dwelling units per acre on an R-2 (Two-Unit Residential) zoned lot with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium Density Residential (max 12 du/acre. There will be 525 cubic yards of grading excavation and 635 cubic yards of fill dirt. Also proposed is the demolition of two unpermitted sheds and a two-car garage. This proposal will address violations identified in Enforcement Case ENF2016-01675.)

Project Design approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project received Planning Commission approval for the Tentative Subdivision Map on November 19, 2018. Project was last reviewed on November 30, 2018.

Item postponed to April 22, 2019.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:18 TO 3:35 P.M. ***

(3:50PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

2. 923 CASTILLO ST
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-301-014
 Zone: R-M
 Application Number: PLN2015-00341
 Owner: RBH Family Living Trust
 Architect: Richard Redmond

(Proposal for a three-story, three-unit residential condominium development on an approximately 9,100 square foot vacant lot adjacent to Mission Creek. The project consists of 3, three bedroom units that will total 4,816 square feet and will comprise the second and third levels, with three covered parking spaces provided in a carport on the ground level. Three uncovered parking spaces are also proposed, as well as rooftop decks. One 20" diameter palm tree will be removed. The property is zoned R-M and has a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium High Density Residential (15-27 du/acre). Planning Commission review is required for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires review by Planning Commission, compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 3:36 p.m.

Present: Richard Redmond, Architect; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments:

1. Mr. Ozyilmaz clarified that the project was re-noticed for this meeting and is being treated as a new project.
2. Ms. Brodison stated that this project was affected by the implementation of Title 30 and will continue to the Planning Commission due to its adjacency to Mission Creek.

Public comment opened at 3:46 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The Board supports the project.
2. The Board provided comments on the following Compatibility Analysis Criteria (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The size, mass, bulk, and scale of the project fits well into the neighborhood.

- i. However, the size, mass, bulk and scale is pushing the boundary due to the technical requirements of the base flood elevation limits. Study minimizing the height of the first finished floor structure relative to the base flood elevation.
- ii. The Board finds that with some care given to articulating the elevations, especially the north and south elevations, and restudying the proposed side windows to mitigate privacy issues with the north and south neighbors; the size, mass bulk, and scale of the project is compatible with the neighborhood.
- b. It appears that the project is consistent with the City Charter and Municipal Code requirements, as staff has not stated otherwise.
- c. The style of the project is compatible and harmonious with the architecture of buildings across the street and is compatible with the architecture of the neighborhood.
- d. It appears that there are no sensitive adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources that would be affected by the project.
- e. No established scenic public vistas are affected.
- f. Study opportunities to provide more landscaping on north and south elevations to lessen the verticality and impact of those elevations on neighbors.
- 3. Study whether the elevator will require a transformer.
- 4. Provide a preliminary landscape plan along with the submission for Project Design Approval by Planning Commission.
- 5. Study bringing more girth to the support columns, especially on the southeast corner.

Action: Six/Cunningham, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

(4:30PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

3. 3855 STATE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-010
 Zone: C-G/USS
 Application Number: PLN2018-00436
 Owner: Macerich La Cumbre LLC
 Agent: Sam Masterson
 Applicant: Darin Eng

(Proposal for a tenant improvement to an existing commercial use. Project consists of a multiple elevation remodel of an existing grocery store in preparation for occupation by Bristol Farms. Alterations include new stucco, stone, paint, and tile roofing, relocation of entry doors, and the installation of new storefront windows. An increase in height from 25 feet to 37 feet is proposed as part of the façade remodel.)

Project Design approval is requested. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Upper State Street Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on December 24, 2019.

Actual time: 4:32 p.m.

Present: Darin Eng, Applicant; and Sam Masterson, Agent, Bristol Farms

Public comment opened at 5:00 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel that the design of the project is ready for Project Design Approval? 5/2 Passed.

Motion: Project Design Approval to return to the Full Board for an In-Progress review with comments:

1. Overall the project is moving into the right direction. However, issues with the detailing need to be resolved.
2. On the east elevation's higher parapet line where the wall returns and steps down, wrap the corner with the cornice detail to provide a profile in the perpendicular direction and have it return 24 inches.
3. Clarify the faux vent detail materials at the rake.
4. Provide better samples of the sandstone that reflect the color, texture, and pattern of the 5 point sandstone configuration that specifically matches the proposed image.
5. Cap details on the parapet wall where the sandstone occurs should be at least 4 inches thick.
6. Provide samples of the faux stone assembly of outside corner conditions and cap details.
7. Refine the overall proportions of east (front) elevation clerestory windows. Consider either engaging window units below or look at the scale of the window units.
8. Restudy the faux clearstory window detail on the south tower elevation. Either reflect the east (front) elevation windows or use a completely different detail entirely.
9. The color and material of the faux sandstone small tile along the entry way are not acceptable as proposed and should reflect the quality and granularity of sandstone.
10. Restudy the profile and scale of the rafter edge on Sheet A202, Detail 9, in order to have it match the cut of the adjacent trellis details.
11. Refine the column cap condition on Sheet A202, Detail 10. The board does not prefer the exposed metal flashing at the top, and the metal connector is too simple and industrial as proposed.
12. Clarify if the trellis on Detail 10 are raised over the site wall as shown on elevations, or if they are going to be set off by the hardware shown in the detail.
13. Have no visible aluminum flashing on column caps, cornices, and parapet walls; or provide copper flashing at the rake and eave details and half round gutters.
14. On Detail 6, applicant to provide a copper strip for the details exposed or a double rake tile.
15. Restudy how to raise the tower soffit to the greatest extent possible in order to gain some height and volume in the entryway.
16. Restudy the window at south east elevation to be centered in the vaulted space. If cannot be done, revise the detail so there is no longer a window.
17. In Detail 7, show grouted birdstops and booster tiles on details along edges of the roofline where the two-piece tile is proposed.
18. A half round shape is more appropriate for the profile of the gutter system.
19. Provide Boston Ivy plants at the north elevation to match the existing Boston Ivy.
20. Eliminate plaster frame around all clerestory windows and around the small corbels at the trellis connections back to walls.
21. The Board finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project is compatible with applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable

- to its location within the City. In particular, the project is consistent with the Upper State Street Design Guidelines. However, concerns about the sandstone still exist.
- b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics of the City of Santa Barbara through the use of plaster, tile work, wood trellis members, two-piece tile. The finished materials as proposed are consistent with the immediate area and does not impact the surrounding neighborhood.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate and do not exceed given height limits. The scale is well-proportioned and elements such as trellis and sandstone base help provide a better scale for the frontage.
 - d. The project does not have adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources that it would affect.
 - e. The project does not impact scenic public vistas as the new reconfiguration of the front elevation entry is within the required height limits.
 - f. No open space but proposed landscaping is appreciated and improves on the existing landscaping.

Action: Watkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(5:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

- 4. 1317 PUNTA GORDA ST**
- | | |
|---------------------------|-----------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 017-300-017 |
| Zone: | R-M |
| Application Number: | PLN2018-00627 |
| Owner: | Jim Carr |
| Architect: | Tom Ochsner |
| Landscape Architect: | Charles McClure |

(Proposal for seven new residential duplexes developed under the Average Unit Density Incentive Program (AUD). Project includes demolition of an existing single residential unit, asphalt driveway, and site paving, and the construction of seven, two-story duplexes comprised of 14 two-bedroom units ranging in size from 810 to 992 square feet with an average unit size of 914 square feet. The proposed density for this 23,847 square foot parcel is 25 dwelling units per acre on a site with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density, which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. Additional site improvements include a new parking lot with 14 parking spaces for the residential units, a permeable paver driveway, bicycle parking, common areas, fencing, paths, paved and landscaped area, and trash enclosure.)

Second Concept Review. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis as well as the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 6:04 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; and Charles McClure, Landscape Architect

Staff comments: Mr. Ozyilmaz clarified that this project was noticed properly initially and a second notice is not warranted.

Public comment opened at 6:28 p.m.

The following individual spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

Written correspondence from Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:31 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members feel that the design as presented is appropriate? 2/5 Failed

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

1. Restudy the building design and the site plan.
2. Increase the availability of open space.
3. Study combining the buildings to provide for triplexes or fourplexes.
4. Consider the possibility of adding two stories or maybe three stories in some places in order to consolidate construction and open up the site plan.
5. Reduce the apparent heights of buildings.
6. Provide more variety in design and materials between the buildings to provide a more residential feel.
7. Design the project to emphasize a community feel. The development should not look like a project but a community.

Action: Cunningham/Olson, 5/2/0. (Watkins and Six opposed. Motion carried.)

(5:40PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

5. 519 W PEDREGOSA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-163-017
Zone: R-M
Application Number: PLN2018-00516
Owner: Tom Kenny
Applicant: Brooke Vanduyne

(Proposal for two new multi-unit structures on a lot developed with a single residential unit. Project proposes to maintain the existing 1,358 square foot, 3-bedroom unit and construct two new two-story structures containing three residences. Unit mix includes one three-bedroom, one one-bedroom, and two studio units ranging in size from 455 to 1,358 square feet with an average unit size of 702 square feet. The proposed density on this parcel will be 26 dwelling units per acre on a parcel with a General Plan Land Use Designation of Medium-High Density which allows for 15-27 dwelling units per acre. A total of four vehicle and four bicycle parking spaces are proposed; vehicle parking includes a proposed new two two-car garage and two new uncovered spaces. Staff Hearing Officer review is required for an Open Yard Modification.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires review by the Staff Hearing Officer, compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis, and the following guidelines: Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

Actual time: 7:09 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect; and Brooke VanDuyne, Applicant

Staff comments: Mr. Ozilymaz clarified that due to a change in the Average Unit Density Ordinance regarding parking spaces, the project is not compliant with the ordinance but the Board can provide comments about the design.

Public comment opened at 7:24 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. Restudy site plan and configuration of buildings.
2. The preservation of the existing buildings does not work with the present proposed density of the building
3. Provide overall building elevations of the proposed project from all sides.

Action: Cunningham/Six, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:42 P.M. ***